

1985

Review: 'Divorce and Remarriage'

William P. Roberts

University of Dayton, wroberts1@udayton.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://ecommons.udayton.edu/rel_fac_pub



Part of the [Religion Commons](#)

eCommons Citation

Roberts, William P., "Review: 'Divorce and Remarriage'" (1985). *Religious Studies Faculty Publications*. 30.
https://ecommons.udayton.edu/rel_fac_pub/30

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Department of Religious Studies at eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Religious Studies Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of eCommons. For more information, please contact frice1@udayton.edu, mschlangen1@udayton.edu.

episcopal ministry in a revolutionary situation. The section on "Marxist Analysis" is most helpful. Marxist categories, according to Berryman, "seem indispensable" but can be used "badly or well." Pressing both Congar and Sobrino into service, he draws a picture of the popular church. "Sanctity for the Church of the poor means being a servant and seeking justice, and from that perspective the sin of the Church is revealed."

The final chapter wrestles with God, Sin and Grace, Christ, and History and Eschatology. The Latin American theological *proyecto* is compared with some themes from Rahner's *Foundations*. From that framework the author moves to some basic concerns of Liberation Theology. He briefly discusses Ellacuria's essay "The Crucified People." Again relying on Sobrino, he links Christology and Ecclesiology to Eschatology. "Jesus does not define God for himself or for us; he is concerned that God not be manipulated. 'The ultimate mystery is the guarantee for the seriousness of the penultimate.'" A short epilogue offers some reflections on the importance of these issues for the United States.

Only very minor criticisms can be mentioned. The book has some redundancies and perhaps tries to cover too much ground. The theological sections need deepening. But all of this Berryman himself admits and is already planning future projects to develop points touched upon in this work. The book is a major contribution to the discussion on religion and social change in the world. It interprets well and realistically the "option for the poor" to a North American audience. The text is very readable, extremely well documented, and followed by an extensive bibliography listing many key and, as yet untranslated, resources. It would be informative and provocative background reading for any course on Latin American Theology, Politics, or History.

National Endowment for the Humanities

JOHN P. HOGAN

Divorce and Remarriage. By Theodore Mackin, S.J. Marriage in the Catholic Church, 2. New York: Paulist, 1984. ix + 565 pages. \$19.95 (paper).

Like the first volume in his series on marriage in the Catholic Church Mackin's latest book, *Divorce and Remarriage*, is an exercise in painstaking, detailed scholarship. Mackin's material is well organized, his style extremely clear, and his analysis of the complex history of divorce and remarriage in the Church is extraordinarily perceptive.

In his biblical treatment, the author first examines the Jewish context of early Christian teaching. He then analyzes the key texts relating to divorce and remarriage in the synoptic gospels and in the Pauline tradition.

Mackin's study of the first four centuries includes a summary of the history of legislation regarding divorce and remarriage in the Roman empire, and a reflection on the teaching and discipline during the patristic period. Because of their enormous influence, very detailed treatment is given to Jerome and Augustine.

Subsequent chapters trace the development from Augustine through the canonists and theologians of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, to the Reformation and into the twentieth century and the Second Vatican Council. In the final chapter Mackin explicitly brings together his sound critical reflections on

the Catholic Church's present teaching and canonical practice regarding divorce and remarriage.

Mackin begins his critical reflection by presenting a paradigm familiar to those in marriage counseling. A woman, fifty-two, had been abandoned two years earlier by her husband after twenty-nine years of marriage. Both are Roman Catholics and have four children born of the marriage. After divorcing her, the husband entered a second and civil marriage. Now the woman wishes to marry a Roman Catholic widower. According to Catholic doctrine and teaching she cannot do so. Her first marriage was consummated, and presumed in Catholic law to be a sacrament, since both were baptized in the Roman Catholic Church. Hence it is indissoluble.

There are at least three assumptions in prohibiting this woman from remarrying. 1) Even when love, commitment, and the other signs that visibly manifest a marital relationship have been irretrievably lost from the marriage, the bond remains, and hence this woman must be faithful to that bond. 2) Every valid marriage between two baptized Christians is automatically a sacrament. 3) A marriage is consummated by the first act of intercourse after the couple is married.

In light of his careful study that runs over five hundred pages, Mackin challenges—and correctly so, in the opinion of this reviewer—all three assumptions. Just a few examples of some of the kinds of questions Mackin raises must suffice here. If marriage is an intimate communion of life and love, as Vatican II states, then what is this bond to which the woman in the paradigm is still obligated? If marriage as a sacrament is a sign of Christ's love for the Church, in what sense does the marriage in the paradigm continue to be a sacrament? If marriage is a lifelong commitment to a growing intimacy of love and communion, is it automatically consummated by one act of physical intercourse?

This volume is required reading for all cardinals, bishops, and future popes! It is also a must for those who teach marriage courses, who work in marriage tribunals, and who counsel the divorced. While the book will be useful for graduate students, its technical scholarship and overwhelming detail may prove prohibitive for the average undergraduate.

University of Dayton

WILLIAM P. ROBERTS

On Becoming A Catholic: The Challenge of Christian Initiation. By Regis A. Duffy, O.F.M. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984. xiii + 178 pages. \$7.95 (paper).

If I'm a Christian, Why Be a Catholic?: The Biblical Roots of Catholic Faith. By James E. Hanson, C.S.C. New York: Paulist, 1984. iii + 232 pages. \$4.95 (paper).

We have here two books whose titles seem to indicate they belong together, but whose subtitles in pointing out the main theme of each clearly indicate as well the basic difference between them. Hanson wants to put into the hands of his readers a book that shows the biblical relatedness of Catholic faith/practice; it is informational. Duffy challenges his readers to reflect upon their own experiences as members of a Christian community in the light of what this community is said to be. He likes to connect what we do with what we teach!