

## Marian Studies

---

Volume 31 *Proceedings of the Thirty-First  
National Convention of the Mariological Society  
of America held in New York, NY*

---

Article 16

1979

### The Absolute Predestination of the Blessed Virgin Mary

Juniper B. Carol

Follow this and additional works at: [https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian\\_studies](https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian_studies)



Part of the [Religion Commons](#)

---

#### Recommended Citation

Carol, Juniper B. (1980) "The Absolute Predestination of the Blessed Virgin Mary," *Marian Studies*: Vol. 31, Article 16.

Available at: [https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian\\_studies/vol31/iss1/16](https://ecommons.udayton.edu/marian_studies/vol31/iss1/16)

This Back Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Marian Library Publications at eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Marian Studies by an authorized editor of eCommons. For more information, please contact [mschlangen1@udayton.edu](mailto:mschlangen1@udayton.edu), [ecommons@udayton.edu](mailto:ecommons@udayton.edu).

*Editor's note:*

*This article by Rev. Juniper B. Carol, O.F.M., is published as a supplement to this volume of MARIAN STUDIES. It was not among the papers delivered at the 1980 Convention.*

*The following list of ABBREVIATIONS was prepared by Father Carol to accompany his article:*

## **ABBREVIATIONS FOR PERIODICALS AND OTHER SETS**

- AAS—Acta Apostolicae Sedis  
AAV—Acta Academiae Velehradensis  
ABM—Archivos - Bibliotecas - Museos  
ACAAL—Actas del Congreso Asuncionista Franciscano de América Latina, 1948 (Buenos Aires, 1950)  
ACMB—Congrès Marial de Bruxelles, 1954 (Bruxelles, 1955)  
ACNM—Atti del Congresso Nazionale Mariano dei Frati Minori d'Italia, 1947 (Roma, 1948)  
AdC—L'Ami du Clergé  
Ang—Angelicum  
Ant—Antonianum  
AOFM—Acta Ordinis Fratrum Minorum  
APAR—Acta Pont. Academiae Romanae S. Thomae Aq.  
Aptm—Apostolicum (Tsinanfu)  
ASC—Alma Socia Christi  
ASCSI—Acta Secundi Congressus Scholastici Internationalis Oxonii et Edimburgi 11-17 sept. 1966 celebrati. Studia Scholastico-Scotistica III (Romae, 1968)  
ATh—L'Année Théologique  
Bibl—Biblica  
BSFEM—Bulletin de la Société Française d'Etudes Mariales  
BTSS—Bulletin trimestriel des anciens élèves de S. Sulpice (Paris)

- CCMF—Compte-rendu du Congrès Marial de Fribourg (Blois, 1903)
- CCMIZ—Cuarto Congreso Mariano Internacional de Zaragoza, 1908 (Madrid, 1909)
- CF—Collectanea Franciscana
- ChF—Cahiers Franciscains
- CFS—Collectanea Franciscana Slavica
- CML—Congrès Marials Nationaux. VII<sup>e</sup> Congrès, Lyon, 1954 (Lyon, 1955)
- CMNL—Congrès Marial National de Lourdes, 1930 (Lourdes, 1931)
- Cmp—Compostellatum
- CMVP—Congrès Marial du Puy-en-Velay, 1949 (Paris, 1950)
- CPCMM—Crónica del Primer Congreso Mariano-Monfortiano, Barcelona, 1918 (Totana, 1920)
- Crd—The Cord
- Ctr—Culture (Québec)
- DBibl—Dictionnaire de la Bible
- DT(Pl)—Divus Thomas (Placentiae)
- DTC—Dictionnaire de Théologie Catholique
- Dvts—Divinitas
- EC—Enciclopedia Cattolica
- EcF—L'Ecole Franciscaine
- EdisF—Estudis Franciscans
- EF—Etudes Franciscaines
- EM—Estudios Marianos
- EMF—Estudos Marianos. Teses apresentadas ao Congresso Mariologico Lusso-Espanhol na Fatima, 1944 (Fatima, 1945)
- EmR—Ecumenical Review
- EphM—Ephemerides Mariologicae
- ER—The Ecclesiastical Review
- ETL—Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses
- EstF—Estudios Franciscanos
- FAT—Franciscan Approach to Theology; Franciscan Education-

- al Conference 8 (Washington, 1958)
- FEC—Franciscan Educational Conference
- FF—La France Franciscaine
- FHF—Franciscan Herald and Forum
- FLDF—Fünfte Lektorenkonferenz der deutscher Franziskaner (Sigmaringen, 1930)
- FMC—Fêtes Mariales de Chartres (Chartres, 1927)
- FS—Franciscan Studies
- FzS—Franziskanische Studien
- Ggm—Gregorianum
- HPR—Homiletic and Pastoral Review
- IER—Irish Ecclesiastical Record
- IMd—La Inmaculada y la Merced (Roma, 1955)
- Int—Interest (Washington, D.C.)
- ItF—L'Italia Francescana
- JB-1—Jean-B. du Petit-Bornand, O.F.M.Cap., *Essai sur la primauté de Jésus-Christ et sur le motif de l'Incarnation* (Paris, 1900)
- JB-2—Jean-B. du Petit-Bornand, O.F.M.Cap., *Sur la primauté de Notre-Seigneur Jésus-Christ et sur le motif de l'Incarnation. Notes Additionnelles* (Paris, 1922)
- JEUO—Journées d'Etudes Université d'Ottawa, 1957: *La Maternité spirituelle de la B. Vierge Marie, II* (Ottawa, 1958)
- JSEM—Journées Sacerdotales d'Etudes Mariales, 1943 (s.l., 1948)
- JSM—Journées Sacerdotales Mariales, 1951 (Dinant, 1952)
- JTS—Jahrbuch der Theologischen Schule
- JTSt—Journal of Theological Studies
- KM—Katholische Marienkunde, ed. P. Sträter (Paderborn, 1947)
- Kyrl—Kyrilliana (Cairo)
- LM—Lexikon der Marienkunde
- LTPh—Laval Théologique et Philosophique
- Maria—Maria. *Etudes sur la Sainte Vierge*, ed. H. du Manoir

- MC—Mémorial Catholique  
MCMZ—Memoria del Congreso Mariano Nacional de Zaragoza, 1954 (Zaragoza, 1956)  
ME—Maria et Ecclesia  
MF—Miscellanea Francescana  
MIPC—Maria Immacolata nella Provincia dei Frati Minori Cappucini di Lombardia (Milano, 1955)  
Mm—Marianum  
MS—Marian Studies  
MSO—Mary in the Seraphic Order, XXXV Franciscan Educational Conference (Washington, D.C., 1954)  
MSR—Mélanges de Science Religieuse  
NCE—New Catholic Encyclopedia  
NG—Naturaleza y Gracia  
NRM—Nouvelle Revue Mariale  
NRT—Nouvelle Revue Théologique  
OrFr—Orate Fratres  
Ornt—Orient (Toulouse)  
Pareri—Pareri dell'Episcopato Cattolico...sulla definizione dogmatica dell'Immacolato Concepimento della B.V.M. (Roma, 1851-1854)  
PC—Palestra del Clero  
PCCM—Primer Congreso Pan-Americano de las Congregaciones Marianas, 1921 (Santiago de Chile, 1922)  
PCMB—Premier Congrès Marial Breton, Josselin, 1904 (Paris, 1905)  
PCSJ—Provincial Chronicle of St. John the Baptist Province, Special Marian Issue (Cincinnati, 1952)  
PFC—Points fondamentaux du christianisme en général et du catholicisme en particulier, ed. Migne (Paris, 1862)  
PS—Priestly Studies  
QSF—Quaderni di Spiritualità Francescana  
RB—Revue Biblique  
RdR—Revue du Rosaire  
RDS—Revue Duns Scot

- REB—Revista Eclesiástica Brasileira  
 RET—Revista Española de Teología  
 Rjs—Reflejos  
 Rgl—Reglense (Chipiona-Cádiz)  
 RHR—Revue de l'Histoire des Religions  
 RI—Regina Immaculata (Rome, 1955)  
 RIJL—La Rotauté de l'Immaculée. Journées d'Etudes Université Laval, 1955 (Ottawa, 1957)  
 RSR—Revue de Science Religieuse  
 RSPT—Revue des Sciences Philosophiques et Théologiques  
 RTFR—Round Table of Franciscan Research  
 RTh—Revue Thomiste  
 RUP—Repertorio Universal del Predicador  
 SC—Studia Catholica  
 SCMB—Segundo Congresso Mariano Nacional (Braga, 1954)  
 SF—Studi Francescani  
 SL—Spiritual Life  
 Spz—Sapienza  
 SR—La Settimana Religiosa (Genova)  
 Stm—Studium (Montréal)  
 SV—San Vigilio (Trento)  
 TCC—The Teaching of the Catholic Church, ed. Smith (New York, 1961)  
 TCMB—Troisième Congrès Marial Breton, Guingamp, 1910 (St. Brieuc, 1911)  
 TFAM—La teologia, fondamento dell'ascetica mariana (Milano, 1948)  
 Theol—Theologica  
 Tondini—A. Tondini, Le encicliche mariane (2 ed., Roma, 1954)  
 VD—Verbum Domini  
 VDA—Vers le dogme de l'Assomption (Montréal, 1948)  
 Vgl—Virgo Immaculata  
 Vglia—Vigilia (Budapest)  
 VF—La Vie Franciscaine (Paris)

VIHD—La Vierge Immaculée. Histoire et Doctrine (Montréal,  
1954)

VyV—Verdad y Vida

WuW—Wissenschaft und Weisheit

## THE ABSOLUTE PREDESTINATION OF THE BLESSED VIRGIN MARY

A cursory survey of our manuals of theology reveals that only a relatively small number of authors preface their treatise *De Beata Virgine* with a serious discussion of Our Lady's predestination. The omission is rather regrettable, for it is precisely the stand we take on this subject that will set virtually every other mariological thesis in its proper perspective. The unique place held by Mary in the overall hierarchy of beings making up the entire creation is bound to give cohesion and unity to the scientific structure of the Marian tract.

By "predestination" we mean the eternal act of God's will determining the existence of a rational creature and ordaining it to grace and glory. Several questions are usually discussed by theologians in connection with Mary's predestination.<sup>1</sup> The only one that concerns us here is the exact place assigned to her in the internal hierarchy of the divine decree relative to the universe. Briefly: whether or not Mary was willed (predestined) by God with a *logical priority* over all other creatures.

Since Mary's predestination is but one aspect of the broader question of Christ's own predestination, the former must perforce be treated within that frame of reference. As everyone knows, the question of whether or not Christ was predestined prior to all other creatures has been heatedly debated among theologians for centuries; it is, admittedly, one of the most intricate in Catholic theology, especially from a historical point of view. The mere cataloguing of authors according to the various opinions is in itself a formidable task, since their theories are often misrepresented by their interpreters and commen-

<sup>1</sup> Cf. J. B. Carol, O.F.M., *Fundamentals of Mariology* (New York, 1956) 21-25.



tators.<sup>2</sup> Perhaps a lifetime would be needed to disentangle this "selva enmarañada," to use Aldama's apt description.<sup>3</sup>

And yet, despite the difficulties involved, the problem deserved to be treated, if for no other reason, because of its inherent importance. Let us put it this way: Many cruel wars have been fought over *geographical* frontiers. Are we to think that, when there is a question of limiting Christ and Mary's *spiritual* frontiers, the subject becomes less important?<sup>4</sup> The plurisecular controversy over the "motive" of the Incarnation would suggest otherwise.

Incidentally, this so-called "motive"<sup>5</sup> of the Incarnation is often treated under the heading of Christ's "primacy." Obviously, the two ideas involved here are not always conceptually co-extensive; they are, nevertheless, intimately related.

The term "primacy" can refer to the state of holding the highest place or rank within a given order and/or to the state of being logically or chronologically first. For the Scotists, Christ holds the absolute and universal primacy: (a) in the order of dignity, (b) in the order of divine intention, and (c) in the order of causality. From the fact of Christ's absolute and universal primacy, as taught in *Col.* 1:18, the Scotists argue

<sup>2</sup> Good examples are given by Chrysostome [Urrutibéhéty], O.F.M., *Le motif de l'Incarnation et les principaux thomistes contemporains* (Tours, 1921), esp. 283.

<sup>3</sup> J. A. de Aldama, S.J., in *EM* 25 (1964) 41.

<sup>4</sup> It is well known, for instance, that many Thomists, as a result of their views on Christ's predestination, do limit His meritorious influence as regards the Angels and our first parents *ante lapsum*.

<sup>5</sup> J.-F. Bonnefoy, O.F.M., has repeatedly reminded theologians that nothing can move or motivate God to act, besides His own free will. Nor is it correct to speak of original sin as being the *occasion* or the *condition* of the Incarnation. The order of the universe does not result from conditions or occasions, but from relations of cause and effect (cf. St. Thomas, *Summa theol.* I, q. 48, a. 1, ad 5). Nevertheless, since God is infinite wisdom, He always has a *reason* for acting. Hence, we should speak of the *reason* for the Incarnation, rather than its motive, occasion or condition. Cf. *The Predestination of Our Blessed Lady*, in *Mariology*, ed. J. B. Carol, O.F.M. (Milwaukee, 1957) II, 156-157.

to His having been predestined first in the order of divine decrees *ad extra*. One group of Thomists opines that Christ's primacy is absolute and universal only in the order of dignity. A second group holds that His primacy is absolute also in the order of *final* causality (technically called *finis cuius gratia*), but not in the order of material causality (*finis cui*), as will be indicated shortly.

---

The specific purpose of this essay is rather limited. We propose to offer: (a) a synopsis of the various opinions on the primary reason for the Incarnation and (b) a list of modern authors (nineteenth and twentieth centuries) who, in our judgment, have endorsed, at least in substance, what is commonly known as the "Franciscan" viewpoint relative to the role of Christ and His Mother in the internal hierarchy of the divine decree concerning the universe.

## PART ONE

### VARIOUS THEORIES ON THE PRIMARY REASON FOR THE INCARNATION

In the brief description that follows we purposely refrain from indicating the reasons or arguments pro and con, which the reader can easily find in any manual of dogmatic theology.<sup>6</sup>

#### THEORY (A). *Thomists* (1st Group):

For this group, the order of predestinations (*signa rationis*) is substantially this:

- 1) God decrees to create the universe in order to manifest His goodness.

<sup>6</sup> A fairly good reference here would be A. Michel's article *Incarnation*, in *DTC* 7 (1921) 1498-1499 (for the Scotistic viewpoint) and 1501-1505 for the Thomistic viewpoint).

- 2) God decrees the permission of Adam's sin.
- 3) God decrees to become man (Incarnation) in order to redeem man.

*Conclusion:* The only primary reason for the Incarnation is man's Redemption. Hence, if Adam had not sinned, there would have been no Incarnation.<sup>7</sup> The theory is subscribed to by most of the traditional followers of St. Thomas Aquinas.<sup>8</sup>

### THEORY (B). *Thomists* (2nd Group):

- 1) In the order of final causality, Christ is willed first.
- 2) In the order of material causality, the Redemption is willed first.

*Conclusion:* The Incarnation is the *finis cuius gratia* of all creation, but the Redemption is the *finis cui* of the Incarnation. If Adam had not sinned, there would have been no Incarnation. The theory is endorsed by not a few Thomists, among whom are Cardinal Cajetan, the Salmanticenses, Capreolus, Medina, Gonet, and others.<sup>9</sup> Those who subscribe to theory (A) and

<sup>7</sup> G. Friethoff, O.P., suspects that it may be even *heretical* (!) to assign to the Incarnation any reason other than man's redemption. Cf. *Ang* 15 (1938): 13. He forgets that, for St. Thomas, the ultimate reason for the Incarnation is God's infinite goodness (cf. *Summa*, III, q.1, a.1). We have it on the authority of Benedict XIV that Dominicans and Franciscans were forbidden by Pope Sixtus IV to call one another "heretics" in this connection, since, as he put it, the opinions held by both groups "are based on piety, the authorities of faith, and reasons." *De beatif. et canoniz.*, lib. 2, cap. 28, n. 10. Ref. in *JB-1*, 8. Incidentally, Pope Paul VI had the highest praise for Scotus' teaching on Christ's universal primacy. Cf. his *Alma parens*, in *AAS* 58 (1966) 609-610.

<sup>8</sup> Cf. *JB-1*, 29-31, where the more prominent supporters are named.

<sup>9</sup> "Gonet, Salmanticenses et communius AA. addunt ad distinctionem supra relatam ex Cajetano, aliam distinctionem inter finem *qui* seu *cuius gratia* et finem *cui*. In genere causae finalis *cuius gratia* Deus prius voluit et vidit Christum quam alias res; at in genere causae materialis et in genere causae finalis *cui* prius voluit et vidit permissionem peccati quam Christum. Datur igitur mutua causarum dependentia, et in ordine *intentionis* prius fuit decretum incarnationis decreto creationis, dum in ordine *executionis* decretum creationis fuit prius." Thus J. Solano, S.J., *De Verbo Incarnato*,

theory (B) claim to base their opinion on the teaching of St. Thomas.<sup>10</sup>

### THEORY (C). *Scotists*:

The Scotists arrange the order of predestinations as follows:

- 1) God decrees the existence of Christ, independently of any other circumstance, in order to have someone who will love Him in a most perfect way.
- 2) God decrees the existence of angels and men, with Christ as their final, exemplary and efficient (meritorious) cause.
- 3) God decrees the rest of the universe for the glory of Christ.
- 4) God decrees the permission of Adam's sin.
- 5) God decrees that Christ will come *in carne passibili* as Redeemer.

*Conclusion:* Even if Adam had not sinned, God would have become incarnate, not as Redeemer, of course, but as King of all creation. The theory is held by most followers of Bl. John

in *Sacrae Theologiae Summa* (ed. 3, Matriti, 1956) 15-16. On the Salmanticenses, cf. T. Deman, O.P., *Salamanca* (Théologiens de), in *DTC* 14, 1029-1030. Deman states that the Salmanticenses, Godoy, Gonet and other Thomists incorporated into their own theory "the best of the Scotistic thesis." On the internal contradictions of Cajetan's position, cf. Chrysostome [Urrutibéhéty], *op. cit.*, 108ff. and 165; on the contradictions of the Salmanticenses, cf. *ibid.*, 124-149.

Among recent exponents of Theory (B) we may mention R. Garrigou-Lagrange, O.P., *Causae ad invicem sunt causae*, in *Ang* 9 (1932) 21-42; id., *De motivo Incarnationis*, in *APAR* 10 (1945) 7-13, where he seems to follow Suárez. For an extensive critique, see Rocca-Roschini, *De ratione primariae existentiae Christi et Deiparae* (Romae, 1944) 143-167. Later on, in his book, *The Mother of the Savior and Our Interior Life* (Dublin, 1948) 23-29, Garrigou-Lagrange substantially agrees with Bonnefoy's views on the place of Christ and Mary in the divine decree. On the author's interpretation of Christ's triple causality, cf. J. B. Bonnefoy, O.F.M., *Il primato di Cristo nella teologia contemporanea*, in *Problemi e orientamenti della teologia dommatica* (Milano, 1957) II, 218-219.

<sup>10</sup> For a good explanation of the views held by St. Thomas himself, cf. M. D. Meilach, O.F.M., *St. Thomas Aquinas and the Primacy of Christ*, in *Int* 1 (n. 1, 1960) 22-27; Chrysostome, *op. cit.*, 417-443.

Duns Scotus, O.F.M. (d. 1308),<sup>11</sup> and also by not a few outside the Franciscan Order, for example, A. Catharinus, O.P., A. Salmerón, S.J., St. Francis de Sales, etc.<sup>12</sup>

### THEORY (D). The "Conciliatory Opinion":

This theory, which claims to harmonize Thomists with Scotists, was advanced by Francisco Suárez, S.J. (d. 1617). According to him, there are *two total* adequate reasons for the Incarnation:

- 1) The intrinsic excellence of the mystery itself, and
- 2) The Redemption of the world.

*Conclusion:* Even if Adam had not sinned, the Incarnation would have taken place, since either reason would have sufficed

<sup>11</sup> For Scotus himself, whose stand is often misrepresented, cf. his *Opus Oxoniense*, lib. III, d. 7, q. 3: ed. C. Balić, O.F.M., *J. D. Scott, Doctoris Marialis, Theologiae Marianae elementa* (Sibenici, 1933) 1-10; id., *Duns Scotus Lehre über Christi Prädestination im Lichte der neuersten Forschungen*, in *WuW* 3 (1936) 19-35; A. B. Wolter, O.F.M., *Duns Scotus on the Predestination of Christ*, in *Crd* 5 (1955) 366-372; A. Martini, O.F.M., *Sul motivo primario dell'Incarnazione*, in *SF* 6 (1934) 3-33, 288-318, being an answer (how successful?) to Déodat Marie de Basly, O.F.M., *Le vrai motif de l'Incarnation: Scot aussi loin des scotistes que des thomistes*, in *RDS* 9 (1911) 149-151, 167-171, 180-182, 198-201, 213-215, continued in *EcF* 10 (1912) 14-17, 33-34, 37-41, 49-53, 62-64. Of particular importance here is Bonnefoy's *La question hypothétique: Utrum si Adam non peccasset . . . au XIII<sup>e</sup> siècle*, in *RET* 14 (1954) 327-368. Incidentally, Scotus himself did not apply to Mary his views on Christ's predestination. The first to do so were his disciples John de Bassolis (d. 1333) and Francis de Mayronis (d. 1330). Again, the first to deduce the Immaculate Conception from Mary's absolute predestination was pseudo-Lull (actually an anonymous Franciscan from Aragón) in *De immaculata beatissimae Virginis conceptione*, written in 1394 but first published in Seville, 1491. Cf. *EM* 16 (1955) 125-126. See also C. Balić, O.F.M., *La prédestination de la Très-Sainte Vierge dans la doctrine de Jean Duns Scot*, in *FF* 19 (1936) 114-158.

<sup>12</sup> A list of the more prominent followers of Scotus is given by A. Michel, *art. cit.*, in *DTC* 7 (1921) 1495-1496, and also by L. M. Bello, O.F.M., *De universali Christi primatu atque regalitate*, in *AOFM* 52 (1933) 293-311.

to bring it about.<sup>13</sup> This opinion never found a sufficient number of adherents to form a School—not even within the Society of Jesus.

### CONTEMPORARY ATTEMPTS

Besides the above-mentioned conciliatory opinion of Suárez, there have appeared in more recent times a few theories endeavoring to bring about at least a substantial harmony between Thomists and Scotists.

The first attempt was made in 1911 by Galtier.<sup>14</sup> Some have understood him as reviving the Suarezian theory; actually, at least since 1947, his opinion coincides substantially with the one held by Bonnefoy.<sup>15</sup> For this reason we may here dispense with a discussion of his views. A second attempt was made in 1937 by Bonnefoy (d.1959) who, in turn, influenced a third theory proposed by Servite Fathers Rocca and Roschini in 1941. The latest is by American philosopher-theologian William H. Marshner. Let us say a word about each.

#### THEORY (E). J.-F. Bonnefoy<sup>16</sup>

As arranged by this author, the order of predestinations

<sup>13</sup> Suárez, *De Incarnatione*, disp. 5, sect. 4, n. 7; *Op. omnia* (ed. Parisiis, 1856) XVII, 241; cf. Disp. 5, sect. 2, n.16; *ed. cit.*, XVII, 223. On the weaknesses of Suárez's position, cf. Chrysostome, *op. cit.*, 115. At any rate, later in life, the Doctor Eximius seems to have abandoned some of his previously held views, as appears from his *De Angelis*, lib. 7, cap. 13, n. 9; *ed. cit.*, II, 883-884.

<sup>14</sup> Paul Galtier, S.J., *Le vrai motif de l'Incarnation*, in NRT 43 (1911) 44-57, 104-124; in a later book, *Les deux Adam* (Paris, 1947) he admits (p. 102, n.1) the weak points of Gonet's theory concerning the famous *finis qui* and *finis cui*. In his art. *Primato di Cristo*, in EC 10 (Vatican City, 1953) 5-6, he simply gives the various opinions without expressing his own. On Galtier, cf. A. O'Neill, in SF 1 (1914-1915) 252-255; Michel, in DTC 7 (1921) 1505, and L. Ciappi, O.P., *Il motivo dell'Incarnazione e "Les deux Adam" du P. Galtier*, in Spz 3 (1950) 92-107.

<sup>15</sup> Cf. Galtier, S.J., *Les deux Adam* (Paris, 1947) esp. 87, 92, 100-124.

<sup>16</sup> Actually, Bonnefoy is not the "author" of this theory, though he is,

should be conceived as follows:

- 1) God decrees the Incarnation as the highest possible communication of His goodness in order to have someone who will love Him in a supreme way.
- 2) God decrees the existence of Mary, Christ's associate, so that Christ may have a most perfect beneficiary with whom He may share His goodness and happiness.
- 3) God decrees the existence of angels and men, so that Christ and Mary may have beneficiaries on whom they may bestow their gifts.
- 4) God decrees the existence of the material universe, destined to be the throne and footstool of His Son (Acts 9:49).
- 5) Since it is more noble to dispense one's own gifts than those belonging to others, God decrees that Christ and Mary will earn (merit) such gifts for their beneficiaries.
- 6) Since the most excellent way to show one's love is to lay down one's life for the loved ones (John 15:13), God decrees Christ's sufferings and death, with Mary's share therein.
- 7) Since it is more noble and perfect "to forgive" than "to give," God decrees (with a permissive will) the fall of our first parents so as to make possible the Redemption (and Coredemption) from sin, as the "perfect gift" to Christ's and Mary's beneficiaries.<sup>17</sup>

admittedly, the one who has developed it fully and systematically with a solidly biblical and theological justification. We will have an opportunity to mention many of his predecessors in this matter. Meanwhile, cf. our remarks in *Reflections on the Problems of Mary's Preservative Redemption*, in *MS* 30 (1979) 78-79.

<sup>17</sup> Cf. Bonnefoy's *art. cit.* in Carol's *Mariology* (Milwaukee, 1957) II, 160-169; id., *La primauté du Christ selon l'Écriture et la Tradition* (Rome, 1959); tr. by M. D. Meilach, O.F.M., with the title: *Christ and the Cosmos* (Paterson, 1965); id., *L'Immaculée dans le plan divin*, in *EphM* 8 (1958) 5-61. The accusation is sometimes made that those who distinguish various *signa rationis* within the one, single decree of divine predestination are indulging in "anthropomorphism." Cf. *EphM* (1979) 137. The accusation goes back to L. Molina, S.J., who, in his *Comment. in primam divi Thomae partem* (ed. Venetiis, 1602) q. 23, a. 4-5, disp. 1, mem. 7 writes: "...ex-

To the hypothetical question, "Would the Incarnation have taken place if Adam had not sinned?" Bonnefoy answers: The problem should not be formulated hypothetically, since God has not revealed what He might have done (or not done) in an order of things different from the one He actually chose.<sup>18</sup> Bonnefoy's views have been endorsed, at least in their substance, by a couple dozen modern authors, among whom are Alonso, Bertetto, Leblond, O'Neill, and E. Schmidt.<sup>19</sup>

### THEORY (F). *Rocca-Roschini*

The essence of this theory may be formulated thus:

The primary reason for the Incarnation is: God's free elec-

terminanda omnino videntur instantia [signa rationis] Scoti. . . Yet he himself presents the order of divine intentions by such terms as *antequam*, *praeterae*, *tunc vero*, and *denique*, the very figures of chronological succession which he condemns in others. While we must always emphasize that there is no chronological "before" or "after" in God's mind, the fact remains that the causal order existing in the divine mind cannot be adequately expressed by us humans without recourse to categories of time and space; otherwise our discourse will be simply unintelligible. Incidentally, if the accusation is valid against the Scotists it is valid likewise against the Fathers of the Church and the Scholastics (including the Angelic Doctor), to say nothing of the Sacred Scriptures themselves. Cf. Bonnefoy, *Christ and the Cosmos*, 12-13. The above observation has been endorsed by M. J. Nicolas, O.P., in *RTb* 51 (1951) 663-670, by M. R. Gagnebet, O.P., in *Ang* 28 (1951) 391, and by P. Galter, S.J., in *Ggm* 32 (1951) 596-598. Ref. in Bonnefoy, *op. cit.*, 19, n.31.

<sup>18</sup> Cf. Bonnefoy, *art. cit.*, in *RET* 14 (1954) 327-368; id., *Raison de l'Incarnation et primauté du Christ*, in *DT(P1)* 46 (1943) 103-120; S.-M. Leblanc, O.F.M., *La fausse et la vraie position d'un problème théologique*, in *Stm* 1 (1946) 3-7.

<sup>19</sup> For the exact reference to these authors, see the second part of this paper. We may mention here that the characteristic feature of Bonnefoy's theory, namely, that the decree concerning the Redemption preceded (logically) the absolute decree concerning the Fall, had many supporters in the past, for example: Gonzalo Sánchez Lucero, Didacus Granado, S.J., Petrus de Lorca, O.Cist., Petrus de Cabrera, O.S.Hier., Joannes P. Nazarius, O.P., Franciscus Amicus, S.J., Franciscus Palanco, Ord. Minim., Thomas Muniessa, S.J., Philippus Aranda, S.J., Joannes Prudencio, O. de M. and others. Cf. P. de Alcántara Martínez, O.F.M., in *EstF* 55 (1954) 207-212, 225-227.



tion of the present order, in which the Incarnation is decreed *independently* of Adam's sin but *connected* with it.<sup>20</sup>

To the hypothetical question, "Would God have become incarnate if Adam had not sinned?," the authors answer: We do not know for certain, since God has not revealed to us what He might have done (or not done) in an order different from the one He actually chose.<sup>21</sup>

### THEORY (G). *W. H. Marshner*<sup>22</sup>

*First:* In a logically early moment God knows, through His *scientia simplicis intelligentiae*, all possible worlds, with different ones presumably having different things to recommend them.

*Second:* Among these possible worlds which God understands, there is one in which a race is raised to friendship with Him through capitulation in its first parent. Still through His *scientia simplicis intelligentiae*, He understands the possible loss of that friendship, and its possible restoration through the Logos, become incarnate.

*Third:* God prefers this possible world because of the infinite glory resulting from the redemptive Incarnation which is a feature of it.

*Fourth:* God chooses to create this particular world, and through His *scientia visionis*, He now knows all that His creation will contain relative to each efficacious decree.

Formally speaking, the main difference between the above schema and what I take to be (*salvo meliori iudicio*) the Scotist

<sup>20</sup> I. M. Rocca-G. M. Roschini, O.S.M., *De ratione primaria existentiae Christi et Deiparae* (Romae, 1944) 172p. The book incorporates the authors' previous articles in *Mm* 3 (1941) 3-31, 151-168, 301-371, and includes answers to their critics, such as Berti, Perrella, Veuthey, Bonnefoy, etc.

<sup>21</sup> Rocca-Roschini, *op. cit.*, passim.

<sup>22</sup> Prof. Marshner's theory is here published for the first time and with his kind permission. Actually, it is only a condensed schema of a more elaborate presentation which the author hopes to publish eventually.

schema, is that the divine volition, in proceeding *ad extra*, begins not with an Incarnation willed in isolation, but willed within a set of possible worlds of which the Incarnation is a feature, although the set is chosen *because* of that feature (i.e., the Incarnation). Note that in such a schema:

- 1) The reason God chose to create a world such as ours is so that the Incarnation might occur.
- 2) Since the Incarnation is the final cause of creation, it should form the content of the very first of God's efficacious decrees *in ordine intentionis*.
- 3) The Incarnation thus chosen first, and for the sake of which all else will follow, is already a redemptive Incarnation.
- 4) Adam, his fall, and his descendants are already *praeintellecta* (as opposed to *praevisa*) as features of a merely possible world which might be made to exist for the sake of a redemptive Incarnation.
- 5) There is no particular difficulty about picking a possible descendant of Adam (who will exist if she is chosen to cooperate in the Incarnation) as a second criterion for choosing to create the possible world in which she will exist.
- 6) Mary's existence as Theotokos-Coredemptrix would thereby form a secondary and further-determining reason for the creation of just *this* world.
- 7) The predestination of Mary's existence and privileges could thereby form the secondary content of the very first of God's efficacious decrees *in ordine intentionis*.
- 8) Mary, who had already been *praeintellecta* as a descendant of fallen Adam, is now *praevisa* as such a descendant. But this does not mean that she is now included in Adam's moral headship and thus subject to the universal law of sin, because there are no subjections to laws outside efficacious decrees, and neither Adam nor his fall has yet been efficaciously decreed.
- 9) When Adam is efficaciously decreed in solidarity with "many," he and they are decreed for the sake of Christ and

- Mary. Her logically antecedent predestination prevents Mary from being among the "many."
- 10) Nevertheless, *de potentia ordinata*, God could have actualized a theologically possible world one of whose features could have been God's prevision of Mary as contracting original sin.
  - 11) Therefore, while utterly exempt from all *debitum peccati* (because efficaciously decreed with a logical priority to the absolute prevision of the Fall) her predestination is nevertheless a redemption because she was *praeintellecta* (and could have been *praevisa*) as forming part of a theologically possible world in which she could have contracted original sin.
  - 12) Finally, the Mary who was *de facto* predestined as Mother of the Savior, and about whom the *debitum* controversy is waged, is not the "Mary" who could have contracted original sin in a theologically possible world. The latter "Mary" was the object of God's *scientia simplicis intelligentiae*, never the object of His *scientia visionis*.

It scarcely needs to be mentioned that in *all* the theories we have discussed, it is always understood that Our Blessed Lady was predestined "in one and the same decree" with Christ.<sup>23</sup> As a consequence, for the Thomists, if Adam had not sinned, Mary would not have existed—a conclusion logically rejected by the exponents of Theory (C) above.

## PART TWO

### MODERN SUPPORTERS OF THE "FRANCISCAN" VIEWPOINT

Following is a list of modern authors who, in our judgment,

<sup>23</sup> This is also the teaching of the Church: Pius IX, *Ineffabilis Deus*, in Tondini, 32; Pius XII, *Munificentissimus Deus*, in AAS 42 (1950) 768; Vatican II, *Lumen gentium*, n.61 (Abbott ed., New York, 1966) 91; Paul VI, *Marialis cultus*, in AAS 66 (1974) 136.

endorse the various elements of the Franciscan thesis concerning Christ's and Mary's place in the divine decree of creation. In order to simplify matters, the following codes will be used at the end of each reference:

C(M)EC—Christ (Mary), the exemplary cause of all things.

C(M)FC—Christ (Mary), the final cause of all creation.

C(M)FEC—Christ (Mary), final-exemplary cause of all creation.

FBT—Follows substantially Bonnefoy's theory.

FST—Follows Scotistic theory.

MPF—Mary predestined first (with Christ), before all creatures.

MPIF—Mary predestined independently of the Fall.

Acri, F., *Dialettica serena: Disputa in religione con un teologo non filosofo* (Rocca S. Casciano, 1917) 101-103: FST.

Adalbertus a Postioma, O.F.M.Cap., *De praedestinatione B. M. Virginis apud Joannem M. Zamoro, O.F.M.Cap.* In *MF* 58 (1958) 225-229: MPF.

Adeodatus, P., *Vergine Santa, d'ogni grazia piena* (s.l., 1948) 19-21: MPF.

Affelt, F., O.F.M., *The Marian Doctrine of St. Bernardine of Siena*. In *MSO* (1954) 222: FBT.

Agnini, F., Bp. of Luni-Sarzana, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 1 (Roma, 1851) 304: MPF.

Albergamo, B. M., O.F.M., *Il fine primario dell'Incarnazione nell'opera d'un Terziario ingiustamente dimenticato*. In *SF* 11 (1939) 180-183: FST.

Aldama, J. A. de, S.J., *Consecuencias de la inclusión de María en el orden hipostático*. In *EM* 25 (1964) 41-45: FBT.

Alejandro de Villalmonste, O.F.M.Cap., *La Inmaculada y el débito del pecado*. In *VyV* 12 (1954) 49-101: FST.

———, *María Inmaculada, exenta del débito del pecado original*. In *Vgl* 11 (1957) 94-136: FST.

———, *María y los Angeles*. In *ME* 20 (1959) 401-437: FST.

- Allegra, G., O.F.M., *Il primato di Cristo in S. Paolo e in Duns Scoto (Dialogo col P. Teilhard de Chardin, S.J.)*. In ASCSI III, 219-258: FST.
- Allen, W. F., *The Predestination of Mary in the Light of Modern Controversy*. In MS 2 (1951) 178-192: Reveals his admiration for the Bonnefoy theory (Cf. p. 192, n. 34).
- Alonso, J. M., C.M.F., *De quolibet débito a B. M. Virgine prorsus excludendo*. In EphM 4 (1954) 227 and 237: FBT.
- , Address in 1954 Roman Congress. In Vgl 11 (1957) 465: MPIF.
- . *Constitutivo formal del privilegio de la Concepción Inmaculada de María*. In MCMZ 496: MPIF. Cf. also 485 and 487.
- Ambrosij, F., *Discorsi teologico-morali in lode di Maria Vergine* (Ascoli, 1843) I, 51-58: MPF, MFEC.
- Ameri, H., O.F.M., *De debito peccati originalis in B. V. Maria deque ejusdem redemptione apud theologos Concilii Basileensis*. In Vgl 11 (1957) 192: MPIF.
- Amor Ruibal, A., *Maria Mater et universalis hominum Mediatrix* (Manuscript c. 1921): MPIF.<sup>24</sup>
- Amorós, L., O.F.M., *La realeza de María en el "Mariale" atribuido a San Alberto Magno*. In EM 17 (1956) 138: MPIF. Cf. MCMZ 853.
- Anonymous, *Ragionamento dedicato all'Immacolata Concezione*

<sup>24</sup> His ms. began to be published in the journal *Compostellanum* 1 (1956), but we have been unable to locate it. Our information is based on J. M. Delgado Varela in EM 17 (1956) 380-381; 20 (1959) 88-89. See also Rainerio de Nava, O.F.M.Cap., *El primado de Cristo y María en Escoto y Amor Ruibal*, in Cmp 4 (1959) 365-369. Here in the United States, the name Angel Amor Ruibal means nothing to most people, but in Europe he was widely regarded as one of the most talented and brilliant philosopher-theologians of the century. When Pope Benedict XV ordered the formation of three theological commissions (one in Belgium, one in Spain, one in the Vatican) to examine critically and scientifically the question of Our Lady's universal Mediation, Prof. Amor Ruibal was selected to work on the Spanish commission.

- di Maria Vergine*. In *Pareri* 5 (Roma, 1851) 755-756: MPF.
- Anonymous, *Novus Adam, nova Eva*. In *Aptm* 8 (1937) 300-303: MPIF.
- Anonymous, *Inmunidad de la "deuda" del pecado original*. In *RUP* 4 (1931) 175: MPIF.
- Antoine de Sérent, *L'Immaculée Conception et les franciscains de Bretagne*. In *PCMB* 482-483: MPIF.
- , *Encore la primauté du Christ*. In *EF* 46 (1934) 492-496: FST.
- Aperribay, B., O.F.M., *Primado de Jesucristo en la Escuela Franciscana*. In *VyV* 5 (1947) 401-417: FST.
- , *La redención preservativa en la bula "Ineffabilis"*. In *EstF* 55 (1954) 88: MPIF.
- , *María en la Sagrada Escritura según los exégetas y teólogos franciscanos*. In *EM* 23 (1962) 222ff: MPIF.
- Archangelus a Roc, O.F.M.Cap. Address during the 1954 Roman Congress. In *Vgl* 11 (1957) 493-497: MPIF.
- Arduini, P. R., O.F.M., Bp. of Alghero, Letter to Pius IX (1851). In *Pareri* 7 (Roma, 1852) CXLII: MPF.
- Artaud, V. D., *La Vierge Marie* (5 ed. Paris, 1921) 5-6: MPF, MFC.
- Assouad, N., O.F.M., *Necessarium Adae peccatum*. In *SF* 7 (1935) 217-229: MPIF.
- , *Lacune en Mariologie*. In *Mm* 19 (1957) 150: MPF.
- Aubron, Père, S.J., Exchange of views after Heris' lecture. In *BSFEM* (Paris, 1938) 36-38: FST.
- Auriault, J. J., S.J., *La place de l'Immaculée Conception dans la synthèse théologique*. In *CMNL* 218: MPIF.
- , *La maternité divine*. In *FMC* 172: FST.
- Azevedo, D. de, O.F.M., *A Imaculada e o Redentor*. In *Theol* 1 (1955) 334: MPIF.
- Baier, D., O.F.M., *The Franciscan Office of St. Mary of the Angels and the Mediation of Grace*. In *OrFr* 10 (1936) 402: MPIF.

- Baillargeon, C.M., O.F.M., *A propos d'une opinion sur l'objet du péché de Lucifer*. In *Stm* 6 (1944) 137-180: FST.
- Balić, C., O.F.M., *La prédestination de la Très-Sainte Vierge dans la doctrine de Jean Duns Scot*. In *FF* 19 (1936) 114-158.
- , *Duns Skotus Lehre über Christi Prädestination im Lichte der neuersten Forschungen*. In *WuW* 3 (1936) 19-35.
- , *Marie, Mère de Dieu et Mère des hommes, dans la pensée de l'Eternel*. In *JEUO* 164-166: MPIF.
- Baraúna, G., O.F.M., *De natura Corredemptionis marianae in theologia hodierna (1921-1958) disquisitio expositivo-critica* (Romae, 1960) 75: FST.
- Barbieri, C., *Maria. Vita di Nostra Signora, Maria Santissima* (Milano, 1918) 5-6: FST.
- Baril, H., O.F.M., *La préservation de la tache originelle en Marie*. In *VIHD* 215-219: MPIF.
- Bartolomei, T.M., O.S.M., *La predestinazione di Maria insieme col Cristo*. In *EphM* 10 (1960) 261 and 272: FBT.
- , *Le radici del mutuo amore tra i Sacri Cuori di Gesù e di Maria*. In *Mm* 22 (1960) 477: MPF.
- , *La predestinazione di Cristo e di Maria e la sua indissolubile unità*. In *EphM* 19 (1969) 5-99.
- Basetti-Sani, G., O.F.M., *Il primato di Cristo in S. Cirillo*. In *Kyrl* (1947) 139-196: FST.
- Basilio de Pinillas, O.F.M.Cap., *La Virgen y el débito del pecado original*. In *Rfs* 15 (1954) 33-35: MPIF.
- Basilio de Rubi, O.F.M.Cap., *Aspectes diversos de la Rédempció*. In *EdisF* 45 (1933) 249-270, esp. 269-270: FST.
- Baudry, Ch.-Th., Bp. of Périgueux, *Le Coeur de Jésus* (Paris, 1865) 50-51: CFC.
- Beaubien, R.M., O.F.M., *Your Mass and Your Life*, tr. Cooper (Montréal, 1960) 10-21: FST.
- Bellan, F., Orat., *Dissertazione... nella quale, ritenutosi che Maria Santissima sia stata preservata dall'atto d'incor-*

- rere nella colpa d'origine... studiarsi di mostrare che sia stata preservata altresì da ogni debito d'incontrarla. In *Pareri* 5 (Roma, 1851) 667-668: MPIF.
- Bello, L. M., O.F.M., *De universali Christi primatu atque regalitate*. In *AOFM* 52 (1933) 293-311: FST.
- Bellord, J., tit. Bp. of Milevis, *Mediations on Christian Dogma I* (3rd ed. Callan, 1906) 266-267: FST; 328-329: MPIF.
- Benigar, A., O.F.M., *Compendium theologiae spiritualis* (Rome, 1959) 70-85: MPIF.
- Béraud de Saint-Maurice, *John Duns Scotus, a Teacher for Our Times*, tr. C. Duffy (St. Bonaventure, N.Y., 1955) 239-275: FST.
- Bernardi, E., *Una recente teoria intorno all'Assunzione di Maria*. In *SV* 24 (1949) 135-140; 25 (1950) 7-9: FBT.
- Bernardinus a S. Joanne Rotundo, O.F.M.Cap., *Thesis franciscanae de motivo primario Incarnationis expositio cum respectu speciali ad doctrinam S. Laurentii a Brundisio*. In *CF* 4 (1934) 546-563: FST.
- Bertagna, M., O.F.M., *Christologia S. Bernardini Senensis*. In *CF* 18 (1948) 5-19: FST.
- , *Padre Remigio Buselli, O.F.M., e il movimento assunzionistico contemporaneo*. In *ACNM* 410: MPIF.
- Berteaud, J. F. L., Bp. of Tulle. Cf. J.-B. du Petit-Bornand, *Essai sur la primauté de N.-S. Jésus-Christ...* (Paris, 1900) 44, n.3.
- Bertetto, D., S.D.B., *Maria, Madre universale. Mariologia* (Firenze, 1958) 35-50: FBT.
- Bertoni, A., O.F.M., *Le Bienheureux Jean-Duns Scot, sa vie, sa doctrine, ses disciples* (Levanto, 1917) 330: MPC, CMFC.
- Bettoni, E., O.F.M., *Nothing for Your Journey*, tr. Malina (Chicago, 1959) 71-104: FST.
- Beumer, J., S.J., *Maria Mutter des Christenheit*. In *KM* 2 (Paderborn, 1947) 228: MPIF.
- Biancheri, P., C.M., *Voto in forma di dissertazione sulla defi-*



nizione dogmatica dell'Immacolato Concepimento della B. V. Maria. In *Pareri* 5 (Roma, 1851) 545: MPIF.

Bigoni, A., O.F.M.Conv., *Dissertazione panegirica in onore dell'Immacolata Concezione di Maria Santissima*. In *Pareri* 9 (Roma, 1852) append. II, 289, 297, 300: MPF.

Bisaillon, C., O.F.M., *La primauté du Christ dans Col. 1:13-20*. In *Stm* 8 (1954) 11-28: FST.

Bissen, J. M., O.F.M., *De primatu Christi absoluto apud Col. 1:13-20*. In *Ant* 11 (1936) 3-26: FST.

———, *De praedestinatione absoluta Christi secundum Duns Scotum expositio doctrinalis*. In *Ant* 12 (1937) 3-36: FST.

———, *La tradition sur la prédestination absolue de Jésus-Christ du VII<sup>e</sup> au XIV<sup>e</sup> siècle*. In *FF* 22 (1939) 9-34: FST.

Bizé, Abbé, *Vérité et vraie raison du Christianisme* I (Paris, 1871) 316: FST.

Blasucci, A. M., O.F.M.Conv., *La dottrina scotistica della predestinazione assoluta di Maria e il dogma dell'Immacolata Concezione*. In *Vgl* 9 (1957) 124-163: MPIF.

Bonafede, G., *L'Incarnazione negli scrittori francescani del secolo XIII*. In *ItF* 27 (1952) 143-153: FST.

Bonal, A., S.S., *Institutiones Theologicae II: de Verbo Incarnato* (ed. 15, 1884) 578: FST.

Bonanno, D., O.F.M., *Christocentrism in 20th-Century Theology*. In *Int.* 1 (n.4, 1962) 22-30: FST.

Bonnefoy, J.-F., O.F.M., *La primauté absolue de N. S. Jésus-Christ et de la T.-S. Vierge*. In *BSFEM* 4 (1938) 43-100: MPIF, MCFEC.

———, *Sa Sainteté Pie XII et la primauté du Christ et de la T.-S. Vierge*. In *SF* 12 (1940) 2-6: MPF.

———, *L'Assomption de la T.-S. Vierge et sa prédestination*. In *VDA* 293-335.

———, *Reaction to Garrigou-Lagrange's lecture*. In *APAR* 10 (1945) 24-35.

- , *Raison de l'Incarnation et primauté du Christ*. In DT(P1) 46 (1943) 102-120.
- , *La place du Christ dans le plan de la création*. In MSR 4 (1947) 257-284.
- , *Le mérite social de Marie et sa prédestination*. In ASC 2 (1952) 21-48.
- , *Marie dans l'Eglise, ou la primauté de la Sainte Vierge*. In BSFEM 11 (1953) 51-73.
- , *La question hypothétique: Utrum si Adam non peccasset . . . au XIII<sup>e</sup> siècle*. In RET 14 (1954) 327-368.
- , *A propos de la primauté du Christ*. In VyV 8 (1950) 228-235.
- , *The Predestination of Our Blessed Lady*. In Mariology, ed. J. B. Carol, O.F.M. (Milwaukee, 1957) II, 154-176.
- , *Il primato di Cristo nella teologia contemporanea*. In *Problemi e Orientamenti di Teologia Dogmatica* 2 (Milano, 1957) 123-236.
- , *L'Immaculée dans le plan divin*. In EphM 8 (1958) 5-61.
- , *La primauté du Christ selon l'Ecriture et la Tradition* (Rome, 1959), tr. and abridged by M. D. Meilach, O.F.M., and published under the title: *Christ and the Cosmos* (Paterson, N.J., 1965) xviii-438p.
- , *Marie préservée de toute tache du péché originel*. In CML, esp. 202-208.
- Bonomelli, G., Bp. of Cremona, *Il pulpito di Nostra Donna di Parigi* (Torino, 1893) 47-48: MPIF.
- Borgianelli, E., S.J., *La maternità divina e le conseguenti prerogative* (Napoli, 1874) 362-371: MPIF.
- Borgonovo, G., *Maggio liturgico . . .* (ed. 11, Trento, 1932) 17-19: MPF.
- Bosio da Trobaso, A., O.F.M., *Catechismo mariano: Trattato di Mariologia . . .* (Venezia, 1931) 15: MPIF.
- Bouëssé, H., O.P., *Le Sauveur du monde: La place du Christ dans le plan de Dieu* (Chambéry-Leyse, 1951) 88: The

Incarnation conditions the Fall, not the other way around.<sup>25</sup>

Bougaud, L.-V., Bp. of Laval, *Le Christianisme et les temps présents* 3 (Paris, 1884) 255: FST.

Bourgeois, P., O.P., *La Vierge Marie. Mystères de sa prédestination et de sa vie* (Paris, 1908) 6-7: MPF.

Bover, J. M., S.J., *Gratiae oeconomia per Christum, independens a peccato, secundum Pauli doctrinam*. In *VD* 2 (1922) 79-87: FST.

———, *Dei Filius, homo factus, independenter a peccato, secundum Pauli doctrinam*. In *VD* 2 (1922) 170-176: FST.

Bracaloni, L., O.F.M., *Spiritualità francescana* (ed. 2 Venezia, 1949) passim: FST.

Braso, G. M., O.S.B., *Liturgy and Spirituality*, tr. L. J. Doyle (Collegeville, Minn., 1960) 56-76: FST.

Breton, G., *Un évêque d'autrefois: Mgr. Berteaud, évêque de Tulle* (Paris, 1898) 356-357: Endorses the Bishop's Scotistic teaching. Cf. *JB*-1, 197.

Breton, V., O.F.M., *La spiritualité franciscaine* (Paris, 1935) 40-42: MPIF.

———, *Méditation de Jésus-Christ* (Paris, 1936): FST.

Bridges, G., O.F.M., *The Divine Plan*. In *Crd* 8 (1958) 1-6: MPIF.

Brinkmann, B., S.J., *Die kosmische Stellung des Gottmenschen in paulinischer Sicht*. In *WuW* 13 (1950) 11: FST.

Brouillard, C., O.F.M., *Les motifs de l'Incarnation d'après saint Anselme*. In *ChF* 2 (1932-1933) 21-52: FST.

Brunot, A., S.C.J., *St. Paul and His Message*, tr. Matthews (New York, 1959) 123-127: CFC.

Bryant, J. D., *The Immaculate Conception of the Most Blessed*

<sup>25</sup> J.-F. Bonnefoy, O.F.M., in *Un essai récent sur le plan divin de la création* (Paris, 1953) tells us that Bouëssé admits virtually all the elements of the Scotistic thesis (p. 33). Bonnefoy's brochure, which first appeared in *MF* 52 (1952) 425-460, is well worth reading in its entirety.

- Virgin Mary, Mother of God: A Dogma of the Catholic Church* (Boston, 1855) 54: MPF.
- Buathier, Abbé, *Le Sacrifice* (Lyon, 1886) 23-26: FST. Cf. JB-1, 47.
- Burgio, C., O.F.M., *Le ragioni dell'Incarnazione secondo S. Leone Magno*. In SF 37 (1940) 81-94: FST.
- Burney, C., *Christ as the arché of creation: Prov. 8, 22; Col. 1, 15-18; Gen. 3, 14*. In JTS 27 (1925-1926) 160-177: FST.
- Burón Alvarez, C., O.E.S.A., *Causalidad de María en nuestra predestinación según el P. Bartolomé de los Rios, O.E.S.A.* In EM 1 (1942) 304: The author arranges the *signa rationis* the same as Prof. W. H. Marshner (See Part One above).
- Buselli, R., O.F.M., *La Vergine Maria vivente in corpo ed in anima in cielo . . .* (Firenze, 1863) 189ff: MPIF.
- Caesari, Th., Ord. Cist., Letter to Pius IX (1852). In *Pareri* 9 (Roma, 1852) 287: MPIF.
- Caggiano, A. M., O.F.M., *De mente Joannis Duns Scoti circa rationem Incarnationis*. In Ant 32 (1957) 311-334: FST.
- , *La questione del "debitum peccati" in Girolamo da Montefortino*. In VgI 11 (1957) 299-314, esp. 312-314: MPIF.
- Caldentey, M., T.O.R., *Principio fundamental de la Mariología luliana: notas sobre el primado universal de Jesucristo y María*. In VyV 1 (1943) 113-124: MPIF.
- , *Nuestra Señora Santa María ¿fue Madre por causa del pecado?, o el primado universal de Jesucristo y María según el Doctor Iluminado*. In EM 8 (1949) 363-381: MPIF.
- Canice, Father, O.F.M.Cap., *Mary. A Study of the Mother of God* (Dublin 1937) 1-7: MPF.
- Capecelatro, Cardinal A., *Exposition de la doctrine catholique* (nouv. éd., Paris, 1910) 164-169: FST.
- Capelle, B., O.S.B., *L'Assomption*. In ACMB 81: MPF.

- Carlos de Villapadierna, O.F.M.Cap., *La aurora de la historia*. In NG 5 (1958) 117-129: MPIF.
- Carmelus ab Iturgoyen, O.F.M.Cap., *De Incarnationis motivo ac de Christi Domini primatu*. In CF 7 (1937) 161-178: 342-356: FST.
- , *Un díptico teológico-franciscano. El primado universal y absoluto de Jesucristo y el primado universal y relativo de María*. In RI 68-80: MPIF, MFEC.
- Carol, J. B., O.F.M., *Fundamentals of Mariology* (New York, 1956) 21-25: MPIF.
- , *A History of the Controversy over the Debitum Peccati* (St. Bonaventure, N.Y., 1978) 170, 176-178: MPIF.
- , *Reflections on the Problem of Mary's Preservative Redemption*. In MS 30 (1979) esp. 71-81: MPIF.
- Carr, A., O.F.M.Conv. (now a Trappist), *Mary's Immaculate Conception*. In *Mariology*, ed. J. B. Carol, O.F.M. (Milwaukee, 1954) I, 384: MPIF. Cf. also MSO 375: FST.
- Carrell, G. A., Bp. of Covington, Ky., Letter to Msgr. L. M. Pin (Oct. 1867) in connection with the latter's book (qv.): FST. Ref. in JB-1 46, n.6.
- Castellano, J. M., Letter to Pius IX. In *Pareri* 4 (Roma, 1851) 201: MPIF.
- Castelplanio, L. di, O.F.M., *Maria nel consiglio dell'Eterno, ovvero la Vergine predestinata alla missione medesima con Gesù Cristo* 1 (2 ed., Napoli, 1902) 56-67: MPIF.
- Cerfaux, L., *Christ in the Theology of St. Paul*, tr. Webb & Walker (New York, 1959) 429-432: FST.
- Cerri, D., *Enchiridion auctoritatum super duodecim momenta fundatum ex quibus exurgit triumphus B. Mariae Virginis Matris Dei in originale peccatum*. In *Pareri* 6 (Roma, 1951) 34-35: MPIF.
- Chaptal, E. A., Bp. of Isonda, *Marie, mère du prêtre* (Paris, 1942) 7: MPF. Cf. p. 24.
- Charbonnell, F., O.F.M., *Le grand drame de la création* (Paris, 1909) 221-224: MPIF.

- Charmot, F., S.J., *Présence mariale immaculée* (Paris, 1954) 16-17: MPF
- Chavez, T. de, O.F.M.Cap., *O Primado universal de Cristo em S. Lourenço de Brindisi*. In REB 29 (1959) 579-592: FST.
- Chevalier, J., M.S.C., *Le Sacré-Coeur de Jésus dans ses rapports avec Marie* (Paris, 1884) Ch. 3: FST.
- Chomilier, Canon M., *La Très-Sainte Vierge Marie dans le cadre de l'année liturgique* (Clermont-Ferrand, 1950) 9-10: MPF.
- Ciampi, L., O.F.M., Archbp. of Sorrento, Letter to Pius IX. In *Pareri* 3 (Roma, 1851) 402: MPIF.
- Ciappi, L., O.P., (now Cardinal), *De privilegio Immaculatae Conceptionis ac de praedestinatione Matris Dei Salvatoris juxta doctrinam S. Thomae de motivo Incarnationis*. In *Vgl* 6 (Romae, 1955) 4-5: The Incarnation was decreed *ante praevisum lapsum*; 7: Mary is the final, efficient and exemplary cause of the entire economy of redemption.<sup>26</sup>
- Ciccarelli, M. M., O.F.M., *La Collaboratrice dell'Altissimo* (ed. 2, Milano, 1963) 150: MPIF.
- Claret, St. Anthony M., Archbp. of Santiago de Cuba, *L'Immacolata, Trattatello sul mistero dell'Immacolato Concepimento di Maria*, tr. from Spanish with notes by G. M. Roschini (Milano, 1943) 63: MPF. (This is the Saint's Pastoral Letter of 1855).
- Clari, M.M., Archbp. of Bari, Letter to Pius IX (1848). In *Pareri* 9 (Roma, 1852) 195: MPF.
- Clemente da S. Maria in Punta, O.F.M.Cap., *S. Lorenzo da Brindisi, teologo dell'Immacolata*. In *Vgl* 7/2 (1957) 26-27: MPIF.

<sup>26</sup> The author mentions, however, that Mary was not predestined independently of the prevision of sin (p. 5). It seems to us that if she was predestined *uno eodemque decreto* with Christ (as Pius IX taught) and Christ was predestined *ante praevisum lapsum* (as Ciappi holds), then she, too, must have been predestined before the prevision of the Fall. Cf. further remarks in MS 30 (1979) 80-81.

- Clergy & People of the Diocese of Cagli, Letter to Pius IX. In *Pareri* 44 (Roma, 1851) 141. They ask: If Mary was the firstborn of all creatures, how could she be involved in Adam's Fall?
- Clovis de Provin, O.F.M.Cap., *Notre-Dame de la Trinité d'après la théologie, l'art et la mystique ...* (Blois, 1932) 207: CFC.
- Coccia, A., O.F.M.Conv., Intervention during the 1954 Roman Congress. In *Vgl* 11 (1957) 487-488: MPIF.
- Coeur Immaculé de Marie, Le;* par un moine Bénédictin (Paris, 1946) 109-110: FST.
- Cohauz, O., S.J., *Maria in ihrer Urdee und Wirklichkeit* (Limburg an der Lahn, 1938) 8-9: MPF.
- Coiteux, F., O.F.M., *Le caractère marial des origines franciscaines*. In *VIHD* 103, 106: MPF.
- Colomer, L., O.F.M., *El primer momento de la Virgen*. In *EM* 15 (1955) 266-267: MPIF (Cf. p. 259).
- , *El porqué de la Inmaculada Concepción*. In *Vgl* 9 (1957) 164-184: MPIF.
- Combalot, T., *La connaissance de Jésus-Christ* (Paris, 1841) 21-22: FST.
- , *Le culte de la B. Vierge Marie, Mère de Dieu I* (Lyon, 1865) 412-441: MPIF.
- Conti, G. M., O.F.M.Conv., *La predestinazione e la divina maternità di Maria secondo il P. M° Angelo Volpi, O.F.M. Conv., grande teologo scotista del seicento (d.1647)* (Roma, 1947) 15, 20, 23: MPF.
- Contratto, M., O.F.M.Cap., Bp. of Acqui, Pastoral Letter of Dec. 1, 1844. In *Pareri* 6 (Roma, 1851) 623: MPF.
- Corne, J., O.M.I., *Le mystère de N.-S. Jésus-Christ I* (Paris, 1892) 171: FST.
- Cranny, T., S.A., Intervention during Franc. Ed. Conf. 1954. In *MSO* 222: MPIF.
- Crespo, J. D., O.F.M., *A crença do povo na Imaculada Conceição*. In *SCMB* 642-643: MPIF.

- Crisóstomo de Pamplona, O.F.M.Cap., *Puntos más salientes de la Mariología laurenciana*. In *EstF* 54 (1953) 166-172: FST.
- , *María y la Iglesia en la moderna bibliografía francesa*. In *EM* 18 (1957) 118: FBT.
- Cristiani, Chan., *Une thèse remarquable sur l'Assomption de la T.-S. Vierge*. In *AdC* 11 (Aug. 1949) 498-499: FBT.
- Curci, C. M., S.J., *La natura e la grazia*, tr. from 2nd French ed. (Paris, 1870) 251-279: FST.
- d'Acquisto, B., *Trattati di Teologia Dogmatica* (Palermo, 1862) c. 5: FST.
- Dadolle, P., Bp. of Dijon, *Il Mese di Maggio*, tr. V. Tardieu (Giarre, 1914) 9-12: MPF.
- Da Fonseca Moniz, A., Bp. of Faro, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Parei* 1 (Roma, 1851) 511-512: MPIF, MFC.
- Dám, I., O.F.M., *Kegyosztó Tarsa Krisztusnak [Alma Socia Christi]*. In *Vglia* 13 (1948) 1-5: FST.
- da Mistretta, O., O.F.M., *Il Verbo divino, increato, incarnato, ispirato, eterna verità e centro d'Unità* (Firenze, 1867): FST.
- Daniélou, J., S.J. (later Cardinal), *Christ and Us*, tr. Roberts (New York, 1961) 60-64: FST.
- d'Arcy, M., S.J., *Christ, Priest and Redeemer*. In *TCC* I, 492-493: FST with some reservations.
- Davies, J., O.F.M., *Regarding Scotus Himself*. In *Int* (n. 1, 1960) 16: FST.
- Davis, C., *Theology for Today* (New York, 1962) 159-170: FBT.
- de Basly, D. M., O.F.M., *Grandes thèses catholiques I: Le Sacré-Coeur* (Paris-Lille, 1901) 218-219: MPIF.
- , *Le vrai motif de l'Incarnation: Scot aussi loin des scolastiques que des thomistes*. In *RDS* 9 (1911) 149-151, 167-171, 180-182, 198-201, 213-215; continued in *EcF* 10 (1912) 14-17, 33-34, 37-41, 49-53, 62-64.<sup>27</sup>

<sup>27</sup> The author claims that Scotus prescinded from the hypothetical ques-



- De Bianchi-Dottula, J., Archbp. of Trani, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 1 (Roma, 1851) 9-10: MPF.
- de Castro Mendes, A., *A maternidade divina de Maria*. In SCMB 189-199: MPF, MFEC.
- Dechamps, Cardinal V., C.S.S.R., *La Nouvelle Eve* (2 ed., Paris, 1862) 9-20: MPIF.
- , *De la certitude en matière de religion...*, c. 12. In PFC I, col. 1014-1029: FST.
- de Concilio, J., *The Knowledge of Mary* (New York, 1878) 39-40: FST; 53: MPF; 193-194: MFC
- Deffrennes, R., O.F.M., *Essai de la théologie dans la charité*. In FF 16 (1933) 133-161: FBT.
- Deguire, J. J., O.F.M., *Marie vivante* (Nicolet, 1952) 9-13: MPIF.
- Deidier, X., Preface to L. M. Pin's book, *Jésus-Christ dans le plan divin de la rédemption* (Paris, 1873): FST.
- de la Peña, J. L., Letter to the Vicar Apostolic of Uruguay, signed by ten other priests of Montevideo. In *Pareri* 4 (Roma, 1851) 244-245: MPF.
- Delgado Capeáns, R., O. de M., *María, luz esplendorosa del mundo* (Madrid, 1955).<sup>28</sup>
- Delgado Varela, J. M., O. de M., *La exclusión de todo débito a la luz de la razón teológica*. In Vgl 11 (1957) 88-89: MPIF.
- , *La maternidad espiritual y la realeza de María*. In EM 17 (1956) 380-381, 391: FST, but rightly rejecting hypothetical formulation of the thesis.
- Démaret, G., O.S.B., *Marie de qui est né Jésus I* (Paris, 1937) 191-194: FBT.

tion: *Utrum si Adam non peccasset...* He was answered by A. Martini in SF 6 (1934) 3-33, 288-318.

<sup>28</sup> On p. 23 the author says that Mary was decreed neither before nor after the prevision of the Fall, but in the same decree with it. On p. 45-46: There was in Mary an impossibility to contract original sin because she was not connected with Adam; on the contrary, Adam owed his first grace to her. This is Scotism pure and simple.

- de Pablos, B., *Constitutivo formal del privilegio de la Concepción Inmaculada de María*. In MCMZ 512: MPIF.
- de Pesquidoux, D., *L'Immaculée Conception* (Paris, 1898): 46-47: MPF.
- Depoix, H., S.M.M., *Tractatus theologicus de Beata Maria Virgine* (ed. 2, Lugduni, 1866) 69-70: MPIF.
- de Portes, T., Archbp. of Santo Domingo, Letter to Pius IX. In *Pareri* 2 (Roma, 1851) 173-174: MPF.
- de Prado, E. A., Bp. of Santa Cruz de la Sierra, Letter to Pius IX. In *Pareri* 3 (Roma, 1851) 342-343: MPF.
- de Romo, J. J., Card. Archbp. of Seville, *Discurso sobre la Inmaculada Concepción de María* (Sevilla, 1850). In *Pareri* 8 (Roma, 1852) 148: MPF.
- de Ségur, L. G., *La SS. Vergine nei commenti dei Santi Padri*, tr. from the French ed. of Paris, 1867 (Torino, 1925) 186-189: CMFC.
- , *Jésus-Christ* (8th ed.) 44: FST. Ref. in JB-1 44, n.4.
- Desfleches, J., Bp. of Sinita, Letter to Pius IX (1848). In *Pareri* 3 (Roma, 1851) 410: MPF.
- de Stefani, G., *Maria Santissima nell'Antico Testamento, nella sua vita e nella vita della Chiesa* (Torino, s.a.) 167-173: MPIF.
- de Torres y Estans, J. G., Bp. of New Pamplona, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 2 (Roma, 1851) 74: MPF.
- De Zubiría, J. A., Bp. of Durango, Letter to Pius IX (1850). In *Pareri* 3 (Roma, 1851) 164: MPF.
- Diekhans, M., O.F.M., *Maria Santíssima, Mãe de Deus e Mãe dos homens* (Salvador-Bahia, 1954) 8: FST. Cf. p.51-52.
- , *O "debitum peccati originalis" em Maria Santíssima*. In REB 17 (1957) 332 and 340: MPIF.
- Di Fonzo, L., O.F.M.Conv., *La Mariologia di S. Bernardino da Siena*. In MF 47 (1947) esp. 19-22: MPIF.
- Di Lella, A., O.F.M., *The Blessed Virgin. Part I: Mary's Predestination, a Key to a Synthesis of Mariology*. In Crd 9 (1959) 129-138: MPIF.

- Di Monda, A. M., O.F.M.Conv., *L'Immacolata nell'opera mariologica dello scotista Angelo Volpi, O.F.M.Conv. (d. 1647)*. In *Vgl* 7/2 (1957) 267: MPIF.
- Dionne, Maurice, *La grâce de Marie est d'ordre hypostatique*. In *LTPb* 10 (1950) 144: MPF.
- Di Rosa, L., O.F.M., *Il problema del male I* (Palermo, 1929) 42-48: FST.
- [Dominique de la Mère de Dieu, C.P.], *Excellence de Marie et de sa dévotion*, tr. Labis (Tournay, 1841) 17 and 78: MPF.
- Doublet, J., *Saint Paul étudié en vue de la prédication* (Paris, 1889) ch. 2: FST. Ref. in JB-1 46.
- Doyle, S., O.F.M., *The Fundamental Principle of Mariology*. In *Int* 1 (n.3, 1961) 21-25: FBT.
- Dubois, M.-M., Archbp. of Besançon, *Petite Somme Marial* (Paris, 1957) 249-251: MPIF.
- Durand, A., S.J., *Incarnation et Christocentrisme*. In *NRT* 69 (1949) 475-486: FST.
- Durrwell, F. X., C.S.S.R., *The Resurrection: A Biblical Study*, tr. Sheed (New York, 1960) 108-150: FST with some reservations concerning the Angels.
- Eijo Garay, L., Bp. of Madrid-Alcalá, *La finalidad de la Encarnación según el beato Raimundo Lulio*. In *RET* 2 (1942) 201-227: FST.
- Emmanuele da S. Marco, O.F.M.Cap., *Il piano divino della salute nella pericope Rom. 3:21-26* (Roma, 1937): FST.
- Escobar, C., O.F.M., *Utrum Virgo Deipara contraxerit debitum incurrendi peccatum originale*. In *VyV* 18 (1960) 331: MPIF.
- Escolano y Fenoy, J., Bp. of Jaen, Letter to Pius IX (1850). In *Pareri* 3 (Roma, 1951) 93-94: MPF.
- Faber, F. W., Orat., *The Blessed Sacrament* (new ed., Philadelphia, 1958) 333-340: FST.
- , *Bethlehem* (new ed., Philadelphia, 1955) 26-27: FST.

- , *The Precious Blood* (10th ed., Baltimore, s.a.) 107: FST.<sup>29</sup>
- Feckes, C., *Die Gottesmutterchaft*. In KM II, 79: MPIF.
- Federico da Baselga, O.F.M.Cap., *Monumento liturgico all' Immacolata* (ed. 2, Roma, 1954) 59-60: MPIF.
- Falcone, S., O.F.M.Cap., *St. Lawrence of Brindisi, Marian Saint and Scholar*. In MSO 130-131: MPIF.
- Féret, H. M., O.P., *A propos de la primauté du Christ*. In RSPT 27 (1938) 69-72, esp. 70: FST. Cf. J. B. Bonnefoy, *Il primato . . .*, 214-215.
- Fernández, L. A., Vicar Apostolic of Uruguay, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 2 (Roma, 1851) 22-23: MPIF.
- Feuling, Dom., O.S.B., *Katholische Glaubenslehre* (Salzburg, 1937) 426-428: FST.
- Fidèle de la Motte-Servolex, O.F.M.Cap., *Préélection ou prédestination éternelle de la T.-S. Vierge*. In CCMF I, 246-256: MPIF.
- Fischer, C., O.F.M., *Jacques Nacchianti, O.P., évêque de Chioggia (Chizza) d. 1569, et sa théologie de la primauté absolue du Christ*. In FF 20 (1937) 97-174: FST.
- Folgori, F., *Dignità, santità e gloria di Maria Vergine I* (Napoli, 1867) 79: MPF.
- Fondora, C., *Cenni sulla Immacolata Concezione di Maria Vergine Madre di Dio e Regina dell'universo*. In *Pareri* 5 (Roma, 1851) 691-692, 715-716: MPF.
- Forn Roget, J., S.J., *De veritate catholica Immaculatae Conceptionis B. Mariae V. disquisitio octo disputationibus comprehensa* (Ms. in Arch. Hist. Prov. Tarracon. Soc. Jesu, 1850), disp. 8: MPIF. Ref. from F. de P. Solá in *VgI* 11 (1957) 331.
- Fornari, Vito (d. 1900), *Vita di Cristo* (Firenze, 1869) 66-67:

<sup>29</sup> Cf. D. J. Unger, O.F.M.Cap., *Christ and His Virgin Mother in God's Eternal Decree according to Frederick W. Faber*, in *Mm* 17 (1955) 369-391; W. Wilhelm, O.F.M.Cap., *Father Frederick Faber on the Queenship of Mary*, in *Mm* 16 (1954) 468 and 473.

- FST. Ref. from D. Scaramuzzi, *Il pensiero di Giovanni Duns Scoti nel mezzogiorno d'Italia* (Roma, 1927) 273-279.
- Franciscus X. de Abarzuza, O.F.M.Cap., *Manuale Theologiae Dogmaticae* 3 (ed. 2, Matriti, 1956) 145-160: FST.
- Franco, M., Bp. of Catanzaro, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 1 (Roma, 1851) 31: MPF.
- Franzi, F., O.M.I., *Verso l'altare con Maria* (Casale Monferrato, 1944) 13-15: MPF, MFEC.
- Gabriel de la Dolorosa, O.S.S.T., *¿Nuevos argumentos immaculistas?* In MCMZ 137: FST.
- Gallus, T., S.J., Address during the 1954 Roman Congress. In *Vgl* 11 (1957) 469-470: FBT.
- Galot, J., S.J., *L'Immaculée Conception*. In *Maria* 7 (Paris, 1964) 102: FBT.<sup>80</sup>
- Galtier, P., S.J., *Les deux Adam* (Paris, 1947) 100-124.
- Gamboni, G., S.J., *Vergine Madre* (Napoli, 1937) 11-16: MPF.
- García Abella, P., Orat., Archbp. of Valencia, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 1 (Roma, 1851) 371: MPF.
- García Garcés, N., C.M.F., *Títulos y Grandezas de María* (2 ed., Madrid, 1952) 39-44: MPF, MFEC.
- Garriguet, L., *La Vierge Marie* (8 ed., Paris, 1933) 13: MPF.
- Gaume, J.-J. (d. 1879), *Traité du S.-Esprit* (2 ed., Paris, s.a.) I, 55-67: FST.
- Gava, A., Bp. of Feltre-Belluno, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 1 (Roma, 1851) 462: MPF.

<sup>80</sup> Galot, *art. cit.*, p. 102: "Nous n'avons pas à entrer ici dans la controverse traditionnelle entre scotisme et thomisme sur la prédestination du Christ et le but de l'Incarnation. Bornons-nous à constater que selon la bulle *Ineffabilis* cette prédestination est *antérieure* à la création et qu'ainsi se manifeste le primat du Christ; mais que d'autre part il s'agit d'une prédestination du Christ rédempteur... Le but essentiel de l'Incarnation est donc la Rédemption, et cependant le dessein rédempteur est antérieur à la création, grâce à la prévision du péché d'Adam." Maybe he means the prevision of sin *as possible*, in which case he is saying substantially the same thing as Father Bonnefoy.

- Gay, C. L., Aux. Bp. of Poitiers, *Elévations sur la vie et la doctrine de N.-S. Jésus-Christ I* (Oudin, 1879) 3-5: FST; 92: MPF. Cf. JB-2, 6-7.
- Gemelli, A., O.F.M., *Maria Santissima, modello e guida nella vita spirituale*. In TFAM 9: MPF.
- , *Il Francescanesimo* (6 ed., Milano, 1947) 60-61: MPIF.
- Genty de Bonqueval, *Elévations sur les litanies de la T.-S. Vierge I* (Paris, 1902) 239-259; 3 (Paris, 1903) 361-392: FST.
- George, Father, O.F.M., *Incarnation Is Complement of Creation: the Duns Scotus View*. In ER 88 (May, 1933) 522-526: Defends Scotistic view but misrepresents it.
- Giamberardini, G., O.F.M., *S. Hilarius Pictaviensis de praedestinatione Verbi Incarnati*. In MF 49 (1949) 266-300, 514-533: FST.
- , *Due tesi scotiste nella tradizione copta: Il primato assoluto di Cristo e l'Immacolata Concezione di Maria*. In ASCSI, 346-347: MPIF.
- Giampedi, A., Bp. of Alatri, Letter to Pius IX (1851). In *Pareri* 1 (Roma, 1851) 271: MPF.
- Giannuzzi, J., S.J., *Le grandezze di Maria Vergine Madre di Dio svelate al popolo cattolico* (Ferrara, 1878) 9-12: MPF.
- Gilloz, Dom, Art. in VF (Nov., 1930) 331-335: MPIF. Ref. in D. Scaramuzzi, *J. D. Scoto Summula* (Firenze, 1932) 225-226.
- Giraud, M. S., S.M., *Prêtre et Hostie I* (Paris-Lyon, 1885) xxvii: MPIF.
- Giroto, S., O.F.M., *Il perchè del mondo* (Roma, 1954): FST.
- Goicoechea, J. M., O.F.M., *Explicación teológica de la realeza de María*. In ACAAL, 266-267, 275: MPIF, MFEC.
- Gómez, E., O. de M., *La Inmaculada Concepción de María según el Ilmo. Mtro. Fr. Pedro de Oña (1560-1626)*. In Vgl 8/1 (1955) 98: MPIF.
- Gommenginger, L., *Unsere Königin* (Paderborn, 1931) 151-180: FST.

- González Pintado, G., S.J., *La Virgen María, aurora de salvación* (3 ed., Bilbao, 1943) 25-28: MPF, MFC.
- Gratry, A., *Le mois de Marie* . . . (2 ed., Paris, 1931) 68-78: FST.
- Gréa, A., O.S.B., *De l'Eglise et de sa divine constitution* (Paris, 1885) 9-10.<sup>31</sup>
- Gremigni, G. V., Archbp. of Novara, *La Madonna* (Novara, 1959) 13-16: MPF.
- Grézier, M. M., Ord. Carth., *Cur Deus Homo, ou le motif de l'Incarnation* (Currière près la Grande Chartreuse, 1886) 70: FST. Ref. in Bonnefoy, *Un essai récent sur le plan divin de la création* (Paris, 1953) 6.
- Grillmeier, A., S.J., *Fragen der Theologie heute* (Einsiedeln, 1957) 270: Gives Scotistic interpretation of Col. 1:15. Ref. in Hernández Cirre, *El primado universal de Cristo a la luz del Vaticano II*. In *EstF* 69 (1968) 34.
- Gual, P., O.F.M., *Della definibilità della Concezione Immacolata di Maria dissertazione teologica*. In *Pareri* 8 (Roma, 1852) 24-25: MPIF.
- Guallar Poza, S., *La cuádruple fórmula del Beato Montfort*. In *CPCMM* 204: MPF, MFC.
- Guardini, R., *The Lord*, tr. Briefs (Chicago, 1954) 454-461: FST.
- Guarra, A. M., O.F.M., *La meta del Serafico: Me solum* (Ispica, Ragusa, 1952) 419: FST.
- Guéranger, P., O.S.B., *The Feast of the Immaculate Conception* (repr. from *Année Liturgique*, Epistle for Dec. 8). Text in *The Promised Woman. An Anthology of the Immaculate Conception*, ed. S. G. Mathews, S.M. (St. Meinrad, 1954) 154-155: MPIF. Cf. also *JB-2*, 52.
- Guérin, L. F., *L'homme, âme et corps, à l'image de Jésus-Christ*. In *MC* 21 (1865) 386ff: FST. Ref. in *JB-2*, 12, n.1.

<sup>31</sup> According to *JB-1*, 320, n.2, Gréa follows a conciliatory theory like that of Jourdain (q.v.). If so, it is virtually indistinguishable from the theory later proposed by Bonnefoy.

- Guerra Lazpiur, I. de, O.F.M., *El débito de pecado y la redención de la Virgen Inmaculada en la mariología de Carlos del Moral*. In *Vgl* 11 (1957) 165-173, 185: MPIF.
- , *La Virgen Santísima, cabeza secundaria del Cuero Místico de Cristo en la mariología de Carlos del Moral*. In *EM* 18 (1957) 257-258: MPIF.
- Guerrini di S. Marcello, N., O.F.M., *L'Immacolata ed il Verbo Umanato nel concetto di Giovanni Duns Scoti* (Quaracchi, 1904) 10 and 20: MPIF.
- Guéry, E., Archbp. of Cambrai, *In the Whole Christ*, tr. Carroll (New York, 1959) 80-83: FST. Ref. in Bonnefoy-Meilach, *Christ and the Cosmos* (Paterson, N.J., 1965) 418.
- Guitton, J., *La Vierge Marie* (Paris, 1950) 158-160: MPIF.
- Gumbinger, C., O.F.M.Cap., *St. Anthony and the Lord*. In *FHF*, XIII, 234: MPIF.
- Gummersbach, J., S.J., *Auserwählung*. In *LM* 1, col. 467-470: MPF.
- Harapin, T., O.F.M., *De praedestinatione Christi juxta doctrinam B. J. Duns Scoti*. In *ČFS* 1 (1937) 263-318: FST.
- Hausherr, I., S.J., *Un précurseur de la théorie scotiste sur la fin de l'Incarnation: Isaac de Ninive*. In *RSR* 22 (1932) 316-320: FST.
- Heerinckx, J., O.F.M., *The Importance of Charity in Franciscan Spirituality*. In *Crd* 6 (1956) 143-144: FST.
- Henry, J., *Comment l'Immaculée Conception peut-elle être dite "parfaitement rachetée" par la mort du Christ?* In *NRM* 3 (1956) 45-48: MPIF.
- Hercedes, P., *La place du Christ dans le plan de la création selon le B. Jean Duns Scot*. In *FF* 19 (1936) 30-52: Excellent explanation of Scotus' views, but nothing explicitly on Mary.
- Héris, C. V., O.P., *Le motif de l'Incarnation*. In *BSFEM* 4 (1938) 34: "Le Christ est la fin de l'intention divine



conditionnée dans sa réalisation effective par la rédemption des hommes."

Hernández Cirre, H., O.F.M.Cap., *El primado universal de Cristo a la luz del Vaticano II*. In *EstF* 69 (1968) 5-40: FST.

Hettinger, F., *Apologie du Christianisme* 3 (Bar-le-Duc, 1870) 537: FST.

Hilaire de Barenton, O.F.M.Cap., *Problème ancien, solution nouvelle*. In *EF* 7 (1902) 5-29: Substantially the same theory as later proposed by Bonnefoy.

Hilaire de Paris, O.F.M.Cap., *Cur Deus Homo, ou le motif de l'Incarnation* (Currière, 1886): FST<sup>32</sup>

Hillmann, W., O.F.M., *Wege zur neutestamentlichen Theologie*. In *WuW* 14 (1951) 56-67, 200-211: FST.

Hiral, A.-M., O.F.M., Tit. Bp. of Sululi, cf. *Marie, Reine du monde, et Mgr. A.-M. Hiral, O.F.M. Documentaire par P.E.Trudel, O.F.M.* (Montréal, 1954) 69, 74, 84, 214: MEF; 169, 220, 231: FST. Cf. also *Les chants de Mgr. Hiral, O.F.M.* (Québec, 1953) 141-142: MPF.

Holzer, O., O.F.M., *Hamartiozentrische oder Christozentrische Theologie?* In *WuW* 6 (1939) 236-282; 7 (1940) 19-45: FST.

Hoppenot, J., *La Sainte Vierge dans la Tradition...* (Paris, 1911) 11-12: MPF, MEC.

Huby, J., S.J., *Saint Paul. Les Épîtres de la captivité* (14 ed., Paris, 1947). Predominantly Scotistic.

Hurtado, A., O. de M., *La Inmaculada en el plan de la Redención*. In *IMd* I, 37-441: MPIF (substantially the same as Marshner).

Hyacinth of Croce di Morcone, O.F.M.Cap., Letter to Pius IX,

<sup>32</sup> The author had previously written a book, *Cur Deus Homo? Dissertatio de motivo Incarnationis* (Lugduni, 1867), endorsing the Thomistic viewpoint, but was converted by the book, *Cur Verbum caro factum?* (Catania, 1869), written by his Sicilian confrere, Jesualdus a Luca a Bronte (q.v.).

- signed by eight other Capuchins. In *Pareri* 4 (Roma, 1851) 16: MPF.
- Hygonet, M. B., O.F.M., *Problème autour d'un berceau: Pourquoi le Verbe s'est-il fait chair?* (Bordeaux, 1931): FST.
- Ildefonso de la Inmaculada, O.C.D., *La Inmaculada y la reforma carmelitana descalza*. In *Vgl* 8 (1956) 53-79, esp. 68: MPIF.
- , *El misterio de la Corredención*. In *ME* 4 (Romae, 1959) 199: MPIF.
- Jacques de S. Biagio, O.F.M.Cap., *Saint Laurent de Brindes, théologien de la primauté du Christ*. In *EF* 4 (1953) 53-88; 189-227: FST.
- Jamar, C. H. T., *Theologia Mariana* (Lovanii, 1896) 15-17: MPIF.
- James, Father, O.F.M.Cap., *The Mother of Jesus* (Westminster, Md., 1946) 67-71: MPF, MFC.
- Jannuzzi, J., Bp. of Lucera, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 2 (Roma, 1851) 375: MPF.
- Jansch, R., O.F.M.Cap., *St. Lawrence of Brindisi and the Assumption of Mary*. In *MSO*, 164: MPIF.
- Jean-B. du Petit-Bornand, O.F.M.Cap., *Essai sur la primauté de Jésus-Christ et sur le motif de l'Incarnation* (Paris, 1900): FST.
- , *Sur la primauté de N.-S. Jésus-Christ et sur le motif de l'Incarnation. Notes additionnelles extraites des "Etudes Franciscaines," année 1921* (Paris, 1922) 43-45, 67: MPIF.
- Jean Chrysostome, O.F.M.Cap., *La Très-Sainte Vierge Marie* (Toulouse, 1914) 3-155: MPIF.
- Jean de Dieu, O.F.M.Cap., *La primauté du Christ d'après le texte de S. Paul, Col. 1:15-20*. In *EF* 40 (1928) 200-203: FST.
- , *La Vierge et l'Ordre des Frères Mineurs Conventuels, Franciscains, Capucins*. In *Maria* II (Paris, 1952) 812: MPIF.

Jérôme de Paris, O.F.M.Cap., *La doctrine mariale de Saint Laurent de Brindes. Etude théologique* (Rome, 1933) 26-27: MPIF.

Jesualdus a Luca a Bronte, O.F.M.Cap., *Cur Verbum Caro factum?* (Catania, 1869). A Scotistic reply to Hilaire de Paris' first book, *Cur Deus Homo?* (Lyon, 1867).

Jocham, Prof., art. in *Pastoralblatt für die Erzdiözese München-Freising*, 1876: FST. Ref. in JB-1, 68, n.2.

Jorge de Barcelona, O.F.M.Cap., *Predestinación de María y su santidad inmaculada*. Cf. VV 12 (1954) 273: MPIF.

Jourdain, Z. C., *Somme des grandeurs de Marie...* (nouvel éd., Paris, 1900) I, 1-66, esp. 34: Substantially the same as the theory later proposed by Bonnefoy and Marshner.<sup>33</sup>

Juan de Guernica, O.F.M.Cap., *Reina y Madre. La Virgen María según la teología franciscana* (Santiago de Chile, 1947) 5-12: MPIF.

Jugie, M., A. A., Introd. to his edition of Theophanes Nicaenus' *Sermo in Sanctissimam Deiparam*. In *Lateranum* 1 (1935) XXVIII: FST. Cf. Bonnefoy, *Il primato...*, 145, 189.

———, *La mort et l'Assomption de la Sainte Vierge* (Città del Vaticano, 1944) 547: FST.

Jules d'Albi, O.F.M.Cap., *L'immanence et primauté du Christ*. In *Ornt* 11 (1927) 287-291: FST.

<sup>33</sup> Here is a summary of the author's views: Christ and Mary were predestined prior to every other creature (p.1-26); Mary's predestination was the cause of all other predestinations (p.62-66). On p. 34 he gives the following *signa rationis*: 1) Christ and Mary are predestined as Redeemer and Coredemptrix; 2) Adam is predestined and his sin is permitted so as to make the redemption possible; 3) predestination of all the elect; 4) decree concerning the rest of the universe. *Objection* (p. 35): The above arrangement is not possible because the existence of a Redeemer presupposes the existence of sin. *Answer*: It need not be so. The existence of sin is accidental and depends on the existence of Redeemer; in God's mind, sin is relegated to a later decision. On p. 20: Mary was predestined "ante praevisum peccatum,"... "non tamen ante praevisam Redemptoris... necessitatem."

- Julien-Eymard d'Angers, O.F.M.Cap., *La doctrine de l'Immaculée Conception chez les capucins français du XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle . . .* In EF 5 (1954) 180, n. 144: MPIF.
- Jurić, J., O.F.M., *Franciscus de Mayronis, Immaculatae Conceptionis eximius vindex*. In SF 51 (1954) 260-263: MPIF.
- Kaup, J., O.F.M., *Cur Deus homo?* In FzS 21 (1934) 232-242: FST.
- Kerrigan, A., O.F.M., *The Predestination of Mary according to St. Cyril of Alexandria*. In ASC 3 (Romae, 1952) 34-56: FST.
- Kittel, G., *Theologisches Wörterbuch zum Neuen Testament* 4 (Stuttgart, 1959) 879: FST. Ref. in R. North (q.v.), 183, n. 35.
- Knabenbauer, I., S.J., *Epistola ad Colossenses* (Paris, 1912) 298: CFC. Ref. in Bonnefoy-Meilach, *op. cit.*, 398.
- Knoll a Bulsano, A., O.F.M.Cap., *Institutiones theologiae theoreticae seu dogmatico-polemicae* I (Augustae Taurinorum, 1868) 505-507: Finis principalis et supremus Incarnationis est gloria Dei; finis proximus est redemptio.
- Korba, J., C.S.S.R., *Maternité divine et Royauté de Marie*. In RIJL, 218-220: FBT.
- Koser, C., O.F.M., *Die Immakulatalehre des Johannes Duns Skotus*. In FzS 36 (1954) 362-363: FST.
- Köster, H. M., S.A.C., *Die Magd des Herrn* (2nd ed., Limburg an der Lahn, 1954) 285-286: MPF.
- Lahoz, B., O. de M., *El voto de sangre y el marianismo mercenario*. In ASC 7 (Romae, 1952) 482-483: MPIF.
- Landriot, J. B., Archbp. of Rheims, *Le Christ et la Tradition* I (1865) 247: FST. Ref. in JB-1, 44.
- Lanzrath, C., O.F.M., *Mary Eternally Predestined to Be the Associate of Christ*. In PCSJ, 39-40: MPIF.
- La Sainte Vierge. Petite Somme Mariale*. Institut de Petits Frères de Marie (5 éd., Paris, 1942) 6-10: MPF, CMFC.

- Lattanzi, U., *Il primato universale di Cristo secondo le S. Scritture* (Roma, 1937): FST.
- , *Cristo nella gerarchia degli esseri secondo le lettere dalla cattività e quella ai Romani*. In *Dvts* 2 (1959) 472-485: FST.
- Laudisio, N. M., C.S.S.R., Bp. of Policastro, Letter to Pius IX (1848). In *Pareri* 9 (Roma, 1852) 236: MPF.
- Laurent, J. T., Vicar Ap. of Luxemburg, *Les mystères de la Sainte Vierge Marie, Mère de Dieu*, tr. from German (Bruxelles, 1857) I, 14-17: MPIF.
- Laurent, L., O.F.M., *L'Assomption et la maternité divine*. In *CMVP*, 137: MPIF.
- Lázaro de Aspurs, *Semana de estudios sobre San Lorenzo de Brindis en Pamplona*. In *EstF* 52 (1951) 438: MPIF.
- LeBlanc, P., S.J., In *Psalmum* 109, n.53: FST. Ref. in *JB-2*, 48, n. 2.
- Leblanc, S.-M., O.F.M., *La fausse et la vraie position d'un problème théologique*. In *Stm* 1 (1949) 3-7: FST, against the hypothetical way of formulating the Scotistic thesis.
- Leblond, G., O.S.B., *Le mystère éternel de Marie*. In *Marie, salut du monde* (Paris, 1954) 22-31: FBT.
- Le Garrec, E., Opening address, without title, at the Guingamp Congress. In *TCMB* 9: MPF, CMFEC.
- Leo XIII, Pope, Enc. *Augustissimae Virginis* (Sept. 12, 1897). In *Tondini*, 258: MPF. See comments in *JB-2*, 46-47.
- Le Roux, Abbé, Sermon (Nov. 24, 1904) closing the Josselin Congress. In *PCMB* 569: MPIF.
- Lesêtre, H., *Marie, mère de Jésus*. In *DBibl* IV, col. 782: MPIF.
- Lewinski, A., O.F.M., in *MSO* 492: FST.
- Lewis, J., S.J. *Marie, miracle ineffable de Dieu. Court traité sur la Sainte Vierge* (Montréal, 1954) 34: MEC; 42: MPIF.
- Locatelli, A. M., *Adnotationes ad serm. S. Antonii de Padua in dom. 3 post Pascha*. In *S. Antonii Patavini Sermones dominicales et in solemnitatibus* I (Paduae, 1895) 117-178: MPF.

- Longpré, E., O.F.M., *La thèse franciscaine de la primauté du Christ*. In FF 13 (1930) 365-371: FST.
- , *Le Bx Duns Scot, Docteur du Verbe Incarné*. In FF 17 (1934) 1-36: FST.
- , *L'Assomption et l'Ecole Franciscaine*. In VDA, 209: MPIF.
- Lorscheider, L. (Cardinal) O.F.M., *I fondamenti teologici della spiritualità francescana*. In QSF I, 71-75: MPIF.
- Lot-Borodine, M., *La doctrine de la déification dans l'Eglise grecque jusqu'au XII<sup>e</sup> siècle*. In RHR 105 (1932) 5-43: FST. Ref. in Bonnefoy, *Il primato . . .*, 194.
- Ludovic de Besse, O.F.M.Cap., *Marie révélée à ses enfants* (Paris 1906) 21: FST.
- Louismet, S., O.S.B., *The Mystery of Jesus* (New York, 1922) 3-7: FST.
- Louis de Gonzague, O.F.M.Cap., *Lectures sur la Vierge* (Paris, 1936): FST.
- Lynch, K., O.F.M., *The Predestination of Our Lady in the Franciscan School*. In FEC 38 (1957) 77-165: MPIF.
- Macali, L., O.F.M.Conv., *La dottrina dell' Immacolata nei grandi scotisti O.F.M.Conv. dei secoli XVI-XIX*. In Vgl 7/2 (1957) 67-69: MPIF.
- Maestu, L., O.F.M., *La Asunción de la Santísima Virgen en los principios marianos, especialmente en el principio escotista*. In ACAAL 252-253: MPIF.
- Magnasco, S., Archbp. of Genoa, *Lettera al suo clero* (dic. 20, 1882). In SR dic. 1882, No. 53, p. 623-627: MPF. Text in ACNM, 399.
- Mancini, A., S.D.B., *Sui fini dell'Incarnazione*. In PC 35 (1956) 659-662: FST.
- Mariacci, B., O.F.M., *Gesù Cristo, essenza del Cristianesimo*. In QSF 2 (1961) 9-29: FST.
- M.-Antoine de Toulouse, O.F.M.Cap., *Le Lys Immaculé* (Toulouse-Paris, 1873) 216-241: FST.
- Marie-Bonaventure, Père, O.F.M., *L'Eucharistie et le mystère du*

*Christ d'après l'Ecriture et la Tradition* (Paris, 1897)  
383: FST.

Marie-Cécile de S. Paul, O.S.C., *Jésus-Christ dans la liturgie*  
(Albi, 1925): FST. Ref. in Bonnefoy-Meilach, 418.

Mariotti, C., O.F.M., *L'Immacolata Concezione di Maria ed i*  
*Francescani* (Quaracchi-Firenze, 1904) 231-232: MPIF.

Marques, J.R., C.M.F., *O Coração de Maria e a santificação da*  
*família*. In EMF 148, 150: MPF, MFEC.

Martinet, A., *La science de vie*, lec 28; *Oeuvres*, II (Paris, 1879)  
269: FST.

Martínez, P. de A., O.F.M., *La redención de la Santísima Virgen*,  
in Vgl 9 (1957) 40-41: FBT. Id., *EphM* 4 (1954) 243-  
267.

Martínez y Sáez, J., O.F.M.Cap., Bp. of Havana, *La Virgen*  
*Maria en sus relaciones con Dios, con los ángeles y los*  
*hombres* (2 ed., Madrid, 1877) 35-36, 81, 230-232:  
MPF.

Martini, A., O.F.M., *Sul motivo primario dell'Incarnazione*. In  
SF 6 (1934) 3-33; 288-318: FST. The author argues  
against D. M. de Basly (q.v.) concerning the hypothet-  
ical formulation of the thesis.

—, *L'Assunzione di Maria SS. e la dottrina francescana sul*  
*primato assoluto di Cristo*. In ACNM 583-597: MPIF.

Martins Manso, E., Bp. of Funchal, Letter to Pius IX (1850).  
In *Pareri* 3 (Roma, 1851) 226: MPIF. Cf. also *Pareri*  
II, 179.

Maura y Gelabert, J., Bp. of Orihuela, *El optimista del B. Ray-*  
*mundo Lulio* (Barcelona, 1904) 29-41: FST.

Meilach, M. D., O.F.M., *St. Thomas Aquinas and the Primacy*  
*of Christ*. In Int 1 (n.1, 1960) 22-27. St. Thomas' *prin-*  
*ciples* logically lead to the Scotistic thesis.

—, *The Primacy of Christ in Col. 1*. In Int 1 (n.3, 1961)  
4-11: FBT.

—, *Firstborn Son* (Chicago, 1962).

—, *From Order to Omega* (Chicago, 1967). A revision of

- his former book, *The Primacy of Christ, Doctrine and Life* (Chicago, 1964).
- , *Firstborn of Every Creature*. In *NCE* 5 (1967) 941-942: FST.
- , *Primacy of Christ*. In *NCE* 5 (1967) 944-945: FST.
- Menge, G., O.F.M., *Eine Ausserung über die Prädestinatio Christi absoluta*. In *WuW* 3 (1936) esp. 289: FST.
- Merkelbach, B. H., O.P., *Mariologia. Tractatus de Beatissima Virgine Maria Matre Dei...* (Parisiis, 1939) 97: *Ordine intentionis*, the end cannot depend on others, but *ordine executionis* it can depend as on a conditional or material cause; 98: Christ and Mary depend on the sin of Adam "tamquam a conditione et causa materiali," but the redemption depends on Christ "tamquam a fine et perficiente," and in this type of causality Christ and Mary precede the redemption, and sin was permitted for the greater glory of Christ.
- Meschler, M., S.J., *Le don de la Pentecôte. Méditations sur le Saint-Esprit*, tr. from the German by Mazoyer (Paris, 1895) 73-75: Christ is the final cause of all creation. Ref. in *JB-2*, 8.
- Michel, A., Art. in *AdC* 59 (1949) 498-499: Praises Bonnefoy's theory on Mary's predestination.
- , Art. in *AdC* 64 (1954) 360-362: Asks: Would it not be simpler and more logical to confess that the principles of the Franciscan School on Mary's predestination demand the exclusion of all *debitum peccati* in Mary?<sup>34</sup>
- Miguens, M., O.F.M., *Base escriturística de la doctrina de Escoto sobre el primado de Cristo*. In *ASCSI*, 105-167: FST.
- Minges, P., O.F.M., *Compendium theologiae dogmaticae specialis, pars prior* (ed. 2, Ratisbonae, 1921) 256-257: MPIF.

<sup>34</sup> Many years previously, in his lengthy art., *Incarnation*, in *DTC* 7 (1921) 1506, Michel had held that the Thomistic viewpoint was "more probable" than the Scotistic.



- , *J. Duns Scoti doctrina philosophica et theologica* 2 (Quaracchi, 1930) 368-370: FST.
- Mislei, G., S.J., *La Madre di Dio descritta dai Santi Padri e Dottori della Chiesa . . .* (Venezia, 1859) 87-89: MPIF, CMFEC.
- Möhler, J. A., *Kirchengeschichte* I (Regensburg, 1867) 4f: FST. Ref. in *WuW* 7 (1940) 22.
- Montalverne, J., O.F.M., *Mary's Predestination with Jesus and Her Universal Queenship*. In *MSO* 519-530: MPIF.
- Mooney, H., O.F.M., *Bl. John Duns Scotus, O.F.M.* (London, 1960) 25-27: FST.
- Morineau, B. H., S.M.M., *La Sainte Vierge Marie* (Paris, 1929) 10: FST.
- Moscarella, G., O.F.M., *Il primato di Gesù Cristo sulla creazione nella luce dell'Immacolato Concepimento di Maria SSma.* (Manfredonia, 1954) passim, esp. 80: MPIF.
- Moureau, E., *La royauté de Marie dans la liturgie*. In *JSEM*, 126: MPIF.
- Mückshoff, M., O.F.M.Cap., *Die mariologische Prädestination im Denken der franziskanischen Theologie*. In *FzS* 39 (1957) 288-502, esp. 288-290: MPF, MFEC.
- Müller, M., O.F.M., *Die theologische Gesamtsynthese des Duns Skotus*. In *WuW* 1 (1934) 110-140: MPIF.
- , *Die Sakramente der Kirche und das Christusbild der absoluten Prädestination*. In *WuW* 8 (1941) 1-13: FST.
- Mura, E., *Le Corps Mystique du Christ* I (2 éd., Paris, 1936). 238, n.4: CFC. Ref. in Bonnefoy, *La place du Christ . . .*, in *MSR* 5 (1948) 40, n.1.
- McKeever, F., O.F.M., *Christ*. In *Crd* 9 (1959) 101-104: FBT.
- Nègre, J., *Figures et emblèmes de Marie* (Paris, 1894): MPIF. Ref. in H. Pradié (q.v.) I, 99.
- Newman, Cardinal J. H., *Discourses to Mixed Congregations* (new ed., London, 1906) disc. XV, 321-322: FST.
- Nicolas, A., *La Vergine Maria e i disegni divini*, first Ital. tr.

- (Milano, 1856) 118-129, 174-175: Substantially the same theory as later proposed by Bonnefoy.
- Nicolas, M.-J., O.P., "*Sublimiori modo redempta.*" In *Vgl* 9 (1957) 14: Same views as those of C. V. Hérís (q.v.).
- Nicolau, P., T.O.R., *Doctrinae Iulianae specimen circa Verbi Incarnationem*. Doctoral Thesis, Gregorian University, 1935: Incarnation independent of the Fall.
- Nieva, R., O.F.M., *La glorificación de la Santísima Virgen*. In *ACAAL*, 320: CMFEC.
- North, R., S.J., *The Scotist Cosmic Christ*. In *ASCSI*, 201, n.103: The Fall is the motive of the execution of the Incarnation-decree, not of the decree itself.
- Notargiacomo, F., O.F.M.Conv., *Il primato di Cristo nella predicazione di S. Bernardino da Siena* (Roma, 1949): FST.
- Ocerín Jáuregui, A. de, O.F.M., *La Virgen María, medianera universalísima*. In *CPCMM*, 301-303: MPIF.
- Ocerín Jáuregui, B., O.F.M., *Exención del débito y del fomes peccati en la Virgen María*. In *VyV* 5 (1947) 447-449: MPIF.
- Olinto da Solzano, O.F.M.Cap., *L'Immacolata nella teologia*. In *MIPC*, 48: MPF.
- Oltra, M., O.F.M., *La mediación universalísima de Cristo y de la Virgen*. In *VyV* 5 (1947) 453-466: FST.
- O'Neill, A. M., O.F.M., *Cristologia. Sul motivo dell'Incarnazione*. In *SF* a. 12, vol. 1 (1914-1915) 252-260, 336-347, 423-428: FST.
- O'Neill, F., *The Blessed Virgin Mary and the Alleged Debt of Sin*. In *IER* 34 (1929) 46: MPIF.
- Ortuzar, M., O. de M., *San Pedro Pascual (d. 1300) y el dogma de la Inmaculada Concepción*. In *IMd* I (1955) 384: MPIF.
- Osborne, K. B., O.F.M., *The Predestined Queen*. In *PS* 22 (1954) 65-88: FBT.
- Oswald, H., *Dogmatische Mariologie* (Paderborn, 1850) 210ff: MPIF.

- Oxenham, H. N., *The Atonement* (London, 1881) Ch. 1: FST.
- Pacelli, Card. E. (later Pius XII), Sermon on the occasion of the 70th anniversary of the Association of Our Lady of a Happy Death (Nov. 28, 1937). In *Discorsi e Panegirici* (2 ed., Milano, 1939) 633-634: MPF.<sup>35</sup>
- Pacifico, A., O.F.M., *La Chiesa Cattolica nel fatto dell'Immacolatissimo, santissimo Concepimento della gran Madre di Dio, Maria I* (Napoli, 1852) 125, n.1: MPIF.
- Palatucci, A., O.F.M.Conv., *Utrum Verbum Dei incarnatum fuisset si homo non peccasset* (Neapoli, 1942): FST.
- Panetti, J. B., Archbp. of Pisa, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 1 (Roma, 1851) 417-418: MPIF.
- Paolini, F. M., O.F.M., *De eximia praedestinatione Christi Fratris Ambrosii Catharini Politi, O.P.* (Bastia, 1937): FST.
- Parent, E., O.F.M., *Prédestination absolue et primauté du Christ chez Duns Scot.* In *Ctr* 7 (1946) 460-484: FST.
- Parisis, P. L., Bp. of Langres, Pastoral Instruction (n.d.). In *Pareri* 7 (Roma, 1852) 262 and 266: MPIF.
- Parladore, L., Bp. of St. Mark, *Ad Pium IX . . . votum* (Neapoli, 1850). In *Pareri* 7 (Roma, 1852) LXXVI: MPIF.
- Pauvert, Abbé, *La nature et la grâce* (Paris, 1869) 184: FST.
- Peinador, M., C.F.M., *Fundamentos escriturísticos de la realeza de María.* In *EM* 17 (1956) 41-42: Mary's absolute and universal primacy is based on *Prov. VIII* and *Eccli. XXIV*.
- , *Estudio sintético comparativo de las pruebas de Escritura en favor de la Inmaculada Concepción de María.* In *MCMZ*; 201: Welcomes argument from Mary's predestination *ante praevisum lapsum* to prove her Immaculate Conception, but says the argument cannot be based on Gen. 3:15, as some authors want.

<sup>35</sup> See comments by Bonnefoy, *Sa Sainteté Pie XII et la primauté du Christ et de la T.-S. Vierge*, in *SF* 12 (1940) 2-6; D. J. Unger, *The Absolute Primacy of Christ and Mary according to Pope Pius XII*, in *FS* 8 (1948) 417-420.

- Pepe, F., S.S., *Sabbati dell'Immacolata Concezione di Maria Santissima* (Napoli, 1858) 19 and 32: MPIF.
- Perardi, J., *La Virgen Madre de Dios y la vida cristiana I* (2 ed., Barcelona, 1923) 6-8: FST.
- Pérez, A., O. de M., *Primado de Cristo y María según los teólogos mercedarios*. In *ASC* 7 (1952) 1-34: MPIF.
- , *Exención del débito según Prudencio*. In *IMd I* (1955) 58-65: Seems to agree with Prudencio's views on Mary's predestination, substantially the same as those proposed by Prof. Marshner.
- Pérez, E., O.F.M., *La sentencia escotista de la supremacía absoluta de Cristo en la Escritura y en la Tradición*. In *Rgl* 9 (1935) 258-275: FST.
- Pérez, J. L., O. de M., *El Rdmo. P. Fr. Pedro A. Valenzuela y la Inmaculada Concepción de María* In *Vgl* 8/1 (1955) 378: MPIF.
- Pérez, N., S.J., *Mariología Popular* (2 ed., Valladolid, 1949) 29-31: Refers to Scotistic view on Mary's predestination as sublime and very glorious for Christ and Mary.
- Pérez Goyena, P., S.J., Comments on Fr. Ocerín Jáuregui's thesis. In *CPCMM*, 301: Same comments as those of N. Pérez, just mentioned.
- Pession, P. J., *Considérations théologiques sur le Paradis* (Aosta, 1899) 36, 46-47: The Fall is subordinated to Christ, not vice versa.
- Pétitalot, Père, S.M., *La Vierge Marie d'après la théologie* (5 éd., Paris, 1904) 3-12: MPF, MFC.
- Philip, Bro., Gen. of Christian Brothers, *Meditations on the Most Blessed Virgin* (New York, 1884) 13: MPF.
- Philippon, M. M., O.P., *La prédestination de la Mère de Dieu*. In *RdR* 32 (1952) 276-280 esp. 217: MPIF. Ref. in Bonnefoy, *Il primato . . .*, 203.
- , *Le mérite 'de congruo' de notre Mère dans le Christ*. In *BSFEM* 1 (1955) 302-345: FST. Cf. also *BSFEM* 2 (1936) 217.

- Philips, G., *De electione B. V. Mariae*. In *ASC* 3 (1952) 1-20.
- , *Lugar de la Mariología en la teología católica*. In *EM* 10 (1959) 14: Scotistic view on Mary's predestination reveals a "particularly profound and fecund intuition." Cf. also *ETL* 25 (1949) 105, where he praises Bonnefoy's theory.
- Piault, B., *La royauté éternelle du Christ*. In *ATh* 9 (1948) 242-251; 10 (1949) 215-225: FST.
- Piccoli, Canon V., Letter to Pius IX, signed by eighteen other Canons of the Cathedral Chapter of Isernia. In *Pareri* 4 (Roma, 1851) 60-61: MPIF.
- Picus, Abbé, *Esther, ou Quelques mots sur le mystère de la B. Vierge Marie* (Rome, 1875) ch. 5: FST. Ref. in *JB-1*, 47.
- Pie, Cardinal L.F.D., *Troisième Instruction Synodale; Oeuvres*, 5 (Poitiers-Paris, 1879) 136: CFEC.
- Pijoán, J., O.F.M., *El primado de Cristo. Notas sobre una cuestión antigua y reciente*. In *VyV* 7 (1949) 553-563: FBT with some reservations.
- Pin, L. M., *Jésus-Christ dans le plan divin de la création* (Paris, 1872) ch. VI-VII: FST. Ref. in *JB-1*, 46.
- Pineda y Zaldana, T., Bp. of Antigonía, Letter to Pius IX (1851). In *Pareri* 9 (Roma, 1852) append. I, 14: MPF.
- Pinna, H., O.F.M., *De praedestinatione Christi et Deiparae secundum Theophanem Nicaenum* (Calari, 1948): FST.
- Plassmann, T., O.F.M., *Uno eodemque decreto. Maria Immaculata praedestinata in Sacra Pagina*. In *Vgl* 3 (1955) 174-197: MPIF.
- , Intervention during the 1954 Roman Congress. In *Vgl* 11 (1957) 492: MPIF.
- Poggi, C., *I trionfi della Vergine Immacolata nel secolo decimonono* (Milano, 1904) 27-28: MPIF.
- Pohle, J., *Lehrbuch der Dogmatik II* (ed. 7, Paderborn, 1921) 152: The Angels and innocent Adam received their grace from Christ.

- , *Soteriology*, tr. A. Preuss (6th ed., St. Louis, 1933) 30-34: Praises Scotistic theory, e.g.: "Besides, there is something sublime and overwhelming in the thought that, as Scotism consistently teaches, not only all men but all angels, not only fallen and sinful man, but likewise man as constituted in Paradise, owe their original sanctity entirely to the merits of an *absolutely* predestined Redeemer . . ." (p.33-34).
- Poirier, L., O.F.M., *La révélation de Marie à travers la Sagesse de l'ancien Testament*. In *VIHD*, 43: MPIF.
- [Pollien, F., Cistercian], *Grandeurs mariales étudiées avec l'Ave Marie* (Turin-Rome, 1934) 501: MPIF. Ref. in *CML*, 220, n.41.
- Portugal, J. M., O.F.M., Bp. of Aguascalientes, *María la Inmaculada y Santa* (Aguascalientes, 1908): MPIF. Ref. in *RSR* 1 (1910) 611. Cf. 609, n.2.
- Pradié, H., S.J., *La Vierge Marie, Mère de Dieu et chef-d'oeuvre de Dieu* 1 (Tours, 1899) 99-100: MPF; 115-122: MPIF.
- Puech, L. M., O.F.M., *La parfaite rédemption de Marie*. In *EphM* 26(1976) 195-199: MPIF.
- Pujol, A., O.F.M., *The Blessed Virgin Mary and the Universal Necessity of Contracting Original Sin*. In *Int* 1 (n. 1, 1960) 11-16: MPIF
- Rabbitte, E., O.F.M., *Mother and Son*. In *ASC* 3 (1952) 23-33: FST.
- , *The Primacy of Christ, a Study in Speculative Theology*. In *IER* 70 (1948) 878-889: FBT.
- Ragazzini, S.M., O.F.M.Conv., *La divina maternità di Maria nel suo concetto teologico integrale* (Roma, 1948) 194-197: MPIF.
- Rahner, K., S.J., *Theological Investigations*, tr. Ernst (Baltimore 1961) I, 164-166: FST.
- , *La Iglesia y los Sacramentos*, tr. from German (Barcelona, 1964) 14: FST.

- Rahsdall, H. (non-Catholic), *The Idea of Atonement in Christian Theology* (London, 1919) 196: FST.
- Rainerio de Nava, O.F.M.Cap., *La redención de María según el P. Montalbán*. In *EstF* 55 (1954) 266-267 and 277-278: MPIF.
- , *El primado de Cristo y María en Escoto y Amor Ruibal*. In *Cmp* 4 (1959) 365-369: FST.
- Rambla, P., O.F.M., *Tratado popular sobre la Santísima Virgen* (Barcelona, 1954) 58-61: MPIF.
- Ramière, P., S.J., *Le regne social du Coeur de Jésus* (Toulouse, 1892): FST. Cf. P. Galtier, *De Incarnatione et Redemptione* (Paris, 1926) 465, n.3.
- Randellini, L., O.F.M., *L'Immacolata nella S. Scrittura*. In *SF* 51 (1954) 277: MPIF.
- Raymond de Courcerault, O.F.M.Cap., *Le motif de l'Incarnation: Duns Scot et l'Ecole scotiste*. In *EF* 28 (1912) 186-201; 313-331: FST.
- R[eynaud], A., *The Immaculate Conception and the "Contracting of Sin."* In *ER* 72 (June, 1925) 82: MPF.
- Ricci, A., Bp. of Segni, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 1 (Roma, 1851) 466: Mary was exempt from the general law of sin; thus implicitly: MPIF.
- Rigaux, B., O.F.M., *Marie Immaculée dans sa conception*. In *ACMB* 41: CMFC; 47-48: MPIF (implicitly).
- Righetti, G., *Il mese mariano . . .* (Napoli, 1855) 150: MPF.
- Risi, F. M., O.S.J. de Deo, *Sul motivo primario dell'Incarnazione del Verbo*, 4 vols. (Roma, 1897-1898); I, 365-368: MPIF, MFEC.
- Rivarola, G., O.S.B., *Dissertazione in cui si prova che Maria Vergine sia stata necessariamente concepita Immacolata . . .* (Palermo, 1822). In *Pareri* 5 (Roma, 1851) 40-41: MPIF.
- Robert, P., O.F.M., *L'Immaculée Conception au moyen âge*. In *VIHD* 148-149: MPIF.

- Robinson (Anglican), *St. Paul's Epistles; Eph.* (London, 1895) 20-29: FST. Ref. in Miguens (q.v) 125, n.32.
- Rodríguez, I., O.F.M., *Estudio filológico de la Primacia de Cristo en las Epístolas de S. Pablo.* In *VyV* 7 (1949) 259-267: FST.
- Rolland, C., *La Reine du paradis. Le mystère de la T.-S. Vierge* ... (8 éd, Langres, 1910) I, 77-80: MPF, MFEC.
- Romualdus a Delft, O.F.M.Cap., *Opinio thomistica de motivo Incarnationis estne adhuc probabilis?* In *CF* 26 (1956) 266-273: FST.
- , *Christus, de eerstgeborene van de schepping.* In *SC* 18 (1942) 155-171: FST.
- , *Le Corps Mystique du Christ d'après le R. P. Mura.* In *EF* 47 (1935) 718-725: FST.
- Rondet, H., S.J., *De la place de la T.-S. Vierge dans l'Eglise, Corps Mystique du Christ.* In *BSFEM* 3 (1937) 201: MFEC.
- , *Assomption et Corédemption.* In *CMVP* 164, 166: We were all predestined in Christ and in Mary.
- Rosca, R., O. de M., *La exención de todo débito según Silvestre de Saavedra.* In *IMd* I, 80: MPIF.
- Rosini, R., O.F.M., *Maria et Ecclesia in divinis decretis.* In *ME* 3 (Romae, 1959) esp. 528-533: MPIF.
- Rougier, F. de J., M.Sp.A., *María* (2 ed., México, 1953) 17-20: Mary was predestined first to glory and then, as a means, to suffering. Seems to follow Bonnefoy's theory.
- Rouzic, L., *La Très-Sainte Vierge Marie* (3 éd., Paris, 1931) 2-3: MPIF, MFC.
- Ruivo, M. de L., *Maria, primeira entre as criaturas, bendita entre as mulheres.* In *SCMB* 392: MPIF.
- Rulla, A., O.P., *Nel Paradiso Mariano* (Brescia, 1939) I, 9-15: FBT.
- Ryder, J. H., S.J., *Our Lady of Eden.* In *MS* 25 (1974) 78: MPIF.
- Saggese, J. M., Archbp of Chieti, *Pro B.M.V. Conceptione dog-*



*matice Immaculata definienda . . . votum* (Teate, 1849)  
In *Pareri* 7 (Roma, 1852) III-IV: MPF. Cf. also p. XXXVI.

Sagüéz, I. F., S.J., *De Deo creante et elevante*. In *Sacrae Theologiae Summa a PP. Soc. Jesu in Hispania edita* (3 ed. Matriti, 1958) II, 534-536: Defends Christ's universal final causality.

Saintrain, H., C.S.S.R., *Dieu et ses infinies perfections* (Paris-Tournai, 1887) 254: FST.

Salvador Ramón, F., *Teología Mariana* (Guadix, 1921) I, 174-178 and 222: MPIF.

Salvini, F., Archbp. of Camerino, Letter to Pius IX. In *Pareri* 2 (Roma, 1851) 185: MPIF.

Samuel de Algaida, O.F.M.Cap., *Christologia Lulliana seu de motivo Incarnationis doctrina B. Raymundi Lull*. In *CF* 1 (1931) 145-183: FST.

Samuel de S. Teresa, O.C.D., *La definibilidad dogmática de la Asunción de María en cuerpo y alma a los cielos*. In *PCCM* 413-414: MPF.

Sanchis, J., *Un libro de teología del siglo XV escrito en valenciano*. In *ABM* 34 (1930) 267-283: On Francis of Pertusa, favorable to the absolute primacy of Christ.

Sancho Blanco, A., O. de M., *Sanctus Petrus Paschasius, episcopus et martyr, Immaculatae Conceptionis defensor*. In *Vgl* 8/1 (1955) 25: MPIF.

Sanna, A., O.F.M.Conv., *La regalità di Cristo secondo la Scuola francescana* (Padova, 1951) 64-68: MPIF.

Scaramuzzi, D., O.F.M., *Il pensiero di Giovanni Duns Scoto nel mezzogiorno d'Italia* (Roma, 1927).

———, *Le idee scotiste di un grande teologo domenicano del 1500: Ambrogio Catarino*. In *SF* 4 (1932) 296-319; 5 (1933) 197-217.

———, *Duns Scoto Summula scelta di scritti coordinati in dottrina* (Firenze, 1932) 225: MPIF.

- Scheeben, M. J., *Handbuch der katholischen Dogmatik* (Freiburg im Brisgau, 1882) III/1, 372-377: FST.
- , *The Mysteries of Christianity*, tr. C. Vollert (St. Louis, Mo., 1946) 352-430: FST.
- Schell, H., *Katholische Dogmatik* (Paderborn, 1892) III/1, 90: MPIF.
- Schmaus, M., *Katholische Dogmatik* (München, 1938) II, 261: FST.
- , *Mariologie* (München, 1955) 144-145: Favorable to MPIF.
- Schmidt, E., O.F.M., *Das seraphische Weltbild des Duns Skotus*. In *WuW* 2 (1935) 70-80: FBT.
- Schmidt, F., O.F.M.Cap., (later Vic. Ap. of Mendi), *Mary, Queen of the Friars Minor*. In *MSO* 508-509: MPIF. MFEC.
- Schmidt, H. W. (non-Catholic), *Die Christusfrage. Beitrag zu einer christlichen Geschichtsphilosophie* (Gütersloh, 1929) passim: FST. Cf. long review by O. Holzer in *WuW* 6 (1939) 236-282; 7 (1940) 19-45.
- , *Die Personenbegriffe in der Trinitätslehre*. In *JTS* 4 (1933) 174: FST.
- Schütz, A., *Gott in der Geschichte. Eine Geschichtsmetaphysik und -theologie*, tr. from Hungarian by V. Zoltan (Salzburg, 1936) 167: FST. Ref. in Holzer, *art. cit.*, 23.
- Schütz, J. H., *Summa Mariana. Allgemeine Handbuch der Marienverehrung* (Paderborn, 1903) I, 196: MPF.
- Scipioni, A., C.R.I., *Maria dalla quale nacque Gesù* (Roma, 1947) 22: FST.
- Sebastian, W., O.F.M., *De B. V. Maria universali gratiarum Mediatrix doctrina Franciscanorum ab an. 1600 ad an. 1730* (Romae, 1952) 39-55: MPIF.
- Seiller, L., O.F.M., Exchange of views on C. V. Hérís' lecture. In *BSFEM* 4 (1938) 30-33: MPIF.
- Seisdedos, J., S.J., *Ensayo de teología popular mariana* (Madrid, 1921) 18 and 58: MPIF; 18-21: MFEC.

- Serafín de Ausejo, O.F.M.Cap., *Presentación* of a special issue of *VyV* (Jan.-June, 1954) viii: MPIF.
- Serent, A. de, *Encore la primauté du Christ*. In *EF* 46 (1934) 492-496: FST.
- Sericoli, C., O.F.M., *De regalitate B. M., Virginis juxta auctorum franciscalium doctrinam*. In *Ant* 30 (1955) 105-118; 221-244, esp. 228: MPIF.
- Severa, J.M., Bp. of Città delle Pieve, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 2 (Roma, 1851) 67: MPF.
- Sheehan, P. A., *Mariae Corona* (New York, 1902) 8-15: MPF.
- Shircel, C., O.F.M., *The Position of the Blessed Mother in the Franciscan Theological Synthesis*. In *MOS* 105: MPIF, MFEC.
- Siegl, J., *Maria in Sacra Scriptura*. In *CCMIZ* 703: MPF (appl. to Mary of Col. 1:15ff.).
- Sigismond de Villeneuve, O.F.M.Cap., *La royauté universelle du Sacré-Coeur et l'Immaculée Conception de Marie* (Toulouse, 1925) 40-44: MPIF.
- Sittler, J. (Lutheran), *Called to Unity*. In *EmR* 14 (1962) 177-187: FST.
- Smetana, R., C.S.S.R., Letter to Pius IX. In *Pareri* 9 (Roma, 1852) append I, 76: MPF.
- Smith, G. D., *Jesus, God and Man*. In *TCC* I, 400: FST. Ref. in Bonnefoy-Meilach, *op. cit.*, 414
- Smutko, G. F., O.F.M., *The Absolute Primacy of Christ and Mary*. In *RTFR* 1 (1959) 4-12: MPIF, MFEC.
- Socche, B., Bp. of Reggio Emilia, *Il Verbo Incarnato e la Madonna* (Reggio Emilia, 1958) 269-354: MPIF.
- Soiron, T., O.F.M., *Das Weltbild des mittelalterlichen Augustinismus*. In *FLDF* 76-98: FST.
- Soloviev, V., *Histoire et futur de la théocratie*, tr. from Russian (1885); *Oeuvres* IV, 537. Cf. *AAV* 10 (1914-1919) 5-6, n.2. Ref. in *Vgl* 4 (1955) 223-246.
- Souben, J., O.S.B., *Nouvelle Théologie Dogmatique* (Paris, 1902) IV, 78: FST.

- Spina, G., O.F.M., *La prima creatura. Stato attuale di una grande questione teologica* (Molfetta, 1944) passim: FST.
- Stamm, C., *Mariologia* (Paderbornae, 1881) 461: MPIF.
- Stanislas de Chambon-Feugerolles, O.F.M.Cap., *Médiatrice* (2 éd., Le Puy, 1944) 12-23: MPIF, MFC.
- Stier, M., O.F.M., *Franciscan Life in Christ* (Paterson, 1953) 126-141: FST.
- Storff, H., O.F.M., *The Immaculate Conception* (San Francisco, 1925) 198: MPIF.
- Stromillo, A. M. (Theatine), Bp. of Caltanissetta, Letter to Pius IX (1849). In *Pareri* 2 (Roma, 1851) 146: MPF.
- Suenens, L. J., Aux. Bp. of Maline (now Cardinal), *Mary the Mother of God*, tr. from French (London, 1959) 21-22: CMFC. The author praises the Scotistic view of the Incarnation.
- Thomas, J., *Quelle est la meilleure structure interne d'un traité théologique de Mariologie?* In *JSM* 112-113: The Incarnation was willed for the glorification of Christ and for our Redemption; 114: MPF.
- Tomás, T., O. de M., *Los méritos de Cristo y la exención del débito*. In *IMd* I, 104, 125, 133: MPIF.
- Trinidad, J. T., *The Mystery Hidden in God. A Study of Eph. 1:3-14*. In *Bibl* 31 (1950) 1-26: Our predestination depended on Christ's. Ref. in M. Miguens (q.v.) 125, n.32.
- Ubaldo d'Alençon, O.F.M.Cap., *S. François d'Assise* (Paris, 1885) 32: Christ's predestination independent of Adam.
- Ullathorne, Bishop W. B., O.S.B., *The Immaculate Conception of the Mother of God* (Baltimore, 1855) 61-68: FST.
- Unger, D., O.F.M.Cap., *Franciscan Christology: Absolute and Universal Primacy of Christ*. In *FS* 2 (1942) 428-448: FST.
- , *The Absolute Primacy of Christ and Mary according to Pope Pius XII*. In *FS* 8 (1948) 417-420: MPIF.
- , *The Incarnation, a Supreme Exaltation for Christ, according to St. John Damascene*. In *FS* 8 (1948) 237-249.

- , *The Absolute Primacy of Christ and His Virgin Mother according to St. Lawrence of Brindisi*. In CF 22 (1952) 113-119: MPIF.
- , *Christ and His Virgin Mother in God's Eternal Decree according to Frederick W. Faber*. In Mm 17 (1955) 369-391. Cf. 389, n.78: FBT.
- , *Christ Jesus, the Center and Final Scope of All Creation, according to St. Maximus, Confessor*. In FS 9 (1949) 50-62.
- , *Christ Jesus, the Exemplar and Final Scope of All Creation, according to Anastasius of Sinai*. In FS 9 (1949) 156-164.
- , *Christ Jesus the Secure Foundation, according to St. Cyril of Alexandria*. In FS 7 (1947) 1-25; 324-343.
- , *Christ's Role in the Universe according to St. Irenaeus*. In FS 5 (1945) 3-20; 114-137.
- , *The Love of God, the Primary Reason for the Incarnation, according to Isaac of Niniveh*. In FS 9 (1949) 146-155.
- , *A Special Aspect of Athanasian Soteriology*. In FS 6 (1946) 30-63; 171-194.
- , *Robert Grosseteste, Bishop of Lincoln (1235-1253) on the Reasons for the Incarnation*. In FS 16 (1956) 1-36.
- , *Select Questions on the Final Cause of the Incarnation*. In FAT 46-76.
- , *The Primary Reason for the Incarnation according to Father Roschini*. In Ant 34 (1959) 409-448.
- Uribealga, J., O.F.M., *La Corredención mariana a la luz de la Cristología de Escoto*. In EM 3 (1944) 232: MPIF.
- [Urrutibéhéty, Chrysostome, O.F.M.], *Marie d'après les principes de l'école franciscaine* (Rome, 1904): MPIF.
- , *Christus Alpha et Omega, seu de Christi universali regno* (2nd ed., Lille, 1910): FST.
- , *Marie, Reine de la création* (Rome, 1905): MPIF.

- , *Encore le vrai motif de l'Incarnation: pour la thèse scotiste contre l'opinion moyenne*. In NRT 43 (1911) 367-382; 389-404.
- , *Encore le vrai motif de l'Incarnation. I. Réponse aux observations de M. Galtier; II. Discussion de l'opinion de Molina* (Orleans, 1911).
- , *Le motif de l'Incarnation. A propos d'un article du R. P. Edouard Hugon, O.P.* In EF 30 (1913) 364-481; 575-592; 31 (1914) 18-54.
- , *Le motif de l'Incarnation au XX siècle*. In FF 6 (1923) 71-107.
- , *Cur Deus Homo: Réponse au R. P. Lemonnyer, O.P.* In FF 9 (1929) 97-118.
- , *Le motif de l'Incarnation et les principaux thomistes contemporains* (Tours, 1921) 362, 389, 403: MPIF.
- , *Le vrai motif de l'Incarnation*. In NRT 43 (1911) 282-303.
- , *Pourquoi Jésus-Christ, ou le motif de l'Incarnation* (Lille, 1923).
- , *Le motif de l'Incarnation et les "Etudes" des RR.PP. Jésuites* (Tours, 1922).
- , *Le motif de l'Incarnation et le D.T.C.* In EF 34 (1922) 483-499; 35 (1923) 67-88.
- , *Le motif de l'Incarnation, explication dernière des meilleurs thomistes*. In FF 8 (1925) 158-164.
- , *Le motif de l'Incarnation d'après l'Angelicum et l'Ami du Clergé*. In FF 15 (1932) 361-408.
- , *La fête du Christ-Roi et le motif de l'Incarnation*. In EF 40 (1928) 459-481; 595-611.
- Vacquerie, B., *Immaculée Conception de Marie*. In Pareri 9 (Roma, 1852) append. II, 186: MPF.
- Vagaggini, C., O.S.B., *Theological Dimensions of the Liturgy* (Collegeville, 1959) I, 8-10: Seems favorable to Scotistic view.
- Valentinus a Westende, O.F.M.Cap., *De relationibus inter Im-*

- maculatam Beatae Mariae Virginis Conceptionem et dona justitiae originalis*. In *Vgl* 9 (1957) 81: MPIF.
- Valenzuela, P. A., O. de M., *De intemerato Deiparae conceptu in Ordine ipsi sub titulo de Mercede dicato* (Romae, 1904) 60-66: MPIF.
- Vázquez, A., O. de M., *Inmaculada Concepción y psicología de la Virgen*. In *MCMZ* 915: MPF.
- Vázquez de Mella, J., *Filosofía de la Eucaristía* (ed. Barcelona, 1928) 119, 165-167: FST.
- Ventura, J. (Théatine), *La raison philosophique et la raison catholique* (Aix-la-Chapelle, 1852) conf. IX, part II: FST. Ref. in *JB-1*, 45-46.
- Verrière, A., *Le plan de salut d'après saint Irénée*. In *RSR* 14 (1934) 492-524.
- , *Il soprannaturale in noi e il peccato originale*, tr. Tommasini (Milan, 1936): FST. Ref. in Bonnefoy-Meilach, 412.
- Veuthey, L., O.F.M.Conv., *De ratione Incarnationis*. In *MF* 41 (1941) 97-102; cf. 101: MPIF.
- Vidal Vendrell, J., *Maternidad de María en la Mariología de Ramón Lull*. In *EstF* 52 (1951) 371: MPIF.
- Villar, I., S.D.B., *Marian Meditations* (2nd ed., Valley Cottage, N.Y., 1961) 16: MPF.
- Vitus of Bussum, O.F.M.Cap., *Duns Scotus' Christocentric Doctrine*. In *RTFR* 11 (1945-1946) 138-142: FST.
- , *De spiritualitate franciscana aliqua capita fundamentalia* (Romae, 1949) 24-31: FST.
- Von Balthasar, H. U., *A Theology of History* (New York, 1963) 61-63: FST.
- Von Klogriwof, I., S.J., *Das Wort des Lebens* (Regensburg, 1938) 52-54: FST. Ref. in Hölzer (q.v.) 273, 277.
- Wambacq, B. N., O.Praem., *"Per eum reconciliare . . . quae in coelis sunt"* (Col 1:20). In *RB* 55 (1948) 35-42: Explains the word "reconciliation" in a Scotistic sense.

- Wehrle, J., *La Royauté du Christ*. In *BTSS* (1927), No. 108: FST.
- Wehrle, R., *Primogenita* (Paris, 1948) 52: MPIF.
- Westcott, B. (Anglican Bp. of Durham), *The Epistles of St. John, The Greek Text with Notes and Essays* (London, 1883) 273-315: FST.
- Williams, G., O.F.M.Conv., *Mary's Immaculate Conception*. In *Mariology* (ed. J. B. Carol, O.F.M.) I (Milwaukee, 1954) 384: MPIF.
- Wilwers, N. M., S.A.C., *Mary's Predestination before Adam*. In *HPR* 62 (1961) 239-244: FBT.
- Wolter, A. B., O.F.M., *Duns Scotus on the Predestination of Christ*. In *Crd* 5 (1955) 366-372, esp. 367: MPIF.
- Wörnhart, L. M., O.F.M., *Maria die wunderbare Mutter Gottes und der Menschen* (Innsbruck, 1890) 33-36: MPIF.
- Wright, J. J., Bp. of Worcester (later Cardinal), *Prefatory Note to Bonnefoy-Meilach, Christ and the Cosmos* (Patterson, 1965) ix-x: FST.
- , *Christocentric Humanism*. In *SL* 4 (1958) 282-286: FST.
- Wroblewski, S., O.F.M., *Role of Mary in the Spiritual Formation of the Franciscan Seminarian*. In *MSO* 481: MPIF.
- Xiberta, B. M., O.Carm., *Tractatus de Verbo Incarnato II: Soteriologia* (Matriti, 1954) 659: Man's Fall is the motive of the *execution* of the Incarnation decree, but not of the decree itself.<sup>36</sup>
- Yáñez de Montenegro, J. M., Bp. of Cochabamba, Letter to Pius IX (1850). In *Pareri* 3 (Roma, 1851) 150: MPF.
- Zepeda, J. de J., O.F.M., Letter to the Archbishop of Guatemala (1850). In *Pareri* 9 (Roma, 1852) append. II, 199, 201, 309: MPF.

---

<sup>36</sup> We are indebted to Eamon R. Carroll, O.Carm., for having verified this reference.



## CONCLUSION

At the close of this survey, a few brief observations would seem to be in order.

1) Concerning the number and religious affiliation of the authors mentioned: To our knowledge, the above list is by far the most complete ever assembled.<sup>37</sup> Our survey, which covers only the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, includes 504 authors. Of these, many are well-known and respected professional theologians;<sup>38</sup> others would fall under the category of spiritual writers. It is not always feasible to draw the dividing line. The distinction should not be emphasized, nor will it be by those who are familiar with the history of Marian doctrines, particularly the Immaculate Conception.

Of the 504 authors mentioned, 214 belong to the Franciscan Order. That should surprise no one, since the doctrine of Christ's and Mary's absolute and universal primacy has always been cherished by the spiritual sons of the Poverello. The remaining 290 belong to various Religious Orders (Jesuits, Benedictines, Mercedarians, etc.) and to the diocesan clergy, with a few lay writers added. This should dispose of the claim sometimes made that the Franciscan viewpoint is endorsed only by the members of the Seraphic Order "*and a few others.*"<sup>39</sup> Never-

<sup>37</sup> We take this opportunity to convey our thanks to our distinguished colleague, Father Michael D. Meilach, O.F.M., who graciously allowed us to incorporate into our survey not a few of the entries he himself had used in the bibliography he compiled for Bonnefoy's book, *Christ and the Cosmos*.

<sup>38</sup> Which hardly verifies the judgment of L. Thomassinus, according to whom, those who adopt the Franciscan theory must be suffering from hallucinations (!). Cf. his *Dogmata theologica III: De Incarnatione*, lib. 2, cap. 5, n. 1 (ed. Parisiis, 1866); ref. in *JB-1*, 35, n. 1.

<sup>39</sup> According to E. Hugon, O.P., the Franciscan thesis is held only by "a few mystics full of idealism." Cf. his *Le motif de l'Incarnation*, in *RTb* 21 (1913) 279. Equally discouraging was C. Pesch, S.J., in his *Praelectiones Dogmaticae IV: De Verbo Incarnato* (ed. 3, 1903): "By now [the Franciscan opinion] hardly has any supporters." In fairness to the author,

theless, let us not indulge in the numbers game. As everyone knows, the large number of those adhering to a given thesis is not necessarily an index of its truth.<sup>40</sup> Let us say simply that, in our case, it is rather significant and hence not to be summarily dismissed.

2) Concerning the positions taken by our authors: We note that not everyone in our survey explicitly refers to *all* the elements which make up the "Franciscan" theory.<sup>41</sup> Nevertheless, if a theologian states, e.g., that Mary was willed (predestined) by God *first* among creatures, we may infer that, according to him, Mary was predestined independently of Adam's fall. Again, if a theologian claims that Christ and Mary are the final and/or exemplary cause of all creation, we must assume that, according to him, they were predestined with a logical priority over the rest. It is true that some Thomists (followers of Theory B above) do speak of Christ as being the final cause of all creation, and yet they subordinate His very existence to the Fall. With all due respect, we suggest that their posture is illogical because it clashes with the principles of the *philosophia perennis*.<sup>42</sup> At any rate, since the authors in our list do not refer to

we must mention that later on (ed. 4-5, Friburgi Brig., [1922] 229) he acknowledges that "tot et tanti doctores" endorse the Scotistic viewpoint. G. Bonomelli's appraisal of the situation is more encouraging; in his *Il pulpito di Nostra Donna di Parigi* (Torino, 1893) 47-48, the distinguished Bishop of Cremona expressed the opinion that the Franciscan thesis was gaining so many followers that the Church would eventually sanction it as it did the question of the Immaculate Conception. According to Dom Feuling, O.S.B., *Katholische Glaubenslehre* (Salzburg, 1937) 427, the number of those who follow the Franciscan thesis is *still* increasing.

<sup>40</sup> Melchior Canus, O.P., said it well: "Non enim numero haec judicantur sed pondere." *De locis theologicis*, lib. 8, cap. 4, concl. 1 (ed. Patavii, 1762) 213.

<sup>41</sup> For us, the quintessence of the Franciscan position is that Christ and Mary were willed or predestined by God *logically prior* to, and thus independently of, every other creature. Other aspects of the question either lead to it or follow from it.

<sup>42</sup> Cf. St. Thomas, *Summa theologiae*, I, q. 105, a. 5: "Semper enim imperfectum est propter perfectius;" *Contra Gent.*, 2, c. 44, 1: "Quanto aliquid

the subordination just mentioned, we assume (*donec contrarium probetur*) that they, logical with themselves, imply that Christ and Mary were predestined independently of the Fall.

At this point we would call the reader's attention to what many will consider a strange anomaly. A few of the authors who explicitly teach Mary's predestination independently of Adam, happen to be "debitists." That is to say, they hold that, since Our Lady was conceived according to the ordinary laws of generation, she should have been included in Adam's moral solidarity. This is what is commonly known as a *debitum debiti* or *debitum remotum*.

Is their stand illogical? From their viewpoint it is not, although from ours it certainly is. Let us explain briefly. The authors now under discussion, like many theologians of old, understand the transmission of original sin *via physica*, i.e., by way of a libidinous generation and the consequent communication of the *caro infecta*. They believe that in this fashion they can better safeguard Mary's preservative redemption. Those who explain the transmission of original sin *via legali vel juridica*, may or may not demand a *debitum* in Mary, depending on the place they assign to her in the divine decree of predestination.<sup>43</sup> It seems to us that if Mary was predestined with a logical priority over Adam, the (logically) later decree concerning his sin could in no way affect her retroactively without implying mutability in the divine mind.<sup>44</sup> In other words, by the

est melius in effectibus, tanto est prius in intentione agentis," *Summa theol.*, III, q. 56, a. 1, ad 3: "Semper enim id quod est perfectissimum est exemplar ejus quod est minus perfectum." Father Chrysostome (*op. cit.*, 439-443) has shown that the Scotistic theory is actually based on the principles of the *philosophia perennis* as formulated by the Angelic Doctor

<sup>43</sup> Cf. P. de A. Martínez, O.F.M., *Las primeras elaboraciones de los conceptos de redención preservativa y el débito del pecado*, in EM 16 (1955) 127-128; id., *La Inmaculada Concepción según las doctrinas de Juan de Cartagena y Juan de Serrano*, in Vgl 7/2 (1957) 240-241.

<sup>44</sup> Cf. our art., *Reflections on the Problem of Mary's Preservative Redemption*, in MS 30 (1979), esp. 83-84.

time Adam's sin comes into the picture (humanly speaking), Mary is *already* chosen by God as immaculate and full of grace. There is simply no room here for a *debitum* of any kind. Hence according to *our* viewpoint, the authors alluded to are illogical.

Not a few theologians in our survey follow the traditional Scotistic theory to the effect that, even if Adam had not sinned, Christ would have come anyway, but *in carne impassibili*. We agree with them, of course, that Christ was predestined independently of the Fall, but we do not believe (for reasons indicated above) that the matter should be formulated in a hypothetical way. As to the distinction between *caro passibilis* and *caro impassibilis*, we are of the opinion that it should be discarded as going counter to God's immutability.<sup>45</sup>

Concerning the last three theories summarized in the first part of this essay (i.e., Bonnefoy, Rocca-Roschini, Marshner) we note that they all agree on three important points: a) Christ and Mary hold an ontological primacy (not only a primacy of honor) over all creation; b) They were predestined with a logical priority over the rest of the predestined; and c) as a result of the above, they were predestined independently of Adam's sin. In this sense the three theories are thoroughly "Franciscan." The difference in the arrangement (or number) of the *signa rationis* is accidental and in no way affects the substantial agreement. Nevertheless, if we must express our preference among them, our choice falls on the theory so ably and cogently presented by Prof. Marshner.

REV. J. B. CAROL, O.F.M.  
*St. Anthony's Friary*  
*St. Petersburg, Fla. 33701*

<sup>45</sup> Cf. Bonnefoy, *L'Immaculée dans le plan divin*, in *EphM* 8 (1958) 15.