

Marian Studies

Volume 49 *The Virgin Mary in Art*

Article 12

1998

A Survey of Recent Mariology (1998)

Eamon R. Carroll

Follow this and additional works at: https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian_studies



Part of the [Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Carroll, Eamon R. (1998) "A Survey of Recent Mariology (1998)," *Marian Studies*: Vol. 49, Article 12.
Available at: https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian_studies/vol49/iss1/12

This Back Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Marian Library Publications at eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Marian Studies by an authorized editor of eCommons. For more information, please contact mschlangen1@udayton.edu, ecommons@udayton.edu.

A SURVEY OF RECENT MARIOLOGY (1998)

*Eamon R. Carroll, O.Carm.**

The opening trio for this year's Survey comes from Scotland, England and the United States. First is the beautiful book, *Iona: The Earliest Poetry of a Celtic Monastery*, edited by the Dominican Gilbert Márkus and Thomas Owen Clancy (University of Edinburgh, 1995; x & 271 pp.), with color covers from the Book of Kells. The preface is dated Edinburgh, June 9, 1994, feast of St. Columba, who "wishing to be a pilgrim for Christ" (his words) left Ireland in 563 to settle on the tiny island of Iona in the Hebrides. Both the British and Irish postal services issued a commemorative stamp for the anniversary of his death (in 597). A set of seven poems, from the zenith of Iona's influence (563 to 704), in Latin and English translation, are the core of this book. The first three chapters cover early history, the life and work of the monastery and "Iona as a literary centre." A final chapter concerns Iona's library. The book was brought to my notice by Esther de Waal's review in *The Tablet*, August 17, 1996, under the heading "a noble harmony," possibly inspired by the closing line of her review: "This is a book for serious reading. But it is also a book for praying with and singing with." The reviewer focused on the eighth-century hymn *Cantemus in omni die*, on Mary the God-bearer, at the heart of the mystery of the Incarnation. It is a monastic composition, strongly aware of the community: "Let *us* sing! Let *us* praise Mary!" The Mother of Jesus has brought forth not only Christ but the kingdom of heaven, for which (Esther de Waal writes) "all Christians must be prepared to lose everything. This is the

*Father Carroll is professor emeritus of theology at Loyola University (Chicago) and a member of the faculty of the International Marian Research Institute of the University of Dayton. He resides at Brandsma House; 1035 W. Loyola Avenue, 3-E; Chicago, IL 60626.

Celtic understanding of *peregrinatio*, the wandering saints and their understanding of exile, abandoning everything to seek salvation." *Cantemus in omni die* begins: "Let us sing every day, harmonizing in turns, together proclaiming to God a hymn worthy of holy Mary." Also: "The mother of Christ made a tunic of seamless weave; Christ's death accomplished it remained thus by the casting of lots." And "Truly, truly, we implore by the merits of the Child-bearer, that the flame of dread fire not be able to ensnare us." Each poem is followed by extensive notes (e.g., for the 13-stanza *Cantemus* ..., seven lucid pages).

The reviewer Esther de Waal knows the field; she published recently *Carmina Gadelica: the Celtic Vision*, an anthology from the Hebrides. Doubleday published in 1997 her *Celtic Way of Prayer*. At our MSA convention a year ago (1997), Ross Mackenzie, native Scot, referred to the praise of Mary in the *Carmina Gadelica*. See also a chapter in the book by J. Philip Newell, *Listening for the Heartbeat of God: A Celtic Spirituality* (Paulist Press, Mahwah, NJ, 1997). The author, minister of the Church of Scotland, has served as warden of Iona Abbey, brought to life again in the twentieth century by George Macleod. Newell's third chapter is "Listening for God in All Things: *Carmina Gadelica*," with translations of "the songs and poems of the Gaels," ancient prayers that survived the Calvinist ice age of the Protestant Reformation, recorded a century ago by Alexander Carmichael (1832-1912). These traditional compositions, passed down from parents to children, in spite of the slaps and scoldings of schoolmasters and ministers, praise the goodness of creation. Deeply Christological, they are filled with the memory of Mary his Mother. One example only—a prayer said at the deathbed of a loved one: "Sleep, thou beloved, while she herself soothes thee; / Sleep thou this night on the Virgin's arm, / Sleep, thou beloved, while she herself kisses thee" (p. 57).

Opening item number two is by the English Dominican Aidan Nichols, *Epiphany: A Theological Introduction to Catholicism* (Michael Glazier Book, Liturgical Press, Collegeville, MN, 1996). The tenth of its fifteen chapters is "Mary

and the Saints," which moves along brilliantly from the opening quotation by G. K. Chesterton, another English champion of our Lady: "Men are men but man is a woman," with the next line by Nichols: "For Catholic Christians, Mary is the icon of how humanity should be before God." Subheads throughout the chapter indicate their riches: mysteries of Mary's preparation, mysteries of Mary's childbearing, mysteries of Mary's suffering, mysteries of Mary's glorification. Closing sections treat an archetypal litany (invocations of the Litany of Loreto) and, finally, the saints, with some words on relics and pilgrimages.

My third introductory reference is to the American Protestant scripture scholar, Beverly Roberts Gaventa. In 1995, the University of South Carolina Press published her *Mary: Glimpses of the Mother of Jesus*. She uses literary analysis to explore the picture of Mary in four early Christian narratives: the Gospel of Matthew, Luke's Gospel and his Acts, John's Gospel, and the second-century book known as the "First Gospel of James." Dr. Gaventa puts to her four sources such questions as these to draw up her characterization of the Mother of Jesus: What does Mary say and do? How do others speak to her or about her? In what ways does Mary change as the story develops? In an address to an ecumenical convocation at Princeton University (September 30, 1996), Dr. Gaventa reflected on some themes from her book, for example: "When poor and imperilled Christians turn to Mary as the Mother of Sorrows, consciously or not they touch a thread in Matthew's Gospel." Following on her reading of St. Luke's Mary as "mother, prophet and disciple," Dr. Gaventa said: "If we can say that Mary is a disciple, even the first disciple of Jesus, then we have taken an important step together. And, if we can say that Mary is a disciple, then is it not a Protestant sort of thing to affirm that Mary is, symbolically speaking, the Mother of Disciples, even the Mother of Believers?"

This Survey continues with the customary divisions: 1. Journals and annuals—periodicals and proceedings, 2. Magisterial documents, 3. Scripture and tradition, 4. Doctrine, 5. Liturgy and devotion(s), 6. Ecumenism, and 7. Miscellany. A "Further selection of recent writings" forms the Appendix.

1. Periodicals and proceedings

Ephemerides Mariologicae comes out three times a year. The first 1997 issue was volume 47 (January-June), on "Mary: history and celebration." The two main sections reflect that title. Under "history" are articles by E. Llamas (St. Joseph, husband of Mary, in current liturgy), José Cristo Rey García Paredes (Mary, first disciple and follower of Christ), D. Fernández (Mary model of consecration and the following of Jesus for consecrated persons), and A. Molina Prieto (Mary in principal modern apostolic movements). Under "celebration" are two entries: John Samaha (of our MSA) in English: "Is there a Byzantine Mariology?" and Juan Esquerda Bifet on Marian shrines and sanctuaries. Llamas' paper was given at the Czestochowa International Mariological Congress (August, 1996); it was read for him, as illness kept him from attending. It makes extensive use of the apostolic exhortation *Redemptoris custos* (August 15, 1989). His references include the article by James Davis, O.P., which was in *Marian Studies* 42 (1991). Llamas offers a theological interpretation of the spousal love in the marriage of Mary and Joseph. Applying the axiomatic *lex orandi, lex credendi*, he finds that historically the liturgy has been comparatively mute in this respect, although there has been a change for the better, thanks to the papal letter of 1989 and also to the new votive Mass of "Holy Mary of Nazareth." That Mass is number eight in the 1987 collection (English title "Our Lady of Nazareth"), with the allusion in the proper preface to "the unbreakable bond of chaste love, uniting Mary and Joseph in their virginal relationship." "At Nazareth also this purest of virgins, united with Joseph, the just man, in an unbreakable bond of chaste love, praises you in song, worships you in silence, honors you by her daily life, and gives you glory as she cares for her family."

José Cristo Rey García Paredes (now editor of *Ephemerides Mariologicae*, succeeding Aparicio Rodríguez) proposes as a contribution to Mariology the "new theological paradigm," "Mary as follower and disciple of Christ." He takes up the place of Mary in the synoptic gospel account of the "coming of the mother and the brethren." In *Theological Studies* (vol. 41,

1980), the New Zealand Marist P. J. Bearsley wrote an article (cited by García Paredes), "Mary the Perfect Disciple: A Paradigm for Mariology." Other writings of García Paredes include a 1995 Mariologia from Madrid. His 1988 title has appeared in Italian translation as *Maria nella comunità del Regno. Sintesi di Mariologia* (Libr. Ed. Vaticana, 1997). The extended review in *Miles Immaculatae* (33/2, 1997) sees it as resulting from the rebirth of this type of writing in the eighties, stimulated by the Marian Year and *Redemptoris Mater*.

Juan Esquerda Bifet's article (under "María en la celebración") considers the value of Marian sanctuaries, incorporating many statements of John Paul II in his visits to these shrines, also from his Angelus homilies (1997-1998). Places of pilgrimage recall to the Church and celebrate in the communion of saints the lasting role of Mary, Mother of Mercy. I was reminded of the picture-story in *Maryknoll* magazine (July-August, 1996), "Making a Deal with the Virgin," by David Johnson, showing a fiesta in a Bolivian village for the local feast of Our Lady of Copacabana (August 6), when the people bring reproductions of objects for which they are praying—for example, a toy bus stuffed with play money. Far from being a concession to superstition, the Maryknoller Fr. Curt Cadorette, professor of theology at the University of Rochester and former director of Peru's Institute of Aymara Studies, points out: "Tourists see only a reliance on magic, but there's much more to it. Implicit in the request is a promise to live responsibly. It is understood that the request has vital importance, linked to the family's or community's well-being rather than mere personal gain." Rather than being simply self-centered petitionary prayer, those who thus honor our Lady of Copacabana promise better lives with God's help and Mary's intercession.

Molina Prieto looks into the Marian dedication of ten modern apostolic movements, starting with Schoenstatt (from 1914, J. Kentenich), continuing with the Militia of the Immaculata (1917, St. Maximilian Kolbe), the Équipes de Notre-Dame (1939), Focolare (Obra de Marla: 1943, Chiara Lubich), Cursillos de Cristiandad (1949), Vida Ascendente (1962, Spain; similar French movement same year), Comunidades Catecumenales (1964, born in Spain, in Rome from 1968, and to

the world as Neocatecumenato), Renovación Carismática Católica (1967, influence of Cardinal Suenens and origins at Duquesne University, Pittsburgh [Feb. 17, 1967]), Comunión y Liberación (1969, from Milan), and Milicia de Santa María (1989).

The "Chronicle" by D. Fernández reports on the Mariological/Marian congresses in Poland, August, 1996. He gives a run-down on the plenary sessions and the Spanish-language section. One plenary paper was by the Anglican R. Greenacre, on the Virgin Mary and the Trinity in Anglican liturgical texts.

The second 1997 *Ephemerides Mariologicae* (43/2, July-Sept.) starts with an editorial explaining why the issue begins with two Christological articles, then gives Mariological essays, sections on liturgy and devotion, finally chronicle and reviews. Editor García Paredes contributes the article on the theological/apocalyptic depth of the manifestation of the heart of Mary and Fatima, and also does some of the book notices. María Teresa Porcile offers a feminist view of Christology, with expected dependence on other women writers. She holds that traditional Christology has been consistently and excessively "patriarchalized." Summaries of her article follow, in both French and English. Pedro M. Sarmiento has the second Christological essay: a call for a post-modern approach—finding Christ as helper, beloved friend, as Spirit-inspired. His English summary is of little help. Under the rubric "Temas mariológicos de actualidad," Victor Codina writes of "Mariología desde los pobres." Its English summary reads: "From the perspective of the poor, Mary is the sacrament of the option of God for the poor, the personification of a liberating faith."

In the section "Mary in celebration and life," there are two articles. The first is by Jaime Colomina Torner on the Holy Spirit and Mary in Hispano-Mozarabic eucharistic euchology. The second is in English, author not named; it is reprinted from *Herald of the Immaculate* (Aug.-Sept. 1996), "The Marian Devotion of St. Anthony of Padua." The American Claretian Steve K. Sherwood reports on the forty-eighth annual convention of our MSA, San Antonio, May, 1997: "The Virgin Mary, Mother of God, Icon of the Church, Intercessor: Ecumenical Perspectives."

Since last year's Survey, I note for *Marianum* the second number for 1996, whole number 150, fifty-eighth year. Its three-hundred-and-some pages include four articles (under *Studia*), two Miscellanea items, papal documents from 1993, and a selection of reviews—as noteworthy for the reviewers as for titles chosen (e.g., Luigi Gambero, on European Marian shrines and also on the mosaics in Santa Maria in Trastevere; Walter Brennan, somewhat astringently on Tavard's *Thousand Faces of the Virgin Mary*). The four *Articuli* are by A. Valentini, S.M.M. (the Magnificat as early evidence of the veneration of the Mother of the Lord), by S. Rosso, S.D.B. (Marian eucharology of the Roman missal), by R. Laurentin (report on the international petitions for a dogmatic definition of Mary's mediation and co-redemption, reviewing his own consistent attitude as not favorable), and by the Spanish Discalced Carmelite Jesus Castellano Cervera (a beautifully balanced thirty-page study on the "presence of Mary in the mystery of cult: its nature and significance"). He notes particularly the emergence of this important concept in recent magisterial statements and theological reflection. Given that the glorified Mother of Jesus remains "inseparably joined to her Son's saving work," as the Second Vatican Council stated in the decree on the liturgy (no. 103), there is warrant for her unique liturgical presence, with ramifications in other areas of Christian life and experience—shrines seem a ready example.

The first *Miscellanea* piece is by Marcel Gendrot, S.M.M., in commentary on the Roman decree of July 20, 1996, placing St. Louis de Montfort in the general calendar. The decree was made public September 23, just after Pope John Paul's visit to France earlier that month, including a visit to the tomb of Montfort. Just a few weeks back this year (1998), we kept the feast of St. Louis for the first time in our current calendar, joining on the same day (April 28) another French saint, Peter Chanel, the Marist protomartyr. Javier Ibáñez and Fernando Mendoza contribute as a *Miscellanea* item a review article on a recent study of a Coptic apocryphal treatment of the dormition of the Virgin by Gonzalo Aranda Perez (Madrid 1995). Among the allocutions of John Paul are two selections in English from the World Youth Day in Denver, mid-August 1993.

The latest *Marianum*, first 1997 number (year 59, whole no. 151), with its 374 pages, begins with Calabuig's editorial, taking the occasion of anniversaries to comment on articles in this issue: St. Ambrose (d. 397); the Venerable Antonio Rosmini Serbati (1797-1885), founder of the Institute of Charity; St. Therese (d. 1897); Paul VI (his *Marialis cultus*, 1974). It is a human habit to commemorate anniversaries on life's odometer: thousands, hundreds, fifties, twenty-fives. Major divisions in this *Marianum* are Articles, Miscellanea entries, a rubric labelled "Dossier" for the 150th LaSalette anniversary, papal documents, chronicles, book reviews, and, under the heading "In pace Christi," a tribute and bibliography for the late (German) Don Bosco/Salesian scholar George Söll (1913-1997), whom some of us were privileged to know.

The anniversary articles are: M. de Goedt, O.C.D., on our Lady and Doctor St. Therese; U. Muratore, on Rosmini's commentary on the Magnificat; J. P. Sieme Lasoul, on *Marialis cultus*, with a bibliography of studies on that great letter, 1974-1997; and St. Ambrose and Marian mediation by B. Amata. Two additional articles are both biblical: P. Stefani, on Mary as daughter of Sion and the Jewish roots of Jesus, and A. Valentini, on the great sign of Apocalypse 12 and its bearing on the Church as the image of Mary. The two miscellany items reflect current discussion about the advisability or not of a dogmatic definition of Mary as co-redemptrix and mediatrix. Arthur Burton Calkins takes issue with Angelo Amato, S.D.B., who argued a negative position in *Marianum* 58 (1996): 229-32. Calkins' piece is "'Towards another Marian Dogma?': A Response to Father Angelo Amato, S.D.B." Emmanuele di Napoli contributed "Attualità di uno studio sul Vaticano II tra mariologia e corresponsione." He uses Perrella's study on the teaching in the pastorals of Italian bishops.

For the LaSalette anniversary (1846-1996), there are these "Dossier" items: the pope's letter, May 6, 1996, to the bishop of Grenoble; the papal letter to Cardinal Henri Schwery, envoy to LaSalette for the anniversary (dated July 16, 1996); the Cardinal's sermon on September 19, actual anniversary date; and finally the report by the premier expert, LaSalette Father Jean Stern, on "LaSalette since Vatican II."

The Spanish Mariological Society met at Czestochowa, August 18-26, 1996, as part of the international congresses (the twelfth Mariological and nineteenth Marian). *Estudios Marianos*, volume 63, contains their addresses: *María: culto y doctrina hoy en España* (published from Granada, 1997). The preface, by Cándido Pozo, S.J., explains the choice of the ten papers—from the Spanish language section and also from plenary sessions. Pozo's own paper is the first: Mary in the mystery of Christ in the new Marian votive Masses. Lucas F. Mateo-Seco and Juan Luis Bastero spoke on the Marian patristic theology of the new liturgy. Juan-Miguel Ferrer Grenesche looked in on Hispano-Mozarabic liturgy, on Mary as type of the Church in the mystery of salvation (a plenary session paper).

Juan Cascante Dávila surveyed documents of Spanish bishops on Mary and the Church. Three further papers also built on the current Spanish situation: a) figure of Mary in present-day Spanish Mariologies, b) Mary's place in religion manuals, and c) recent studies in patrology. Alejandro Martínez Sierra, S.J., spoke on Mary as disciple of the Lord. Juan Esquerda Bifet's theme was the memorial-bearing of Marian sanctuaries for the Church. Luis Díez Merino chronicled recent happenings in PAMI (Pontifical International Marian Academy). The Antonianum in Rome has now been formally named the seat of PAMI, a function it has fulfilled since PAMI's foundation in 1946. The second news note was the retirement of Paul Melada, O.F.M., who worked with Carlo Balić (d. 1977), whom he succeeded as president of PAMI. Father Melada has passed the age of eighty, after a lifetime devoted to Marian doctrine and devotion. Born in 1916, he organized five international PAMI congresses: Saragossa (1979), Malta (1983), Kevelaer (1987), Huelva (1992), and, finally, Czestochowa (1996). L. Díez Merino devotes several pages to Melada's accomplishments, and announces his successor, Gaspar Calvo Moralejo (born in Spain, 1930).

Theotokos: Ricerche interdisciplinari di Mariologia, twice-yearly organ of the Italian Mariological Society, reached its fifth volume in 1997. The first number was "The Mother of My Lord," with the Visitation as theme of ten articles, five *Studi*, and twenty-three pages of reviews (a total of 388 pages). The

editorial is by the Montfortian A. Valentini. Some of the articles are: Bruno Maggioni, exegesis of Luke 1,39-45; Luigi Gambiero, patristic readings of the same passage—with a good English brief summary; P. Sorci, liturgy; F. Castelli, poetry about the Visitation (e.g., Péguy, Rilke, Claudel, Camera); Micaela Soranzo, iconography. Three of the *Studi* are: Guido Miglietta, on the Marian and feminine face of the Church in Balthasar; Corrado Maggioni, "Mother of the Redeemer in St. Louis Mary de Montfort"; U. Casale, on Kierkegaard and Mary.

Miles Immaculatae (Conventual Franciscans, Rome), the second 1997 issue (anno 33), has expected material on St. Maximilian Kolbe. Magisterial documents take up 74 pages. John Samaha, S.M., of our MSA, has the English article "Presenting Mary as Model and Type of the Church in the Liturgical Year." Sergio Gaspari, S.M.M., writes of Marian consecration and baptismal life in Montfort. Giorgio Domański's study is on the "spiritual pact" between Kolbe and St. Therese. Among the reviews are several by Arthur B. Calkins: Fulton Sheen's classic, *The World's First Love*; N. Geagea (Mary in Carmel); Conrad De Meester (St. Therese).

The fifty-third session of the French Mariological Society was held at Issoudun, September 1997, under the presidency of Jean Longère (Editions Mediaspaul, Paris, 1998). With most of the back numbers (1972 to the present), this 283-page volume is available from the Secrétariat (Société Française d'études mariales, N.-D. de Pontmain, 2 Place de la Basilique, 53220 Pontmain). After a brief presidential foreword, there are sixteen articles—all on the virginity of Mary. Some of the titles are: J.-F. Baudoz on the synoptic tradition; Yves-Marie Blanchard on the fourth gospel; Edouard Cothenet on the apocrypha; Goulven Madec, on Ambrose and Augustine; Benoit Jeanjean, on Jerome, "polemicist and exegete"; Bernadette Jolès, on medieval Latin poetry; Michel Dupuy, on the school of Bérulle. The La Salette archivist Jean Stern offers, with his customary lucidity, an overview of Mary's virginity in the living tradition of the Church. As do others in this volume, he alludes to the sixteenth centenary of the Council of Capua (392), and to the papal address of May 24, 1992 (printed in full at the end of this *Études Mariales*). Though lacking illustrations, Chantal Leroy's exploration of Mary's virginity in medieval iconogra-

phy is enriching. One key exemplar is *Hortus conclusus*. Another is the Virgin and the unicorn, shown in full color on the cover of the volume. Concentrating on the period 1985 to 1997, Johann Roten offers a "quantitative analysis, with some qualitative elements" for "the actual state of the question of Mary's virginity." His first extended footnote puts the discussion in terms of the contrasting views of René Laurentin (who is represented with his own contribution in this volume) and Raymond Brown (d. August 8, 1998). The seven sections to Roten's fifty-plus pages chart the contents: a) *lex orandi, lex credendi*; b) philosophical aspects; c) theological aspects; d) exegetical aspects; e) christological aspects; f) ecumenical aspects; g) feminist aspects; plus a conclusion.

2. Magisterial documents

At Fordham University, New York, last November 19 (1997), Avery Dulles, S.J., lectured on "Mary at the Dawn of the New Millennium" (printed in the weekly, *America*, January 31, 1998). He began as follows: "For Pope John Paul II Mary is the primary patroness of the advent of the new millennium. As the Mother of Christ, she is preeminently an advent figure—the morning star announcing the rising of the Sun of Righteousness. Like the moon at the dawn of a new day, she is wholly bathed in the glory of the sun that is to come after her. Her beauty is a reflection of his." In a similar vein, the Servite Walter Brennan writes of the holy Virgin as the great "lady in waiting." The Holy Father has considered the role of Mary in his major encyclicals; in countless allocutions; the full letter of 1987, *Redemptoris mater*; also, in a pastoral outreach, in a series of seventy Wednesday catechetical instructions (from September 8, 1995 to November 12, 1997). These explanations add up to a whole course of Marian doctrine and devotion by a master teacher; they are currently in press by Pauline Books of Boston. On the papal coat of arms, the letter M is placed in the shadow of the cross, symbolizing in graphic fashion the Johannine line "Near the cross of Jesus stood his mother." The Latin slogan, *Totus tuus*, summarizes St. Louis de Montfort's dedication: "I belong entirely to you and all that I have is yours. I accept you into everything that pertains to me. Give me your

heart, O Mary!" Montfort's life and apostolate were marked even more profoundly by the motto *Deus solus*, which might also be said of Pope John Paul.

For a fuller appreciation of the Marian eighth chapter of *Lumen gentium*, noteworthy is the big volume (2186 pages) published by the Vatican Press, 1995: *Concilii Vaticani II Synopsis Constitutio Dogmatica de Ecclesia Lumen gentium*, by Francisco Gilhelin. Preliminary drafts, the actual approved text, views (in Latin and French) by the bishops are all here.

The Pontifical Council for Interreligious Dialogue has issued *The Official Teaching of the Catholic Church 1963-1995* (ed. Francisco Gioia; Pauline Books and Media, Boston, 1997), from *Il dialogo interreligioso* (Libr. Ed. Vaticana, 1994), with significant references (e.g., "Mary and the Jews," "Mary and the Muslims"), all well indexed.

Behold Your Mother, Woman of Faith was published November 21, 1973, by the National Conference of Catholic Bishops, subtitled "A Pastoral Letter on the Blessed Virgin Mary" (Publications Office, United States Catholic Conference, Washington, DC). It was issued simultaneously in English and in Spanish. Subsequently, French and Italian translations were made. The chairman of the responsible episcopal committee, John Cardinal Carberry of St. Louis, long a member of MSA, died at the age of ninety-three on June 17, 1998. In the collection *Pastoral Letters of the U.S. Catholic Bishops*, the document on our Lady is in volume three (1962-74, pp. 408-452); the late Cardinal Krol contributed a foreword to this volume.

The Holy Father declared that St. Therese of the Child Jesus and the Holy Face is "doctor of the universal Church," on Mission Sunday, October 19, 1997. Some years back, the phrase "storm of glory" was used to describe the world-wide appeal of the obscure cloistered nun of Normandy; the same words apply to the extraordinary outpouring of interest and affection at the promulgation of St. Therese's doctorate, beginning with the papal statements. No attempt is made here to keep track even of the Holy Father's references, beginning with his apostolic letter *Divini amoris scientia* (October 19, 1997).

Under this rubric of "magisterial teaching," I place only comments from the superiors general of both Carmelite Or-

ders—the ancient observance (Joseph Chalmers, O.Carm.) and the Discalced (Camilo Maccise, O.C.D.). In the centuries-long history of Carmel, this is the first time both a Scot (J. Chalmers) and a Mexican (C. Maccise) have held such positions. For the anniversary of her death (1997), their joint letter, *Back to the Gospel: The Message of Therese of Lisieux*, had the section “Close to Mary of Nazareth,” which read: “Long before the Second Vatican Council, she discovered the simple woman of Nazareth, pilgrim of faith and hope, Mother and model. She can be said to have lived her life by Mary’s side.” A year later, Fathers Chalmers and Maccise published the letter *A Doctor for the Third Millennium*, concluding as follows: “May our sister Therese of Lisieux obtain for us from the Lord the grace to be His collaborators in bearing witness and proclaiming the Good News to our brothers and sisters of the Third Millennium. May we be authentic followers of Jesus, in communion with Mary, the first one to receive the joyful news of salvation and who proclaimed it with the joy of one who has discovered that God gives Himself freely to the poor, humble, and simple.”

3. Scripture and tradition

The late Carroll Stuhlmueller (d.1994) and Sebastian MacDonald edited the papers of their brother-Passionist Barnabas Ahern in *A Voice Crying Out in the Desert: Preparing for Vatican II with Barnabas Ahern (1915–95)* (Liturgical Press, Collegeville, MN, 1996). The section “Presence of Mary in the Bible” (pp. 171–210) has four chapters, three by B. Ahern and the fourth by an Australian Passionist, Jerome Crowe, “Mary in Church Life Today,” showing the influence of Ahern. Earlier in this Survey, I referred to the translation of the First Gospel of James by Beverly Roberts Gaventa, in *Mary: Glimpses of the Mother of Jesus*. The same second-century book was published by Ronald F. Hock (Ulysses Press, Berkeley, CA, 1997; 104 pp.), *The Life of Mary and Birth of Jesus: The Ancient Infancy Gospel of James*.

The American Jesuit Brian E. Daley is the translator and author of the forty-five-page introduction in *On the Dormition*

of *Mary: Early Patristic Homilies* (St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, Crestwood, NY, 1998). He offers a dozen homilies plus John Damascene's canon for the feast of the Dormition. Currently teaching at Notre Dame University (South Bend, IN), Fr. Daley quoted John Damascene in his lecture, "Mary, Icon of Holiness," in the 1996 fall lecture series "Holy Young Women," at the Center for Spirituality of St. Mary's College (South Bend, IN). *Cistercian Studies* 32 (1997) had a series of eleven articles on the Marian sermons of Aelred: Mary's birth, purification, Assumption. In 1996, it had the article by Maximilian Marnau, "The B.V.M., the Ideal of the Monk, a Marian Reading of the Rule of St. Benedict." The latest *Cistercian Studies* (vol. 33 [1998: 2]) is all on "Cîteaux and Devotion to Mary." Thomas Merton writes on St. Alberic. A sermon of Adam of Perseigne on the Assumption is translated. André Fracheboud's article is on Cistercian antecedents of the Rosary. Augustine Roberts' piece is "Mary and the Monk."

Often attributed to St. Bernard, but in fact by Ogier of Lochedio (d. 1214), is the widely circulated medieval lament, "Quis dabit capiti meo" [et oculi meis aquam] (Who will give tears to my head and my eyes?). The Latin and an English translation are given in *Texts of the Passion: Latin Devotional Literature and Medieval Society* by Thomas H. Bestul (University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, 1996). The conclusion of the lament in praise of John the disciple captures its charm and appeal: "O happy and blessed John: the Lord has committed to you a treasure of great privilege. The Lord will repay you a reward for love, a reward for the affection which you always had toward his mother who was commended to you. You are blessed by Christ, and blessed by his mother whom you loved with a pure heart. May all who love her be blessed by her. And above all, blessed be her Son, our Lord, who with the Father and the Holy Spirit, lives and reigns for ever and ever."

A final medieval reference: the 1997 second edition of *Medieval Latin*, a textbook from the University of Chicago (edited by K. P. Harrington, revised by Joseph Pucci), gives as the initial item in part five ("Varieties of medieval Latin [1100 to 1350]) St. Anselm's famous "third prayer to Mary" ("When the mind is troubled by fear"). Still in print is the Penguin Classics paperback by Sister Benedicta Ward, S.L.G., *Prayers and*

Meditations of St. Anselm, first published in 1973. Sister Ward did the translations; the great medievalist, Sir Richard A. Southern, contributed a foreword.

We can look forward to a title in the Classics of Western Spirituality series of the Paulist Press (promised for spring, 1999): *Alphonsus de Liguori: Selected Writings*, edited by the late Irish Redemptorist, Frederick M. Jones—remembered for his *Alphonsus de Liguori, the Saint of Bourbon Naples (1696-1787)* (Christian Classics, Westminster, MD, 1993), which had significant material on the celebrated *Glories of Mary*.

Interest in Cardinal Newman fuels a virtual industry of its own. Just as I was putting this Survey together, I received from Madrid the latest *Ephemerides Mariologicae* 57 (oct.-dic., 1997). The cover features "born of a woman," which is the lead article by Mercedes Navarro. Pablo Largo Domínguez writes of Marian apparitions, and Domiciano Fernández of the political-social aspects of the message of Fatima. The final entry is the interestingly titled "Embroidery on the Litanies of Loreto," taken from Newman's posthumous *Meditations and Devotions*, published in 1893 by his colleague Fr. Neville. They are here left in Newman's magnificent English, twenty-seven invocations. Available in both England and the United States is the new book by Michael Perrott, *Newman's Mariology* (St. Austin's Press, Southampton, 1997; also St. Augustine's Press, South Bend, IN, October, 1997; 104 pp.). A friend passed on to me the homily in the "Friends of Cardinal Newman Newsletter" (Easter, 1998) by the Irish Bishop Philip Boyce, O.C.D., for the feast of the Presentation, February 2, 1998, at the Birmingham Oratory. The occasion was the 150th anniversary of the foundation of the English Oratory; it was filled with remembrances of what our Lady meant to Newman.

4. Doctrine, general and specific

Marian Library Studies, new series 25, 1996-97, has appeared. It contains the second part of J. Roten's doctoral dissertation, "Erlöstes und unerlöstes Paradox oder Balthasars Leiden um das 'tiefliegende Wahre.'" Theodore Koehler has the paper he read to the Alliance of the Two Hearts at Fatima,

September, 1996: "The Heart of Mary in the Latin Tradition: From the Seventh to the Sixteenth Century." And, accompanied by color plates, Sister Marie Brisson offers "Oraisons à Notre Dame d'après un manuscrit du XVe-XVIe siècles."

There are twenty-five papers in the volume edited by Jean Comby on behalf of the faculty of Theology, Commission de Fourvière: *Théologie, histoire et piété mariale. Actes du Colloque de la Faculté de Théologie de Lyon 1-3 octobre 1996* (370 pp.). Pustet of Regensburg has published the second edition of *Handbuch der Marienkunde*, edited by W. Beinert and H. Petri, preface dated January 1, 1996. Band I is *Theologische Grundlegung—Geistliches Leben*. Some indication of the contents of its ten chapters follows: O. Knoch and F. Mussner on Mary in the Bible; Anastasios Kallis on the Mother of God in Orthodox theology and piety—one section is "Eve and Mary." Regina Radlbeck-Ossmann takes up feminist theology. Bruno Kleinheyer and August Jilek write of Mary in the liturgy—one part is the *Ordo Missae*. Band II (1977) *Gestaltetes Zeugnis—Gläubiger Lobpreis* adds another ten chapters: F. Courth on pilgrimage places; H. Petri on Marian appearances; G. M. Lechner on veneration of Mary in art; F. Fleckenstein in music; and the final chapter (XXI) by F. Stadlbauer, aspects of veneration of Mary across-the-board—folk medicine, botanical, animals! A small fascinating detail: the beetle we call the seven-spotted ladybug (*coccinella septempunctata*) is *Marienkäfer* in German, named for the Blessed Virgin.

Germain Grisez contributed to the October, 1997, *New Blackfriars* the article "Mary, Mother of Jesus, Sketch of a Theology." The January, 1998, issue of *The Month* (2nd new series, vol. 31, no. 1) is full of Marian material. James Hanvey's lead article is "Reflecting on Mary." Gerard MacCarthy looks to the new world in "The Virgin of Guadalupe." Anne Winston-Allen has "Rosarium revisited: the name of the prayer." The December, 1997, issue of the same journal reviewed her book *Stories of the Rose: The Making of the Rosary in the Middle Ages*. Finally, there is a review of the book by Sister Mary Timothy Prokes, *Toward a Theology of the Body* (Eerdmans, Grand Rapids, MI, 1996). Readers of *Marian Studies* 34 (1983) may recall the report on the conference held at the Josephinum

(January, 1982), relating our Lady to the life sciences, as does Sister Prokes also in her book *Mutuality: The Human Image of Trinitarian Love* (Paulist, Mahwah, NJ, 1993). That meeting was held under the auspices of the Institute for Theological Encounter with Science and Theology, headed by Robert Brungs, S.J. Sister Prokes was one of the participants; the host for the gathering was Frederick M. Jelly, O.P., who wrote of it in *Marian Studies* 34 (pp. 66–84), "Towards a Theology of the Body through Mariology." In the writings of Sister Prokes, also of R. Brungs, there is significant material on our Lady. At Assumption College (Worcester, MA), June 21–26, 1998, Sister Prokes is one of the speakers at a symposium on "theology of the body."

The movement to have a new dogmatic definition about Mary, as "co-redemptrix, mediatrix of all graces and advocate for the people of God" has given rise to much discussion, reflected in many publications. A reliable *status quaestionis* is in the winter 1997/98 "Marian Library Newsletter." Donal Flanagan of Ireland wrote, for *The Furrow* (vol. 49, Jan., 1998), "A New Marian Dogma?" The International Marian Research Institute of the University of Dayton's Marian Library sponsored a "Symposium on Mary's Place in Redemption: Toward a New Marian Dogma?" (July 18 and 19, 1998). The speakers were Johann G. Roten, S.M., "Mary and Dogma"; Frederick M. Jelly, O.P., "Mary's Place in Redemption"; Peter Fehlner, F.F.I., "Co-redemptrix—Toward a New Marian Dogma?" (in favor of definition). A panel discussion moderated by George F. Kirwin, O.M.I., followed the talk by René Laurentin, "Should Mary's Mediation be Defined?" (negative position). Mark I. Miravalle, of the Franciscan University of Steubenville, Ohio, has led the movement favoring definition, *Vox Populi Mariae Mediatrici*, which has garnered millions of petitions requesting the Holy Father to infallibly proclaim the new dogma. Dr. Miravalle has edited a second book of essays in support: *Mary Core-demptrix, Mediatrix, Advocate. Theological Foundations II: Papal, Pneumatological, Ecumenical* (Queenship Publishing Co., Santa Barbara, CA, 1997; xi & 328 pp.). There are eight contributors: Stefano M. Manelli, F.F.I., Bertrand de Margerie, S.J., Arthur B. Calkins, Josef Seifert, Vladimir Zelinsky, Michael

O'Carroll, C.S.Sp., John Macquarrie, and Peter Damian Fehlner, FFI.

Frederick M. Jelly has the article "Marian Devotion" in *Our Sunday Visitor Encyclopedia of Catholicism* (ed. Russell Shaw, 1997, p. 405).

5. Liturgy, devotion and devotions

Significant studies in these areas have appeared in periodicals and annuals earlier in this Survey. Here are a few further items. Liturgical Press (Collegeville, MN) published in 1977 *Our Lady in the Liturgy* by J. D. Crichton. The Irish Carmelite Eltin Griffin wrote a tribute to Monsignor James Dunlop Crichton, celebrating his ninetieth birthday the summer of 1997. Fr. Griffin's article was in the Irish magazine *Spirituality* 3 ([July/August 1997]: 223-227), in the series "People of Hope," about "people whose life and work is giving hope to many." When Fr. Griffin interviewed the liturgical pioneer (his father a Scot, his mother a convert from Somerset), Fr. Crichton was working on *Our Lady in the Liturgy*, seventeenth of his published works, 1964 to the present, listed at the end of the article.

There is a continuing literature on Guadalupe, for example, *Goddess of the Americas/ La Diosa de las Americas: Writings on the Virgin of Guadalupe*, edited by Ana Castillo (Riverhead Books, 1996), an essay collection, covering history, poetry, drama, fiction. A new edition (1995) is being advertised of the 1978 title *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture*, by the late Victor Turner and his wife Edith (Columbia University Press, American Academy of Religion, 284 pp.). Edith Turner is a speaker at a symposium in Reno (October 28-31, 1998) on "Carmel and Mary: Living the Tradition Today." Her topic is: "Pilgrimage and Marian Shrines." The March 1998 number of *Catholic Library World* (vol. 68, pp. 25-30) has a helpful bibliography of publications about apparitions: "Sources of Information on Marian Apparitions," by Elyse Hayes; it extends to websites and internet resources, such as The Mary Page from the Marian Library of the University of Dayton (internet <http://www.udayton.edu/mary/>).

I saw a couple of months ago an advertisement for *The Voyage to Lourdes*, the famous book by Alexis Carrel, with an introduction by Stanley Jaki, O.S.B., Templeton Award recipient, polymath of Seton Hall University. The ad was from Real View Books (P.O. 1793, Royal Oak, MI 48068-1793; 95 pp.; \$7.95). Advertised also was Richard Foley, S.J., *Mary and the Eucharist* (at \$8.95), from Hope of St. Monica (P.O. 308, Newtonsville, OH 45158-0308).

Publications on the rosary appear at a steady pace; I offer a sampling from recent advertisements: Warren F. Dicharry, C.M., *Praying the Rosary: The Joyful, Fruitful, and Glorious Mysteries* (Liturgical Press, Collegeville, MN, 1997; 64 pp.); Marc Treméau, O.P., *The Mystery of the Rosary* (from an early-1998 ad, at \$3.25, publisher not given). Paul Guthrie has the article "The Rosary and Spiritual Welfare," in *The Priest* 53 (October, 1997): 12-15.

Sophia (of Manchester, NH) has reprinted Gerald Vann's *Heart of Compassion: The Vocation of Woman Today* (former title was *Eve and the Gryphon*). Along with the Blessed Virgin, Fr. Vann (d. 1963) offers profiles of Dante's Beatrice, Catherine of Siena, and Monica.

6. Ecumenism

The front-runner in ecumenical consideration of our Lady remains the Ecumenical Society of the Blessed Virgin Mary. Their May 1998 "Newsletter" (third series, no. 8) reached me from England last month (April). It announces the Society's twelfth international ecumenical congress, in Leeds, August 24-29. Its theme is: the presence of the Virgin in the Church as the woman open to the Spirit, the woman of hope, who, like Abraham, accepted God's will "hoping against hope" (Rom. 4,18). The preliminary roster of speakers include: E. Yarnold, S.J.; Bishop Knapp-Fisher; Sister Cecily Boulding, O.P.; Eamon R. Carroll, O.Carm. Along with the "Newsletter" was mailed the pamphlet *The Place of Mary in the Church*, subtitled "Mariologists on Mary—Co-Redeemer?" Yarnold introduces the papers, four of them reprinted from the London *Tablet*, issues of 17, 24 and 31 January and 7 February, 1998, by Bishop

Kallistos (Orthodox), René Laurentin, Canon Roger Greenacre (Anglican, part of the committee that prepared the position paper about a new Marian dogma, requested by the Holy See at Czestochowa), and Elaine Storkey (Anglican in Evangelical tradition). In addition, there is an article favoring such a definition by Michael O'Carroll, C.S.Sp. Fr. O'Carroll published recently *A Priest in Changing Times: Memories and Opinions* (Columba Press, Dublin, 1998), which has significant Marian material (including the ESBVM).

Members of the American ESBVM receive regular reports of activities in the Washington D.C. area and, as well, the thrice-yearly "Newsletter" and pamphlets from England. In addition, the American Society has begun the series *Hopes and Visions*, from its file of current and past papers. Number three is *Mary in the New Testament* by John Breck (Orthodox), previously published in *Pro Ecclesia*, and initially read to the ESBVM in Washington, October 1992.

7. Miscellany

A number of writers contributed to the 1994 art book *Great Women of the Bible* (Eerdmans, Grand Rapids, MI), for which Dorothee Sölle wrote the commentary "Eve to Mary." A small section on our Lady occurs only at the end of the book: "Mary, Mother of Christ." Sölle contributes a page of her own on the revolutionary patience of Mary in St. Luke, and she quotes this apostrophe from the poet Novalis (d. 1806), suited perhaps to the theme of our current MSA convention (The Virgin Mary in Art): "On a hundred pictures have you been, oh Mary, painted charmingly. But never have you yet been seen the way my soul has looked at thee." In his *Madonna: Mary in the Catholic Tradition*, Father F. M. Jelly reflects similarly: "During the course of Catholic tradition there has been but one Mary, mother of Jesus, yet there have been many Madonnas."

The latest book by Kathleen Norris is *Amazing Grace: A Vocabulary of Faith* (Riverhead, N.Y., 1998), in which she takes up from an ecumenical standpoint sixty-seven terms she calls "scary words." According to reviews there is good material on our Lady.

Finally there is the dedication in the *Encyclopedia of American Catholic History*, edited by Michael Glazier and Thomas Shelley (Liturgical Press, Collegeville, MN, 1997). M. Christian Athans, a Sister of Charity of the B.V.M., has the article "Mary in American Catholicism." The dedication resonates well with the author of this Survey, son of immigrants, among the grateful recipients of our Lady's favor, as are doubtlessly some here present and the many other descendants who will read these words: To Mary, the Mother of the Lord, who had a special place in the lives of immigrants and their descendants who made American Catholicism." One recalls the words of Archbishop John Ireland of St. Paul for the first centenary (1889) of the establishment of the American hierarchy:

"We pray to God and to his Immaculate Mother for our Church of the United States . . . we pray thee, renew for thy Church in America the miracles of love and piety of apostolic days. Look with gracious eyes upon our country, so fair, so rich in nature's gifts; add unto those gifts favors of grace, and let America be for long ages to come what our hearts bid her to be—first in civil liberty and social happiness, first in Christian loyalty among the nations of the earth!

Appendix: Further Selection of Recent Writings

This list is as late as October, 1998. Arrangement is: A. Magisterium, B. Scripture and tradition, C. Doctrine, D. Liturgy and devotion, E. Ecumenism, F. Miscellany.

A. Magisterium

1. The output of papal addresses and documents is almost beyond measure. Simply as a sort of "family sample," I note an allocution of John Paul II at the Sunday Angelus, July 24, 1988, referring to the sanctuary "Flos Carmeli" on Mount Carmel in the Holy Land. The Holy Father joined the theme of Marian contemplation to Mount Carmel, as a symbol of the path towards union with God. He said: "Mary is model of contemplation, alert to hearing and meditating the Word of God and obedient to the will of the Father through Christ in the Holy Spirit. Therefore in Carmel and in every soul profoundly Carmelite

there flowers a life of intimate communion and familiarity with the Holy Virgin, as a 'new way' of living for God and continuing here on earth the love of her Son Jesus for his Mother Mary." He alluded to the entrance prayer of the Mass for Our Lady of Mt. Carmel of July 16th, which can be translated: "We pray, Lord, that the intercession of the glorious Virgin Mary may assist us, so that by her help we may be able to come to the mountain who is Christ." The official Latin runs: *Adiuvet nos, quae-sumus, Domine, gloriosae Virginis Mariae intercessio veneranda, ut, ejus muniti praesidiis, ad montem, qui Christus est, pervenire valeamus . . .* Unfortunately, the version in the current English Sacramentary misses the point of the mountain imagery, linking the geographical roots of the feast among the hermits on Mount Carmel to the mystical imagery of the "ascent of Mt. Carmel" as metaphor for the movement of the believing pilgrim toward union with Christ.

B. Scripture and tradition

1. *New Testament Abstracts* for 1997 lists two articles on the Magnificat: Jutta Burggraf on scriptural understanding of woman in light of the Magnificat (in a 1997 issue of *Forum Kath.Theol.* 13 [1997]: 50-69; Aschaffenburg) and an article by Klauck, written in German in *New Testament Studies* (43 [1997]: 134-139; Cambridge), on Godfarers in the Magnificat, arguing that St. Luke was thinking ahead to the Acts of the Apostles when he wrote the Magnificat.
2. Thomas J. McGovern, "Newman and Devotion to Our Lady," *Homiletic and Pastoral Review* 97 (May, 1997): 8-18.
3. Orestes Brownson, *The Influence of Devotion to Mary*, by the famous nineteenth-century American convert who held dim views of Newman (a 24-page pamphlet, available from The Neumann Press of Long Prairie, MN—in their Winter 97/98 booklist).

C. Doctrine

1. Bishop Philip Boyce, O.C.D., *Mary Mother of Mercy* (Divine Mercy Library, Dublin, and Marian Fathers, Stock-

- bridge, MA, 1986): pamphlet based on *Dives in misericordia*—an address of March 13, 1981, at the International Centre for Missionary Animation, a study session on evangelization and the mercy of God.
2. Robert Auman, "Did Mary Merit the Incarnation?" in *Homiletic and Pastoral Review* 97 (May, 1997): 28-31, 43-44. In the same number, Father Joseph, "Mother of the Living" (pp. 54-58).
 3. In the St. Anthony Messenger Press (Cincinnati) series, Millennium Monthly (series 2: The Year of the Spirit, 1998), promised as the eighth of the set: Gloria Hutchinson, *Mary, a Model for All Ages*.
 4. As advertised: Catherine de Hueck Doherty, *Bogoroditza: She Who Gave Birth to God* (Madonna House, Combermere, ON; 146 pp.—notice seen June, 1998).
 5. Charlene Altemose, M.S.C., *What You Should Know About Mary* (Liguorian Press, Liguori, MO), advertised as due March, 1998 (pb., 80 pp.).

D. Liturgy and devotion(s)

1. John M. Samaha, S.M., "The Painting of a Prayer: Millet's Angelus," in *Queen* 44 (July-August, 1993): 5-8.
2. Anne Vail, *The Rosary: A Way into Prayer* (Harper, San Francisco, 1996; also, Canterbury Press, Norwich, England): with wood engravings by David Jones, poet and painter (d. 1974).
3. David E. Rosage, *Mary, Star of the New Millennium: Guiding Us to Renewal*, in the Celebrate 2000! series, (Charis/Servant Publications, Ann Arbor, MI, 1998), as advertised (189 pp.).

E. Ecumenism

1. Eamon R. Carroll, O.Carm., "Mary in Ecumenical Perspective," in *Theology Digest* 44 (Winter 1997): 345-349; condensed from *Ecumenical Trends* 26 (May, 1997), lecture delivered at Seton Hall University, November 14, 1995.
2. Charles Dickson, *A Protestant Pastor Looks at Mary* (Our Sunday Visitor Press, Huntington, IN, 1996; 112 pp.): reviewed in *Queen* (Jan.-Feb., 1997; p. 41). Rev. C. Dickson

is a contributing editor to the Montfort magazine *Queen*. He is also author of "Mary Teaches Us the Power of Pondering," in *Spiritual Life* 43 (Winter 1997): 201-203.

3. Bishop Christopher Hill, *Arcic I and II: An Anglican Perspective* (Ecumenical Society of the B.V.M., Sept. 1998): a paper first given August 31, 1996, for the 75th anniversary of the Malines Conversations and, more recently, to the annual general meeting of the ESBVM, March 7, 1998.

F. Miscellany

1. *Queen of All Hearts* (or, simply, *Queen*) is published every other month by the Montfort Fathers (26 Saxon Avenue, Bay Shore, NY 11706-8993), with J. Patrick Gaffney, S.M.M., as editor: good blend of materials, both popular and scholarly (e.g., Deyanira Flores, "Discovering Mary in the Middle Ages—Rupert of Deutz (1130)—Mary, Teacher of the Apostles," in *Queen* (July-Aug., 1998): 22-25).
2. Michael Cuneo, *The Smoke of Satan: Conservative and Traditionalist Dissent in Contemporary American Catholicism* (Oxford University Press, New York, 1997): one section of this strange book is titled "The Marianists," blithely disregarding that this is the popular designation of the Society of Mary founded by the Venerable William Chaminade and dedicated to education (e.g., the Marian Library of the University of Dayton).
3. According to a listing in the Spring, 1998, *Theology Digest, Religion and Rebellion* is edited by Judith Devlin and Ronan Fanning (Dublin University College Press, 1997), from the 22nd conference of Irish Historians (1995): offers three titles of Marian import: "Our Lady of Marpingen and Imperial Germany," "Our Lady of Knock and Revolutionary Politics," and "The Sexual Politics of Pilgrimage to Lourdes." According to a less-than-sympathetic review in *Doctrine and Life* (Nov. 1992), the 1990 title edited by Enda McDonagh, *Faith and the Hungry Grass: A Mayo Book of Theology* (Columba Press, Dublin, 1990), recommends Knock, the Rosary, and Mary as central to renewal.

4. Benedict Ashley, O.P., *Justice in the Church: Gender and Participation* (Catholic University Press, Washington, DC, 1996): in chapter four, "Women and Worship," there is a section "Mary and Priesthood" (pp. 131-37), from lectures given in 1992.