

4-8-2016

Mary's Place in Today's Church

Thomas Buffer

Dennis M. Doyle

Follow this and additional works at: https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian_forum



Part of the [Catholic Studies Commons](#), and the [Christianity Commons](#)

ROUGH TRANSCRIPT

“Mary's Place in Today's Church”

Marian Forum, University of Dayton

April 8, 2016

Father Thomas Buffer, Lecturer, International Marian Research Institute

Dennis Doyle, Professor, University of Dayton

[7:10] - Welcome to the second online session

[7:13] of the Marian Forum

[7:16] hosted by the international Marian Research Institute

[7:19] here at the University of Dayton

[7:22] in Dayton, Ohio,

[7:24] of the United States of America.

[7:28] My name is Dr. Gloria Falcão Dodd.

[7:32] I'm a faculty member

[7:33] at the International Marian Research Institute.

[7:37] I will be your host today.

[7:39] Father Johann Roten,

[7:42] the organizer of the forum

[7:43] is recovering well,

[7:45] but is not able to be with us today.

[7:49] I thank the Marian Library

[7:51] for providing their reading room here

[7:55] as an appropriate location

[7:57] for this forum.

[7:59] Let us begin with a prayer

[8:02] that I offered for Father Roten's complete recovery,

[8:05] as well as for all of your intentions.

[8:10] And I invite you

[8:12] to join in praying the Hail Mary.

[8:16] In the name of the Father,

[8:17] of of the Son,

[8:18] and of the Holy Spirit,

[8:20] Amen.

[8:22] Hail Mary, full of grace,

[8:24] the Lord is with thee.

[8:26] Blessed art thou among women,

[8:29] and blessed is the fruit of thy womb, Jesus.

[8:32] Holy Mary, mother of God,

[8:34] pray for us sinners

[8:37] now and at the hour of our death,

[8:39] Amen.

[8:41] In the name of the Father,

[8:42] and of the son,

[8:43] and of the Holy Spirit.
[8:45] Amen.
[8:47] The goal of the Marian Forum
[8:50] is to provide a free
[8:52] (audio cuts out)
[8:54] format,
[8:55] for it to bring people
[8:57] together
[8:58] from around the world
[8:59] in an online format
[9:01] to foster fresh
[9:03] and creative approaches
[9:05] to Mariology
[9:06] and Marian devotion.
[9:08] We are delighted
[9:11] that this second session of the Marian Forum
[9:14] includes 67 participants
[9:18] representing eight countries.
[9:20] The United States,
[9:22] Canada,
[9:23] Trinidad Tobago,
[9:26] Vietnam,
[9:27] Indonesia,
[9:29] Australia,
[9:30] Nicaragua,
[9:32] and Costa Rica,
[9:34] reflecting the international aspect
[9:37] of the International Marian Research Institute.
[9:42] Most of our audience is participating online today,
[9:46] but a few are with us,
[9:48] present here,
[9:50] in the Marian Library.
[9:53] Now today's forum is taking stock
[9:56] of Mary's place in the church.
[10:00] Do we need a reappraisal
[10:03] of Mary's place in the church?
[10:06] Is there still a minimalist approach
[10:09] towards Mary
[10:10] in theology
[10:12] and ecclesiology?
[10:15] What about the idea of a Marian church?
[10:17] Mary's relationship with the church
[10:22] has many aspects.
[10:23] On May 12, 2014,

[10:27] Pope Francis
[10:29] recommended to seminarians
[10:32] that they should always remember
[10:34] our lady,
[10:35] and to have a good relationship with her
[10:37] as our mother.
[10:41] Quote, to forget the mother
[10:44] is something awful.
[10:46] And to say it another way,
[10:49] if you don't go to our lady as mother,
[10:52] you will certainly have her
[10:54] as a mother-in-law,
[10:56] and this isn't good.
[10:58] (laughter)
[11:00] So in the first hour,
[11:02] our two speakers will present their thoughts
[11:05] in answering the questions
[11:07] of the forum.
[11:09] Their written contributions
[11:10] were emailed in advance
[11:13] to all those who had registered.
[11:15] This allowed the participants
[11:18] an opportunity
[11:19] to read them
[11:21] and to send in questions in advance.
[11:24] The speakers will presume
[11:26] that the audience has read
[11:28] their contributions.
[11:30] They will perhaps highlight
[11:32] some of the main ideas,
[11:34] and if they wish,
[11:36] they could begin addressing
[11:38] some of the questions
[11:39] that have been emailed already.
[11:43] The second hour
[11:45] will allow our audience
[11:46] to share more questions.
[11:49] To allow as many as possible to participate,
[11:53] we will rotate
[11:55] the source of our comments
[11:57] and questions
[11:59] starting with the chat box,
[12:00] then taking one of the emails
[12:02] sent in advance,

[12:03] and then a question or comment
[12:06] from our live audience,
[12:08] rotating through these three groups.
[12:11] Any chat box,
[12:13] or emailed comments
[12:15] that we might not get to
[12:17] during the live session
[12:18] will be given to the speakers.
[12:22] And Paul Dagnall,
[12:24] a faculty member of the School of Education,
[12:27] as well as an E-learning specialist
[12:30] of the Learning, Teaching Center
[12:33] of the University of Dayton
[12:35] is here today
[12:37] to explain to our online audience
[12:41] how they will participate
[12:43] in the discussion.
[12:50] - Hi, this time when you watch the video on YouTube,
[12:52] it should be very simple for you
[12:54] just to watch it.
[12:56] If you would like to participate,
[12:58] there's two ways you can do it.
[12:59] One, is if you sign into YouTube
[13:00] using the sign in the chat
[13:03] that you'll see to the right side of your screen,
[13:04] or you can
[13:08] sign in using the button at the top.
[13:11] Either way, it'll do the same thing.
[13:12] That will allow you to chat right into the box
[13:14] to the right of the screen that you're watching right now.
[13:16] And if you're not comfortable doing that,
[13:19] or you don't have a google
[13:21] account,
[13:22] you could also
[13:23] email me
[13:24] who you'll find my
[13:26] email address on the message that
[13:29] Gloria emailed to you earlier,
[13:32] but that's pdagnaw1@Udayton.edu
[13:35] and we'll relay your questions
[13:39] that you submit electronically
[13:40] to our speakers.
[13:41] And they will answer any questions you have
[13:45] as long as we have time to get to them.

[13:47] - Very good.
[13:52] Thank you Paul.
[13:54] And we certainly also want to thank
[13:56] John LeComte
[13:57] for technical support
[13:58] in getting this forum put together today.
[14:01] It is now my pleasure
[14:05] to introduce our first speaker
[14:07] that is Father Thomas Buffer.
[14:10] He has a license in sacred theology
[14:14] from our institution,
[14:16] the International Marian Research Institute.
[14:19] His doctorate is from the Gregorian University in Rome.
[14:23] He has been a professor of theology
[14:27] at the Josephinum Seminary in Columbus, Ohio.
[14:31] As well as remaining as one of our professors here
[14:35] at the International Research,
[14:37] the International Marian Research Institute
[14:40] where he currently
[14:42] teaches church in the patristic period.
[14:46] He is also the pastor
[14:47] of a providentially named parish
[14:51] and town,
[14:52] St. Mary's Church
[14:54] in Marian, Ohio.
[14:57] So, with that,
[14:59] it is my pleasure to
[15:00] present Father Thomas Buffer.
[15:02] (applause)
[15:07] - So thank you Dr. Dodd.
[15:09] Just to give a brief recap
[15:12] of the paper which I hope at least most of you
[15:15] have had the chance to read.
[15:17] It's been my experience
[15:19] that even though in the creed,
[15:22] we profess a belief in the church
[15:24] or in some older formulations
[15:26] of the Nicene creed,
[15:28] I believe the church,
[15:30] that we don't always look at the church
[15:33] as something that's necessary
[15:36] at all
[15:37] for someone to be a Christian
[15:38] and participate in the Christian life.

[15:41] And you might think I'm speaking only of
[15:42] the thought and experience of
[15:45] non-Catholic Christians,
[15:47] but there's also a bit of an element of this
[15:50] in the minds of at least some Catholics as well.
[15:54] When we talk to people
[15:56] who we presume we are evangelizing
[15:58] for the first time,
[16:00] how do we speak to them about what they need to do
[16:03] to become a Christian,
[16:05] to come into the relationship with God
[16:07] that characterizes
[16:08] a follower of Jesus Christ?
[16:10] Because there are people who will talk about
[16:13] these same things,
[16:15] and they might talk about
[16:16] how to be saved.
[16:17] They might talk about
[16:20] how to become a Christian,
[16:21] or they might just talk about
[16:22] to people who are already Christians
[16:23] and talk to them about how to be a good Christian
[16:26] or how to be a better Christian.
[16:28] And they can do all of this
[16:30] without mentioning
[16:31] the church,
[16:32] or in some people's language,
[16:34] a church.
[16:36] This is very common in the United States,
[16:38] and I know in some other countries as well.
[16:41] There are people who are very earnest,
[16:43] believing Christians
[16:44] and they're out there evangelizing
[16:46] and they're trying to win other people to Christ,
[16:48] and they lead them through a process
[16:50] where they get them to accept
[16:52] some basic beliefs about who Jesus is.
[16:55] And then they have to accept Christ as
[16:57] their savior and ask him for forgiveness
[17:00] and that sort of thing,
[17:02] and be born again.
[17:03] And that might even include
[17:05] some kind of baptism.
[17:07] But then,

[17:08] they say now what you need to do is
[17:11] you need to join a church,
[17:13] where that faith is going to be supported
[17:17] by other individuals
[17:18] who have the same faith.
[17:21] Very interesting approach
[17:23] and it's absolutely not what we find
[17:26] in the days where the church
[17:29] was coming into existence.
[17:31] It's not what we find in the very earliest days
[17:34] of Christianity.
[17:36] And the question arises then
[17:38] is the church even necessary?
[17:42] And if it is necessary,
[17:44] why?
[17:46] Is it just something that's a support structure
[17:48] for the spiritual activity
[17:51] of individuals?
[17:52] Or is it actually got part of
[17:54] God's plan?
[17:56] Is it part of
[17:57] the way that
[17:59] things were arranged
[18:00] in the history of salvation?
[18:03] A word we find for that a lot
[18:05] in early Christian writing is
[18:06] what they called
[18:07] the arrangement,
[18:09] or based on a Greek word,
[18:11] economy.
[18:12] And this is not, thank God,
[18:13] about economics,
[18:14] but it's the way,
[18:16] it's God's plan
[18:17] for saving the world
[18:19] that He created.
[18:21] Is the church a necessary
[18:23] part of that?
[18:26] Or is it just something that's added on?
[18:27] And I like to say
[18:28] that
[18:30] one place where a lot of Christians
[18:32] and a lot of atheists agree
[18:34] is they both see the church

[18:37] as something evil.
[18:38] But a lot of Christians see the church as
[18:40] a necessary evil,
[18:42] and a secularist,
[18:44] or an atheist would say that church
[18:46] is both evil and unnecessary.
[18:48] And I'd like to think that there's a third option.
[18:51] And certainly when we look at the work
[18:53] of these first Christian teachers
[18:55] and pastors,
[18:57] we find them looking at the church
[18:59] in a much more positive way.
[19:01] And one of the ways they do that is
[19:02] by making comparisons
[19:04] between the church and Mary.
[19:08] And I gave you just a few
[19:09] and a very few examples of this
[19:12] where people are speaking of the church as a woman,
[19:15] as a mother,
[19:17] as a virgin,
[19:19] or sometimes as a virgin mother,
[19:21] and sometimes all these things
[19:22] mixed up together.
[19:23] And what they're all assuming is
[19:26] that the church is
[19:28] part of God's plan.
[19:30] And I want to jump to
[19:32] a Clement of Alexandria,
[19:35] and you want to think about what Clement was doing.
[19:38] If you asked Clement
[19:39] what are you doing,
[19:41] what is your job?
[19:43] He would say that he was a teacher.
[19:45] He wouldn't say that I'm a professor of theology
[19:48] because they didn't have those then.
[19:50] But they had what they called
[19:52] catechetical schools.
[19:53] And he was,
[19:55] his students,
[19:57] were kind of an upper slice.
[20:01] They were the more educated people
[20:02] who wanted to learn about Christianity
[20:05] and perhaps learn more about Christianity.
[20:07] So some of the things Clement is saying

[20:09] are very dense.
[20:11] And so, we just take one little quotation from Clement
[20:15] and he's saying
[20:17] why does the New Testament call Christians children?
[20:21] Now here we are in the Easter season.
[20:24] We're hearing a lot
[20:25] in the liturgy from,
[20:26] we're gonna hear a lot in the liturgy from
[20:28] the letters of John,
[20:29] the three letters of John.
[20:31] And he's always calling them children,
[20:33] little children.
[20:34] And St. Paul sometimes writes to his people
[20:37] and he calls them children.
[20:39] Why is that?
[20:41] And Clement says
[20:43] it makes sense to call Christians children
[20:46] and he talks about why,
[20:48] but if there are children,
[20:50] then who is their mother?
[20:52] Who gives birth to these children?
[20:54] And who nurses these children?
[20:57] Okay, because of course,
[20:59] in his society,
[21:00] and in many societies still today,
[21:01] giving birth to children
[21:04] and nursing them
[21:05] is something that's always done by the same person.
[21:08] So he says
[21:10] Christ was given the opportunity
[21:13] to affirm that the breasts of women
[21:16] were blessed,
[21:17] but he didn't do that.
[21:19] But when the kind and loving father
[21:20] reined down the word,
[21:22] Christ himself became
[21:24] spiritual
[21:26] nourishment.
[21:28] And so, this is what the church does.
[21:30] The universal Father is one,
[21:32] and one the universal word,
[21:34] and the Holy Spirit is one and the same everywhere.
[21:37] And one is the only virgin mother.
[21:40] I love to call her

[21:43] the church.
[21:45] Isn't that a bit of a surprise?
[21:47] If you say there's one virgin mother,
[21:49] you expect him to say
[21:50] I love to call her Mary,
[21:52] or the mother of Jesus,
[21:54] or something like that.
[21:55] But clearly he's doing something we didn't expect.
[21:59] Why does he say that there's one virgin mother?
[22:02] Why is it appropriate to call the church
[22:04] a virgin mother?
[22:06] And remember, this is part of explaining why Christians
[22:08] are called children.
[22:09] This mother, the church,
[22:11] when she was alone,
[22:13] she did not have milk,
[22:15] because alone she was not a woman.
[22:17] And what he means is
[22:19] a human female is not properly called a woman
[22:22] until she becomes pregnant.
[22:26] But the church he says,
[22:28] is both virgin and mother.
[22:30] She is pure, the way a virgin is.
[22:32] But she is loving the way a mother is,
[22:35] and specifically, loving by feeding.
[22:37] And she calls her children to her self
[22:40] and she nurses them with holy milk,
[22:43] namely, the word for childhood,
[22:45] the food their children need
[22:47] to grow into adults.
[22:50] She's feeding and who's that?
[22:51] That's Christ himself.
[22:53] Okay.
[22:54] So, she,
[22:56] the church, did not have milk
[22:58] before
[22:59] for the milk was this child,
[23:02] Christ.
[23:04] But then the child becomes
[23:06] the body of Christ,
[23:07] which nourishes by the word,
[23:10] the young brood,
[23:11] which the Lord himself brought forth
[23:13] in throws of the flesh.

[23:14] Which the lord himself swathed
[23:16] in his precious blood.
[23:17] That's all very dense, isn't it?
[23:19] But here's what,
[23:21] we know that the scripture calls the church
[23:23] the body of Christ.
[23:26] But he says this church
[23:28] which is also the body of Christ,
[23:30] is also the virgin mother,
[23:33] who gives birth to Christians,
[23:35] and who feeds them with
[23:37] the word
[23:38] and with the Eucharist.
[23:41] So that's a lot, isn't it?
[23:43] So what's the connection between Mary
[23:45] and the church there?
[23:47] He doesn't, he never says Mary.
[23:49] He never says the mother of Jesus.
[23:52] But, he's talking to people
[23:55] who already know
[23:57] the scriptural message
[23:58] that Jesus Christ was born of a woman
[24:01] who was both virgin
[24:03] and mother.
[24:06] So they all have that in their minds already.
[24:08] The idea that Mary really was
[24:11] both virgin and mother
[24:13] and she gave birth to Christ.
[24:15] And they already have in their heads
[24:17] the idea that
[24:18] a woman who's a mother
[24:19] feeds her children.
[24:21] So he's able to connect
[24:23] Mary and the church.
[24:25] He's able to use a scriptural message
[24:28] that is about Mary
[24:30] to talk about the church.
[24:33] Why?
[24:34] Because everyone he's talking to
[24:37] already understands
[24:39] that Mary is a central and essential part
[24:44] of telling people who Jesus is
[24:47] and telling people the mystery of Christianity.
[24:51] He's assuming that

[24:53] everyone he's talking to
[24:54] already knows
[24:55] and believes that Mary,
[24:58] the mother of Jesus
[24:59] was both virgin and mother.
[25:01] And why is this important?
[25:03] Because there are people who say
[25:05] that's not really
[25:07] central.
[25:08] And they're saying that's not an indispensable part
[25:11] of Christian belief.
[25:12] There are people who say that today.
[25:14] Once you do that,
[25:16] then you can't
[25:17] metaphorically,
[25:19] call the church virgin
[25:21] and mother.
[25:23] Because you've,
[25:25] in a way, you're separating the church from Christ.
[25:30] Flannery O'Connor,
[25:32] who was an American novelist
[25:34] and short story writer
[25:36] and not at all incidentally
[25:37] a Catholic,
[25:39] in one of her books,
[25:40] she has a non-Catholic church
[25:43] and the name of the church is,
[25:45] it's something like
[25:48] the church without Christ.
[25:49] The church without Christ.
[25:52] Well, we don't have a lot of people
[25:54] who would put up a sign outside their church building
[25:56] and call it the church without Christ.
[25:58] No one would come.
[25:59] But, there are people who believe in
[26:03] Christ without the church.
[26:06] But how do we open a dialogue
[26:09] with people who think that way?
[26:11] They say well did Christ have a mother?
[26:14] She did.
[26:16] And don't we actually know something
[26:18] very striking about her
[26:21] from the message of scripture?
[26:23] We do.

[26:24] We know that she was both virgin
[26:26] and mother.
[26:28] The New Testament went to a certain amount of trouble
[26:30] to tell us
[26:32] some very important details
[26:34] about what made the mother of Jesus
[26:36] unique.
[26:38] Does this tell us something about
[26:39] God's plan?
[26:40] Yes it does.
[26:42] Is that story over?
[26:48] Wednesday,
[26:49] a couple days ago,
[26:50] if you pray the office of readings,
[26:53] the second reading
[26:56] in the office of readings,
[26:57] Wednesday,
[26:58] was from St. Leo, the Great.
[27:00] And he says
[27:02] the things that happened in the life of Christ,
[27:06] they're not just historical events
[27:09] that happened to people
[27:10] who lived at that same time.
[27:12] But the effects are still happening to us
[27:15] today.
[27:17] And that's why talking about Mary can help us
[27:20] understand what the church is today.
[27:25] We just jumped to Ambrose.
[27:27] Ambrose talks a lot
[27:29] about Mary and the church.
[27:32] And,
[27:34] he's speaking more about the church
[27:39] than he is about Mary.
[27:42] And he looks at David,
[27:45] and David is a type of Christ.
[27:49] That means what happens to David
[27:51] is going to tell us something about
[27:53] what is going to happen
[27:55] later in time to Christ.
[27:58] David was called Christ
[27:59] and to him,
[28:01] Jesus Christ,
[28:02] the church was wedded.
[28:05] She who, being filled with the seed of the word,

[28:08] and the spirit of God,
[28:09] gave birth to the body of Christ,
[28:11] that is to the Christian people.
[28:14] And this is all symbolized
[28:17] in the story of
[28:18] David and Bathsheba.
[28:21] What does this tell us about the church?
[28:23] Because he's talking more about the church
[28:26] as the bride of Christ
[28:27] than about Mary.
[28:30] Bathsheba became pregnant
[28:33] through a physical union
[28:36] with David.
[28:37] This is a type.
[28:39] This is prefiguring something that's going to happen
[28:42] later in history.
[28:43] What?
[28:44] The church is going to become pregnant.
[28:47] How?
[28:48] The church will be filled
[28:50] with the word,
[28:51] and with the Holy Spirit.
[28:54] She's going to become pregnant
[28:56] and she's going to give birth.
[28:58] And to whom does the church give birth?
[29:00] The Christian people.
[29:02] What's another name for the Christian people?
[29:04] The church.
[29:06] The body of Christ.
[29:09] Mary gave birth, physically,
[29:12] to Christ.
[29:14] She gave birth to the body of Jesus.
[29:15] The church is giving birth to
[29:17] the body of Christ,
[29:19] which is the church.
[29:22] Now, if Ambrose believed that the church was not
[29:25] part of God's plan and salvation,
[29:27] he would not have spoken that way.
[29:30] I don't think he could have.
[29:32] You can't talk about
[29:34] the church as being God's people
[29:39] if the church doesn't,
[29:41] you can't talk about God's people
[29:44] if there's not a church to give

[29:45] birth to
[29:46] God's people.
[29:48] And here's where I make my observation
[29:51] about Christmas.
[29:53] For a lot of non-Catholic Christians,
[29:55] the virgin Mary only appears at Christmas time.
[29:59] Right.
[30:01] Right, starting around the end of November,
[30:04] the beginning of December,
[30:06] and disappearing at about 2:00 p.m.
[30:09] On December 25.
[30:10] (laughter)
[30:11] And, you say well, why do they suddenly have
[30:16] a picture of the Virgin Mary in their house?
[30:19] Okay, I visited a Baptist college
[30:22] in North Carolina.
[30:24] North Carolina people,
[30:26] is not a very Catholic place.
[30:27] And in the cafeteria where the students eat
[30:31] they had a nativity scene
[30:33] set up.
[30:35] It was November.
[30:37] And it was a very,
[30:38] I don't think there's such a thing
[30:41] as a nativity scene
[30:42] that doesn't look Catholic.
[30:43] It looked just like a Catholic nativity scene, okay.
[30:46] And that makes sense.
[30:49] You can't have baby Jesus
[30:51] unless you have
[30:53] a mother, okay.
[30:57] But, if you said, why don't you put up a picture like that
[31:00] in your church and leave it there all year?
[31:05] You would have a fight on your hands.
[31:07] And isn't that strange?
[31:09] Isn't that strange?
[31:12] Okay.
[31:13] They understand there's a necessity there
[31:18] to talk about the birth of Jesus.
[31:21] His mother at least has to be
[31:23] literally in the picture,
[31:25] or in the nativity scene.
[31:27] But how can we speak about the birth
[31:30] of Christians?

[31:33] The church can be
[31:34] put aside,
[31:36] except when it seems to be
[31:37] necessary.
[31:39] And this again,
[31:40] this is something Catholics can also do.
[31:44] When Catholics use,
[31:45] let's talk about the church.
[31:48] Or they say, you know,
[31:49] the church is making us do this.
[31:51] What they really mean is
[31:52] somebody who works in some office
[31:55] in the diocese
[31:57] is making us do this.
[31:59] Or when they say the church teaches.
[32:02] What does that really mean?
[32:05] Does that mean this is the constant teaching of the church
[32:08] who is filled with the word and the Holy Spirit
[32:11] and so brings us to a new birth
[32:13] and produces new members of the body of Christ.
[32:15] Or does it mean
[32:17] something that got printed
[32:19] in losservatore romano last week
[32:21] because the undersecretary
[32:23] of the pontifical council for the stuff
[32:26] that we don't have other pontifical councils for,
[32:29] (laughter)
[32:30] had an idea
[32:32] and it got printed.
[32:34] I'm just saying.
[32:35] Okay.
[32:38] Baptism of course is a big part of this.
[32:41] And this is the obvious place
[32:43] where the church
[32:44] looks like Mary, the mother of Jesus.
[32:47] Most people will tell you
[32:50] to study these things.
[32:51] The first theological reflection
[32:54] about the virgin Mary
[32:57] that adds anything to what the New Testament
[33:00] says about her
[33:01] is the idea of Mary as
[33:02] the new Eve.
[33:04] We're comparing Mary to Eve.

[33:07] Justin Martyr,
[33:09] Eranus,
[33:10] Tertullian,
[33:11] and one of the things they'll tell you is
[33:15] Eve in the scripture
[33:17] was called the mother of all the living.
[33:18] But this is kind of strange
[33:20] because she's also involved in the responsibility
[33:23] for original sin,
[33:24] and that leads to people dying.
[33:26] And Tertullian ends up saying
[33:29] you know who the real mother of all the living is.
[33:31] It's the church.
[33:33] The true mother of all the living, says Tertullian,
[33:36] is the church.
[33:38] And here is how he does it.
[33:40] It's again through this idea of typology
[33:43] or prefigurement.
[33:44] If Adam
[33:47] prefigured Christ,
[33:50] and St. Paul says he does,
[33:52] then Adam falls asleep, right,
[33:56] and God does the surgery and takes
[33:59] his rib out that he builds up into a woman.
[34:02] The sleep of Adam prefigures
[34:04] the death of Christ.
[34:07] Christ falling asleep in death on the cross.
[34:10] And then,
[34:12] you have this rib being taken out of Adam's side,
[34:15] and then you have the side of Christ being pierced
[34:18] on the cross.
[34:19] And from the wound on his side,
[34:21] what comes out?
[34:23] Blood and water.
[34:26] And if you've ever been involved
[34:28] with babies being born,
[34:30] then he says,
[34:32] what is this?
[34:33] This is a prefigurement
[34:34] of the true mother of living,
[34:36] which is the church.
[34:37] Or you might say blood and water perhaps
[34:40] are, he's taking a sign of the sacrament.
[34:43] Sacraments of baptism and Eucharist,

[34:45] it's not quite clear.
[34:47] The church conceives,
[34:50] becomes pregnant,
[34:52] become fruitful,
[34:54] how?
[34:56] As Mary did in the enunciation
[34:58] by hearing and believing the word.
[35:02] Mary conceived by believing.
[35:05] In fact, Elizabeth praised her specifically for
[35:07] her faith.
[35:09] Blessed is she who believed.
[35:10] St. Ambrose again picks up on this
[35:13] in his commentary on Luke.
[35:16] On Luke, excuse me.
[35:18] Okay.
[35:19] And he say, it wasn't union with the man,
[35:21] that opened the secrets
[35:23] of the virginal woman, Mary.
[35:26] But it was the Holy Spirit
[35:27] that poured in an immaculate seed
[35:29] into her inviolable womb.
[35:32] But that holy one,
[35:33] Jesus,
[35:35] by whom the faithful directions
[35:37] of the divine law,
[35:38] ascribe the figure of the mystery to come
[35:40] and that he alone would open the secret birthplace
[35:43] of the holy virgin church
[35:45] to give birth to the peoples of God.
[35:48] This is a little dense, isn't it?
[35:49] Okay.
[35:52] What is he saying?
[35:53] Jesus opened the secret birthplace
[35:56] of the holy virgin church.
[35:58] He's saying Christ is the first born of many brothers.
[36:06] He's saying if we can't understand what it means
[36:08] to be born again
[36:10] until we look at the mystery
[36:12] of the birth of Christ himself.
[36:16] And so,
[36:17] the church is part of
[36:20] this plan.
[36:22] People say are you born again?
[36:23] How can you be born again

[36:25] if you do not have, to paraphrase,
[36:28] the church as your mother?
[36:32] Little bit about virginity.
[36:34] Virginity has meant different things
[36:38] in different cultures.
[36:39] Even today,
[36:41] if you go to different countries,
[36:43] the word virginity
[36:45] will have different meanings for people.
[36:47] It'll have a different role
[36:48] in the way societies are structured.
[36:50] Right now, in the United States,
[36:52] and in the awful, awful popular culture
[36:55] that we are marketing to the rest of the world,
[36:58] and I apologize,
[36:59] virginity is not seen as a positive.
[37:03] It's a failure.
[37:05] It's a neurosis.
[37:07] And in the United States,
[37:09] we have this very large man
[37:11] who plays American football,
[37:12] and his name is Tim Tebow.
[37:14] And people make fun of him
[37:16] because he's made it clear
[37:18] that he's going to remain a virgin
[37:19] until he's married.
[37:22] And they only make fun of him
[37:23] when he's not close to them,
[37:24] because he could snap their neck like a twig.
[37:26] But,
[37:27] but people don't see much value in virginity.
[37:29] There are two main things
[37:32] that it's going to mean
[37:34] in this writing from
[37:36] the patristic period.
[37:39] And one I remembered to write down
[37:41] and the other I didn't.
[37:42] The first one is fidelity,
[37:44] and St. Paul talks this way too.
[37:47] If you are a virgin,
[37:48] you are faithful to someone.
[37:50] So a virgin church is faithful to Christ
[37:52] and faithful to Christ's teaching.
[37:56] Were in the works of some writers,

[37:57] it's being faithful to the true Christian teaching
[38:00] that was handed down from the beginning
[38:01] and staying away from heresy
[38:03] or gnostic tricks
[38:05] and that sort of thing.
[38:07] What I forgot to write is
[38:09] virginity, and this is more important,
[38:12] is also a sign that what really matters
[38:14] in the life of the church
[38:17] is not what we the members of the church do,
[38:20] but something God does,
[38:23] something only God can do,
[38:24] something he does in and through us.
[38:27] And to understand this,
[38:29] we have to go back to the virgin Mary.
[38:32] How can she, how does she become pregnant?
[38:35] It's through God's initiative.
[38:38] That's the whole,
[38:40] what's behind the scene in Luke
[38:42] would be enunciation.
[38:44] The angel comes to her and says
[38:46] you are going to conceive and bear a son.
[38:48] And she says
[38:49] how can this be?
[38:50] It was not her idea.
[38:52] God is taking the initiative.
[38:54] God is going to do something in and through her
[38:57] that she couldn't do
[38:58] without God being involved.
[39:02] And that's the important meaning
[39:04] of the word virginity
[39:05] of the church.
[39:07] A virgin can't be fruitful.
[39:08] A virgin cannot be the mother
[39:10] unless God is at work in her.
[39:13] A virgin cannot give milk,
[39:15] going back to Clement,
[39:16] unless God is at work in her.
[39:19] And the church
[39:20] is not going to conceive
[39:22] and bear fruit
[39:25] until the church understands
[39:28] that it's the activity of God
[39:30] in and through us,

[39:32] all of us,
[39:34] all the members of the church,
[39:35] lay ordained, consecrated.
[39:37] That's going to make the church truly fruitful.
[39:41] That's going to make the church a faithful virgin.
[39:44] That's going to make the church a mother
[39:46] who not only gives birth to her children,
[39:48] but loves them and feeds them
[39:50] and takes care of them.
[39:52] Thank you.
[39:53] (applause)
[40:01] - Thank you very much Father Buffer.
[40:05] Your presentation, rich in church fathers,
[40:08] has already prompted some email responses
[40:11] that will be presented in the second hour.
[40:16] Next, we have Dr. Dennis Doyle.
[40:19] He received his doctorate
[40:22] in religious studies
[40:23] from the Catholic University of America
[40:26] in Washington D.C.
[40:28] He has taught at the University of Dayton
[40:30] for 18 years.
[40:33] His recent involvements
[40:35] include being director of publications
[40:37] for the College Theology Society,
[40:40] a planner and speaker
[40:43] of the Catholic Common Ground,
[40:46] a participant in the U.S. Methodist Catholic Dialogue,
[40:51] and a collaborator
[40:54] in at least one of our Marian Forums of the past
[41:00] here at the University of Dayton.
[41:03] And I am delighted to present
[41:05] Dr. Dennis Doyle.
[41:07] (applause)
[41:17] - Thank you.
[41:19] Thank you Dr. Dodd.
[41:20] I realize I have to update my
[41:23] webpage,
[41:25] cause after 31 years of teaching at the university,
[41:29] my webpage still says I've been teaching here 18 years.
[41:33] (laughter)
[41:34] I think maybe they're just counting
[41:35] the years that I was really
[41:37] teaching well.

[41:38] (laughter)
[41:40] 18 out of 31's not too bad, huh?
[41:43] I get a lot of great opportunities in life,
[41:48] and,
[41:50] I feel very privileged.
[41:52] This is one of those opportunities I,
[41:57] I get busy with things,
[41:58] I've got projects,
[41:59] I kind of just
[42:01] started to turn it down and then,
[42:03] I thought about the topic.
[42:05] And I thought about
[42:08] where do I teach,
[42:10] and what are the important things, and so,
[42:16] so I did say yes.
[42:18] I mean isn't that what Mary says is yes?
[42:22] And I told my wife about it,
[42:23] normally, might give me a hard time
[42:26] for taking on something else.
[42:27] And she immediately said,
[42:28] well you have to do that.
[42:30] You have to do that.
[42:31] (laughter)
[42:34] And I had filled out a survey
[42:36] where I said well perhaps a good topic for a talk would be
[42:39] how can you talk about the church
[42:41] without talking about Mary?
[42:43] And then,
[42:45] I got the
[42:46] particular topic when
[42:48] Father Rhoten and Dr. Dodd
[42:51] wrote to me
[42:52] and offered me a few possible titles and
[42:55] one of them was
[42:56] a more Marian church,
[42:58] what would that look like?
[42:59] And so, that's what I took on.
[43:01] And my,
[43:05] a lot of my ideas come from
[43:08] a study I've done over the past few years
[43:10] of the work of Otto Semmelroth
[43:13] without was a Jesuit
[43:14] at the council
[43:16] and he died in 79.

[43:19] But he was very involved
[43:21] in the drafting of several of the Vatican Two documents.
[43:24] And then he wrote a lot about
[43:26] his experience and what went on.
[43:28] And he had written in particular a book
[43:31] about Mary in 1950,
[43:33] Mary Archetype of the Church,
[43:35] and then another book,
[43:37] The Church of Sacrament,
[43:38] in 1953.
[43:40] And the book, The Church of Sacrament,
[43:43] was a direction setting book
[43:45] for Lumen Gentium.
[43:48] And,
[43:50] Semmelroth actually was
[43:52] connected somewhat with Rohner.
[43:54] Rohner was eight years his senior.
[43:59] But he roomed with Rohner at the council.
[44:02] You know, Rohner was kind of a leading figure
[44:05] and somebody who
[44:08] though I understand a very gracious man always,
[44:12] was somebody who could push the envelope on things,
[44:15] where Semmelroth was
[44:16] always remembered for
[44:17] just being balanced.
[44:19] Semmelroth
[44:20] wanted to listen seriously to the various voices
[44:23] and he wanted to get it right
[44:25] in a way that was balanced,
[44:27] and not as well known as Rohner.
[44:29] But I think somebody really,
[44:32] really worth studying.
[44:33] And,
[44:36] so,
[44:38] I did a bit of reading
[44:39] in some classic authors.
[44:43] I was reading a little
[44:44] other (inaudible) and so on.
[44:46] But what struck me
[44:48] was just in some web research
[44:50] finding that there are various
[44:52] web postings about what more Marian church would look like.
[44:55] And although in my footnotes,
[44:57] I only mention the one by Anthony Garacia,

[45:02] if I'm saying that right.
[45:03] I read several of these,
[45:06] and I thought that well gee,
[45:07] there's a lot of people out there
[45:08] who have these ideas about what
[45:11] a more Marian church would look like.
[45:12] And these are people
[45:13] who participate in Marianas communities.
[45:15] In a sense, I do,
[45:17] because I teach it at the University of Dayton,
[45:19] you know, Marianist University.
[45:21] But not in the same sense that these people do.
[45:24] And so I think that their testimony
[45:26] is very valuable,
[45:28] and so I thought well,
[45:32] let me reflect on,
[45:35] on something I know a bit about,
[45:37] Lumen Gentium and his composition
[45:39] and in particularly drawing upon
[45:40] Otto Semmelroth.
[45:42] And I was also joined upon by materials
[45:45] that I was developing for a class
[45:46] that I was teaching this semester.
[45:47] I teach a course called the Church,
[45:49] and I always redo it,
[45:50] so I can get another good year
[45:53] that I can list on my resume
[45:55] in teaching.
[45:57] And,
[45:59] the,
[46:01] one of the things that I had my students thinking about
[46:03] was how you can read Lumen Gentium
[46:05] with the main theme being
[46:08] universal call to holiness.
[46:09] And at this,
[46:10] this theme runs throughout the document.
[46:12] But another thing I did,
[46:15] was I had them consider
[46:16] the famous critique
[46:18] of an earlier draft
[46:20] of the document on the church,
[46:22] the critique by Bishop Emile Deschmidt,
[46:24] where said well this draft is,
[46:27] is clericalistic

[46:30] and triumphalistic
[46:31] and juridical.
[46:33] And that really became a rallying cry.
[46:36] And,
[46:37] as to how would this be revised.
[46:41] And I think that the revisions
[46:43] by Vatican Two,
[46:44] some people are
[46:46] inclined to think that well,
[46:48] there was a minority position
[46:50] which was traditionalist
[46:52] and there was a majority position
[46:53] which was progressive and wanted changes.
[46:56] And the majority won out.
[46:58] But in retrospect,
[47:00] and I mean that's true,
[47:02] may be true to the experience of the time,
[47:04] but in retrospect,
[47:05] some of the biggest points of tension today
[47:09] were already starting to develop
[47:12] among people who represented
[47:14] what you would call majority view.
[47:16] And those who were progressives
[47:18] included people
[47:20] who would go on to
[47:22] be the ones who would write for the journal,
[47:26] Conchilian,
[47:27] and be the progressives
[47:28] that pushed the envelope.
[47:30] But also the people who would go on to found
[47:32] the journal, Communio,
[47:33] which is much more conservative
[47:35] and stands as kind of a counterpoint
[47:38] to Conchilian.
[47:40] They too,
[47:41] they were not traditionalists.
[47:42] They were part of the majority.
[47:43] They wanted changes at Vatican Two,
[47:44] and after the council,
[47:47] when,
[47:49] when some of these polarities developed,
[47:51] it was among people who really were
[47:54] on the same committees
[47:56] and had a lot of agreement at the time.

[47:58] And so that's one of the things I like
[48:00] about the work
[48:01] of Otto Semmelroth,
[48:02] because he's somebody
[48:04] who takes our range of concerns very seriously.
[48:08] And he's somebody who maybe,
[48:09] he was associated with the majority position,
[48:13] not the minority.
[48:15] But in so far as that
[48:17] majority would have splits in it develop,
[48:19] I think Semmelroth is recently a figure
[48:20] who
[48:23] spans a broad range of concerns.
[48:26] And,
[48:29] and that's how I see
[48:31] the incorporation of the chapter on Mary
[48:33] in Lumen Gentium.
[48:37] Originally, there was an appendix to
[48:39] the early document on the church
[48:43] that then got separated
[48:45] and it was voted on whether they would
[48:48] release this as it's own document.
[48:51] And that proposal lost.
[48:54] It lost fairly narrowly.
[48:56] And it really wasn't until 1963,
[48:59] so you're at the
[49:02] next to the last draft,
[49:04] that the decision is made to incorporate this chapter
[49:07] into Lumen Gentium.
[49:09] And in my view,
[49:11] I think that they did a very balanced way.
[49:13] I think they really were aware of this,
[49:16] the maximalist versus the minimalist
[49:18] and they tried to do it
[49:20] in a way that,
[49:22] that people could read
[49:25] recently, attention to their own
[49:28] positions and concerns in it.
[49:30] Now, of course,
[49:32] after the council,
[49:33] there's a big change in catholic culture.
[49:36] How much did it have to do with Lumen Gentium?
[49:39] I'm inclined to think that
[49:41] it had to do with a lot of factors.

[49:44] And maybe Lumen Gentium's one,
[49:46] one causal thing.
[49:49] But really, I think maybe more Lumen Gentium reflects
[49:51] a certain point in time
[49:54] and a certain point in the history of the church.
[49:57] And that,
[49:59] many of the things that happened at the council
[50:02] I think were going to happen
[50:04] with or without Lumen Gentium.
[50:05] Really the biggest thing being,
[50:08] the collapse of the Catholic subculture
[50:11] and that
[50:14] Lumen Gentium
[50:15] has positions that I think are very balanced,
[50:18] but that
[50:19] they're also capable of being
[50:21] co opted by
[50:23] one side or another side
[50:25] and so on.
[50:27] So,
[50:31] in my paper,
[50:33] I thought well,
[50:37] let me try to rely on the work of Semmelroth
[50:40] and let me use these categories from
[50:43] Emile Deschmidt
[50:45] and think about how did that chapter on Mary
[50:48] get incorporated
[50:50] into Lumen Gentium
[50:52] and what was going on in the overall document
[50:55] a the time?
[50:57] And so, for that,
[50:59] I highlighted three themes
[51:01] which you all know, I think,
[51:04] and you could almost make a little grid
[51:07] out of my paper.
[51:09] And I guess that has advantages and disadvantages.
[51:12] I love Cardinal Avery Dulles
[51:15] and his work was very influential to me.
[51:17] And most things that he wrote,
[51:20] if you got to the end,
[51:21] you could make a little grid
[51:23] and you could fill in what he had.
[51:25] And you can do that with mine.
[51:26] So you got the clericalism

[51:28] and the triumphalism
[51:29] and the juridicism
[51:30] named by Bishop Deschmidt.
[51:32] But then you have these three themes,
[51:34] the universal call to holiness,
[51:36] which as I say,
[51:38] really you could read that as,
[51:40] as the key theme
[51:42] in the final draft of Lumen Gentium.
[51:45] What's it all about?
[51:48] Well it's all about Christian discipleship
[51:51] and how do you follow Christ?
[51:54] Well, you follow Christ by being a loving person.
[51:59] And how do you love?
[52:01] Well, you love by following Christ
[52:04] in seeking out the world Father,
[52:06] and listening to the promptings of the Spirit.
[52:10] And the universal call to holiness,
[52:11] something very characteristic of it
[52:13] is that it's inclusive,
[52:15] that it's everybody in the church
[52:17] experiences this.
[52:19] It's called holiness.
[52:21] And then you think about Mary
[52:23] and a church that's more Marian.
[52:26] Mary is the one who says yes to God.
[52:29] And that she's both a model for us
[52:33] and one who is like us.
[52:39] And in the second theme that I tried to play out
[52:42] was this notion that church
[52:43] as eschatological.
[52:47] The church is on a journey.
[52:48] It's not finished yet.
[52:50] That we in the earthly church need to be humble.
[52:54] And,
[52:56] that,
[53:00] we're on this side of the,
[53:04] of the,
[53:05] of the line that would divide the earthly church
[53:08] and the heavenly church.
[53:09] But these two go together
[53:10] to make up the communion of saints.
[53:12] And, the question of these chapters in Lumen Gentium
[53:16] was all very deliberate,

[53:17] that the call to holiness is the fifth chapter.
[53:20] I think it's a very central,
[53:22] and it sets up this dynamic
[53:25] that then looks at
[53:27] those who take religious vows as
[53:29] answering an exceptional call
[53:32] to holiness,
[53:34] which is then as it were somewhat
[53:37] distinct from the universal call.
[53:39] They have an exceptional call,
[53:41] take vows of poverty, chastity and obedience.
[53:43] But then looking at the saints,
[53:44] you know, chapter seven,
[53:46] eschatological chapter is about the saints,
[53:48] and then Mary.
[53:50] And so Mary being linked with this chapter on the saints,
[53:55] and so, you know,
[53:57] there are those who want to
[53:58] emphasize Mary's privileges
[54:00] and how she is distinct,
[54:02] and those who wanted to emphasize Mary
[54:05] as a Saint who is
[54:07] like us,
[54:09] and
[54:10] Lumen Gentium,
[54:12] I think made an honest attempt
[54:14] to do both of those things.
[54:15] That those things are not contradictory.
[54:17] And it's not contradictory to say that
[54:19] the church itself
[54:20] has it's pilgrim dimension
[54:22] and it's heavenly church dimension.
[54:23] And it's not contradictory
[54:25] to see in Mary one
[54:26] who lived as a pilgrim without sin,
[54:28] lived as a pilgrim among us,
[54:30] and who is part of this heavenly church.
[54:40] And then, finally, the theme of the church as a sacrament,
[54:41] which as I said,
[54:43] one of Semmelroth's big book is called
[54:46] (speaking foreign language)
[54:49] The Church as the Original Sacrament.
[54:52] And there's a lot of debate about this in the council,
[54:56] but not only does it become a key theme

[54:58] of Lumen Gentium by stating it
[55:00] in the first paragraph,
[55:01] but it's a theme that carries through
[55:04] Lumen Gentium in many, many ways.
[55:06] There are all kinds of relationships
[55:08] within the document
[55:09] that one could recognize as sacramental.
[55:11] And one of those is
[55:13] in chapter seven
[55:15] that the relationship between the heavenly church
[55:18] and the pilgrim church
[55:19] is the sacramental one.
[55:20] And I love that line
[55:22] from Semmelroth,
[55:24] I hope I get it right where he says that,
[55:26] that the heavenly church is present in the pilgrim church,
[55:30] not in the way,
[55:31] simply in the way that we call
[55:34] the train from Hamburg to Munich.
[55:37] We would call it the Munich train,
[55:39] but it doesn't have anything of Munich in it,
[55:41] unless they got a lot of pretzels and beer maybe.
[55:43] (laughter)
[55:46] But in a much more integral sense,
[55:48] the,
[55:52] the pilgrim church carries within it already
[55:54] the heavenly church.
[55:57] And the heavenly church is there
[55:59] as a shaping factor,
[56:00] as part of it,
[56:02] and so that we are able to
[56:04] celebrate the liturgy
[56:06] in the presence of the full communion of saints
[56:09] and that,
[56:11] in the presence of heavenly hosts.
[56:12] And so,
[56:16] whereas with the first theme I came out with,
[56:18] well the church has to be inclusive.
[56:20] It's the universal call to holiness.
[56:22] But the second theme,
[56:24] the church needs to be humble.
[56:25] And with this third theme of sacrament,
[56:29] the church is relational.
[56:32] The church is more than just an institution.

[56:38] And you know, today we experience many polarities
[56:41] and I think if we look to Semmelroth,
[56:44] I think we could have
[56:48] a view of the Vatican Two documents
[56:50] that
[56:52] can see that in it's origins
[56:54] it really
[56:56] didn't mean to cause a split.
[56:58] It really meant to be a place where
[57:01] okay, different points of view are represented,
[57:04] but,
[57:05] that something that would hold us together.
[57:06] And I just,
[57:09] let me see how we're doing with time here.
[57:10] I'm still fine, yeah.
[57:14] My children are kind of like the health police.
[57:19] I have to wear this Fit Bit everywhere.
[57:21] It's like an ankle brace or something.
[57:23] And so anytime I want to see what time it is,
[57:25] I have to either
[57:27] move my arm in a certain way,
[57:28] or I have to press a button.
[57:30] So,
[57:31] the,
[57:35] but I did want to say that
[57:37] I think with Father Buffer's paper,
[57:39] that there are a couple points of overlap
[57:41] with what we're doing.
[57:43] One being to see the church as relational,
[57:48] not just as an institution,
[57:49] but something that has to do with personal relationships.
[57:52] And Father Buffer spelling it out very clearly
[57:56] in terms of
[57:58] motherhood
[57:59] and the way one relates to
[58:02] their mother.
[58:03] And a second theme I think where we had some overlap
[58:06] was in that
[58:09] Mary, our devotion to Mary
[58:11] doesn't just have to do with
[58:13] privileges.
[58:14] But her privileges, it does have to do with that,
[58:16] but it doesn't just have to do with that.
[58:17] It also has to do

[58:19] with
[58:21] what does that mean about us?
[58:22] What does that mean for everyone
[58:24] who is Christian,
[58:25] about how do we answer the universal call to holiness?
[58:28] And,
[58:35] so,
[58:37] I do have some questions lined up here.
[58:39] And I don't know if I should dive into them,
[58:41] or if,
[58:42] okay.
[58:45] So thank you.
[58:50] From Australia,
[58:53] where it is the middle of the night, I'm told.
[58:56] We have a question from
[59:00] Debra Newbery,
[59:02] having read professor Doyle's presentation,
[59:06] the idea being transfigured by grace
[59:08] into the immaculate one,
[59:09] the spouse of the Holy Spirit,
[59:12] through Mary and consecration,
[59:14] what seemed to be a way for those in the church
[59:16] to reach this level of love,
[59:18] rather like St. Theresa
[59:19] (inaudible) elevator.
[59:21] Would professor Doyle care to comment on this?
[59:25] And so, this idea that well,
[59:27] how do we get to be this more Marian church?
[59:30] So, I would say that my paper was
[59:32] really kind of speculative
[59:34] in a way,
[59:37] not so practical.
[59:38] It was about
[59:39] well what would this more Marian church look like?
[59:44] This is a question really about
[59:46] well how do we get there?
[59:48] And so, what role
[59:50] would Marian consecration plan this?
[59:57] Let me say first of all,
[59:58] hopefully, this conversation goes on.
[1:00:00] People will have things to say about this
[1:00:03] beyond what I can testify to personally.
[1:00:05] But, yeah, as someone who has worked
[1:00:12] for all these years at a Marian university,

[1:00:14] among all these Marianists,
[1:00:16] that I think this is a very important thing.
[1:00:20] And I see the love for Mary
[1:00:22] in the Marianists,
[1:00:23] and I see it played out in very,
[1:00:25] very concrete and specific ways.
[1:00:28] And so,
[1:00:31] I say from the bottom of my heart,
[1:00:33] yes, of course Marian concentration
[1:00:34] would play an important role
[1:00:36] in getting us there.
[1:00:39] Though also, I think if I were to say no to this question,
[1:00:41] I probably would be carried out of here in handcuffs
[1:00:44] considering where I am.
[1:00:45] (laughter)
[1:00:47] And,
[1:00:49] the,
[1:00:51] but I would say too,
[1:00:52] that I think that
[1:00:55] the concerns of Vatican Two,
[1:00:57] and some of the concerns expressed by Pope Francis say
[1:00:59] on the one hand, yeah,
[1:01:02] popular devotion is so important
[1:01:03] and none of us should somehow stand above that.
[1:01:12] At the same time,
[1:01:13] popular devotion is capable of,
[1:01:14] of being in need of correction at times.
[1:01:18] And so, you know, if there are Marian groups
[1:01:23] that are,
[1:01:26] and of course, you can be consecrated as an individual,
[1:01:28] you can belong to a group,
[1:01:29] you can have it as a religious order.
[1:01:31] There are various paths to Marian consecration.
[1:01:34] Let's say you're with a Marian group
[1:01:36] and maybe that group is triumphalistic,
[1:01:40] or maybe that group is,
[1:01:47] well not so humble or something.
[1:01:49] Or maybe that group is into
[1:01:51] the weirdest prophecies you ever saw in your life.
[1:01:54] I think Marian consecration is a very wonderful thing,
[1:01:58] and I don't know that
[1:02:00] by itself,
[1:02:02] you know, it needs other kind of factors too.
[1:02:04] It would still need to be humble and relational

[1:02:07] and inclusive.
[1:02:13] So yes, yes, I think that is a way.
[1:02:14] And I think that
[1:02:16] the call to holiness is universal.
[1:02:17] I think the call to belong to a religious order
[1:02:20] is exceptional.
[1:02:22] And
[1:02:24] we used to be in a church where
[1:02:26] the call to a special relationship with Mary
[1:02:28] was virtually universal
[1:02:30] and that culture changed from the church.
[1:02:32] I think today,
[1:02:35] we experience it as exceptional.
[1:02:37] Sure, I'd like to see
[1:02:39] a lot more of it.
[1:02:41] There's a lot of Catholics who
[1:02:42] I think would need a lot of pre-evangelization
[1:02:44] before you got them to that point.
[1:02:51] I have another question.
[1:02:52] Some colleagues of mine
[1:02:58] says Robert
[1:02:58] S-T-G,
[1:03:00] some colleagues of mine maintain
[1:03:01] that Vatican Two's decision
[1:03:02] to integrate the Marian schema
[1:03:04] into the constitution of the church
[1:03:05] represents a dramatic change in Catholic Mariology.
[1:03:07] What are your thoughts on this matter?
[1:03:10] Well,
[1:03:12] I think, you know,
[1:03:14] from a certain point of view,
[1:03:15] that's undeniable.
[1:03:16] And particularly, if one
[1:03:17] were
[1:03:19] a maximalist before the council,
[1:03:20] one would see this is a dramatic change.
[1:03:22] Some I think are inclined to read the change
[1:03:26] as being from maximalism
[1:03:28] to minimalism,
[1:03:30] and I don't think you can find that
[1:03:31] in the council itself or in the documents.
[1:03:33] I think what you find is an honest attempt at balance.
[1:03:35] But what happens in Catholic culture
[1:03:37] may represent

[1:03:39] that kind of shift
[1:03:41] from maximalism to minimalism,
[1:03:43] particularly in the decade
[1:03:45] following the council.
[1:03:49] But yeah, yeah,
[1:03:50] there is a dramatic change represented
[1:03:52] what was intension,
[1:03:53] what was intended was a balance.
[1:03:55] And what happened may have been something else.
[1:03:58] And,
[1:04:01] Brother Bernard Hein from Vietnam,
[1:04:04] I apologize if I don't get your name pronounced correctly,
[1:04:08] says according to Dr. Dennis,
[1:04:10] in Lumen Gentium,
[1:04:12] we can know what the church is.
[1:04:14] In my opinion, to understand what the church is,
[1:04:17] we should pay attention
[1:04:18] to Gaudium et spes.
[1:04:20] And I would say,
[1:04:21] oh no, forget about Gaudium et spes.
[1:04:22] I'm just kidding, just kidding.
[1:04:25] (laughter)
[1:04:26] Yeah, I couldn't agree more.
[1:04:27] I mean I wrote a book
[1:04:29] about Vatican Two,
[1:04:30] and it's based on two documents.
[1:04:32] It's based on Lumen Gentium,
[1:04:33] and Gaudium et spes,
[1:04:34] and I am really of the opinion
[1:04:35] that if you want to know what Lumen Gentium
[1:04:38] says about the church, well,
[1:04:39] really there's 16 documents
[1:04:41] you need to pay attention to,
[1:04:42] but above all,
[1:04:43] regarding the church,
[1:04:44] it's those two together.
[1:04:45] And so I was only thinking in terms of
[1:04:47] the study I've done of Lumen Gentium
[1:04:49] of late,
[1:04:50] and I don't know if Father Semmelroth
[1:04:53] and,
[1:04:55] and how in class, it's a starting point for me.
[1:04:58] But I can't teach that course without
[1:05:00] also talking about the church in relation to the world

[1:05:02] and the church in relation to its social teaching,
[1:05:05] and yeah, Gaudium et spes,
[1:05:08] I think,
[1:05:09] I think you're dead on.
[1:05:11] I mean I wouldn't want Gaudium et spes
[1:05:12] without Lumen Gentium.
[1:05:13] But I wouldn't want Lumen Gentium without Gaudium et spes.
[1:05:16] And I really appreciate the question.
[1:05:22] And there's a question also from,
[1:05:24] from bother Wang.
[1:05:33] Whether the mission of the church
[1:05:34] will be shown and done better
[1:05:35] if the role of our blessed mother
[1:05:37] is clarified better,
[1:05:39] even to a confirmation,
[1:05:40] the title, co-Redemptrix.
[1:05:42] Well you know,
[1:05:45] to me it's interesting that
[1:05:50] Otto Semmelroth in his book on Mary
[1:05:52] was one of the early proposals
[1:05:55] of the title,
[1:05:57] Co-Redemptrix.
[1:05:59] By the time he wrote the book,
[1:06:00] the Church of Sacrament,
[1:06:02] he didn't want that title
[1:06:03] for Mary at that time.
[1:06:08] And,
[1:06:10] he,
[1:06:11] he himself read it as an affirmation
[1:06:13] of Mary's role
[1:06:15] in the,
[1:06:17] in the whole story of salvation.
[1:06:19] And that I think there's a way of reading
[1:06:23] Co-Redemptrix
[1:06:24] where it's,
[1:06:27] it's a very appropriate title
[1:06:28] and has a lot of implications
[1:06:29] for all Christians.
[1:06:31] But Co-Redemptrix
[1:06:34] is read by
[1:06:36] those who oppose it
[1:06:39] as being part of this,
[1:06:41] of this world in which
[1:06:44] Marian devotionists perceived as,

[1:06:46] as putting himself in the,
[1:06:48] being put in a place of
[1:06:50] devotion to Christ and so on.
[1:06:52] I mean for me,
[1:06:53] I just think like,
[1:06:55] in terms of the ecclesial culture,
[1:06:57] to make that declaration right now,
[1:07:00] I don't think would be good idea,
[1:07:02] in my opinion.
[1:07:07] And then, I have a question here
[1:07:09] about, from Dr. Gloria Dodd,
[1:07:10] that some people think that a more Marian church
[1:07:13] would have women priests,
[1:07:15] however since Mary's a laywoman
[1:07:16] who is not ordained,
[1:07:17] wouldn't a more Marian church
[1:07:19] be more lay than clerical?
[1:07:21] I always like to avoid this question.
[1:07:23] (laughter)
[1:07:25] And so,
[1:07:26] I will say that
[1:07:27] hopefully we'll have a nice
[1:07:28] conversation for an hour,
[1:07:29] when I'm done and people can say what they think.
[1:07:32] And then, also perhaps the decrease in numbers
[1:07:34] of ordained clergy since
[1:07:36] the second Vatican council
[1:07:37] is perhaps a providential reshaping
[1:07:38] of the church
[1:07:40] in a more Marian, than its lay form.
[1:07:42] But many of the lady
[1:07:44] have not been formed in Mariology,
[1:07:45] nor have been Marian devotion.
[1:07:47] What difference do you think
[1:07:49] good Mariology and or Marian devotion makes
[1:07:50] in the lady
[1:07:52] who are being called to fulfill their role
[1:07:54] of permeating the civil society with Christianity?
[1:07:56] Well,
[1:08:01] as I said about
[1:08:02] is Marian consecration
[1:08:04] something that would lead to this more Marian church?
[1:08:07] I think
[1:08:09] that

[1:08:10] an increase in Marian devotion
[1:08:11] it is,
[1:08:13] it is a very positive thing.
[1:08:15] You know,
[1:08:16] I don't want to see it to be some kind of like
[1:08:19] restorationist
[1:08:21] attempt of oh, the church was so much better before
[1:08:23] and now we've ruined it.
[1:08:25] I don't buy that perspective.
[1:08:27] But in so far as
[1:08:28] a healthy Marian devotionist cultivated,
[1:08:30] I think,
[1:08:32] and this is something I see in the Marianists here
[1:08:33] at the University of Dayton,
[1:08:35] many Marianists who would testify that
[1:08:37] Vatican Two, the event was a liberating experience for them,
[1:08:41] and they were devoted to Mary before,
[1:08:44] and they're devoted to Mary now.
[1:08:45] And I think in that spirit,
[1:08:47] I'm certainly all for it,
[1:08:51] and I hope I can say that
[1:08:52] truthfully and humbly from my heart.
[1:08:56] So thank you, thank you very much.
[1:08:58] (applause)
[1:09:04] (group chatter)
[1:09:09] - I just wanted to
[1:09:10] address two questions that seem to be
[1:09:13] a little bit more connected
[1:09:14] to some of the ideas
[1:09:15] that were in my presentation.
[1:09:18] And the first one is also from
[1:09:20] Debra Newbery, OFS,
[1:09:22] so a member of the Franciscan family.
[1:09:24] And I hope you're still awake,
[1:09:28] had a second cup of tea or something.
[1:09:30] And she writes after reading Father Buffer's presentation,
[1:09:35] the term *virgo facta ecclesia*,
[1:09:38] virgin made church,
[1:09:40] from the salute to the virgin
[1:09:42] by St. Francis of Assisi comes to mind.
[1:09:46] The book (speaking foreign language)
[1:09:49] refers to the church becoming
[1:09:51] an extension of
[1:09:52] the Immaculate,

[1:09:54] without spot or wrinkle.
[1:09:56] The reference is to Ephesians five, 27.
[1:09:58] Thus verifying St. Francis' title
[1:10:02] of the virgin made church,
[1:10:04] I wonder would Father Thomas care to comment
[1:10:07] on this view of Mary and the church?
[1:10:09] Yes I would.
[1:10:10] Well, what's,
[1:10:13] you can't help but notice
[1:10:15] the correspondence,
[1:10:18] coincidence
[1:10:19] between St. Francis calling Mary herself,
[1:10:22] greeting her as the virgin made church,
[1:10:25] and the many, many, many
[1:10:27] patristic references
[1:10:29] where Mary is compared to the church,
[1:10:32] or they're referred to by the same title.
[1:10:35] They're both called virgin and mother,
[1:10:37] or something like that.
[1:10:39] But, there are about,
[1:10:41] in the world, there are about
[1:10:43] 19,000 people who know more about
[1:10:44] St. Francis' Mariology
[1:10:46] than I do,
[1:10:48] but I don't know all of them,
[1:10:50] but I consulted just a few of their books,
[1:10:51] because this is a really good question,
[1:10:53] and it made me do a little more research.
[1:10:55] And it looks like
[1:10:58] St. Francis, when he came up with this title,
[1:11:00] the virgin made church,
[1:11:02] that that did not come from
[1:11:04] St. Francis being exposed to
[1:11:06] or studying patristic writings
[1:11:09] about the church or about Mary and the church.
[1:11:12] But it came specifically
[1:11:15] from his experience
[1:11:16] praying in front of the crucifix
[1:11:19] and the Church of San Damiano.
[1:11:22] And I'd imagine lots of you
[1:11:23] have seen pictures
[1:11:24] of this crucifix
[1:11:26] which is still preserved in Assisi to this day.
[1:11:29] And you know he was praying in front of that crucifix

[1:11:33] when he heard the Lord telling him
[1:11:34] Francis,
[1:11:35] rebuild my church.
[1:11:36] Which as you can see,
[1:11:38] is falling down.
[1:11:39] And that changed his life.
[1:11:41] But, Francis did not formally
[1:11:45] study theology,
[1:11:46] but he's a saint.
[1:11:48] And so he gets to be a theologian
[1:11:50] anyway, you see.
[1:11:52] (laughter)
[1:11:53] Well, it's true,
[1:11:55] because all the saints have something to teach us.
[1:11:57] So he's a doctor,
[1:11:58] isn't he?
[1:12:04] And the
[1:12:05] crucifix in San Damiano
[1:12:07] was really kind of an icon,
[1:12:10] and it's based on the scene of the crucifixion
[1:12:13] and the gospel
[1:12:14] of John.
[1:12:17] And so he's not just praying in front of any crucifix,
[1:12:20] he's meditating on the scene of the crucifixion
[1:12:23] specifically as it is described in the gospel of John.
[1:12:28] And we probably know,
[1:12:30] in the gospel of John,
[1:12:31] Mary is never called Mary.
[1:12:33] She is given a title,
[1:12:36] two titles,
[1:12:37] she's called the mother of Jesus,
[1:12:39] and she is called woman.
[1:12:43] When Jesus speaks to her at the wedding feast,
[1:12:45] he calls her a woman.
[1:12:47] And looking down at her and the beloved disciple
[1:12:50] from the cross he calls her again woman.
[1:12:54] And it looks like according to people
[1:12:57] who have specifically studied St. Francis
[1:13:00] and his Marian statements,
[1:13:01] that's where the idea came from.
[1:13:04] So he came up with pretty much the same idea
[1:13:07] that you find in some of these patristic writers I mentioned
[1:13:11] but he came up with it
[1:13:12] by reflecting on

[1:13:14] the Saint John's gospel,
[1:13:17] and specifically the crucifixion.
[1:13:19] Now Debra,
[1:13:21] you are quoting from this book,
[1:13:22] (speaking foreign language)
[1:13:25] and that book is,
[1:13:26] it's written by
[1:13:28] various authors,
[1:13:30] and it's about the life of St. Maximilian Mary Kolbe
[1:13:33] and it's also about his theological thinking
[1:13:36] and his pastoral activity.
[1:13:38] And there are a couple chapters in it
[1:13:40] specifically about his Mariology.
[1:13:43] And you are pretty much quoting
[1:13:45] from the part of the book
[1:13:46] that was written by Father Peter Damien Felner.
[1:13:49] Okay,
[1:13:51] and I just think it's important to point out
[1:13:53] very quickly that
[1:13:56] Kolbe's idea,
[1:13:59] Kolbe's Mariology
[1:14:02] is not the kind of Mariology that really would have happened
[1:14:05] or indeed been possible in the patristic era,
[1:14:09] and that's not any kind of critique of it.
[1:14:12] It's just a very different kind of theological approach.
[1:14:16] It's a kind of theology that could not have happened
[1:14:19] before what we call
[1:14:21] the scholastic period.
[1:14:24] And Felner has a very nice commentary though
[1:14:27] on this.
[1:14:28] He says, Francis understood that the church needed to be
[1:14:31] rebuilt, but how?
[1:14:33] And first, he thought maybe it's just
[1:14:36] the specific, physical building,
[1:14:38] and I need to clean it up
[1:14:39] and put some new mortar in the walls.
[1:14:41] And then very quickly,
[1:14:43] he understood the spiritual aspects
[1:14:45] of the life the church needed to be rebuilt,
[1:14:47] to become more and more
[1:14:49] what St. Paul says
[1:14:51] the church is going to be in her perfection,
[1:14:54] the bride of Christ,
[1:14:56] without spot or wrinkle, okay.

[1:14:57] But, in the patristic era,
[1:15:01] for what it's worth,
[1:15:02] when you have,
[1:15:04] when they talk about the church as
[1:15:06] bride,
[1:15:07] or when they talk about the bride of Christ,
[1:15:09] that's speaking about
[1:15:11] the church.
[1:15:12] And it's very different from what you find
[1:15:14] in some Franciscan theology,
[1:15:17] the idea of Mary as spouse
[1:15:19] of the Holy Spirit.
[1:15:21] So it's interesting,
[1:15:23] they're very, very different Mariologies,
[1:15:25] very different approaches,
[1:15:26] but you have this nice
[1:15:27] coming together
[1:15:29] and Francis' title,
[1:15:30] (speaking foreign language)
[1:15:33] the virgin made the church.
[1:15:34] And then response to Dr. Dodd's question,
[1:15:37] if Mary is not ordained,
[1:15:41] then wouldn't the Marian,
[1:15:42] a more Marian church
[1:15:44] have quantitatively
[1:15:46] fewer priests in it?
[1:15:48] Well, Dr. Dodd,
[1:15:49] if that's the goal,
[1:15:50] we're well on the way.
[1:15:52] (chuckles)
[1:15:53] At least locally,
[1:15:55] but I would just turn it around, okay.
[1:15:59] Because I think we have to be careful,
[1:16:01] because what if I ask this question.
[1:16:02] What if I said, well,
[1:16:04] Jesus of Nazareth
[1:16:06] was
[1:16:08] a male,
[1:16:11] and we should all be more Christian to each other,
[1:16:14] so the church should have fewer women in it.
[1:16:16] Isn't that right?
[1:16:18] Everyone should say no.
[1:16:19] That's not right.
[1:16:21] And,

[1:16:23] by the same token,
[1:16:25] Mary was not ordained.
[1:16:29] She didn't have the same
[1:16:30] mission in the church
[1:16:32] that say the apostles did
[1:16:34] that they received on the day of Pentecost,
[1:16:36] even though it appears she was in the same room.
[1:16:38] But she had a very different mission.
[1:16:41] So does that mean for the church to be more Marian,
[1:16:44] we should have more lay,
[1:16:48] and fewer priests?
[1:16:49] No, for the same reason
[1:16:50] that for the church to be more Christian,
[1:16:52] we shouldn't have a higher number of males than females,
[1:16:56] or vice versa.
[1:16:58] Okay.
[1:16:59] But what makes us Marian
[1:17:02] is not whether we are lay or ordained,
[1:17:05] or either whether we are male or female,
[1:17:08] but whether we are receptive
[1:17:10] to the word.
[1:17:12] Whether we are obedient.
[1:17:14] Whether we cooperate
[1:17:16] with God's plan of salvation.
[1:17:19] And whether our lives bear fruit.
[1:17:21] So I'd put it that way.
[1:17:24] (group chatter)
[1:17:38] - Okay,
[1:17:39] thank you very much,
[1:17:41] both of you.
[1:17:42] We are also going to take some of the questions by chat,
[1:17:45] and we're been happy to be
[1:17:48] getting those in.
[1:17:49] Paul has been compiling them.
[1:17:51] So if Paul could read for us
[1:17:53] the first
[1:17:55] question.
[1:17:56] Did you want to come to the mic.
[1:17:58] - [Paul] I'll just shout.
[1:17:59] Okay, so the first question is from Danielle Peters
[1:18:03] and she asks,
[1:18:06] Clement can connect Mary and the church
[1:18:08] because he understands our rebirth and baptism
[1:18:11] in parallel to the birth of Christ from Mary.

[1:18:14] What can be done in catechesis
[1:18:18] to bring Mary to the baptismal font?
[1:18:20] I think this is for you.
[1:18:24] (laughter)
[1:18:26] - Hi sister Danielle.
[1:18:27] What can be done in catechesis
[1:18:29] to bring Mary to the baptismal font?
[1:18:32] Boy.
[1:18:33] You know, I'm thinking back,
[1:18:38] just thinking about,
[1:18:39] I celebrate baptisms, right.
[1:18:42] And if you look at
[1:18:46] the rite of baptism for children,
[1:18:49] let's just take a look at that.
[1:18:50] That was extensively revised,
[1:18:52] totally rewritten after the council.
[1:18:54] One of the things they wanted to do
[1:18:56] was they wanted to put more scripture into it.
[1:18:59] They wanted script,
[1:19:00] they wanted the word of God
[1:19:02] to be apart of the celebration of the sacrament.
[1:19:05] That was something that was called for
[1:19:07] by the fathers of the second Vatican council.
[1:19:09] But they tend to
[1:19:11] repeat certain scriptural ideas
[1:19:14] again and again and again.
[1:19:17] And if you--
[1:19:19] And you notice this when you do a lot of baptisms
[1:19:23] and they keep talking about being born again
[1:19:26] by water and the Spirit.
[1:19:28] But if you look at the prayer for the blessing
[1:19:30] of water,
[1:19:31] it just talks about all the places where water occurs
[1:19:33] and salvation history,
[1:19:36] you know, from the very dawn of creation
[1:19:38] to the crossing of the Red Sea,
[1:19:39] and Christ being baptized in the Jordan.
[1:19:41] But, and then they give you
[1:19:44] scripture passages that you could read
[1:19:46] during the celebration of baptism
[1:19:48] outside of mass.
[1:19:49] And none of those had any Marian
[1:19:52] profiles.
[1:19:54] It was very interesting.

[1:19:56] And also, in the rite of baptism itself,
[1:19:58] there's not a lot of overt language.
[1:20:01] Now someone's looking it up right now,
[1:20:04] someone in Indonesia.
[1:20:06] There's not a lot of overt language about
[1:20:08] how we understand the church.
[1:20:11] So, having ruled that part out,
[1:20:13] let me come up with an idea.
[1:20:17] Most, if not all of the ancient baptismal creeds
[1:20:20] mention the church toward the end.
[1:20:23] And this is something that we're familiar with
[1:20:25] in both the apostles creed
[1:20:27] and in the longer Nicene Constantinople creed
[1:20:32] that we say at mass most Sundays.
[1:20:36] And the interesting thing is
[1:20:37] the conjunction of the mention of
[1:20:40] the leaf in the Holy Spirit
[1:20:42] with belief in the church.
[1:20:44] And what are you really saying there?
[1:20:47] You say I believe that
[1:20:48] the Holy Spirit is sanctifying the church.
[1:20:51] Or I believe that the Holy Spirit is sanctifying
[1:20:54] the world through
[1:20:56] what the church does.
[1:20:58] So there could be your jumping off point
[1:21:01] to connect baptism
[1:21:04] and Mary.
[1:21:06] Okay, because
[1:21:07] the Holy Spirit overshadowing
[1:21:09] the womb of Mary
[1:21:11] and making it fruitful.
[1:21:13] The invocation of
[1:21:15] the Holy Spirit
[1:21:16] over the waters of baptism.
[1:21:17] The Spirit hovering over the waters
[1:21:19] at the dawn of creation,
[1:21:21] and so forth.
[1:21:22] That might be one possible avenue of approach,
[1:21:25] but you've got me thinking,
[1:21:27] and on while I'm driving home,
[1:21:30] I'll come up with a really good answer.
[1:21:32] (laughter)
[1:21:35] - [Dr. Dodd] And our live audience
[1:21:36] would you have a question?

[1:21:38] If someone would like to ask at this point?
[1:21:43] Okay, Gwen.
[1:21:44] - [Gwen] Okay, I have a question for Dr. Doyle.
[1:21:46] - [Dr. Dodd] If you could come up.
[1:21:47] Go ahead.
[1:21:50] - [Gwen] One of the things,
[1:21:52] one of the really great strengths that you bring
[1:21:53] to
[1:21:55] the community
[1:21:56] is you work in ecumenism.
[1:21:57] - Yes.
[1:21:58] - [Gwen] And,
[1:22:00] I'm wondering
[1:22:01] how you see
[1:22:03] a Marian aspect
[1:22:06] is that,
[1:22:07] a more Marian,
[1:22:09] what a more Marian aspect
[1:22:11] of ecumenism look like?
[1:22:14] - Yes.
[1:22:16] Well, I think that
[1:22:17] there were ecumenical dimensions to,
[1:22:22] to Lumen Gentium
[1:22:24] and I think
[1:22:26] the whole idea of putting the universal call to
[1:22:30] holiness at the center of the document
[1:22:33] and saying okay, conversion
[1:22:35] is at the center.
[1:22:38] And discipleship is at the center.
[1:22:42] I think that's one of many ways
[1:22:45] that there was a reaching out
[1:22:48] to other Christians.
[1:22:54] There was a,
[1:22:55] a relative of mine, an in-law,
[1:22:57] who's a protestant
[1:22:59] who many years ago, he said to me,
[1:23:00] oh Vatican Two,
[1:23:02] he said, that was just the Catholics
[1:23:04] catching up to the Protestant's after 400 years.
[1:23:06] (laughter)
[1:23:09] And I think that there's,
[1:23:10] I think that's a half truth, you know,
[1:23:13] because there's something in it.
[1:23:15] There's actually quite a bit in it.

[1:23:17] And,
[1:23:20] and I think in the particular,
[1:23:22] just the eschatological nature of the church,
[1:23:24] all the themes that I mentioned,
[1:23:26] have,
[1:23:28] have ecumenical
[1:23:30] value to them.
[1:23:31] And,
[1:23:34] and the way that Mary is treated,
[1:23:36] there's great attention
[1:23:38] to,
[1:23:41] to talk about Mary
[1:23:42] in scripture
[1:23:44] and Mary in the story of salvation
[1:23:46] as we find it in scripture.
[1:23:48] Now there are some things that maybe
[1:23:50] are then said
[1:23:52] that one would have a hard time immediately
[1:23:54] connecting to scripture,
[1:23:56] but those things are at least said within the context
[1:24:00] of the story
[1:24:01] that has its grounding
[1:24:02] in scripture.
[1:24:04] And the whole idea then of an approach
[1:24:06] that sees in Mary
[1:24:08] not only
[1:24:10] a privileged one
[1:24:13] who
[1:24:15] is on say the divine side of any
[1:24:17] divine human
[1:24:19] divides.
[1:24:21] But to see in her
[1:24:23] a fellow pilgrim.
[1:24:26] I think there's a lot of ecumenical weight to that.
[1:24:30] And it seems that,
[1:24:31] you know,
[1:24:32] the ecumenical movement
[1:24:33] really seems so promising until
[1:24:35] you know,
[1:24:37] the last couple of decades, maybe.
[1:24:40] But yeah, I think there are definitely
[1:24:43] ecumenical dimensions to this.
[1:24:44] I mean there was
[1:24:46] a Lutheran Catholic study on Marian scripture.

[1:24:48] (chatter)
[1:24:49] Yeah.
[1:24:50] Yeah, or maybe I'm getting confused.
[1:24:52] Maybe it was the Anglo one I'm thinking of.
[1:24:54] Yeah.
[1:24:56] But, yeah,
[1:24:57] I think there are ecumenical
[1:24:59] possibilities here.
[1:25:00] And there really were for a few decades
[1:25:03] and it seems like we're now in the so called
[1:25:05] ecumenical winter again.
[1:25:07] Yeah.
[1:25:09] Yes?
[1:25:11] - [Man] You went to the (inaudible)
[1:25:14] I do well with the evangelical Protestants,
[1:25:16] - Yeah.
[1:25:17] - [Man] Mary is the one issue
[1:25:18] that is just too Catholic. - Right.
[1:25:22] - [Man] And there are other issues for sure,
[1:25:24] but Mary is the hot button.
[1:25:26] And I've just been thinking about
[1:25:28] how do we communicate the (inaudible) truth
[1:25:31] that we have in the Catholic church
[1:25:32] in Mary's faith,
[1:25:34] (inaudible)
[1:25:36] without trying to (inaudible).
[1:25:38] - [Paul] Dr. Doyle,
[1:25:40] can you paraphrase that a little bit.
[1:25:41] - Yeah, yeah.
[1:25:42] That,
[1:25:44] that, the person asked a question,
[1:25:48] does a lot of work with,
[1:25:50] with evangelicals
[1:25:51] and Mary is a hot button issue.
[1:25:53] Of all the things,
[1:25:55] this is seen as like
[1:25:56] a Catholic thing,
[1:25:57] that is not easily translatable
[1:25:59] into the ecumenical world.
[1:26:02] And, surely that is true.
[1:26:05] And there is a long history to that.
[1:26:06] And in particular,
[1:26:09] I mean that
[1:26:11] Mar devotionism is something that,

[1:26:13] that evangelicals would
[1:26:17] associate with idolatry
[1:26:19] and old use of the statues,
[1:26:22] and the superstitions,
[1:26:24] and let's get heavenly favors,
[1:26:26] and so on.
[1:26:29] And their critiques I think,
[1:26:32] I think fundamentally they're misunderstandings,
[1:26:35] but there was some evidence in some places, you know,
[1:26:38] that,
[1:26:40] and,
[1:26:42] so I think that,
[1:26:45] I think the evangelicals are concerned
[1:26:46] that
[1:26:49] there are people who consider themselves Christians
[1:26:51] who really are not converted.
[1:26:53] And the conversion to Christ
[1:26:56] and to have that experience
[1:26:58] of being converted to Christ.
[1:27:00] And of course there's that long history
[1:27:01] in Catholicism that
[1:27:04] we've always been more about formation
[1:27:06] than transformation.
[1:27:08] There was that book by Rosemary Hotton
[1:27:10] called the Catholic Thing,
[1:27:12] four or so decades ago.
[1:27:18] I think with the collapse of the subculture,
[1:27:19] the need for
[1:27:23] a more evident
[1:27:24] conversion
[1:27:26] it is much more part of the catholic world today.
[1:27:30] And I think that
[1:27:32] it says in the Decree on ecumenism
[1:27:34] there's a heirachry of truths,
[1:27:36] you know,
[1:27:37] and if something's low on the hierarchy of truths,
[1:27:38] that doesn't make it less true,
[1:27:40] but it may be something that we don't want to go there
[1:27:42] at first,
[1:27:43] because why start out by fighting.
[1:27:46] And so,
[1:27:48] I like what John Lesley thought.
[1:27:52] John Lesley who was an Anglican priest
[1:27:55] who said mass

[1:27:57] an average of every five days,
[1:27:59] and at the same time,
[1:28:00] he was somebody who inspires the holiness movement,
[1:28:02] not only the Methodists,
[1:28:04] but the holiness movement
[1:28:05] and Pentecostalism today.
[1:28:07] He thought that
[1:28:08] if all Christians
[1:28:11] could be more converted,
[1:28:14] if more Christians would really live the Christian life,
[1:28:16] that that would be the most ecumenical thing
[1:28:20] that could happen.
[1:28:21] And we see this in
[1:28:22] the Vatican Two decree on ecumenism
[1:28:25] where it talks about spiritual ecumenism.
[1:28:27] And the best thing we could do
[1:28:29] is ourselves have a conversion of heart
[1:28:32] and really live out the gospel
[1:28:34] and so yeah,
[1:28:35] I mean good question.
[1:28:36] You don't want to start
[1:28:38] the conversation out
[1:28:40] by giving them
[1:28:41] a miraculous (inaudible).
[1:28:44] (laughter)
[1:28:46] So.
[1:28:47] - [Dr. Dodd] Very good.
[1:28:48] Thank you Dr. Doyle.
[1:28:49] We actually have some questions
[1:28:50] for Father Buffer as well.
[1:28:52] Thank you.
[1:28:53] We'll rotate you back and forth,
[1:28:55] maybe two questions each.
[1:28:56] - [Paul] Alright this question is from
[1:28:59] Godfrey Yoddam,
[1:29:00] could Father Buffer throw,
[1:29:02] throw more light
[1:29:04] on the blessed mother
[1:29:05] as the bride of Christ
[1:29:07] and St. Ambrose's analogy.
[1:29:15] - He's really looking more at the church as,
[1:29:16] as the bride of Christ.
[1:29:19] And St. Ambrose's analogy,
[1:29:22] and I think he's referring to the one,

[1:29:25] I had a couple texts in there by Ambrose,
[1:29:27] but the one I spent time on in my
[1:29:29] oral presentation
[1:29:30] was where he says
[1:29:33] David is to Bathsheba
[1:29:36] as Christ is to the church.
[1:29:40] So he's not comparing Bathsheba to the virgin Mary,
[1:29:44] or vice versa so much.
[1:29:46] But,
[1:29:51] it's really more about when,
[1:29:53] when the patristic writers talk about
[1:29:57] the bride.
[1:29:59] They are talking about the church.
[1:30:02] Okay,
[1:30:05] and,
[1:30:08] I think the reason for that is obvious.
[1:30:10] And that would be that Mary is the virgin
[1:30:16] more than she is the bride.
[1:30:18] Okay.
[1:30:20] They didn't get into the kind of
[1:30:23] speculative thought that you would find,
[1:30:25] for example,
[1:30:26] and well,
[1:30:27] St. Maximilian Mary Kolbe,
[1:30:30] where he talks about Mary as the bride or spouse
[1:30:35] of the Holy Spirit.
[1:30:36] They didn't get into that kind of speculative thought
[1:30:39] when they spoke about
[1:30:40] the virgin Mary.
[1:30:42] They want to stay closer to the data
[1:30:44] of scripture
[1:30:46] as far as that goes.
[1:30:48] So,
[1:30:50] I hope I understand your question.
[1:30:52] If I understand it correctly,
[1:30:54] then St. Ambrose, when he talks about
[1:30:56] the bride of Christ,
[1:30:57] he's really talking about the church.
[1:30:59] - [Paul] So there's a followup
[1:31:01] from Dorthy Mensagra,
[1:31:04] she says how can David's forceful impregnation
[1:31:07] of Bathsheba,
[1:31:09] adultery,
[1:31:10] be a typology for Mary and the church?

[1:31:12] - Yes, how can,
[1:31:15] how can David be a type of Christ?
[1:31:19] Okay.
[1:31:21] Well David can be a type of Christ
[1:31:23] even though he's a sinner
[1:31:25] for the same reason that Adam
[1:31:27] is a type of Christ,
[1:31:29] and Adam is a sinner, okay.
[1:31:36] How can any physical conception,
[1:31:40] whether it involves force or violence
[1:31:43] or whether it does not involve force or violence,
[1:31:46] how can any physical conception of a child
[1:31:49] that is the result of the union
[1:31:51] of the most pure romantic love
[1:31:53] be a type of
[1:31:56] the conception of
[1:31:58] children of God
[1:32:00] who are born again through faith and baptism?
[1:32:02] Okay, and so,
[1:32:05] when we,
[1:32:08] we are not,
[1:32:10] we don't find perhaps typology
[1:32:12] as natural
[1:32:14] as some of our Christian ancestors did.
[1:32:17] But in their defense,
[1:32:19] I would point out
[1:32:21] that St. Paul thought it was a perfectly normal way
[1:32:23] of interpreting the scripture.
[1:32:30] Anything else?
[1:32:33] - [Dr. Dodd] Maybe we'll take one live,
[1:32:35] very good.
[1:32:36] - [Man] I'd like to ask of Father Buffer,
[1:32:38] (inaudible) I read your article.
[1:32:39] I'm trying to understand,
[1:32:41] what is the culture that is in the patristic period
[1:32:44] that's so different from our culture?
[1:32:46] Is there some kind of a
[1:32:48] example that you could give
[1:32:51] that shows the difference?
[1:32:53] Like I read in the newspaper the other day that
[1:32:57] some writers are writing that
[1:32:59] European attitude toward
[1:33:05] - Donald Trump.
[1:33:06] - [Man] To enjoy the militaries (inaudible)

[1:33:08] And the other people have an attitude
[1:33:11] toward bars, you know.
[1:33:13] Very sort of (inaudible),
[1:33:15] the other one military.
[1:33:17] Anyway, is there some kind of model
[1:33:20] where we can understand the patristic period better.
[1:33:22] - Just throw out any.
[1:33:26] Look, the question is how,
[1:33:27] the patristic authors
[1:33:30] often show that they just think about a lot of things
[1:33:33] very differently
[1:33:35] that we do today.
[1:33:37] Is there some kind of model that can help us understand
[1:33:40] how their thinking is different from ours?
[1:33:43] And that's very interesting right,
[1:33:44] because if their thinking is
[1:33:47] really different from ours,
[1:33:49] then does it have any validity for us?
[1:33:52] Does it have anything to teach us,
[1:33:54] or is it all totally obsolete?
[1:33:56] And that's another interesting question in there.
[1:34:03] These people are just as smart as we are.
[1:34:09] But they, their intellectual training
[1:34:11] was very different from ours.
[1:34:13] As an example,
[1:34:14] today, our framework for,
[1:34:17] how does an educated person,
[1:34:19] how does a modern educated person
[1:34:21] understand the world
[1:34:23] and their own experience
[1:34:24] of their lives and the lives of others.
[1:34:26] Science, right.
[1:34:28] Science.
[1:34:30] If,
[1:34:32] let's say,
[1:34:33] let's take the people
[1:34:34] who were paying good money
[1:34:36] to get lessons from Clement of Alexandria.
[1:34:39] They were educated people.
[1:34:40] What made them people who looked at the world
[1:34:42] as educated persons?
[1:34:44] Plato.
[1:34:46] Or more specifically,
[1:34:48] middle Platonism.

[1:34:50] That was the equivalent of
[1:34:52] forming your mind to understand the world,
[1:34:54] or experience yourself
[1:34:56] the way we did today.
[1:34:58] Okay.
[1:35:00] Another thing is,
[1:35:01] the way we understand history.
[1:35:04] If you look, for example, at
[1:35:07] the works of history
[1:35:09] by some of the ancient historians,
[1:35:12] Tacitus, Lucidies,
[1:35:14] okay,
[1:35:16] if I'm writing a book of history today,
[1:35:18] and this is a gross oversimplification,
[1:35:22] I'm going to tell you what happened.
[1:35:24] And I'm going to do a lot of research
[1:35:27] to go back to
[1:35:28] original sources and archives
[1:35:31] to help you understand
[1:35:33] everything that happened,
[1:35:34] how all these facts interconnected.
[1:35:36] And they were doing that.
[1:35:38] But really what they wanted to do
[1:35:39] was to teach you something.
[1:35:43] Look, another example that would be
[1:35:46] the acts of the Apostles.
[1:35:48] The inspired authors of scripture
[1:35:51] had a very different way
[1:35:53] of thinking and writing
[1:35:55] than theologians do today,
[1:35:57] thank God.
[1:35:58] (laughter)
[1:35:59] And yet we still read the Bible
[1:36:01] and we find that it's teaching us something
[1:36:03] that's very much,
[1:36:05] that's something we need to hear
[1:36:07] right now.
[1:36:08] Yes?
[1:36:10] Okay.
[1:36:11] And so when we're reading
[1:36:12] either the Bible
[1:36:14] or some of these early Christian writers,
[1:36:16] it's helpful to spend a little time
[1:36:19] getting into their mental framework,

[1:36:21] I would say.
[1:36:23] People make a lot of mistakes
[1:36:26] by reading the Bible as their own kind of literature,
[1:36:29] don't they?
[1:36:32] Do we read the Bible to find out
[1:36:35] how the heavens go,
[1:36:37] or how to go to heaven?
[1:36:40] One, you know,
[1:36:41] take your pick.
[1:36:47] - [Dr. Dodd] Alright, thank you.
[1:36:49] Sure.
[1:36:52] This is a question in from
[1:36:55] the chat box
[1:36:57] from Jim Tibbets
[1:36:58] for Dr. Doyle.
[1:37:00] He says another way the church becomes more Marian
[1:37:02] starts when the church began
[1:37:05] in Acts one,
[1:37:07] when the Holy Spirit came down
[1:37:09] and they all, including Mary,
[1:37:12] praised God and prayed in tongues.
[1:37:15] The first 400 years,
[1:37:17] of the church,
[1:37:18] they prayed in tongues
[1:37:21] as they praised God.
[1:37:23] Then it disappeared in the literature.
[1:37:25] It appeared again after Vatican Two
[1:37:29] in 1968 at a retreat
[1:37:31] at Notre Dame.
[1:37:33] Over the next 10 years,
[1:37:34] it spread around the world,
[1:37:36] influenced over 50 million people,
[1:37:38] formed communities,
[1:37:40] and rejuvenated churches.
[1:37:42] A more Marian church
[1:37:44] will be a more charismatic church,
[1:37:47] which praises the Lord,
[1:37:49] and praise in tongues.
[1:37:52] So that was a thought from Jim Tibbets.
[1:37:54] - Yes.
[1:37:55] Yes, I think
[1:37:56] before Notre Dame we have
[1:37:58] beginnings of the modern Pentecostal movement
[1:38:02] in San Francisco,

[1:38:04] the early 20th century.
[1:38:06] And before that we have some of these medical stations
[1:38:09] in the holiness movement
[1:38:11] and that today,
[1:38:14] there are approximately
[1:38:17] 600 million
[1:38:19] Christians worldwide
[1:38:22] who
[1:38:25] are part of these
[1:38:26] spirit filled movements.
[1:38:28] About 200 million of them
[1:38:31] are Catholic charismatics.
[1:38:35] This movement has grown so rapidly,
[1:38:37] that we could predict that by
[1:38:40] 2020, we'll all be Pentecostals.
[1:38:47] But this is a serious thing.
[1:38:49] And it's big
[1:38:51] in the northern hemisphere.
[1:38:53] It's even bigger
[1:38:54] throughout Latin America and Africa.
[1:39:00] And these movements that
[1:39:02] are
[1:39:04] tended to spontaneity
[1:39:06] and the immediate presence of the Spirit
[1:39:09] and the gifts and to healing.
[1:39:13] I think that
[1:39:16] like anything else
[1:39:18] that I would talk about from my own perspective,
[1:39:20] if I'm going to speak about it theologically,
[1:39:22] I'm gonna see
[1:39:24] wonderful things about it,
[1:39:26] and I'm going to see
[1:39:27] that there are some critical problems with these things.
[1:39:29] One thing about the Pentecostals
[1:39:34] is that
[1:39:37] they tend often to split off from each other.
[1:39:40] And this is something that I think the Catholic church has
[1:39:43] as a particular gift
[1:39:45] is this gift of unity
[1:39:47] that there are people who leave,
[1:39:52] but unity,
[1:39:53] relative to other denominations
[1:39:54] and other styles of being Christian,
[1:39:56] that is a great gift of Catholic Christianity.

[1:39:58] I think that,
[1:40:00] I think we have much to learn
[1:40:03] from these people,
[1:40:06] and I think that
[1:40:09] you know, in so far as you could
[1:40:11] look to Christian history
[1:40:13] and talk about
[1:40:14] tensions always between
[1:40:15] the charismatic movements
[1:40:17] and movements to have
[1:40:21] some kind of hierarchal
[1:40:23] input that will
[1:40:25] let the unity hang together
[1:40:27] and that will keep things from getting
[1:40:28] so enthusiastic that
[1:40:30] you're not sure whether this is Christianity anymore.
[1:40:38] But, I mean I
[1:40:39] really like to think of it this way,
[1:40:41] I think that
[1:40:43] there are a few places in history
[1:40:45] where I think you can see the whole spirit.
[1:40:47] And I think you can see it
[1:40:49] in the Reformation.
[1:40:51] And I think you can see
[1:40:52] the Holy Spirit
[1:40:53] in the ecumenical movement of the 20th century
[1:40:56] until recently.
[1:40:58] And I don't mean to be so pessimistic,
[1:40:59] I said ecumenical winter.
[1:41:01] Well, we can always hope that
[1:41:03] we're just, spring is about to start, right.
[1:41:05] And I think that the Holy Spirit is present
[1:41:09] in the movements leading up to
[1:41:11] enduring the second Vatican Council.
[1:41:14] And I do believe that the Spirit is present
[1:41:17] in these Pentecostal and chiasmatic movements.
[1:41:20] In some places in the world,
[1:41:23] the Catholic church is
[1:41:25] in great competition with these,
[1:41:27] with these movements.
[1:41:29] Here somewhat, perhaps, but,
[1:41:33] I think we all need to humbly listen to
[1:41:36] and learn from each other.
[1:41:38] And I think that

[1:41:39] there are just things about acknowledging the presence
[1:41:43] of the spirit
[1:41:44] in a charismatic way
[1:41:45] in Christians
[1:41:47] is an extremely important thing
[1:41:49] that maybe Catholics haven't historically
[1:41:51] been very good at.
[1:41:54] - [Paul] Okay, this question is directed to
[1:41:55] both of you,
[1:41:56] but you're at the podium.
[1:41:58] So, are there,
[1:42:00] this is from Johnathan Lee.
[1:42:02] Are there any implications from Marian reflection
[1:42:04] that the fathers in the Lumen Gentium
[1:42:06] for a theological
[1:42:08] and pastoral approach
[1:42:09] to the environmental concerns?
[1:42:15] - Well,
[1:42:17] I'm hoping Father Buffer
[1:42:18] will have more to say
[1:42:19] than I do
[1:42:20] about the patristic authors, but,
[1:42:22] I think that
[1:42:23] if we read,
[1:42:25] (laughter)
[1:42:26] if we read Pope Francis' encyclical,
[1:42:28] Laudato si,
[1:42:30] he's drawing
[1:42:32] upon a wide range
[1:42:34] of scripture and tradition
[1:42:37] to address this issue.
[1:42:40] And so, specifically,
[1:42:44] this was not addressed.
[1:42:46] I wrote in
[1:42:50] in 1992,
[1:42:51] I wrote well Vatican Two were to happen today,
[1:42:53] there would have been a chapter
[1:42:55] in Gaudium et spes
[1:42:56] on the ecological crisis.
[1:42:58] So now we have an encyclical on it,
[1:43:01] a very important and hard hitting encyclical.
[1:43:04] And that encyclical draws on many resources
[1:43:07] including
[1:43:08] the second Vatican Council.

[1:43:10] So in a certain sense,
[1:43:12] in the most direct way,
[1:43:13] maybe not in Vatican Two,
[1:43:16] but get beyond that, yeah.
[1:43:18] Yeah, sure.
[1:43:19] Gaudium et spes,
[1:43:21] we have to engage the issues of the modern world.
[1:43:23] We have to read the signs of the times.
[1:43:25] We have to come up with a synthesis between
[1:43:26] what science tells us,
[1:43:27] and how we draw upon our traditions, sure.
[1:43:32] (group chatter)
[1:43:34] - [Dr. Dodd] We have a lot of questions.
[1:43:36] - Actually, I just wanted to speak to the question
[1:43:38] about care for the environment.
[1:43:40] There is a connection,
[1:43:42] but it's a little indirect.
[1:43:43] And when the Pope came out with Laudato si,
[1:43:47] a lot of people,
[1:43:48] and some of them Catholic,
[1:43:49] said why does the church even get involved
[1:43:51] in this sort of thing?
[1:43:53] Why does the church make pronouncements?
[1:43:55] The church should stick to things like
[1:43:56] religion,
[1:43:57] right?
[1:43:59] And, but it's a very good question,
[1:44:00] why does the church make pronouncements
[1:44:02] about care for the environment?
[1:44:04] Why does the church make pronouncements about
[1:44:06] labor unions,
[1:44:08] and do you have a right to be,
[1:44:09] for workers to organize and that sort of thing?
[1:44:12] And I would go back to a phrase like
[1:44:15] the mother of us all.
[1:44:18] If the church is part of God's plan of salvation,
[1:44:22] then the church is doing Christ's work
[1:44:24] of gathering into one
[1:44:25] the scattered children of God.
[1:44:28] That means that the church
[1:44:30] has to be concerned for every member
[1:44:32] of the human race,
[1:44:34] because when Jesus became incarnate
[1:44:35] in the womb of the virgin Mary,

[1:44:37] and he joined himself
[1:44:39] to the entire human race
[1:44:42] as a whole.
[1:44:44] So not everybody is explicitly
[1:44:47] a member of the church.
[1:44:50] Some people emphatically don't want
[1:44:52] to be members of the church.
[1:44:53] But the church as to care about
[1:44:54] all human beings anyway.
[1:44:57] And if going back to Laudato si,
[1:44:59] the Pope's angle of approach
[1:45:03] to care for the environment
[1:45:06] begins with anthropology
[1:45:08] and not with just the Earth.
[1:45:11] So that would be the connection,
[1:45:12] and that the church is
[1:45:14] the universal sacrament of salvation.
[1:45:16] The church is supposed to
[1:45:18] give second birth to all people
[1:45:20] so the church has to be concerned with all human beings,
[1:45:22] their dignity and also the home that they live in.
[1:45:30] - [Dr. Dodd] Alright, actually,
[1:45:31] I'm gonna have you stay up there.
[1:45:32] - [Father Buffer] You're gonna have me stay up there.
[1:45:35] - [Dr. Dodd] You have a question for Father Buffer,
[1:45:37] if not, we have a lot of chat questions coming in.
[1:45:39] So, okay,
[1:45:41] let's go ahead and take
[1:45:43] the chat question here.
[1:45:44] This actually somewhat follows on
[1:45:46] what you just said Father Buffer.
[1:45:48] This is from
[1:45:51] Seal Dorger
[1:45:53] and the question is,
[1:45:55] is it fair to say
[1:45:57] that images of the nursing virgin
[1:46:00] can be read
[1:46:02] as symbolic of the church?
[1:46:05] - Well why can't they be?
[1:46:08] Okay.
[1:46:09] And yeah, I don't know if you
[1:46:12] or if anyone who's listening to this talk
[1:46:15] has ever seen
[1:46:16] images of Mary nursing

[1:46:18] the child Jesus,
[1:46:20] but there are lots of them.
[1:46:22] And there's one in this room.
[1:46:24] Okay.
[1:46:27] (laughter)
[1:46:29] Yeah,
[1:46:30] if, and probably,
[1:46:32] when we look at any image of the virgin Mary,
[1:46:34] do we think about the church?
[1:46:37] Okay.
[1:46:40] And I would say that a lot of people probably don't,
[1:46:42] including a lot of Catholics
[1:46:45] because we've got,
[1:46:46] we're not bad people.
[1:46:47] We're wonderful people.
[1:46:49] We've just gotten out of that way of thinking.
[1:46:53] But I will say this.
[1:46:56] When you have an image of Mary
[1:46:58] where she's all by herself,
[1:47:03] then what kind of image of the church
[1:47:06] can you derive
[1:47:07] from that kind of iconography?
[1:47:10] If you have Mary holding Jesus,
[1:47:13] what image of the church do you derive from that?
[1:47:16] If you have Mary feeding Jesus,
[1:47:19] what image of the church do you derive from that?
[1:47:22] Anything else?
[1:47:26] - [Dr. Dodd] Great, thank you Father.
[1:47:29] If Dr. Doyle could come.
[1:47:36] This is for,
[1:47:40] asking for a comment.
[1:47:42] This is from Alvaro Pastora
[1:47:45] in St. Louis De Monfort
[1:47:48] probably shares the same perspective
[1:47:50] of the early fathers
[1:47:52] when he states in his work
[1:47:54] true devotion number 18.
[1:47:56] It is she, who has suckled him,
[1:48:00] nourished him,
[1:48:01] supported him,
[1:48:02] brought him up
[1:48:03] and then sacrificed him for us.
[1:48:05] By feeding and supporting the head,
[1:48:08] it can be concluded she did it

[1:48:11] with the body.
[1:48:13] So, that would be...
[1:48:17] - That's a comment.
[1:48:21] - [Dr. Dodd] It's asked us a question.
[1:48:22] So you think that it's yes?
[1:48:26] - Okay.
[1:48:33] Yeah, I think I need to use one of my lifelines.
[1:48:36] - [Dr. Dodd] Alright.
[1:48:37] - I'm sorry, could you just say briefly
[1:48:38] what the question was again.
[1:48:40] - [Dr. Dodd] So if Mary
[1:48:41] suckled Christ,
[1:48:43] nourished him,
[1:48:44] supported him,
[1:48:45] brought him up,
[1:48:46] sacrificed him for us,
[1:48:48] when it says by feeding
[1:48:50] and supporting the head,
[1:48:52] that is Christ,
[1:48:53] can it be concluded that Mary did that
[1:48:55] with also the body of Christ?
[1:48:58] That would be the church?
[1:49:00] - Yes, yes.
[1:49:01] And I think,
[1:49:03] I think in my own paper,
[1:49:05] I think
[1:49:06] it's clear that I would agree with that.
[1:49:09] And I think that actually speaks even more directly
[1:49:11] to Father Buffer's paper
[1:49:13] where he really makes that point clear.
[1:49:14] Sure, yes.
[1:49:17] - [Dr. Dodd] Okay.
[1:49:19] And, also,
[1:49:22] let's see,
[1:49:24] this one from Raquel Seku.
[1:49:28] Is the higher number of women
[1:49:31] in congregations
[1:49:33] possibly linked Mary
[1:49:36] as like us and as a model to us
[1:49:39] and the church as female?
[1:49:44] - Yes.
[1:49:46] Well,
[1:49:47] I,
[1:49:49] those things speak to me.

[1:49:51] I mean these things have a lot of dimensions.
[1:49:52] They're very complex.
[1:49:53] A few years ago,
[1:49:55] I was giving a paper
[1:49:57] at the American Academy of Religion,
[1:49:58] and I was responding actually to a Pentecostal author
[1:50:00] who was talking about playfulness
[1:50:03] and spontaneity and tradition.
[1:50:05] And I say well,
[1:50:06] you know, it sounds to me like you're asking me
[1:50:07] to come out and play.
[1:50:08] (laughter)
[1:50:09] And I said, but,
[1:50:10] before I come out and play,
[1:50:12] I'm going have to ask my mother.
[1:50:14] And I said after all,
[1:50:15] the church is our mother.
[1:50:17] And this is a,
[1:50:19] there are a lot of
[1:50:20] people from different denominations.
[1:50:21] There were a lot of women theologians there,
[1:50:23] and this groan went throughout the room
[1:50:25] like I had hit them in the stomach.
[1:50:27] Because,
[1:50:28] and in some circles,
[1:50:30] the church is our mother
[1:50:31] is considered to be sexist, right.
[1:50:33] And but,
[1:50:36] that is language that speaks to me.
[1:50:38] I mean I want to be
[1:50:41] concerned about okay,
[1:50:42] where is that coming from?
[1:50:44] I don't want to just dismiss
[1:50:45] that kind of reaction.
[1:50:46] But, it's so,
[1:50:47] it's so grounded
[1:50:48] in the tradition
[1:50:50] for so many centuries.
[1:50:53] And this is a book that Dalebock wrote
[1:50:55] actually after the Council
[1:50:57] because he was upset about
[1:50:59] this aspect not being explored.
[1:51:00] So he writes a whole book on the motherhood of the church.
[1:51:03] And Joe Camachunk who was

[1:51:06] a teacher of mine at Catholic University
[1:51:07] and one of the great ecclesiologists.
[1:51:09] He also has written an article about
[1:51:12] the church as our mother.
[1:51:15] And you know, this is such a part of tradition
[1:51:16] that
[1:51:19] and then, but yeah,
[1:51:20] the presence of women
[1:51:22] in the congregations
[1:51:23] and does that speak to--
[1:51:25] Well yes, yes of course it does.
[1:51:26] Now I mean,
[1:51:28] like I say,
[1:51:29] gender issues
[1:51:30] their complex.
[1:51:31] There's so many things to be said.
[1:51:32] But sure, let's start out with yes.
[1:51:34] Yes.
[1:51:43] - [Dr. Dodd] Okay.
[1:51:44] Maybe we'll give Father Buffer a turn.
[1:51:51] - Sure.
[1:51:53] - [Paul] This next question is from Theresa Monigan.
[1:51:55] She asks the role of motherhood
[1:51:58] is changing men with men,
[1:52:00] women with women,
[1:52:02] et cetera.
[1:52:03] Are there signs of this in Mariology today too?
[1:52:07] - So, if I understand the question is,
[1:52:09] the roles,
[1:52:12] the way we understand the role of mothers
[1:52:14] is changing today
[1:52:15] the way we understand the role of fathers
[1:52:17] is changing today.
[1:52:18] Is this also changing Mariology today?
[1:52:21] You know, you start asking me about Mariology
[1:52:24] after the year 800, and,
[1:52:26] (laughter)
[1:52:29] and I'm not sure I'm the right guy.
[1:52:31] I, you know,
[1:52:32] I think it's,
[1:52:35] you heard Professor Doyle's
[1:52:38] anecdote,
[1:52:41] and just saying something like
[1:52:42] comparing asking my mom

[1:52:45] can I go out to play
[1:52:46] with asking the church
[1:52:48] what should I do,
[1:52:50] how should I behave?
[1:52:51] And just that alone
[1:52:53] some people found that
[1:52:55] offensive.
[1:52:56] It triggered them somehow.
[1:52:58] But, I think,
[1:53:01] I think the way that we talk about Mary
[1:53:06] and the church at least in
[1:53:08] the United States
[1:53:10] and other Western cultures
[1:53:14] has changed a lot
[1:53:15] just in the last 50 years.
[1:53:20] A Catholic priest
[1:53:22] preaching about the virgin Mary
[1:53:24] in 1955 in Chicago
[1:53:27] could use expressions
[1:53:28] that
[1:53:30] his successor today just simply could not use.
[1:53:35] You have in modern Mariology,
[1:53:38] there has been a certain amount of writing
[1:53:41] where people say
[1:53:42] to what extent
[1:53:44] has our theology about Mary
[1:53:46] and some of our homiletic statements about Mary,
[1:53:50] and also Marian devotion.
[1:53:52] To what extent has that been shaped
[1:53:55] by
[1:53:56] just the expectations
[1:53:58] of what women could and could not do
[1:54:02] in a certain society.
[1:54:05] And I certainly think that's true,
[1:54:06] that's going to shape our Mariology.
[1:54:09] That's going to shape the way that we speak about Mary
[1:54:12] as a mother.
[1:54:13] That's going to influence the way we speak
[1:54:15] about the church as a mother.
[1:54:17] Just look at our friend
[1:54:18] Clement of Alexandria.
[1:54:20] For him, you're not really,
[1:54:23] a woman is not called a woman
[1:54:25] until she has become pregnant.

[1:54:28] And he's not the only patristic author
[1:54:31] who has ideas like that.
[1:54:33] We don't talk that way today.
[1:54:34] (laughter)
[1:54:36] okay.
[1:54:38] And, so yeah.
[1:54:40] That's going to change.
[1:54:42] Also what you've seen,
[1:54:43] what you've seen in Mariology
[1:54:46] in the last
[1:54:49] maybe 40 years
[1:54:51] is,
[1:54:52] what some authors idea
[1:54:53] of presenting Mary as
[1:54:56] a person.
[1:54:59] Mary is our example of
[1:55:02] the ideal person,
[1:55:05] or the ideal Christian person.
[1:55:09] And not just looking at her function,
[1:55:11] and the plan of salvation,
[1:55:14] but what does it mean to be
[1:55:16] a person?
[1:55:18] And by the way,
[1:55:19] she's not just a person,
[1:55:20] she's also a person who's a woman
[1:55:22] and who is a mother.
[1:55:24] So yeah, I think these changes
[1:55:25] have in the way we understand being a mother
[1:55:29] and the way we understand being a woman
[1:55:32] in relation to others,
[1:55:33] I think that's already had
[1:55:35] some measurable effects
[1:55:37] on Mariology
[1:55:40] and on theology.
[1:55:41] Sure.
[1:55:44] - [Dr. Dodd] Okay.
[1:55:45] - [Woman] I have a question.
[1:55:47] It's sort of a followup comment I think.
[1:55:50] When my son was born,
[1:55:52] which was in fact 40 years ago,
[1:55:53] my mother's aunt
[1:55:57] gave me an icon
[1:55:59] of the nursing Madonna.
[1:56:01] And the reason she gave it to me,

[1:56:03] she said,
[1:56:04] was that motherhood's really scary
[1:56:06] and this is to remind you
[1:56:08] you don't have to do it entirely on your own.
[1:56:11] - That's yeah, there you go.
[1:56:12] - [Woman] It's still in my (inaudible)
[1:56:15] because
[1:56:16] it continues to be scary.
[1:56:17] - And then,
[1:56:19] and then,
[1:56:20] you reacted,
[1:56:21] yeah.
[1:56:23] But that meant something comforting and positive to you.
[1:56:26] - [Woman] Oh yes,
[1:56:27] it's deeply effected me
[1:56:28] and probably, actually now that I think of it,
[1:56:31] has effected my (inaudible) work.
[1:56:33] - Okay.
[1:56:35] - [Woman] So yeah.
[1:56:36] - And we're Anglicans.
[1:56:37] So, I think it can be universal.
[1:56:39] A mom is a mom,
[1:56:42] to some extent.
[1:56:44] It's all very complicated,
[1:56:46] it's all very,
[1:56:47] it has many, many
[1:56:48] ramifications.
[1:56:51] But also helpful, is to remember that
[1:56:52] motherhood is scary,
[1:56:54] and parenthood is scary,
[1:56:57] and sometimes living is scary,
[1:56:59] and not to have to do it on your own.
[1:57:01] - Yeah, I mean I can share that
[1:57:03] I was complaining,
[1:57:04] a friend of mine who has six children,
[1:57:07] maybe five,
[1:57:08] they keep moving.
[1:57:09] (laughter)
[1:57:13] And I was complaining that
[1:57:14] my whole day was,
[1:57:16] had been made up of interruptions.
[1:57:18] And she said oh, it's like being a mom.
[1:57:22] Mom.
[1:57:23] Mom.

[1:57:24] Mom.
[1:57:25] Right.
[1:57:27] - [Woman] Oh yeah.
[1:57:28] - Yeah.
[1:57:29] So that, you know,
[1:57:30] the church could learn something from that I suppose, huh?
[1:57:37] - [Paul] Okay, and,
[1:57:38] this one's for you.
[1:57:39] This is from Jim Tibbets.
[1:57:41] - Oh yes.
[1:57:42] - [Paul] It says, Father Buffer,
[1:57:43] your emphasis on Mary
[1:57:45] as the new Eve
[1:57:46] and mother of the living
[1:57:48] is unique and modern,
[1:57:49] yet there is a different biblical understanding.
[1:57:52] In a Marian studies article on purification,
[1:57:54] and it explains how the biblical emphasis
[1:57:58] on human life
[1:57:59] is related to purification
[1:58:00] and involved three alters of purification
[1:58:03] of the Lord,
[1:58:04] the alter of sacrifice,
[1:58:06] the alter of marriage,
[1:58:07] of the marriage bed,
[1:58:09] and alter of the kitchen table.
[1:58:12] Whereas the alter of sacrifice was
[1:58:13] spiritual,
[1:58:15] the alter of the kitchen table
[1:58:17] involved a kosher diet,
[1:58:18] even a kosher vegetarian diet.
[1:58:20] Yes some foods bring life
[1:58:22] and others do not.
[1:58:24] This was the concrete understanding
[1:58:25] of life
[1:58:26] in biblical terms.
[1:58:28] Sorry, in biblical times.
[1:58:31] Do you agree?
[1:58:33] - Hi Jim.
[1:58:34] (laughter)
[1:58:36] Let me say,
[1:58:41] my emphasis on Mary
[1:58:43] as the new Eve,
[1:58:45] not it's not modern.

[1:58:49] It's the oldest,
[1:58:50] it's the oldest theological reflection
[1:58:54] that we have about the virgin Mary
[1:58:56] after the New Testament writings.
[1:58:59] Okay.
[1:59:01] So,
[1:59:04] and I would just say
[1:59:05] what does it mean
[1:59:07] that we just went through
[1:59:09] Holy week
[1:59:10] where the scriptures
[1:59:12] worked very hard
[1:59:13] to help us understand the parallel between Jesus
[1:59:17] and
[1:59:19] people being commanded to eat a lamb.
[1:59:24] That's all I got.
[1:59:26] - [Dr. Dodd] Very good.
[1:59:30] And Dr. Doyle.
[1:59:35] This question is from
[1:59:38] Sister Danielle Peters
[1:59:41] for Dr. Doyle.
[1:59:43] Says in his paper he said
[1:59:45] some minimalists thought,
[1:59:47] mainly for ecumenical reasons,
[1:59:49] that Mary should be kept out of the document on the church,
[1:59:54] and that perhaps the Council should not say anything
[1:59:57] about her at all.
[2:00:00] I've read with interest
[2:00:02] all the text he suggested
[2:00:04] in his footnotes,
[2:00:06] but could not find
[2:00:07] an indication
[2:00:08] that there was a group
[2:00:10] wishing not to say anything about her at all,
[2:00:15] nor have I heard of this
[2:00:17] in any Emory class
[2:00:18] or in my personal research
[2:00:20] so I would be interested in knowing
[2:00:23] who belonged to that group.
[2:00:27] - I could be wrong.
[2:00:29] And it maybe that I have my facts wrong
[2:00:32] in this strip.
[2:00:34] But where I thought I was getting at
[2:00:37] is from Semmelroth's commentary on

[2:00:41] the chapter on Mary
[2:00:44] that was in the Lexicon,
[2:00:48] the LCHF Lexicon in German
[2:00:51] and it's in that.
[2:00:53] They have three editions of that.
[2:00:54] It was in the second edition.
[2:00:56] But, it could be that
[2:00:58] I was misremembering that.
[2:01:00] So.
[2:01:05] - Okay, very good Dr. Doyle.
[2:01:08] And I think that
[2:01:09] we will have to,
[2:01:14] I have to be conscious of time
[2:01:16] in that we have many questions
[2:01:19] but we have only so much time
[2:01:21] for today.
[2:01:23] And so I want to say that
[2:01:26] there are still questions on the chat box
[2:01:29] that we have not gotten to,
[2:01:31] but we will give those
[2:01:33] to the speakers
[2:01:34] so that they can
[2:01:36] then respond to them
[2:01:39] in their papers
[2:01:40] as they will continue working.
[2:01:42] And we will have those papers published
[2:01:45] in the future
[2:01:46] and we will let everyone know
[2:01:48] when those are available.
[2:01:51] And so,
[2:01:52] we certainly are glad
[2:01:54] that
[2:01:56] we could have such fine presentations
[2:01:58] with Dr. Doyle
[2:02:00] and Father Buffer's presentations today
[2:02:03] on the question of Mary
[2:02:05] in today's church,
[2:02:07] and
[2:02:08] their thought provoking
[2:02:11] presentations
[2:02:12] generated more questions
[2:02:14] than we could even get to,
[2:02:15] so that's a good thing.
[2:02:17] And, I want to thank our technical assistants,

[2:02:21] especially Paul Dagnall,
[2:02:23] as he worked very hard.
[2:02:25] And John LeComte also
[2:02:28] for being able to
[2:02:30] provide this to you electronically.
[2:02:32] And I want to thank everyone
[2:02:36] for participating.
[2:02:37] Our live audience here
[2:02:39] in the Marian Library,
[2:02:40] and the many people
[2:02:42] watching online.
[2:02:44] It is indeed a blessing
[2:02:46] to have such a global representation
[2:02:49] of the church
[2:02:50] to bring together
[2:02:51] on this topic.
[2:02:53] And we invite you all
[2:02:56] to the third online Marian Forum
[2:02:59] that will be held the afternoon
[2:03:01] of Friday,
[2:03:04] October 14th,
[2:03:06] 2016.
[2:03:08] The topic will be
[2:03:09] on the Papal teachings
[2:03:12] of Mary's place in the church.
[2:03:15] We will have Father Thomas Thompson
[2:03:17] to present Blessed Pope Paul the sixth.
[2:03:21] Sister Danielle Peters
[2:03:23] will talk about
[2:03:25] St. John Paul the second.
[2:03:27] And Father Alexandra
[2:03:30] Mellow
[2:03:31] will discuss
[2:03:32] Pope Francis.
[2:03:34] So registration
[2:03:35] is already open
[2:03:37] for our upcoming forum.
[2:03:39] You can find the link on our website,
[2:03:42] the website of the
[2:03:44] International Marian Research Institute.
[2:03:47] And I will send this link to all those
[2:03:50] who are registered for this forum today.
[2:03:54] And in thanksgiving for such
[2:03:57] a wonderful gathering,

[2:03:58] I think it would be appropriate for us
[2:04:00] to close
[2:04:03] with the doxology
[2:04:04] praising our Holy Trinity
[2:04:07] for this blessing of Mary as our mother
[2:04:10] and also for our time here together.
[2:04:15] And so let us pray
[2:04:16] in the name of the Father,
[2:04:18] and of the Son,
[2:04:19] and of the Holy Spirit,
[2:04:21] Amen.
[2:04:22] Glory be
[2:04:23] to the Father
[2:04:25] and to the Son
[2:04:26] and to the Holy Spirit,
[2:04:28] as it was in the beginning,
[2:04:30] it is now and every shall be
[2:04:33] world without end.
[2:04:35] Amen.
[2:04:36] In the name of the Father,
[2:04:37] and of the Son,
[2:04:38] and of the Holy Spirit,
[2:04:40] Amen.
[2:04:41] Thank you.