A Survey of Recent Mariology

Eamon R. Carroll
A SURVEY OF RECENT MARIOLOGY

My customary opening triad (it is said putting things in threes is an Irish custom) consists of Dante, Jelly and the Lutheran-Roman Catholic Consultation report, The One Mediator, the Saints, and Mary. Dante's Divine Comedy is the object of a series of lectures by Jaroslav Pelikan: Eternal Feminines. The chapter on our Lady is lyrical, with the extraordinary appreciation of history and Christian tradition we have learned to expect from Pelikan (Eternal Feminines: Three Theological Allegories in Dante's Paradiso [Rutgers Univ., 1990]).

Friar of the Order of Preachers, Father Frederick Michael Jelly continues his steady pace of writing and lecturing on our Lady. The Catholic Home Study Institute of Leesburg, Virginia, has just published his correspondence course, the book-length Madonna: Mary in the Catholic Tradition, developed from his Our Sunday Visitor (1986) book of that title, which has itself reached three editions. Thought questions challenge the reader at the end of the chapters, covering the range of modern Mariology, including a chapter on St. Joseph.

Fr. Jelly's setting-out point, illustrative of his extensive ecumenical involvement, is: "During the course of the Catholic Tradition there has been but one Mary, mother of Jesus, and yet there have been many Madonnas," by which he describes the many portraits of Mary, differing according to the perspective of the viewer—historically, culturally, ethnically, and especially ecumenically. There are fourteen lessons to the new course: biblical material, patristic (e.g, the New Eve), major doctrines (Theotokos, ever-Virgin, Immaculate, Assumed). St. Thomas rates his own chapter as "common
doctor" of the Church. The liturgy and private devotions and apparitions are studied, and the concluding chapter is "A Madonna for All Christians."

Off and on over more than a quarter-century the Lutheran-Roman Catholic dialogue has approached the super-sensitive issue of the Virgin Mary. They gave their support some years ago (1978) to *Mary in the New Testament*, a collaborative assessment by twelve authors—Anglican, Catholic, Lutheran and Presbyterian (Reformed)—most of them members of the Dialogue. Meant for a general readership, *Mary in the New Testament* was co-published by a Catholic house and a Lutheran press and has gone through successive reprintings and various translations. As far back as 1975, the Consultation commissioned this reporter to draw up an essay on the doubly difficult themes of papal infallibility and the definitions of the Immaculate Conception and the Assumption; it was published under the title "Papal Infallibility and the Marian Definitions: Some Considerations," in *Carmelus* 26 (1979) 213–250.

Now, after seven years of work, the Dialogue has finally issued this new document, the eighth since they began (the seventh was the landmark *Justification by Faith* [Fall, 1983]). The new document is admirable in facing difficulties calmly and clearly—the divergent views on devotion to the Virgin in the Lutheran and Catholic worlds, still very far from consensus. Here are some of the high points. It has two main parts: part one, issues and perspectives, examines the sixteenth-century situation; part two, biblical and historical foundations. The biblical section considers the scriptures on Mary and the saints; the historical tracks the second to the sixteenth century, then the Reformation to the present. A basic statement, agreed to by both sides, is: "The good news of what God has done for us in Jesus Christ is the source and center of all Christian life and of the existence and work of the Church... our entire hope of justification and salvation rests on Christ Jesus and on the gospel... we do not place our ultimate trust in anything other then God's promise and saving work in Christ."
The problem is how to employ that criterion of authenticity in practice, e.g., the means of grace, the papacy, Mary and the Saints. The Reformation prohibition of calling on the saints in prayer, even saint Mary (invocation), has remained consistent from Luther on. A list of nineteen "divergences" is followed by the question: Need these be "Church-dividing"? It is said that unity might be achieved were two things to occur: 1) Lutherans acknowledge that Catholic teaching on Mary and the saints as set forth at the 2nd Vatican Council does not promote idolatrous belief or practice and is not opposed to the Gospel. (My own reaction is that I would have hoped informed Lutherans gave up long ago such suspicions of idolatry.) The second desideratum is: The Catholic Church acknowledge that in a closer, though still incomplete, fellowship, Lutherans, focusing on Christ, the one Mediator of the Bible, not be obliged to invoke the saints or to affirm the Immaculate Conception and the Assumption. It strikes me that these need to be investigated a great deal more, especially because of the four-and-a-half-century-long parallel growth of two Christian churches with quite different patterns of devotion and doctrine. The new document does note wisely that many factors affect devotional customs, so that "the people who have found spiritual consolation in them should also be treated with pastoral prudence." The further point is made with respect to the "hierarchy of truths" that "theological reflection cannot place all these doctrines and devotions on the same level." Obviously, Theotokos stands closer to the heart of the Gospel than the veneration of the saints, and so forth.

J. Pelikan's "eternal feminines" include Beatrice (donna mia), the Church (bella sposa), lady philosophy (as nutrix and magistra), but above all (his fifth chapter), "Mary as Nostra Regina." This Marian chapter is a commentary on the opening thirteen tercets of Paradiso, addressed to our Lady by "Mary's faithful Bernard," to whom might well be added her faithful Dante.

Dante's poem is probably the high point of medieval Marian poetry, surpassing even such masterpieces (which the Paradiso incorporates) as the Stabat Mater Dolorosa, the
A Survey of Recent Mariology

Regina Coeli, the Salve Regina and, in countless variations, the Ave Maria Stella. J. Pelikan quotes the Dante scholar Henry Osborn Taylor—that the whole Commedia begins and ends with the Virgin. The apostrophe to Mary that opens Paradiso is summation and goal of the entire poem. Among the almost limitless imagery Dante wove into his masterpiece are the themes of Mary's continuity with humanity, expressed in the second Eve symbolism. Already in the Purgatorio the virtues of Mary have appeared, in contrast to the imperfections being purged away, as faith, hope and charity, also humility, chastity and poverty—the last, even though there is question of what became of the frankincense, gold and myrrh of the Magi. Much is made of the Annunciation and Gabriel's role. On Florentine calendars the new age began with the Annunciation, and for many Christian centuries the legal new year also began on March 25.

These divisions follow: 1. Scientific periodicals and annuals; 2. Magisterial documents; 3. Scripture and tradition; 4. Doctrine: general and specific; 5. Liturgy, devotion and devotions; 6. Ecumenism; 7. Miscellany. Finally, the appendix is a "Further Selection of Recent Writings."

1. Scientific periodicals and annuals

"The figure of Mary in the Jewish-Christian apocrypha" is the study highlighted on the cover of the third fascicle of the 1991 Ephemerides Mariologicae (vol. 41). It is the first of three articles by C. Vidal Manzanares; a second appeared in the fourth fascicle of 1991, "Mary in Jewish-Christian archaeology of the first three centuries"; the third is still due, "The influence of Jewish-Christianity on Marian liturgy." In the two articles that have appeared some of the points are these: the Ebionites are not considered, for they did not accept the divinity of Jesus; the author does take up the Protoevangelium Jacobi, the Christian sections (additions) of the Ascension of Isaiah, and certain texts in book eight of the Sibylline Oracles. The Protoevangelium has inventive hagiography in defense of the virginitas in partu and post partum. The Christian portion of the Sibylline Oracles is similar. Jewish-Christianity deserves more recognition for its
A Survey of Recent Mariology

correspondence to the development of doctrine and devotion about Mary, in repeating and expanding the gospel testimony, however fancifully.

The archeology article offers further evidence of the role of primitive Jewish-Christianity as the earliest post-biblical veneration of the Mother of Jesus. Using recent investigations by the late B. Bagatti, great Franciscan scholar, the author takes up Nazareth, ‘Ain Karem (the Visitation), Bethlehem, Calvary, and the tomb of Mary at Gethsemane. The history of these shrines and places of pilgrimage testifies that in popular piety the Mother of Jesus was closely joined to her Son. It was from Christians of this Jewish Palestinian world that such veneration sprang, not from the adoption and/or adaptation of pagan hellenistic practices and cults.

The same third number of the 1991 *Ephemerides Mariologicae* had a long article by A. Molina Prieto on the Mariological interpretation of the Canticle of Canticles in St. Amadeus of Lausanne (d. 1159), famous among other accomplishments for eight Marian homilies. Brother John Samaha, S.M., of our Society, has here part two of his article “The Marian Doctrine of Venerable Chaminade.” Part one appeared in 1990. The focus of Samaha’s article is the presentation of Chaminade’s doctrine in the work of the late Emil Neubert, S.M. (d. 1967).

The section “Notae” has the article on the faith of Mary in the pope’s *Redemptoris Mater*, by Alfonso Rivera, C.M.F.

The cover of the final (fourth) 1991 fascicle highlights the article by Antonio M. Calero, S.D.B., on post-conciliar pontifical Mariology. The teachings of Paul VI and John Paul II are taken up thematically, e.g., for Paul VI, Mary and the Church, Mary and the Holy Spirit; for John Paul II, Mary as believer, Mary and woman. G. Girones writes of the motherly mediation of Mary. Salvatore M. Perella, O.S.M., offers a short piece on the state of Mariology on the eve of Vatican II: it is a précis of the author’s S.T.D. thesis, defended at the Marianum, June, 1991, of which the full title was: *I “vota” e i “consilia” mariani dei vescovi italiani per il Concilio Ecumenico Vatican II, importanze della mariologia e questione della corredenzone mariana*. At a distance of thirty years since
A Survey of Recent Mariology

the Council opened, this study fills a significant gap, and it is to be hoped similar investigations will be pursued in the views of the bishops and other conciliar Fathers of other countries and language groups.

The Chronicle reports the forty-fifth meeting of the Spanish Mariological Society, at Avila, September, 1991, fourth centenary of the death of John of the Cross. The Spanish theme was "the study and structure of Mariology at the present time." Papal documents and reviews complete the issue.

The Roman quarterly *Miles Immaculatae* comes from the international Marian center of Kolbian formation, from the Conventual Franciscans. The twenty-seventh year concluded with the combined third and fourth numbers (July–Dec.), 1991, bringing the volume to 294 pages. True to its origins, the journal contains a great deal on the spirituality of St. Maximilian Kolbe, martyred at Auschwitz, 1941.

The lead-off item, according to custom, is a long section of documents of the pope. Subsequent sections are: Marian doctrine, Marian life, Kolbian studies, and then "reviews." Bishop J. Wojtkowski writes on the cult of Mary in the Western Church in the years 1964 to 1987, in terms of *Lumen gentium, Marialis cultus* and *Redemptoris Mater* (trans. into Italian from Polish, short and good, pp. 180–191). His conclusion is that since the Council the Church Universal has cultivated an ecclesio-typical Marian piety, preferring the imitation of the holy Virgin to invoking her as Mediatrix. A helpful brief table supports that conclusion by reference to four rubrics, each with a matching form of piety: divine maternity—praise; virginity—love; mediation—invocation; and holiness—imitation.

An English article by J. M. Pawley, O.F.M. Conv., is on the book by an unidentified author of the late-thirteenth/early-fourteenth century: "Mary: her participation in Christ's sufferings as presented in *Meditationes Vitae Christi*." R. Orecki's article (in Spanish) on the Milizia dell'Immacolata and new evangelization applies the teaching of Kolbe. G. Bartosik writes of the relationship between the Holy Spirit and Mary as the principle of Marian mediation in Kolbe's
A Survey of Recent Mariology


The first (of two) fascicle of the 1991 Marianum (annus LIII, whole number 141) has seven articles, one entry under "Miscellanea," one chronicle item, a hundred pages on books, and, under "In pace Christi," a bibliography of the late Salvatore M. Meo (d. 1990) and the conference in his memory given by Angelo Amato, S.D.B., on May 12, 1991: "Salvatore M. Meo O.S.M. (1927–1990) e il 'novum' in mariologia."


The miscellanea entry is an extended notice on Ufficio per le celebrazioni liturgiche del Sommo Pontefice. Liturgie dell'Oriente cristiano a Roma nell'anno mariano 1987–88. Testi e studi (Città del Vaticano, 1990) by Jesús Castellano Cervera, O.C.D. The extensive book review section arranges its great panorama under many headings: biblica, patristica, theologica, encyclopaedica, and congressus-symposia-opera miscellanea (where the lead item is Kevin Duffy's long review of Mary in Doctrine and Devotion, ed. A. Stacpoole, from the Liverpool, 1989, congress of the Ecum. Soc. B.V.M.
A Survey of Recent Mariology

[Dublin, 1990]). Further rubrics in the book reviews are: oecumenica, spiritualitas marialis, iconographica, historia pietatis marialis, sanctuaria-apparitiones b. Mariae Virginis, and orationes-homiliae.

In 1989, The Spanish Mariological Society met at Toledo in commemoration of the 1500th anniversary of the Third Council of Toledo (A.D. 589), giving rise to volume 55 of Estudios Marianos (Salamanca, 1990): Doctrina y piedad mariana en torno al III Concilio de Toledo (a. 589). Outstanding in the series of the eighteen national Visigothic councils that ran from 400 to 702, III Toledo was called by the Arian king who became a Catholic (his uncle was St. Leander of Seville). It represented the triumph of the faith of Nicea, as reaffirmed by Chalcedon. Fourteen papers explore the ramifications of III Toledo under many headings, e.g., Marian doctrine in Spain before that date (E. Llamas), sources of ancient Spanish liturgy in regard to Mariology (M. Garrido), the teachings of Isidore of Seville (Díez Merino and I. Bengoechea), Ildephonsus (D. Muñoz León, A. Molina Prieto and J. Cascante Dávila), and Leander of Seville (G. Calvo Moralejo and I. Vázquez Janeiro) are all taken up. Two papers deal with Marian devotion in Toledo in the period fourth to eighth centuries and early Marian architecture.

The forty-fourth meeting of the Spanish Society took place at Saragossa, September, 1990; it was the golden anniversary of the Society’s origins, at Saragossa, in 1940. The theme of the 56th volume of Estudios Marianos (published in Salamanca 1991) was Sociedad mariológica. Española 50 años de historia aportación a la mariología. There are three sections to the proceedings: 1) history of the Society and its contributions, 2) other aspects of the Society’s service, 3) Mariology and pastoral action. The authors reflect the cream of Spanish theology: E. Llamas, Díez Merino, G. Bonano, I. Bengoechea, M. L. Llamera, and many others. The topics cover liturgy, scripture, spiritual motherhood, perpetual virginity, and the title Mother of the Church. “Other aspects...” are mentioned: the journal Miriam, Benedictine authors, Carmelite authors, Basilio de S. Pablo de la Cruz (d. 1968), the methodology of de Aldama, Our Lady of the
Pillar, and the theology and pastoral action associated with Marian sanctuaries (456 pp. in all).

The forty-seventh session of the French Mariological Society was held at the shrine of Notre-Dame de la Trinité at Blois, and its *acta* form the *Etudes mariales* volume *Le mystère de Marie et la femme aujourd'hui* (Paris, 1991). Charles Molette does the lengthy introduction. There are three main sections: 1) Magisterium since Vatican II, 2) witness of Christian life, 3) theological reflections. Johann Roten studies in depth the documents of Paul VI, showing thereby how carefully and thoroughly the pontiff considered Mary and womanhood and the feminist questions. Theodore Koehler does much the same for John Paul II, taking *Mulieris dignitatem* as his point of departure. For the witness of Christian life, the first essay is by R. de Tryon-Montalembert on the renewed ceremonial for the consecration of virgins in the Latin Church; the second is by the Russian Tatiana Goritcheva, “En Russie, la femme et la Mère de Dieu.” The editors feel obliged to utter a disclaimer with respect to the final article on the woman in the shadow of Eve and the light of Mary, by B. de Margerie.

*Etudes mariales* (vol. 48), *La Vierge Marie dans la piété du peuple chrétien depuis Vatican II* (Paris, 1992), comes from the meeting held in 1991 at Notre-Dame des Trois-Epis, commemorating the fifth centenary of “the first appearance of Mary in modern times.” President of the Society, Msgr. Charles Molette, does the introduction. Joseph Bordes, rector at Lourdes, writes of the development of Marian devotion there since Vatican II. Johann Roten, S.M., of the International Marian Research Institute (Marian Library, University of Dayton), reflects on the extensive poll he ran of the opinions of young people in the United States about our Lady, with an overall optimistic conclusion. René Laurentin speaks of the discovery of Mary in the charismatic movement. Henry Chavannes, of Switzerland, member of the Reformed Church, longtime associate of the Society and of ecumenical enterprises, writes of “La question mariale dans le Pays de Vaud,” with a soaring conclusion of tribute to the holy Virgin.
A Survey of Recent Mariology

*Nouveaux Cahiers Marials* appears quarterly: numbers 25 through 28 cover 1992. The February 1992 issue raises the question: Is Mary optional or part of the structure of the faith in formation? L. B. Pineau comments on the June, 1988, letter from the congregation for Catholic education. There is a review of Jean Stern’s third volume on LaSalette, covering the period May 1 to November 4, 1854. The theme of number 26 (Mai 1992) is “compassion in the Church.” L. B. Pineau studies the theme in the Bible; J.-C. Lavigne in L. Chardon (d. 1651). “Témoignages” gives compassionate letters from St. Augustine, Charles de Foucauld (d. 1916), and Pierre Teilhard de Chardin (d. 1955). August saw number 27; in a society progressively moving towards approving euthanasia, the subject is most timely: *l’accompagnement des malades “et a l’heure de notre mort.”* One article comes from the French bishops; another is on the presence of Mary at the Cross and at the hour of our death (by Marie-Pascale Gonnet); there are also short pieces from a medical doctor and a Camillian chaplain. The final 1992 number is on St. Maximilian Kolbe and the Immaculate Conception. Christian Duquoc, O.P., explains the dogma; Noël Rath, O.S.M., offers his theological reflection about it. On October 10, 1982, Pope John Paul II canonized St. Maximilian; extracts of his homily are given here. There is a French translation of the Holy Father’s Angelus remarks from Sunday, March 1, 1992, on the Basilica of the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception in Washington, D.C. A reproduction of the early Egyptian papyrus fragment with the *Sub tuum praesidium* (in Greek) completes the number, with a commentary by A. Niccacci. Announced for 1993 are these numbers: 29: Les Fêtes Mariales; 30: Marie de la terre; 31: Marie dans l’Ecole Française et chez les Mystiques; 32: Catherine Labouré et les Jeunesses Mariales.

2. *Magisterial documents*

Generous selections of documents are printed regularly in such journals as *Marianum, Ephemerides Mariologicae, Miles Immaculatae,* also in *The Pope Speaks* (U.S.A., every
other month) and *The Pope Teaches* (monthly, English Catholic Truth Society), as well as in *Documentation Catholique* and similar periodicals in other languages. A ready, condensed source is the annual *Catholic Almanac* (Our Sunday Visitor Press, Huntington, IN); e.g., the 1992 edition has many entries, papal and otherwise. There is a report on the Holy Father's visit to Fatima, May 10–13, 1991, with excerpts from addresses and with the repetition of the act of entrustment of the human race to Mary, Mother of the Redeemer, on the tenth anniversary of the attempt on his life. His trip to Poland (the fourth), June 1–9, 1991, is reported similarly, also a fifth trip to Poland and first to Hungary, August 13–20. The *Almanac* has also excerpts from a pastoral letter on evangelization issued by the American bishops, “Heritage and Hope: Evangelization in America” (Nov. 15, 1990). *Pace* the handwringing about the Columbus quincentenary, the bishops' document underscores the positive values of the coming of Christianity. The Vatican congregation for religious orders spoke similarly to the “confederation of Latin American religious” (March, 1990): “Remembering the 500th anniversary cannot be only penitential. It must also be eucharistic, a thanksgiving for the message of salvation... The great challenge is the new evangelization and not the rediscovery of history.”

3. Scripture and tradition

The November-December 1991 issue of *Review for Religious* (vol. 50, 913–23) has the article “Mary Mysteries in the Public Ministry of Jesus,” by Sister Anne Hennessy, C.S.J. Among her references are studies by S. Freyne, John Knox, J. Duncan Derrett, John R. Donahue and Bruce Molina. The last had two articles in the summer 1990 *Biblical Theology Bulletin* (vol. 20, no. 3), a number dedicated to the theme “Mary—Woman of the Mediterranean.” I did no more than touch on that journal at the very end of the “Miscellany” rubric in last year's Survey (*Marian Studies* 42, p. 197). There I described the five articles as “a mixed bag”—some illuminating; others incredibly uncritical, namely, two articles by Bruce Molina who accepted almost as “gospel” the shop-
A Survey of Recent Mariology


At the same time Molina's articles do open up the neglected world of a woman's life in the Nazareth of Mary's day. In gentler fashion the other authors in that issue of *Biblical Theology Bulletin* also investigate the Mediterranean world of that era. Fr. Jerome Neyrey writes of “Maid and Mother in Art and Literature,” with helpful illustrations to bring out his point: “Although Mary is unique in the Mediterranean world as a virgin Mother, the presentation of her virginity and her maternity fully reflect the general cultural evaluation of females in Mediterranean culture.” He offers fascinating evidence in both literature and iconography, e.g., artists picture Mary at the Annunciation customarily in the space reserved to women: the angel Gabriel is often separated by a door or wall. The holy maid of Nazareth is busy at womanly tasks: spinning or drawing water. Mary’s behavior is appropriate for guarding her virginity, the womanly virtue in her culture held to be “the ultimate female virtue.” The article by J. Pilch contrasts the Mediterranean model of Mary’s day to our American twentieth-century model and provides a five-point chart of values across the two cultures. One of these points is how human beings relate to one another. The ancient Mediterranean had a collateral or group focus; the modern is individual. Pilch backs up his claims by biblical examples, e.g., as a relative solicitous for family honor, Mary intervened at Cana—exactly what a sensitive female family member would do to avoid the shame of the wine disaster. Again, apart from the Annunciation (though even there, as we have seen, respect is paid to the reserved aspect of the woman’s part of the house, as artists have also perceived), Mary is presented normally with other women. The synoptic
story of the “true kinsmen” has Mary in the company of the family (Luke 8 and parallels). On Calvary, Jesus provides for her care by entrusting her to an adult male, the beloved disciple; in that culture she would not, could not, be left alone.

As J. Pilch admits, there are other viable approaches with strong scriptural support, such as Mary as the faithful disciple, a model employed by Paul VI (Marialis cultus) and John Paul II (Redemptoris Mater). Each person must strive to live as disciple of Jesus within his or her own culture with its distinctive values. He concludes: “No matter what image of Mary is chosen for one’s spirituality or popular devotion, it is important to respect the cultural distinctiveness of Mary before attempting to universalize her virtues for worldwide imitation, and to resist enculturating her in a given culture so deeply that she is no longer the Mediterranean maiden.”

Under the heading of patristic Mariology, the highlight is the completion of the four-volume Italian Testi mariani del primo millennio of which Luigi Gambero, S.M. (member of IMRI and regular summer lecturer at the University of Dayton), is one of the editors; the others are G. Gharib, E. M. Toniolo and G. DiNola. Volume three came out in 1990: Padri ed altri autori latini; volume four in 1991: I Padri e altri autori orientali (Città Nuova Editrice, Rome). Fr. Gambero has also put together for a large public the volume Maria nel pensiero dei padri della Chiesa (Ed. Paoline, Cisinello Balsamo [Milano], 1991), as reviewed by D. Fernández in Ephemerides Mariologicae 41, 4 (1991) 466 (along also with his review on the fourth volume of the aforementioned set).

Sophia Institute Press of Manchester, N.H., is a non-profit publishing enterprise founded seven years ago by John L. Barger, an apostolate he began with his wife Susan and has continued since her death. The new press has already earned high marks for its titles and the design of its books. Authors include Alice von Hildebrand and her late husband Dietrich (both on marriage), Francois Mauriac (Holy Thursday: An Intimate Remembrance). Sophia has published two titles of St. Thomas Aquinas. One is God’s Greatest Gifts: The Commandments and the Sacraments. The earlier one, and my interest here, is The Three Greatest Prayers: Commentaries on
the Lord's Prayer, the Hail Mary, the Apostles' Creed, a choice of both the Catholic Digest Book Club and the Conservative Book Club. These were sermons the saint preached in Naples in 1273, the year before he died. They were given in his native Neapolitan dialect in San Domenico to the townspeople during Lent. Reginald of Piperno put them in Latin summaries subsequently. The great theologian—holy man that he also was, and primarily!—was leading people to holiness by his preaching; there are hundreds of scriptural citations. I am reminded of the comment of St. Thomas' Dominican brother Y. Congar that only the Church reads the Bible correctly, the more so in view of certain recent statements by professedly Catholic authors challenging not only our Lady's lifelong virginity but even the virginal conception of Jesus. The translation is the 1937 one by Laurence Shapcote, O.P., with added subheadings and other reader helps. The foreword is by Ralph McInerney, philosopher of Notre Dame University and creator of the Father Dowling detective stories; Mr. Barger adds a short editor's preface (1990, xvii & 199 pp.).

I have not tracked it down yet, but I ran across a reference to a book by the Franciscan philosopher and scholar Alan Wolter, O.F.M., Duns Scotus: Mary's Architect.

Saint Anselm: A Portrait in a Landscape represents a lifetime of study by the great medievalist Sir Richard Southern (Cambridge Univ. Press, New York, 1990). In compelling context, the author writes of Anselm's Prayers and Meditations with their Marian content; he does the same for the defense of the Immaculate Conception by the Saxon secretary Eadmer, De Conceptione Sanctae Mariae, attributed to Anselm himself for centuries and finally identified as Eadmer's by H. Thurston and T. Slater only in 1904. As early as the English Carmelite John Baconthrope, hence by the 1320s, Eadmer's little meditation was influencing acceptance of the Marian privilege, along with restoration in England of the pre-Norman feast through the province of Canterbury in 1328 (in Southern's book, especially pp. 432–6).

Jumping ahead to the modern period: the Montfort Fathers got out in 1991 an English translation of a book by Benedetta Papasogli, Montfort a Prophet for Our Times, from
A Survey of Recent Mariology

the 1979 Italian. F. W. Scragg, S.M.M., of the Montfort curia, contributes a foreword dated April 28, 1990, feast of St. Louis. The book has much on our Lady, e.g., chapter nine of part one: “Jesus Living in Mary,” with its Olier overtones (from Montfort Fathers, Bay Shore, NY). According to its advertisement, Montfort is one of the nine topics considered in the book edited by Bradley C. Hanson, Spirituality: Methodological and Historical Essays (Scholars Press, Atlanta, 1990). Among the others are Newman, Margaret Mary Alacoque, Jean de Chantal.


4. Doctrine: general and specific

Paging through the third volume of Marienlexikon (Regensburg, 1991), Greco to Leib, is a wonderful treat. Of its hundreds of articles, each with a bibliography, here is an inadequate sampling. Famous people include Harnack, Hildegard of Bingen, Hopkins, Huysmans, Irenaeus, Isaac of the Star, Jacob of Sarug, John Chrysostom, C. Jung (at
A Survey of Recent Mariology

length), Kolping, Columbus (our Lady's place in his life), and Catherine Labouré, followed by B. J. Labre. Countries and cities are taken up, e.g., Ireland, also Knock Shrine, India, Indonesia, Japan, Croatia and Yugoslavia, Korea, and a long article on Constantinople. Great attention is given to Christian art, with a fair number of black and white illustrations, under such headings as icons and iconography, with individual expansions, as Hodegetria. Doctrines receive extended treatment: Mary's virginity, her coronation, and such charming entries as Mary as a child, with nursery rhymes to her Son. The wedding feast of Cana is discussed both exegetically and artistically.

Oxford University Press has issued a two-volume Encyclopedia of the Early Church (up to A.D. 750) (from the Inst. Patr. Augustinianum of Rome), with some 2300 articles. Women present include such names as Monica, Nonna, Macrina, Melania and, of course, Mary. The book Spirit, Saints, and Immortality by Patrick Sherry (SUNY, Albany, 1984) has no special allusions to Mary, but develops well the importance of holiness in Christianity; its third chapter is “Saints.” Templeton Prize winner Stanley Jaki, O.S.B., published in 1990 his essay, The Virgin Birth and the Birth of Science (Christendom Press, Front Royal, VA). The Crossroad (New York, 1991) title Christology and Spirituality by William M. Thompson has much on Mary, particularly chapter seven, “The Virgin Mary as a Christological Source.”

In 1987, the University of California Press published Barbara Newman's Sister of Wisdom: St. Hildegard's Theology of the Feminine. Given the enormous recent interest in Hildegard, Newman's book is an important presentation of the thought of this remarkable twelfth-century mystic and Benedictine abbess, whose prophetical gifts made her one of the best-known women of her age. The word polymath might well be applied to her, for her writings and lectures covered a vast range—from prayer to medicine, from music to art. Like her sisters Catherine of Siena and Teresa of Spain, Hildegard spoke out fearlessly against corruption in the Church, the venality and immorality of the clergy, etc.
Newman shows the brilliant and prayerful Hildegard as in no sense a feminist in the contemporary sense of the word, even less in its pejorative overtones; and her cosmic consciousness is totally Christian, incarnational, having nothing in common with New Age thought. Newman's book is so rich in content and so lucidly written, working from original sources and providing her own translations from Hildegard's convoluted Latin, that it is difficult to do it justice in any brief review. Chapter five is "The Mother of God." Virginity for Hildegard was the outstanding Christian virtue, of which the Virgin Mary was the supreme exemplar. Mary is the "primeval dawn"; she was predestined; God foresaw her in creating Eve. In her, Sapientia/wisdom achieved a high point. In her visions the seer saw three archetypal mothers: Caritas—Mary—Ecclesia: "All bring God into the world in the flesh." "The motherhood of Mary is at the center of the wheel of divinity." Newman writes: "With the Mother of God we come to the heart of Hildegard's theology of the feminine." Chapter seven, "Sister of Wisdom," is also title of the book.

Mary is model to priests. As Ambrose and other writers, so Hildegard sees the virginal conception of Jesus prolonged in eucharistic conversion. Here her eucharistic teaching has parallels to Syriac views. We might note that in the epiclesis of the Eucharist the same parallel is maintained, even to the choice of words: the same Holy Spirit that brought about the incarnation in the womb of the Virgin Mary brings about the change of bread and wine into the Body and Blood of the same Christ, now in his risen state. The process by which the Holy Spirit transforms all creation lies at the heart of both the Incarnation and the Eucharist.

5. Liturgy, devotion and devotions
Fr. Joncas has given us at this convention important light on the Marian liturgy. An advertisement just come from St. Bede Publications of Petersham, Massachusetts, lists the four volumes of *A Word in Season*, from the "friends of Henry Ashworth, O.S.B." Ashworth (d. 1980), it is said, had read all of Migne in making his selections. The four volumes are a two-year cycle of readings for the monastic liturgy, in
A Survey of Recent Mariology

addition to The Liturgy of the Hours. Both ancient and modern readings are chosen. Volume four (latest addition to the set) has readings for the celebrations of the saints, presumably also for our Lady.


On his deathbed he asked her [Lady Lovat, with whom he was staying] to say the rosary in French and German, so that he could appreciate the beauty of the words in both languages. Then, almost as if by an act of grace (such as might have occurred in one of his own books), an Italian prisoner-of-war, who was working on the estate, appeared at the bedroom door and began to recite the rosary in Italian.

Lawrence Cunningham, chairman of the department of theology at the University of Notre Dame, wrote recently that so many studies on pilgrimage are appearing that “the study of pilgrimages has become a growth industry in academe” (in *Commonweal*, February 28, 1992). Here are some recent titles: *Christian Pilgrimage in Modern Western Europe*, by Mary Lee Nolan and Sidney Nolan (University of No. Carolina, Chapel Hill, NC, 1989); John Eade and Michael J. Sallnow, *Contesting the Sacred: The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage* (Routledge, NY, 1991). They take issue with the Turners (Victor and Edith), whose 1978 book is a standard reference: *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture*: 

https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian_studies/vol43/iss1/11

Sandra L. Zimdars-Swartz’s Encountering Mary: From La Salette to Medjugorje (Princeton Univ. Press, 1991) has received several significant reviews. My own (favorable) one was in Theological Studies 53 (June, 1992) 376–8; Sister Carol Frances Jegen, B.V.M., did it for Worship 66 (September, 1992) 461–3; US Catholic for February, 1992, had the notice by Gerald M. Costello, under the title “What Catholics see in Mary.” Both Sandra L. Zimdars-Swartz and her husband gave papers in the English-language section of the international Mariological Congress at Kevelaer, Germany, 1987 (see Marian Studies 42 [1991] 193–4).

The 1992 Catholic Almanac has short articles on “criteria of apparitions” taken from the 1990 Civitá Cattolica articles by Giandomenico Mucci, S.J., who professes scepticism on Medjugorje. There is also a summary of the report of November 27/28, 1990, signed by nineteen of twenty Yugoslav bishops who indicate that “on the basis of research conducted so far one cannot affirm that supernatural apparitions or revelation are involved” and offer the pastoral suggestion that better liturgical services be provided pilgrims to Medjugorje, to help avoid practices not in agreement with the spirit of the Church (pp. 76, 265). Walter T. Brennan, O.S.M., of our Society, wrote of “Marian Spirituality and Apparitions” for Review for Religious (May–June, 1992) 417–24.

The Blessed Virgin figures prominently in Michael R. Candelaria’s Popular Religion and Liberation: The Dilemma
of Liberation Theology (SUNY, Albany, NY, 1991). Carlos Scannone of Argentina sees popular religion as liberating because it is of the people; Juan Luis Segundo of Uruguay disparages popular religion as incapable of contributing to revolutionary change.

6. Ecumenism

Along with the common statement in The One Mediator, the Saints, and Mary, from the eighth Lutheran-Roman Catholic consultation, the volume published in early 1992 contains a chronological list of sessions and papers that led up to the final statement—from session 37, 1983, through session 50, 1990. A selection of fifteen of these papers are published here, about a third of them, covering scripture (Fitzmyer and Reumann), patristics (Eno), liturgy (K. McDonnell), medieval period (Froehlich on Libri carolinorum, Tavard on Scotus and the Immaculate Conception), Trent (the late Carl J. Peter), Luther and Lutheranism (Gritsch and R. B. Bertram), and with F.M. Jelly on the Immaculate Conception, A. Dulles on the Assumption, J.F. Johnson on “Contemporary Lutheranism and Mary and the saints,” Sister E. Johnson on Mary as mediatrix, and G. O. Fordes’ “Is Invocation of the Saints an Adiaphoron?” The well-produced volume is dedicated, over the line ut omnes unum sint, to five great men who worked in these consultations: Joseph Andrew Sittler (d. 1987), Jerome D. Quinn (d. 1988), Carl J. Peter (d. 1991), Fred Kramer (d. 1991), Bishop Austin Murphy (d. 1991).

The Ecumenical Society of the B.V.M., both the original English society and its American offshoot, continues to publish. The U.S. group meets twice a year in the Washington, D.C., area; two papers are normally read, and these are sent to all who request them (for a small fee to cover postage). At the fall meeting, October, 1991 (15th anniversary), in Richmond’s Emmanuel Episcopal Church, Mary Ann DeTrana spoke on “The Letters of Paul VI and John Paul II on the Virgin Mary: Evolution of a Dialogue,” and Rev. C. Albert Wagaman on the new Lutheran-Catholic document. Both DeTrana and Wagaman had given these papers at the international conference held in Winchester, England, July, 1991.
Dr. Donald Dawe reported on the Winchester meeting. Earlier this month of May, at Oblate College (May 2, 1992) in Washington, Dr. Peter Yeager, secretary of the American ESBVM, gave the paper "Mr. Eliot and the Mother of God; or, Why the Archishop went to Walsingham," and Fr. George Kirwin spoke on "The Theological Meaning and Spiritual Significance of Marian Apparitions."

American members of the Society receive also the Newsletter and other publications from England, as the recent pamphlet by Margaret Speaks, The Two Lady Altars in Canterbury Cathedral (read in the crypt of the cathedral, Nov. 11, 1989; published Jan. 1992). The January, 1992, Newsletter (no. 49, New Series) lists eighteen branches, most of them with reports, including Rome and Ireland. General secretary Fr. Alberic Stacpoole reviews Macquarrie's Mary for All Christians and Eamon Duffy's CTS pamphlet What Catholics Believe About Mary. Edward Yarnold, assistant general secretary, begins a series of articles on "the names of Mary," with the first two (of twelve) here: "Mary," and "Mother of Jesus." What V. Taylor did years ago in his famous The Names of Jesus, Yarnold attempts more modestly; names still to come are: mother of the Lord, wife of Joseph, virgin, blessed one, full of grace, handmaid of the Lord, humble one, believing woman, pierced one and "the woman."

The ESBVM published in September, 1992, a paper read to the Oxford branch on October 17, 1990: Why Did St. Thomas Reject the Doctrine of the Immaculate Conception of Mary? by Marcus Hodges, O.P.

7. Miscellany

"From the bookshelf," by Philip C. Fischer, S.J., in Review for Religious 51 (May-June, 1992) mentions a number of recent titles on our Lady, prefacing them with this remark: "May is Mary's month and I—I may need, not more books but the quiet clicking of my rosary beads. Some recent books, though, do in fact gently help us either to get those beads out or to find more devotion in them." Among the titles he mentions is Ignacio Larrañaga, The Silence of Mary (St. Paul Publications, Boston, 1992, 230 pp.).
Larrañaga is also listed in the rundown of Marian titles by Emmanuel Sullivan, O.C.D., in the Winter, 1992, issue of *Spiritual Life* (vol. 38). The cover story of that same number is “Mary, Mysticism and Mission,” pointing to the article by Kenneth M. Voiles: “Prophetic Pilgrimage: Fiat and Votum in the Spiritual Journey.” Another article is “Our Lady, Seat of Wisdom,” by G. Mangiaracina, O.C.D.

*Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe: Mother of God, Mother of the Americas* is the title of the illustrated catalogue from the exhibition marking the 500th anniversary of the encounter of two cultures, 25 July—19 September 1992, The Elizabeth Perkins Prothro Galleries, Bridwell Library, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University, Dallas, TX, prepared by the curator, Edwin E. Sylvest Jr., who offers a very personal statement “from a United Methodist.”

**FURTHER SELECTION OF RECENT WRITINGS**

This appendix includes titles that came to notice as late as December, 1992, when the Survey was going to press; some will be discussed in greater detail in the 1993 Survey. The order is the customary sequence: A. Magisterium, B. Scripture and tradition, C. Doctrine: general and particular, D. Liturgy and devotion, E. Ecumenism, F. Miscellany and last-minute items.

**A. Magisterium**


4. *Con Maria accanto alla croce*, letter from the prior general of the Servites, August 9, 1992, on the occasion of the anniversary of the approval of the feast of the Seven Dolors (1692); from Hubert M. Moons, O.S.M.


B. Scripture and tradition


A Survey of Recent Mariology


10. (According to Nouvelle Cahiers Marials) At the Centre de documentation mariste of Paris, a collective volume has been published to commemorate the second centenary of the birth of Ven. Jean Claude Colin: Des Pères maristes parlent de Marie.


C. Doctrine: general and particular


A Survey of Recent Mariology


D. Liturgy and devotion


A Survey of Recent Mariology


E. Ecumenism


6. John P. Meier, "The Brothers and Sisters of Jesus in Ecumenical Perspective," in *Catholic Biblical Quarterly*
A Survey of Recent Mariology

54 (Jan. 1992) 1–28: presidential address to the Catholic Biblical Association, August, 1991; this reviewer seriously doubts that the appeal to the "hierarchy of truths" will be helpful here, recalling Newman's recourse to our Lady's lifelong virginity as a capital instance of development of doctrine.


F. Miscellany and last-minute items

1. Marian Library Newsletter (address at end of this Survey) appears twice a year. Number 24 (new series), Spring, 1992, has J. Roten's "A Survey of Marian Art"; "Evangelization, the Church, and Mary"; book reviews; and more. Number 25, Winter 1992–93, commemorates the library's 50th year (1993); continues J. Roten's "Survey of Marian Art"; describes the Sutton (clippings, 50,000 + ) file; reports on the international congress on our Lady, Huelva, Spain, September, 1992, and the convention of the Mariological Society of America, Houston, May, 1992.

2. Newsletter of the Ecumenical Society of the BVM, new series, no. 51, October 1992: Reverend Roger Greenacre, chancellor of Chichester Cathedral, "I sing of a maiden"; program of the 25th-anniversary celebration of the Society at Aylesford (nr. Maidstone), Kent, October 26–29; reports from the branches; Yarnold's "The Names of Mary."


4. All seven volumes of the acta from the international Mariological/Marian congress held at Kevelaer (Germany), September, 1987, have been published (1991/
A Survey of Recent Mariology

2) by the Pontificia Academia Mariana Internationalis (Via Merulana, 124, 00185 Rome, Italy). Volume I is titled: *De cultu mariano saec. XIX et XX usque ad Concilium Vaticanum II studia in sessionibus plenariorum exhibita.*


9. *Servitium Pietatis,* Festschrift for Cardinal Groër on his 70th birthday (ed. Anna Coret and I. Fux, O.S.B.) (Sal Terrae, Maria Roggendorf, 1989): in section one, "Maria," various articles; also under section two, "Spirituality," and under section three, "vowed life" (Legion of Mary, and so forth.).
A Survey of Recent Mariology

ADDRESSES for serial publications mentioned in this survey
(listed alphabetically by title)

Ecumenical Society of the BVM
222 -8th St. NE
Washington, D.C. 20002-6188

“Marian Update”
Servite Marian Center
3121 W. Jackson Blvd.
Chicago, IL 60612-2729

Ephemerides Mariologicae
Buen Suceso, 22
28008 MADRID, Spain

Marianum
Viale Trenta Aprile, 6
00153 ROME, Italy

“The Marian Library Newsletter”
The Marian Library, Box 1390
University of Dayton
Dayton, OH 45469-1390

Nouveaux Cabiers Mariats
27, rue Juliette Recamier
69006 LYON, France

Marian Library Studies
The Marian Library, Box 1390
University of Dayton
Dayton, OH 45469-1390

Queen of All Hearts
Montfort Fathers
26 So. Saxon Ave.
Bay Shore, NY 11706-8993

EAMON R. CARROLL, O.CARM.
Professor Emeritus of Theology
Loyola University of Chicago
and
IMRI, University of Dayton