

## Marian Studies

---

Volume 60 *Telling Mary's Story: The "Life of Mary" Through the Ages*

Article 13

---

2009

### Marian Piety and the Forging of the Community in Hendrick Goltzius's the Life of the Virgin

Elissa Auerbach

Follow this and additional works at: [https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian\\_studies](https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian_studies)



Part of the [Religion Commons](#)

---

#### Recommended Citation

Auerbach, Elissa (2009) "Marian Piety and the Forging of the Community in Hendrick Goltzius's the Life of the Virgin," *Marian Studies*: Vol. 60, Article 13.

Available at: [https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian\\_studies/vol60/iss1/13](https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian_studies/vol60/iss1/13)

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Marian Library Publications at eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Marian Studies by an authorized editor of eCommons. For more information, please contact [mschlangen1@udayton.edu](mailto:mschlangen1@udayton.edu), [ecommons@udayton.edu](mailto:ecommons@udayton.edu).

# MARIAN PIETY AND THE FORGING OF COMMUNITY IN HENDRICK GOLTZIUS'S THE *LIFE OF THE VIRGIN*

Elissa Auerbach, Ph.D. \*

## Introduction

On May 29, 1578, riotous Dutch Calvinist soldiers entered Haarlem's St. Bavo Cathedral during the holy feast-day celebration of Corpus Christi where they incited a scene of complete bedlam.<sup>1</sup> Brandishing swords and shouting at worshippers, the soldiers killed a priest and plundered the church, thus bringing a decisive end to the Catholic ownership of the cathedral. Throughout the summer, Calvinists removed from the church the works of art and liturgical objects that were most offensive to them, and in September the Reformed Church officially reconsecrated the building as the *Grote Kerk* (Great Church). Three years later, in 1581, the Calvinist government of Haarlem in the newly independent Dutch Republic outlawed Catholicism.<sup>2</sup>

\*This essay is based on a chapter of Elissa Auerbach's dissertation, "Re-Forming Mary in Seventeenth-Century Dutch Prints" (Ph.D. diss., University of Kansas, 2009). She adds the following message: "I would like to thank the Mariological Society of America for generously awarding me the Clinton Scholarship for two consecutive years in support of my dissertation, and for inviting me to the 2009 meeting in St. Johns, Florida. I am also deeply grateful to Linda Stone-Ferrier, Sally Cornelison, David Cateforis, and Stephen Goddard for their helpful comments and editorial remarks on earlier drafts of this paper."

<sup>1</sup> Mia M. Mochizuki, *The Netherlandish Image after Iconoclasm, 1566-1672: Material Religion in the Dutch Golden Age* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008), 105-21. See also Samuel Ampzing, *Beschryvinge ende lof der stad Haerlem in Holland* (Haarlem: Adriaen Rooman, 1628), 463-64.

<sup>2</sup> The St. Bavo Cathedral, or *Sint-Bavokerk* (Church of St. Bavo), was renamed the *Grote Kerk* (Great Church) after its transition from Catholic to Calvinist use. On its

Hendrick Goltzius, who moved to Haarlem in 1577, must have witnessed the pivotal events of the following year that began with the May 29 attack at the St. Bavo Cathedral and evolved into the dramatic reorganization of religious life that profoundly affected the city's Catholics and Protestants alike.<sup>3</sup> Goltzius, who may have been Catholic, trained under the artist Dirck Volkertsz Coornhert in Xanten before following him to Haarlem. Coornhert, a Catholic sympathizer and staunch advocate of religious tolerance, fought to defend the city's churches from iconoclasts.<sup>4</sup> Twelve years after Goltzius moved to Haarlem, and perhaps inspired by the events of May 1578, he produced one of the most enterprising projects of his career, the *Life of the Virgin*, 1593-94. The print series' Marian theme—a subject many artists in the Republic had abandoned after the Reformation—would have reminded Haarlem's residents of their shared Catholic past that was deeply rooted in devotion to Mary.

In the six engravings that comprise the *Life of the Virgin*, Goltzius created a sympathetic and touching portrayal of the

dedication for Calvinist worship, see Truus van Bueren, *Tot lof van Haarlem. Het beleid van de stad Haarlem ten aanzien van de kunstwerken uit geconfisqueerde geestelijke instellingen* (Hilversum: Verloren, 1993); Mia M. Mochizuki, "The Reformation of Devotional Art and the Great Church in Haarlem" (Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 2001).

<sup>3</sup> Goltzius (1558-1617) was born in Mülbracht near Venlo. In 1562, he moved with his family to Duisburg where he received training from his father, a glass painter. By 1576, he studied engraving under Dirck Volckertsz Coornhert in Xanten. In the following year, Goltzius and his family followed Coornhert to Haarlem. Karel van Mander discusses Goltzius's biography and the *Life of the Virgin* series extensively in his chapter, "T'leven van Hendricus Goltzius, uytnemende Schilder, Plaetsnijder, en Glaesschrijver, van Mulbracht." See Karel van Mander, *The Lives of the Illustrious Netherlandish and German Painters, from the first edition of the "Schilder-boeck" (1603-1604). Preceded by The Lineage, Circumstances and Place of Birth, Life and Works of Karel van Mander, Painter and Poet and likewise his Death and Burial, from the second edition of the "Schilder-boeck" (1616-1618)*, ed. Hessel Miedema, trans. Michael Hoyle, Jacqueline Pennial-Boer, and Charles Ford (6 vols.; Doornspijk: Davaco, 1994), 1:281v-287r.

<sup>4</sup> On Coornhert's role in Dutch history during the revolt against Spain, see Jonathan I. Israel, *The Dutch Republic: Its Rise, Greatness, and Fall, 1477-1806*, ed. R.J.W. Evans, Oxford History of Early Modern Europe (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), 97-99, 371-73, 500-503, 566-68.

popular pre-Reformation devotional exemplar, the Virgin Mary.<sup>5</sup> The large, single-sheet prints narrate the dramatic episodes of Mary's early motherhood as chronicled in the Gospels of Matthew and Luke. Goltzius's scenes include: the *Annunciation*, *Visitation*, *Adoration of the Shepherds*, *Adoration of the Magi*, *Circumcision*, and *Holy Family with John the Baptist as a Child*.<sup>6</sup> Goltzius began the series in 1591 after a yearlong journey through the Germanic states and Italy.<sup>7</sup> While in Munich, he

<sup>5</sup> For catalogues and overviews of Goltzius's series, see especially Adam Bartsch, *Le peintre graveur* (21 vols.; Vienna: J.V. Degen, 1803-21), 3:15, cat. nos. 15-20; Pieter van der Coelen, *Rembrandts passie. Het Nieuwe Testament in de Nederlandse prentkunst vande zestiende en zeventiende eeuw* (Rotterdam: Museum Boijmans van Beuningen, 2006), 50-55, cat. nos. 1a-1f; Jan Piet Filedt Kok, "Hendrick Goltzius—Engraver, Designer, and Publisher, 1582-1600," *Goltzius Studies: Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617)*, *Nederlands Kunsthistorisch Jaarboek* 42-43 (1991-92): 183, 213-14, cat. no. 104; Otto Hirschmann, *Verzeichnis des graphischen Werks von Hendrick Goltzius 1558-1617*, 2nd ed., Meister de Graphik (Brunswick: Klinkhardt & Biermann, 1976), 6-12; F.W.H. Hollstein, *Dutch and Flemish Etchings, Engravings, and Woodcuts, ca. 1450-1700* (58 vols.; Amsterdam: M. Hertzberger, 1949-2001), 8:5, cat. nos. 9-14; Huigen Leeftang and Ger Lijten, *Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617): Drawings, Prints and Paintings* (Zwolle, Amsterdam, New York, and Toledo, Ohio: Waanders Publishers, Rijksmuseum, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, and The Toledo Museum of Art, 2003), 19, 203, 205-8, 210-15, cat. no. 75; Ger Lijten et al., eds., *Dawn of the Golden Age. Northern Netherlandish Art, 1580-1620* (Amsterdam and Zwolle: Rijksmuseum and Waanders Uitgevers, 1993), 362-66, cat. no. 25; Walter S. Melion, "Piety and Pictorial Manner in Hendrick Goltzius's Early Life of the Virgin," in *Hendrick Goltzius and the Classical Tradition*, ed. Glenn Harcourt (Los Angeles: University of Southern California; Fisher Gallery, 1992), 44-51; Walter L. Strauss, *Hendrick Goltzius, 1558-1617: The Complete Engravings and Woodcuts* (2 vols.; New York: Abaris Books, 1977), 2:574-87, esp. 580-87, cat. nos. 317-22; The University of Connecticut Museum of Art, *Hendrik Goltzius and the Printmakers of Haarlem* (Storrs, Conn.: Museum of Art, the University of Connecticut, 1972), 27-30.

<sup>6</sup> The prints are substantial in size: *Annunciation* (47 x 35.1 cm), *Visitation* (47.2 x 35.2 cm), *Adoration of the Shepherds* (47.5 x 35.3 cm), *Adoration of the Magi* (47.1 x 35 cm), *Circumcision* (47.6 x 35.2 cm), and *Holy Family with John the Baptist as a Child* (47.6 x 35.2 cm).

<sup>7</sup> On Goltzius's trip to Italy, see Lawrence W. Nichols, "Hendrick Goltzius—Documents and Printed Literature concerning His Life," *Nederlands Kunsthistorisch Jaarboek* 42-43 (1991-92): 82; Leeftang and Lijten, *Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617)*, 18-19; Walter S. Melion, "Karel van Mander's *Life of Goltzius*: Defining the Paradigm of Protean Virtuosity in Haarlem around 1600," *Studies in the History of Art* 27 (1989): 118.

visited Jan Sadeler, the Flemish court engraver to Duke Wilhelm V; in Rome and elsewhere in Italy, he sketched antiquities and Renaissance collections. Scholars have described in precise detail the ways in which each print in the *Life of the Virgin* presents a superb example of Goltzius's engraving technique inspired by the ancient, Italian, and Netherlandish artwork he studied during the course of his trip.<sup>8</sup> Yet scholars have paid little attention to Goltzius's selection of scenes for the six sheets and his unusual choice of a Marian theme for his multiconfessional, international market. Given that the Roman Catholic Church perpetuated the medieval cult of Mary, which was a contributing factor for the Protestant reformers' dissent from the Church, Goltzius's treatment of Mary in a major print series deserves serious consideration.

As numerous scholars have shown, Goltzius's *Life of the Virgin* can certainly be interpreted as a calculated display of artistic virtuosity. His approach to the series as an experiment in emulation becomes clear in his dedication on the title print to Duke Wilhelm in which Goltzius compares himself to Proteus, the shape-shifting Greek mythological sea god:

As Proteus changed amidst the waves out of burning love for the beautiful Pomona, so does Goltzius, the admirable engraver and inventor, with his varied art, for you, Oh Prince.<sup>9</sup>

<sup>8</sup> For Goltzius's imitation of work by other artists, see David Acton, "The Northern Masters in Goltzius's *Meisterstiche*," *Bulletin, Museum of Art and Archaeology, University of Michigan* 4 (1981): 49; Leeftang and Luijten, *Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617)*, 208, 212, 215; Walter S. Melion, "Hendrick Goltzius's Project of Reproductive Engraving," *Art History* 13, no. 4 (December 1990): 477; Melion, "Piety and Pictorial Manner in Hendrick Goltzius's Early *Life of the Virgin*," 50; Melion, *Shaping the Netherlandish Canon: Karel van Mander's "Schilder-Boeck"* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1991), 56, 63; Larry Silver, "Imitation and Emulation: Goltzius as Evolutionary Reproductive Engraver," in *Graven Images: The Rise of Professional Printmakers in Antwerp and Haarlem, 1540-1640*, ed. Timothy Riggs and Larry Silver (Evanston, Ill.: Mary and Leigh Block Gallery, Northwestern University, 1993), 71-99.

<sup>9</sup> "Ut mediis Proteus se transformabat in undis,/Formosae cupido Pomonae captus amore:/Sic varia Princeps tibi nunc se Goltzius arte/Commutat, sculptor mirabilis, atque repertos./C. Schonaeus." Leeftang and Luijten, *Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617)*, 210, 335, cat. no. 75.1.

In each print of the series, Goltzius artfully imitated, re-invented, and surpassed well-known works by prominent Northern printmakers, including Albrecht Dürer, Lucas van Leyden, and Cornelis Cort. Goltzius based the *Circumcision*, for example, on a woodcut of the same theme produced by the German printmaker, Albrecht Dürer, from his 1502-11 series, the *Life of the Virgin*.<sup>10</sup> Scholars have also pointed to Jan Sadeler's engraving after a design by Maarten de Vos, the *Circumcision*, from his series, the *Childhood of Christ*, 1579-82, as an important model for Goltzius's scene due to their overt similarities in subject and composition.<sup>11</sup> Thus, by virtue of the complex pictorial referents to earlier works with which his viewers could delight themselves as they methodically decoded each print, Goltzius, in effect, redefined the genre of Netherlandish reproductive printmaking. While his use of pictorial models for each print is integral to our understanding of the series, this mode of inquiry does not account for the social, political, or religious interests of Goltzius's audience. I suggest that the prints must also be understood as unequivocal displays of Marian piety that would have appealed to both Catholics and Protestants, despite the contentious and sometimes violent divide between them.

Goltzius's dedication of the series to Duke Wilhelm, an ardent promoter of Marian devotion and patron of Roman Catholic arts, underscores the devotional function of the prints for Catholics.<sup>12</sup> The inscription on the opening page of the series, the *Annunciation*, reads: "To the exalted Prince and

<sup>10</sup> For the influence that Dürer and Lucas van Leyden had on Goltzius, see Acton, "The Northern Masters in Goltzius's *Meisterstiche*," 43-45; Van der Coelen, *Rembrandt's passie*, 215; Leeftang and Luijten, *Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617)*, 208, 212-13; Luijten et al., eds., *Dawn of the Golden Age*, 363; Van Mander, *The Lives of the Illustrious Netherlandish and German Painters*, 1:284v-285r; Melion, "Piety and Pictorial Manner in Hendrick Goltzius's Early Life of the Virgin," 47.

<sup>11</sup> On Sadeler's series, see Isabelle de Ramaix, *The Illustrated Bartsch: Johan Sadeler I*, ed. John T. Spike (4 vols.; Norwalk, Conn.: Abaris Books, 1999-2003), 1:48-54, cat. nos. 130-41; F.W.H. Hollstein, *Dutch and Flemish Etchings, Engravings, and Woodcuts, ca. 1450-1700*, 21: 105-7, cat. nos. 160-71.

<sup>12</sup> On Duke Wilhelm's fostering of Tridentine doctrine in Bavaria, see Bridget Heal, *The Cult of the Virgin Mary in Early Modern Germany: Protestant and Catholic Piety, 1500-1648* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 189-90.

August Lord, the lord William V, Count Palatine and Duke of the two Bavarias, etc."<sup>13</sup> The magnitude of Mary's role in Christ's incarnation is further conveyed in the didactic Latin inscriptions beneath each image written by Franco Estius, a Catholic poet, and Cornelis Schonaeus, the Catholic rector of the Latin school in Haarlem.<sup>14</sup> Taken together, the impassioned inscriptions and Goltzius's pious imagery articulate a deep and abiding reverence to Mary that foregrounds the series' devotional importance rather than its complex emulation of pictorial precedents.

The emphasis in Goltzius's series on Mary's obedient and maternal role in Christ's life conforms to Roman Catholic directives on Mary that were established by the Council of Trent. In post-Tridentine theology, the Church responded to Protestant attacks against Mary by lessening dependence upon the New Testament apocryphal legends. Although the Church still invoked Mary as a sacred intercessor, it also presented her as a quiet, virtuous, and contemplative role model and encouraged Marian devotion through imagery, text, relics, and pilgrimage.<sup>15</sup>

Perhaps surprisingly, Goltzius's series functions not only as an explicit commitment toward Wilhelm's Roman Catholic convictions, but also as a manifestation of the fundamental tenets of Calvinist doctrines. Certainly, the controversies surrounding Mary in Calvinist theology presented challenges for Dutch artists after the Reformation that relied upon Marian themes as staples in their repertoire. On one hand, John Calvin had harshly denounced Roman Catholics as "papist," "absurd,"

<sup>13</sup> "Serenissimo Principi ac il./lustrissimo domino, D. Guilielmo. V. Comiti Palatiae Rhenanae Utriusque Bavariae Duci. etc." Leeflang and Luijten, *Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617): Drawings, Prints and Paintings*, 210, 335, cat. no. 75.1.

<sup>14</sup> For Schonaeus and his inscriptions on Goltzius's prints, see Leeflang and Luijten, *Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617)*, 308 n. 22; Julie L. McGee, *Cornelis Corneliszoon van Haarlem (1562-1638). Patrons, Friends and Dutch Humanists*, Bibliotheca Humanistica & Reformatorica, 48 (Nieuwkoop: De Graaf Publishers, 1991), 300-19; Hans van de Venne, *Cornelius Schonaeus Goudanus (1540-1611). Leven en werk van de Christelijke Terentius. Nieuwe bijdragen tot de geschiedenis van de Latijnse Scholen van Gouda, 's Gravenhage en Haarlem* (2 vols.; Voorthuizen: Florivallis, 2001).

<sup>15</sup> Donna Spivey Ellington, *From Sacred Body to Angelic Soul: Understanding Mary in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 2001), 142-87.

and "sacrilegious" for their preoccupation with Mary. He disparaged Catholics for awarding Mary unwarranted titles and miraculous powers. In a vitriolic condemnation of Catholics, Calvin wrote: "Nay more, to such a pitch of insolence and fury have they been hurried by Satan, that they give her authority over Christ."<sup>16</sup> Yet on the other hand, Calvin upheld Mary's perpetual virginity and her critical role in the incarnation.<sup>17</sup> Although most Dutch artists discontinued their production of traditional representations of Mary after the Reformation, Goltzius's series of her early motherhood would not have come into conflict with Calvinist doctrines.

Calvin's reluctance to completely disavow Mary in worship or art enabled artists working in Calvinist domains to continue using her as a profitable subject for their work, although not in traditional Catholic contexts. Artists refashioned Mary as the humble, earthly Mother of God, thus enabling them to accommodate the Christological emphasis of Calvin's teachings and his warnings about excessive Marian veneration.<sup>18</sup> The sheer volume of extant Dutch images of Mary from the late sixteenth and seventeenth centuries suggests that the Reformation did not disrupt the overall production of Marian art in Protestant territories, but rather it provided artists an opportunity to pursue expanded pictorial modes of Marian themes for multiconfessional markets.<sup>19</sup>

As I will argue in this essay, Goltzius consciously adapted his *Life of the Virgin* series for both Catholics and Protestants through his selection of events from her life as told in the canonical Gospels and by emphasizing her spiritual *and* physical, humble nature. The *Life of the Virgin* captures and

<sup>16</sup> John Calvin, *Commentary on a Harmony of the Evangelists, Matthew, Mark and Luke*, trans. William Pringle (3 vols.; Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1956-57), 1:54-55.

<sup>17</sup> Ellington, *From Sacred Body to Angelic Soul*, 156; Hilda Graef, *Mary: A History of Doctrine and Devotion* (2 vols.; Westminster and London: Christian Classics and Sheed & Ward, 1985), 2:12-14.

<sup>18</sup> Graef, *Mary: A History of Doctrine and Devotion*, 2:11-13; Jaroslav Pelikan, *Mary Through the Centuries: Her Place in the History of Culture* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1996), 156-67.

<sup>19</sup> See my dissertation, "Re-Forming Mary in Seventeenth-Century Dutch Prints" (Ph.D. diss., University of Kansas, 2009).



reflects the multiconfessional religious climate in Goltzius's city of Haarlem, in particular, and the Dutch Republic, in general. An examination of the biblical sources for each print, and a comparison of the series with Goltzius's earlier Marian prints, as well as with the print series of Mary's life by his predecessors and contemporaries, will illuminate the ways in which the cycle upholds both Tridentine and Calvinist doctrine. I will also consider the series within the larger historical context of Haarlem in the 1590s and the possible influence on Goltzius of the city's "interconfessional conviviality" that was maintained there between Catholics and Protestants.<sup>20</sup>

### **Goltzius's Narrative of Mary's Early Motherhood in the *Life of the Virgin***

The title sheet of the *Life of the Virgin*, the *Annunciation*, demonstrates Goltzius's intention to visualize Mary's life in his series for the broadest audience possible. In the inscription beneath the scene, Cornelis Schonaeus writes:<sup>21</sup>

Be not afraid, girl, I am here, sent as a messenger from the kingdom of heaven on high; a virgin, you shall bear a child to the astonishment of nature, according to the predictions of the ancient Prophets, and the whole world will worship you as the mother of God.<sup>22</sup>

The address to Mary's devotees of "the whole world" suggests that Goltzius and the Catholic advisors with whom he may have collaborated also expected the entirety of humankind, regardless of confessional divisions, to venerate Mary.

<sup>20</sup>The term "interconfessional conviviality" is taken from Willem Frijhoff's essay on the extent to which confessional groups coexisted with one another in the Republic and tested the limitations of Calvinist tolerance toward Catholics. Willem Frijhoff, "The threshold of toleration: Interconfessional conviviality in Holland during the early modern period," in *Embodied Belief: Ten Essays on Religious Culture in Dutch History*, Studies in Dutch Religious History (Hilversum: Verloren, 2002), 39-65.

<sup>21</sup>The English translations of the Latin inscriptions in Goltzius's *Life of the Virgin* series in this essay are taken from Leeftang and Luijten, *Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617)*, 210-11.

<sup>22</sup>"Pone metum virgo, celsi tibi nuncius adsum/Missus ab arce poli, paries intacta stupente/Natura, ut veterum cecinere oracula Vatum,/Teque Dei matrem totus venerabitur orbis." Ibid., 210, cat. no. 75.1.

In the *Annunciation* from Luke's gospel, Gabriel enters Mary's study to find her reading at her lectern near a basket of linens and scissors that denote her womanly virtues (1:26-38). Gabriel approaches Mary from the right of the composition holding a lily with his left hand and gesturing toward her with his right, flattened palm as he communicates his message to her. Mary gazes demurely upon him and gently touches her chest with her right hand to react in disbelief to his presence as she lifts her left knee and rises slowly from her platform. Swooning putti encircle Mary and Gabriel overhead as they part the clouded sky through which the Holy Ghost in the form of a white dove flies directly toward Mary's head in symbolism of Christ's incarnation. While Goltzius clearly represents Mary as a heavenly being, her bulky body, heavy robe, and modest facial expression suggest her dual role as the humble, earthly Mother of God.

In the second print of the sequence, the *Visitation*. Goltzius depicts the meeting described in Luke's gospel between Mary and her cousin Elizabeth (1:39-56). Mary passes through an arched doorway in a city wall to greet Elizabeth whose slightly hunched back conveys deference to the Virgin, and her advanced age. The two women clasp their right hands together, and with their left hands they touch each other's torsos in acknowledgement of their mutual pregnancies. The faint glint of Mary's halo identifies her as a celestial figure, yet her weighty body and cautious movement toward Elizabeth evoke the idea that she is also humble and earthly.

Goltzius's third print, the *Adoration of the Shepherds*, from Luke's gospel, situates the Holy Family with shepherds in majestic, classically inspired ruins (2:8-20). Mary kneels on the ground and lifts a blanket covering the sleeping child to provide proof of Christ's incarnation. A tall shepherd standing behind Mary holds a candle to accentuate the effects of light in the nocturnal event. A multitude of putti enmeshed in thick clouds watch the figures from overhead. In the distance, another angel flying in a brilliant oval-shaped beam of light alludes to additional shepherds who will soon arrive at the scene.

The fourth print, the *Adoration of the Magi*, based on Matthew's gospel, portrays the narrative of the three kings—one

of whom Goltzius depicts with dark skin (2:1-12). The kings wear long and ornately embellished garments that emphasize their exotic, Eastern geographic origins. The men gather around the infant and solemnly present their gifts to him beneath the large star illuminating the clouded sky that guided them to the site. The Holy Family with an ox at the left receives the kings in an open doorway of a tall, stone structure. The child peers into a lidded container filled with coins held by a magus kneeling in front of the infant. In the background, a throng of spectators assembles in an urban landscape to observe the event.

The fifth print in the series, the *Circumcision*, depicts the narrative told in Luke's gospel of Mary's dutiful charge as a young mother in bringing her child to a temple eight days after his birth for the obligatory Jewish ritual (2:21). Unlike the other five prints in the series, Goltzius localizes the *Circumcision* to Haarlem by situating the event inside the groin-vaulted chapel of the Brewers' Guild in the city's St. Bavo Church.<sup>23</sup> The chapel, decorated with a distinctive copper chandelier and wall sconce, is located in the south transept of the church. A bald man wearing spectacles in the composition—the *mohel*—delicately performs the ritual on the infant held carefully by a large-framed, bearded, and hooded male figure—the *sandak*. Nearly two-dozen figures crowd together in the chapel, including the artist who looks directly out at the viewer from the right pier. His attendance at the event merges the contemporary with the biblical time periods, and suggests the continued veneration of Mary at the Calvinist St. Bavo Church.

The concluding sixth print, the *Holy Family with John the Baptist as a Child*, conflates two separate events from the Gospels of Matthew and John, respectively: the Holy Family's flight into Egypt (Matthew 2:13-15) and the adult Baptist's recognition of Christ (John 1:29). Mountains in the distant background of the scene set the Holy Family and John the Baptist in a foreign landscape. Joseph stands over Mary who sits on the ground in humility and holds the child against her body as he touches his left hand to the Baptist's cheek. In the left side

<sup>23</sup> James J. Bloom, "Mastering the Medium: Reference and Audience in Goltzius's Print of the *Circumcision*," *Nederlands Kunsthistorisch Jaarboek* 52 (2001): 92.

of the composition, a cat—possibly a reference to the *Gatta della Madonna* (Cat of the Madonna)—stands in the windowsill of a wooden structure clutching a bird with its front paws.<sup>24</sup> Two elements in the scene of the Holy Family are repeated from the first print in the series, the *Annunciation*: a large vase of lilies on the ground at the left of the composition, and Mary's linens in a basket with scissors in the right foreground. The sixth, final print thus completes Goltzius's image of Mary as a pure, obedient, and devout mother and wife from her virgin birth to her chaste marriage.

### **The International and Local Art Market for the *Life of the Virgin***

The intended audience for Goltzius's *Life of the Virgin* series has been a matter of great speculation among art historians. Scholars agree that his impetus for publishing the scenes in an easily reproducible print medium was largely motivated by the potential for fame and profit, but they disagree on the groups to whom the artist directed the prints. Relying heavily upon Karel van Mander's 1604 biography of Goltzius in *Het Schilder-Boeck* (The Painting-Book) as their main source for the artist's life and patronage, scholars posit that the series would have appealed primarily to a single patron and/or two groups of collectors.<sup>25</sup>

First, as Walter Melion has shown, Duke Wilhelm would certainly have been keenly interested in the series' Marian theme since it supported the Council of Trent's edicts to depict faithfully biblical themes as they are described in the Old and New Testaments.<sup>26</sup> Second, according to Melion, Huigen Leeftang,

<sup>24</sup> George Ferguson, *Signs and Symbols in Christian Art* (London, Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 1961), 13.

<sup>25</sup> Van Mander, *The Lives of the Illustrious Netherlandish and German Painters*, 1:284v-285r.

<sup>26</sup> On the Council of Trent's edicts pertaining to art, see Council of Trent (1545-1563), *Canons and Decrees of the Council of Trent*, trans. H. J. Schroeder (St. Louis and London: B. Herder Book Co., 1941). See also David Freedberg, *Iconoclasm and Painting in the Revolt of the Netherlands, 1566-1609* (New York and London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1988), 55-58. For the scholarship addressing Goltzius's intention to appeal to Wilhelm's artistic interests and Roman Catholic convictions, see Melion, "Piety and Pictorial Manner in Hendrick Goltzius's Early Life of the Virgin," 44-51.

Ger Luijten, and other scholars, an elite group of international art connoisseurs would have purchased the prints—either individually or as a complete series.<sup>27</sup> Third, as James J. Bloom recently proposed, the series would have appealed to the members of the Brewers' Guild in Haarlem by virtue of Goltzius's depiction of their chapel in the St. Bavo Church for his *Circumcision*.<sup>28</sup> Goltzius figuratively places the viewer of the *Circumcision* in the Brewers' private office, the *Brouwers Kantoor*, where guild members presumably stored documents and liturgical objects. Goltzius established a niche market of Haarlem brewers for his print because the viewer assumes the identity of a Guild member.<sup>29</sup> By portraying the scene from the vantage point of the Guild's administrative office in the recognizable space of a converted, Reformed church, he also acknowledges the structure's recent, pre-iconoclastic Catholic past as well as its present use by Calvinists.

In the *Circumcision*, Goltzius positions Mary in the recognizable, Calvinist architectural space of the St. Bavo Church that clearly has been purged of the sculpture, stained glass windows, and paintings that adorned it before iconoclasm when it operated as Haarlem's cathedral.<sup>30</sup> Goltzius could have easily recreated the St. Bavo Church's appearance in its most bedecked state for Roman Catholic worship as he likely observed it firsthand in 1577, the year before iconoclasm. Instead, the clear glass windows and unembellished wall surfaces of the St. Bavo Church in the *Circumcision* form a stark contrast between the

<sup>27</sup> In his biography of Goltzius, Van Mander recounts that after completing the *Life of the Virgin* series, Goltzius used a hot coal or iron to remove his monogram from impressions of the *Circumcision*. He then smoked and crumpled the sheets to make them appear old, and then sold them. Van Mander noted it was "very funny" that collectors purchased impressions of the altered print at a "high price" because they mistook the prints for original works by Albrecht Dürer. Van Mander, *The Lives of the Illustrious Netherlandish and German Painters*, 1:284v.

<sup>28</sup> Bloom, "Mastering the Medium: Reference and Audience in Goltzius's Print of the *Circumcision*," 78-103, esp. 92-97.

<sup>29</sup> Bloom, "Mastering the Medium: Reference and Audience in Goltzius's Print of the *Circumcision*," 95.

<sup>30</sup> On the exterior and interior ornamentation of the St. Bavo Church before iconoclasm, see Mochizuki, *The Netherlandish Image after Iconoclasm*, 25-103.

pre-Reformation exemplar of Mary in the middle ground and the post-iconoclastic view of the St. Bavo Church in the background. While Goltzius seems to collapse time by portraying the Calvinist church and Mary in the same composition, he also separates the two by enclosing Mary and the other figures within the Brewers' Chapel. The overall effect is one that calls attention to Mary's continued presence—both literal and spiritual—in the religiosity of Haarlemers after the Reformation. Thus, Goltzius's series boldly reminds his local multiconfessional audience of their shared Catholic past and the undiminished significance of Marian devotion for Dutch Calvinists. The sensitivity with which Goltzius accommodated the spiritual needs of both Catholics and Protestants as they pertained to Mary is evident in the scenes he selected from her life for his series and his manner of their depiction.

### **Scenes of Mary's Life in Prints by Goltzius, and German and Netherlandish Artists**

Goltzius's remarkable refashioning of Mary's life for a multiconfessional audience in his series can be measured by comparing the *Life of the Virgin* to his earlier Marian images from the 1570s and 1580s. Flemish publishing houses headed by Philips Galle and others printed and sold all of Goltzius's work in the Catholic city of Antwerp from this period of his career.<sup>31</sup> For that reason and perhaps also due to the likelihood that Goltzius was Catholic, the rich corpus of Marian iconography he produced during these decades mainly evokes the post-Tridentine agenda to exalt the lives of the saints rather than strictly exploring Christological themes that had the Protestants' approval. Between roughly 1576 and 1586, Goltzius produced designs for four extant complex engravings that focus on Mary and the events of her life. These four prints constitute his most significant Marian images that predate the *Life of the*

<sup>31</sup> Goltzius's prints were printed and published in Antwerp until 1582 when he opened his own publishing house in Haarlem, which he managed until around 1600. On Goltzius's training, the Flemish publishers with whom he collaborated, and his Haarlem business, see Nadine Orenstein et al., "Print Publishers in the Netherlands, 1580-1620," in *Dawn of the Golden Age*, 167-200.

*Virgin*. All four scenes center on the theme of the Annunciation and Mary's motherhood, and they all present her as part of a cycle on the Life of Christ or as a typology of Old Testament narratives.

One of Goltzius's four early Marian prints, *Six Prophets of the Annunciation*, ca. 1580, depicts a grandiose display of God, the Holy Ghost, Old Testament prophets, and Gabriel's pronouncement to Mary. The scene emulates an earlier engraving of 1571 by Cornelis Cort after Federico Zuccaro, *Annunciation with Prophets*.<sup>32</sup> In the foreground of his print, Goltzius represents six prophets—Isaiah, David, Moses, Jeremiah, Solomon, and Haggai—each holding tablets and scrolls imprinted with their predictions.<sup>33</sup> In the background, the Annunciation scene between the Angel Gabriel and Mary is portrayed in a lavish garden while God the Father, the Holy Ghost, and a multitude of angels bear witness to the event from clouds overhead. Goltzius's representation of God as a human being immediately signals that the image would have been entirely unacceptable to Protestants. Calvin, in particular, prohibited the visual portrayal of God in corporeal form.<sup>34</sup>

Goltzius's *Life of the Virgin* departs not only from his own earlier models of Marian imagery, but also from print series of Mary's life by his German and Netherlandish predecessors and contemporaries. Given his longstanding interest in depicting scenes of Mary's life as demonstrated in his prints that predate the *Life of the Virgin*, his motivation to draw upon works by other artists probably followed upon his primary decision to produce the series. Indeed, scholars have rightly noted that Goltzius knew of at least two such series, one by Albrecht Dürer, and one by Jan Sadeler, in light of the overt similarities

<sup>32</sup> On Goltzius's print after Cort, see Luijten et al., eds., *Dawn of the Golden Age*, 366. See also Johan Catharinus Justus Bierens de Haan, *L'oeuvre gravé de Cornelis Cort, graveur hollandais, 1533-1578* (The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1948), cat. no. 26.

<sup>33</sup> For a description of the print, see Strauss, *Hendrick Goltzius, 1558-1617: The Complete Engravings and Woodcuts*, cat. no. 141.

<sup>34</sup> For a summary of Calvin's stance on visual imagery depicting God in human form, see Mia M. Mochizuki, "Supplanting the Devotional Image after Netherlandish Iconoclasm," in *Negating the Image: Case Studies in Iconoclasm*, ed. Anne McClanan and Jeff Johnson (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005), 141-43.

in the scene of the *Circumcision* by all three artists in their respective series.<sup>35</sup> Yet even though Goltzius clearly turned to the work by Dürer and Sadeler for the *Circumcision* as evidenced by his compositional arrangement, figures, and poses, he also noticeably diverged from them in his selection of scenes for the series as a whole. Goltzius disregarded all of the events often included in cycles of Mary's life from the New Testament Apocrypha, such as Jacobus de Voragine's *Golden Legend* from 1255-66.<sup>36</sup> Instead, he distilled the extensive corpus of Marian images to the Gospels of Matthew and Luke, thereby innovating her as an exemplar appropriate for a wide, multi-confessional audience of Catholics and Protestants.

Goltzius's iconographic deviations from Dürer's twenty-sheet series, the *Life of the Virgin*, 1502-11, all seem aimed at making the narrative of Mary's life more appropriate for Protestant audiences while still appealing to Catholics as well.<sup>37</sup> Goltzius drew all six of his scenes from images in the middle of Dürer's chronology, which represent Mary's early motherhood from the canonical Gospels: the *Annunciation*, *Visitation*, *Adoration of the Shepherds*, *Adoration of the Magi*, *Circumcision*, and *Rest on the Flight into Egypt*.<sup>38</sup> Consequently, the remaining scenes in Dürer's series do not appear in Goltzius's sequence. Goltzius's departure from the series by Dürer begins with the title page depicting the Immaculate Conception, an iconography which does not appear in the

<sup>35</sup> Bloom, "Mastering the Medium: Reference and Audience in Goltzius's Print of the *Circumcision*," 78-103.

<sup>36</sup> For the detailed accounts of Mary's life in the *Legenda aurea* (Golden Legend), see Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend: Readings on the Saints*, trans. William Granger Ryan (2 vols.; Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993).

<sup>37</sup> For Dürer's series, see Giulia Bartrum, *Albrecht Dürer and His Legacy: The Graphic Work of a Renaissance Artist* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002), 135, 145-46, 164, 173-74, 239, 247-49, 281, cat. nos. 80, 117, 185, 200, 204, 239; Peter Strieder, *Albrecht Dürer: Paintings, Prints, Drawings*, trans. Nancy M. Gordon and Walter L. Strauss (New York: Abaris Books, 1982), 268-71.

<sup>38</sup> As Giulia Bartrum has rightly noted, Protestant Reformers rejected imagery by artists of those same events from Dürer's series from the New Testament Apocrypha. Bartrum, *Albrecht Dürer and His Legacy: The Graphic Work of a Renaissance Artist*, 239.



New Testament.<sup>39</sup> Goltzius also rejected the subsequent group of images in Dürer's series that recount the legend of Mary's parents, Anne and Joachim, and the events of her childhood. In addition, he excluded the rest of Dürer's representation of the episodes from Christ's childhood as well as the most vexing for Protestant reformers—Mary's death, Assumption, and coronation as Queen of Heaven. Goltzius's inclusion of specific subjects from Dürer's series at the same time that, according to his biographer Karel van Mander, he used the artistic precedent as a compositional and thematic model, calls attention to his strategy to adapt Mary's pictorial identity to Tridentine and Calvinist doctrines.

In addition to Jan Sadeler's previously discussed *Childhood of Christ* series, 1579-82, Goltzius may also have known and deviated from Sadeler's large-scale engraving, *Madonna and Child on a Crescent Moon (Immaculate Conception)* from 1593—the same year Goltzius completed the *Visitation* and *Holy Family with John the Baptist as a Child*.<sup>40</sup> Goltzius may have examined Sadeler's print and other in-progress works on his return to Haarlem through Munich during his yearlong sojourn. Modeled after a design by Maarten de Vos, Sadeler's *Madonna and Child on a Crescent Moon* depicts circular vignettes of the life of Mary and Christ's passion that form a rosary around the Immaculate Conception in the center of the composition. The small scenes, read counter-clockwise, begin with the events of Mary's life and end with her coronation in heaven—an episode Goltzius purposefully omitted from his own series. Since Goltzius did not create prints that revisited the subject of Mary's life after 1594, we can reasonably conclude that the six episodes he portrayed from her motherhood represent the complete series. Moreover, the absence of Marian apocryphal imagery in his *oeuvre* strongly suggests that the *Life of the Virgin* functioned not only as a demonstration of his

<sup>39</sup> On the Immaculate Conception, see Graef, *Mary: A History of Doctrine and Devotion*, 2:7, 11, 15, 18, 24; Warner, *Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary*, 236-54.

<sup>40</sup> Ramaix, *The Illustrated Bartsch: Johan Sadeler I*, 3:233, no. 7002.038.

artistic virtuosity for *liefhebbers*—those who collected art and were knowledgeable about it—but also as devotional imagery that would be embraced by both Catholic and Protestant audiences.

### Devotion to Mary at the St. Bavo Church

Goltzius published the *Life of the Virgin* during a period in Haarlem's history in which the city's Calvinist political and religious authorities maintained a high level of tolerance toward its resident Catholics.<sup>41</sup> The relatively peaceful coexistence of Haarlem's confessional groups and their desire to preserve the memory of the city's pre-Reformation, Roman Catholic religious heritage is articulated especially in the dedications to various Catholic saints in the St. Bavo Church that were maintained even after it was reconsecrated as the Calvinist, Grote Kerk. The Calvinist Reformed Church's safeguarding of pre-Reformation paintings, altars, and chapel dedications in the church provides compelling evidence that both Catholics and Calvinists of Haarlem would have supported the Marian subject of Goltzius's series.

Of the chapels in the St. Bavo Church that remained dedicated to popular Catholic saints after iconoclasm and the church's reconsecration, the one focused on Mary is especially noteworthy.<sup>42</sup> Located in the north transept, the Chapel of the Guild of Our Lady of the Seven Sorrows is clearly marked on a detailed ground plan of the church drawn by Pieter Wils for Samuel van Ampzing's 1628 book, *Beschryvinghe ende Lof der Stad Haarlem* (Description and Praise of the City of

<sup>41</sup> On the coexistence of Catholics and Protestants in Haarlem after the Reformation, see Van Bueren, *Tot lof van Haarlem. Het beleid van de stad Haarlem ten aanzien van de kunstwerken uit geconfisqueerde geestelijke instellingen*; Frima Fox Hofrichter, Egbert Haverkamp-Begemann, and J. J. Temminck, *Haarlem: The Seventeenth Century* (New Brunswick, N.J.: The Jane Voorhees Zimmerli Art Museum, Rutgers, the State University of New Jersey, 1983); Luttikhuizen, "The Art of Devotion in Haarlem Before and After the Introduction of Calvinism," 281-99; Spaans, *Haarlem na de Reformatie. Stedelijke cultuur en kerkelijk leven, 1577-1620*.

<sup>42</sup> On the naming of chapels after patron saints and guilds, see Mochizuki, *The Netherlandish Image after Iconoclasm*, 39.

Haarlem).<sup>43</sup> Wils labeled the chapel with the letter "D" and the text: *altaar van de maagd Maria* (altar of the Virgin Mary); still today, the chapel remains dedicated to Mary.<sup>44</sup> Another Marian chapel—the Christmas Chapel—is located next to the first and is labeled on Wils's plan with the letter "C" and the label: *altaar van Christus geboorte, van't kersgild* (altar of the birth of Christ, of the Christmas Guild). Mary's integral role in Christ's birth underscores her significance to the Christmas Chapel. Both Marian chapels are located across the nave from the Brewers' Chapel and its small office. The literal proximity of the Brewers' Chapel to the Chapel of the Guild of Our Lady of the Seven Sorrows and the Christmas Chapel provides a convincing point of adjacency between Mary and the Brewers' Guild that Goltzius evokes in his *Circumcision*. Moreover, the Christmas Guild's membership included Goltzius's wife and his stepson, Jacob Matham, which signifies that the Guild and their chapel remained active through the Reformation and the church's reconsecration for Calvinist worship.<sup>45</sup>

<sup>43</sup> For two highly detailed ground plans of the St. Bavo Church before and after iconoclasm, see Mochizuki, *The Netherlandish Image after Iconoclasm*, 4, fig. 1.4, 30, fig. 1.7. For Wils's ground plan and its significance to Goltzius's *Circumcision*, see Bloom, "Mastering the Medium: Reference and Audience in Goltzius's Print of the *Circumcision*," 93, fig. 6; Gary Schwartz and Marten Jan Bok, *Pieter Saenredam: The Painter and His Time* (New York: Abbeville Press Publishers, 1989), 54, fig. 55.

<sup>44</sup> The full inscription for the chapel on Wils's plan reads: "altaar van de maagd Maria, en de grafstede van de Broukhorsten/Schagens kapel." The legend in the upper right corner of the sheet along the south side of the nave lists the chapel as: "D. Shagens kapel." The name "Broukhorsten" refers to the last name of the individual buried in the chapel. I am grateful to Rebecca van Beem for discussing the inscriptions in the ground plan with me. On the chapel, see Hugo Franciscus van Heussen, *Oudbeden en gestichten van Kennemerland, Amstelland, Noordholland; en Westveriesland; bebelzende de oudbeden, opkomste en benaminge der steden Haarlem, Alkmaar, Amsterdam* ... (Leiden: Christiaan Vermey, 1721), fol. 21; Jacob Johannes Graaf, "Plaatsbeschrijving der S. Bavo-kerk te Haarlem," *Bijdragen voor de geschiedenis van het Bisdóm Haarlem* 4 (1876): 50-51.

<sup>45</sup> For the Christmas Guild's use of its chapel, see Graaf, "Plaatsbeschrijving der S. Bavo-kerk te Haarlem," 47-50; McGee, *Cornelis Corneliszoon van Haarlem (1562-1638)*, 45; Mochizuki, *The Netherlandish Image after Iconoclasm*, 88 n. 33, 92 n. 62; A. F. O. van Sasse van Ysselt, *Beschrijving van het H. Kerstmisgilde te Haarlem* (The Hague: Nijhoff, 1905); H. E. Heerkens Thijssen, *Korte geschiedenis van het Heilig Kerstmisgilde te Haarlem* (Haarlem: Enschedé, 1942).

In addition to its chapels, the St. Bavo Church also included two important examples of Marian art. The first work, a life-size sculpture of Mary carved by Herpert Lieven Meinaertsz and painted by Symon van Waterlant from ca. 1453, was attached to the north column behind the high altar, which Wils labeled with the number "4" on his plan.<sup>46</sup> The second work, a sculpture of the Virgin and Child, decorated the northern façade of the St. Bavo Church before *and* after iconoclasm and the church's reconsecration. Attributed to Dirck Jacobszoon from 1496, the sculpture greeted visitors entering the church through the transept containing the two Marian chapels.<sup>47</sup> The statue continued to adorn the church's exterior until 1847, which underscores the relationship that Haarlem Calvinists maintained with Mary, or at least did not outright reject, prior to and during the years that Goltzius engraved the *Life of the Virgin*.<sup>48</sup> Moreover, the high altar itself, as Mia Mochizuki has explained, probably alternated in its dedication between Mary and St. Bavo in the late sixteenth and seventeenth centuries until it was ultimately named in honor of Our Lady of Ascension.<sup>49</sup>

Pieter Wils marked additional places on his ground plan in which altars and paintings bear dedications to other saints, including Catherine, Christopher, and of course, Bavo, the seventh-century Benedictine monk after whom the cathedral was named. Of all the St. Bavo Church's components that were dedicated to saints, its Marian chapel is the most intriguing given its continued existence to the present day. The dedications to Mary and artwork of her throughout the church indicate that

<sup>46</sup> For the sculpture, see Mochizuki, *The Netherlandish Image after Iconoclasm*, 66.

<sup>47</sup> Mochizuki, *The Netherlandish Image after Iconoclasm*, 29; J. J. Temminck, "Bavo en Maria," in *De Bavo te boek*, ed. J. N. de Boer et al. (Haarlem: Enschedé, 1985), 148-49.

<sup>48</sup> Mochizuki notes that a request was made in 1622 for the removal of the sculpture, which was obviously declined. After the sculpture was removed in 1847, it was placed inside the church where it is currently on display. Mochizuki, *The Netherlandish Image after Iconoclasm*, 113, 124 n. 17. See also Van Bueren, *Tot lof van Haarlem*, 219.

<sup>49</sup> For a discussion of the high altar's dedication, see Mochizuki, *The Netherlandish Image after Iconoclasm*, 66. See also Graaf, "Plaatsbeschrijving der S. Bavo-kerk te Haarlem," 15-16.

Calvinist Haarlemers not only maintained their relationship with the city's Catholics, but also continued to venerate Mary in their day-to-day lives.

Indeed, the relatively peaceful coexistence of Catholics and Protestants in Haarlem in the late sixteenth and seventeenth centuries allowed for a considerable measure of tolerance, if not affinity, on the part of Calvinists for religious traditions and art that were associated with pre-Reformation Christianity. J.J. Temminck has shown that Haarlem's flourishing economy from its textile trade, beer production, and ship building united its multiconfessional residents behind a common purpose to encourage Calvinist emigration from Flanders and Wallonia while at the same time allowing its pre-existing Catholic population to contribute to the social, religious, and economic fabric of the city.<sup>50</sup> Pieter Biesboer posits that Haarlem's wealthy elite, many of whom were brewers, remained Catholic after the city's Alteration to Calvinism (1577-78) even though the States General in The Hague prohibited Catholics from holding public office.<sup>51</sup> Haarlem's city officials permitted Catholics to flourish in business and the religious sphere in the St. Bavo Church. The Christmas Guild, mostly comprised of Catholics—Haarlem's wealthiest citizens—held control of its chapel even after 1581 when Catholics were forbidden to worship publicly in the city.<sup>52</sup>

During the period after the Alteration until around 1600, the majority of Haarlemers were Catholics who maintained their religious association with the Roman Catholic Church. As Biesboer demonstrates, since the Reformed government relied upon the Catholics' capital and influence in the marketplace, Calvinists continued to permit Catholics to serve as city council members.<sup>53</sup> Although Haarlem officials prohibited Catholics

<sup>50</sup> J.J. Temminck, "Haarlem: Its Social/Political History," in *Haarlem: The Seventeenth Century* (New Brunswick, N.J.: The Jane Voorhees Zimmerli Art Museum, Rutgers, the State University of New Jersey, 1983), 17-27.

<sup>51</sup> Pieter Biesboer, *Collections of Paintings in Haarlem, 1572-1745*, Documents for the History of Collecting: Netherlandish Inventories, 1, ed. Carol Togneri (Los Angeles: The Provenance Index of the Getty Research Institute, 2001), 7-8.

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid.*, 12-13.

<sup>53</sup> *Ibid.*, 13.

from openly flaunting their religiosity, the unusual allowances they provided Catholics in local government and their entitlement to the Christmas Chapel shows that Calvinists interacted with and supported Catholics to a degree that suggests their shared devotion to Mary.

Goltzius's choice to explore certain aspects of Mary's life at a time when Catholicism was severely weakened in the Republic after the Reformation indicates that Calvinists embraced Marian devotion even after the Alteration. Karel van Mander allocated more of his *Schilder-Boeck* to Goltzius and the *Life of the Virgin* series than to any other artist or work of art, which demonstrates that Goltzius's fellow artists also appreciated his interpretation of the series' Marian theme. Moreover, Dutch print publishers continued to sell new impressions of Goltzius's original six plates well into the latter half of the seventeenth century. Claes Jansz Visscher, the staunchly Calvinist print publisher and art dealer in Amsterdam, initially acquired the plates; later, his grandson, Nicolaes Visscher II, listed the prints in a sales catalogue of 1682 as "*Vrouwe leven Mariae, of de Meester-stucken, van H. Goltzius, 6 Bladen*" (Life of Lady Mary, or the Master-pieces, of H. Goltzius, 6 sheets).<sup>54</sup> Visscher's title for the series as the life of Mary distinguishes it from the life of Christ, as this selection of scenes is usually described. While we do not know if Goltzius himself identified the theme of his series as the life of Mary or the life of Christ, Visscher's title points to a decisive shift in devotional emphasis from Christ to Mary.

What, then, was the result of the resounding success of Goltzius's series? The local and international fame Goltzius acquired for his series in his own lifetime would have been impossible had his images been censured or banned by Calvinist authorities in Haarlem. We can argue, therefore, that the

<sup>54</sup> For Goltzius's series in Visscher's catalogue, see Nicolaes Visscher, *Catalogus van groote en kleene land-kaerten, steden, printkunst en boecken van Nicolaes Visscher van Amsterdam, op den Dam in de Visscher* (Amsterdam: Nicolaes Visscher, 1682), 7. For discussions of the listing, see Van der Coelen, *Rembrandts passie*, 54-55; Jan Piet Filedt Kok, "De wisselvallige reputatie van Hendrick Goltzius," *Bulletin van het Rijksmuseum* 52, no. 1 (2004): 29, 54 n. 14; Leeftang and Luijten, *Hendrick Goltzius (1558-1617)*, 322 n. 37.

series facilitated the production of later seventeenth-century Dutch works of art representing Marian themes, such as the numerous examples by Abraham Bloemaert. Moreover, the large quantity of prints and paintings that Dutch artists produced of the Holy Family and individual scenes from Mary's life, including those by Rembrandt, testify to Mary's continued popularity in Dutch art after the Reformation. Goltzius's *Life of the Virgin* manifests in microcosm the re-formation of Mary's role in the complex religious plurality of the Republic in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries. The series also informs our understanding of printmaking's role in promoting and manifesting Marian devotion in the Northern Netherlands after the Reformation.