

# University of Dayton Law Review

---

Volume 45 | Number 2

Article 1

---

4-1-2020

## Front Matter, Volume 45, Number 2

University of Dayton

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ecommons.udayton.edu/udlr>



Part of the [Law Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

University of Dayton (2020) "Front Matter, Volume 45, Number 2," *University of Dayton Law Review*. Vol. 45: No. 2, Article 1.

Available at: <https://ecommons.udayton.edu/udlr/vol45/iss2/1>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Law at eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in University of Dayton Law Review by an authorized editor of eCommons. For more information, please contact [mschlange1@udayton.edu](mailto:mschlange1@udayton.edu), [ecommons@udayton.edu](mailto:ecommons@udayton.edu).

# University of Dayton

# LAW REVIEW

## ARTICLES

THE SUPREME COURT AND STUDENT FREE SPEECH:  
A RETROSPECTIVE LOOK AT *TINKER V. DES MOINES*  
*INDEPENDENT COMMUNITY SCHOOL DISTRICT*  
AND ITS PROGENY

*CHARLES J. RUSSO*

WHAT WAS WRONG WITH *TINKER*:  
MIND THE GAP

*CHRISTOPHER J. ROEDERER*

FOLLOW THE TRUTH WHEREVER IT MAY LEAD:  
THE SUPREME COURT'S TRUTHS AND MYTHS  
OF ACADEMIC FREEDOM

*WILLIAM E. THRO*

*MASTERPIECE CAKESHOP* AND  
ITS IMPLICATIONS

*FEDERALIST SOCIETY PANEL*

SAY WHAT YOU WILL?:  
GOVERNMENT COMPELLED SPEECH

*FEDERALIST SOCIETY PANEL*

# UNIVERSITY OF DAYTON LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 45

SPRING 2020

NUMBER 2

## ARTICLES

THE SUPREME COURT AND STUDENT FREE SPEECH:  
A RETROSPECTIVE LOOK AT *TINKER V. DES MOINES*  
*INDEPENDENT COMMUNITY SCHOOL DISTRICT*  
AND ITS PROGENY

CHARLES J. RUSSO 189

WHAT WAS WRONG WITH *TINKER*:  
MIND THE GAP

CHRISTOPHER J. ROEDERER 229

FOLLOW THE TRUTH WHEREVER IT MAY LEAD:  
THE SUPREME COURT'S TRUTHS AND MYTHS  
OF ACADEMIC FREEDOM

WILLIAM E. THRO 261

MASTERPIECE CAKESHOP AND  
ITS IMPLICATIONS

FEDERALIST SOCIETY PANEL 289

SAY WHAT YOU WILL?:  
GOVERNMENT COMPELLED SPEECH

FEDERALIST SOCIETY PANEL 315

# UNIVERSITY OF DAYTON LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 45

SPRING 2020

NUMBER 2

## GENERAL INFORMATION

The University of Dayton Law Review (ISSN 0162-9174) is published 2-4 times per year by students at the University of Dayton School of Law. Views expressed in this issue are those of the authors and do not reflect the policies or opinions of the trustees, faculty, or administration of the University of Dayton School of Law or the University of Dayton, the Law Review, or its editors or staff.

The Law Review is indexed in Current Law Index, Index to Legal Periodicals, and Legal Resource Index. Beginning with Volume 17, Issue 1, the Law Review is available on LEXIS. Beginning with Volume 9, Issue 1, selected articles appear on WESTLAW and beginning with Volume 19, Issue 2, full coverage of the Law Review is available on WESTLAW. The Law Review is a member of the National Conference of Law Reviews. The Law Review is printed by Western Newspaper Publishing Co., Inc., 929 West 16th Street, Indianapolis, Indiana 46202.

## SUBSCRIPTIONS

The subscription rate is \$30.00 per volume. Single issues are available for \$17.50 per issue. Subscriptions are automatically renewed unless written notice of cancellation is received prior to shipment of the issue. Please notify the Law Review, in writing, of any change of address and include name, new address and old address or mailing label. Direct all correspondence regarding subscriptions and back issues to the attention of the Business Manager.

## ARTICLE SUBMISSIONS

The Law Review invites submission of articles in all areas of current legal interest. Please direct articles to the attention of the Outside Articles Editor. The Law Review will not return unsolicited articles unless postage is provided.

## CITATION MANUAL

The Law Review substantially conforms to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (20th ed. 2015).

## COPYRIGHT

Copyright © 2018 by the University of Dayton Law Review. Please direct requests for excerpts or reprints to the contact information provided below.

## CONTACT INFORMATION

University of Dayton Law Review  
300 College Park  
Dayton, Ohio 45469-2772  
udlawreview@udayton.edu

Website: [http://www.udayton.edu/law/academics/law\\_review/](http://www.udayton.edu/law/academics/law_review/)

# UNIVERSITY OF DAYTON LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 45

SPRING 2020

NUMBER 2

## ADMINISTRATION

ANDREW L. STRAUSS, A.B., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

LORI E. SHAW, B.S., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Lawyering Skills*

SHANNON R. PENN, B.A., M.S.ED., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs and Registrar*

JEFFREY SCHMITT, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Graduate Programs; Associate Professor of Law*

CLAIRE SCHRADER, B.A., M.ED., *Assistant Dean and Executive Director of Enrollment Management and Marketing*

TIMOTHY G. SWENSEN, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean and Director of Career Services*

VICTORIA VANZANDT, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for the Law@Dayton Hybrid JD Program & Professor of Lawyering Skills*

JULIE E. ZINK, A.A.S., B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion; Coordinator, Legal Profession Program; Professor of Lawyering Skills*

SUSAN N. ELLIOTT, B.A., M.ED., M.L.S., J.D., *Professor and Director, Zimmerman Law Library*

PEGGY WILSON, B.B.A., *Director of Operations and Finance*

## FACULTY

MAUREEN ANDERSON, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M., MLIS, *Professor & Assistant Director for Public Services*

TAN BOSTON, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Visiting Assistant Professor of Law*

FAISAL CHAUDHRY, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *Assistant Professor of Law & History; Hanley Institute Sustainability Scholar*

JEANNETTE COX, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*

DANIEL CRAINE, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Academic Success*

ERICKA CURRAN, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Lawyering Skills*

SUSAN N. ELLIOTT, B.A., M.ED., M.L.S., J.D., *Professor and Director, Zimmerman Law Library*

ERICA GOLDBERG, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*

THADDEUS HOFFMEISTER, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*

PAMELA IZVĂNARIU, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.A., PH.D., *Assistant Professor of Law & Sociology*

MICHELINE KIDWELL, B.S.J., J.D., H.B.X., *Assistant Professor of Academic Success; Director of Bar Preparation*

DENISE PLATFOOT LACEY, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Externships*

KEVIN LESKE, B.S., M.S., M.E.L.P., J.D., *Professor of Law*

TRACY REILLY, B.A., J.D., *NCR Professor of Law and Technology and Director of the Program in Law and Technology*

CHRISTOPHER ROEDERER, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*

ASHLEY RUSSELL, B.A., J.D., M.S., *Visiting Assistant Professor, Academic Success Program*

CHARLES J. RUSSO, B.A., M.Div., J.D., Ed.D., *Director, Ph.D. Program in Educational Leadership; Research Professor of Law*

JEFFREY SCHMITT, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Graduate Programs; Associate Professor of Law*

ANDREA M. SEIELSTAD, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*

DALINDYEBO SHABALALA, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*



# UNIVERSITY OF DAYTON LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 45

SPRING 2020

NUMBER 2

LORI E. SHAW, B.S., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Lawyering Skills*

JAMES STEINER-DILLON, B.A., J.D., M.A., PH.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*

ANDREW L. STRAUSS, A.B., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

TAMARA TABO, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Academic Success and Academic Success Program Director*

ADAM TODD, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Lawyering Skills*

VICTORIA VANZANDT, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for the Law@Dayton Hybrid JD Program & Professor of Lawyering Skills*

PAUL D. VENARD, M.L.I.S., J.D., *Associate Professor & Reference and Electronic Services Librarian*

BLAKE WATSON, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law; Samuel A. McCray Chair*

SUSAN WAWROSE, B.A., M.A., J.D., M.S.ED., *Professor of Lawyering Skills*

JULIE E. ZINK, A.A.S., B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion; Coordinator, Legal Profession Program; Professor of Lawyering Skills*

## ADJUNCT FACULTY

ADAM ARMSTRONG, B.A., J.D.

MATTHEW R. ARNTZ, B.A., J.D.

BRIAN BACON, B.A., J.D.

MICHAEL BANIAK, B.S., J.D.

CHERYLL BENNETT, B.A., J.D.

BRETT BISSONNETTE, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M.

ERIK BLAINE, B.A., J.D.

KAREN BRADLEY, B.A., J.D.

JENNIFER BRILL, B.A., J.D.

JENNIFER L. BROGAN, B.S., J.D.

KESHA BROOKS, B.A., M.P.A., J.D.

JOSEPH BROSSART, B.A., J.D.

CHAD BURTON, B.A., J.D.

TRINITY CAR, B.A., M.S., J.D.

TODD B. CARVER, B.A., J.D.

MOLLY COLANERI, B.S.B.A., J.D.

MATTHEW CURRIE, B.S., M.S.E.L., J.D.

SCOTT DAVIES, B.S.B.A., J.D.

NEAL DUIKER, B.A., J.D.

CHRISTOPHER B. EPLEY, B.A., J.D.

JOHN FELDMEIER, B.A., J.D., PH.D.

JOHN FISCHER, B.A., J.D.

JACQUELINE GAINES, B.A., J.D.

JACQUELINE GALL, B.A., J.D.

SCOT GANOW, B.S., J.D.

KEN GERMAIN, A.B., J.D.

HONORABLE BARBARA P. GORMAN, B.A., M.A., J.D.

JAMES GOTTMAN, B.S.E.E., J.D.

REBECCA M. GREENDYKE, B.S., J.D.

CHARLES GROVE, B.A., J.D.

WILLIAM M. HARRELSON II, B.S., J.D.

KIMBERLY HARSHBARGER, B.A., M.S., J.D.

KELLY HENRICI, B.A., J.D.

# UNIVERSITY OF DAYTON LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 45

SPRING 2020

NUMBER 2

ALEX HIGHT, B.A., M.S., M.B.A.  
JENNA HOSIER, B.A., J.D.  
HONORABLE MARY KATE HUFFMAN, B.A., J.D., M.A.  
PABLO IANNELLO, LL.M.  
VALERIE INMAN, B.A., J.D.  
GEOFFREY IVNIK, B.A., J.D.  
MICHAEL A. JACOBS, B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
KIRK JOHNSEN, B.A., M.A., J.D.  
HONORABLE ERIC H. KEARNEY, A.B., J.D.  
JAMES KELLEHER, B.A., J.D.  
MALIKEYA KHANTRECE, B.A., J.D., LL.M.  
ROBERT KLEES, B.S.B.A., M.B.A.  
JAMES G. KORDIK, B.S., J.D.  
SCOTT KRAMER, B.A., J.D.  
WILLIAM KUGEL, B.B.A., M.B.A.  
JUDITH LAMUSGA, B.S., M.ED., J.D.  
HONORABLE DENNIS J. LANGER, B.A., J.D.  
DAVID LARSON, B.A., M.P.A., J.D.  
ROBERT LECH, B.S., J.D.  
THOMAS LEES, B.S., J.D.  
DENNIS LIEBERMAN, B.A., J.D.  
BRANDON MCCLAIN, B.A., M.S., J.D.  
GLEN MCMURRY, B.S., J.D.  
MICHAEL MCSHEA, B.A., J.D.  
HONORABLE MICHAEL R. MERZ, A.B., J.D.  
IRA MICKENBERG, A.B., J.D., LL.M.  
MICHAEL MILLER, B.A., J.D.  
PAUL MOKE, A.B., M.A., J.D., PH.D.  
HONORABLE MICHAEL J. NEWMAN, B.F.A., J.D.  
SUSAN OILER, B.S., B.A., J.D.  
ANDREA DEWAR OLADI, B.A., B.S.W., B.C.L., LL.B., M.S.W.  
ERIN OTIS, B.A., J.D.  
HONORABLE SHARON L. OVINGTON, B.A., J.D.  
VIPAL J. PATEL, B.S., J.D.  
BRYAN PENICK, B.A., J.D.  
DAVID P. PIERCE, B.A., J.D.  
JESSICA A. RAMOS, B.A., M.A., J.D.  
HONORABLE ROBERT W. RETTICH III, B.A., J.D.  
LYNN REYNOLDS, B.A., J.D.  
MICHAEL RHINEHART, B.A., J.D.  
HONORABLE WALTER H. RICE, B.A., J.D., M.B.A., HON. LL.D., HON. L.H.D.  
NANCY ROBERSON, B.A., J.D.  
ANDREW ROSSOW, B.A., J.D.  
JAMES SCHEPLEY, B.B.A., M.B.A.  
ANDREW SEXTON, B.A., J.D.  
CARL SHERRETS, B.B.A., J.D.  
NATHAN SHRIDER, B.S., M.B.A.  
HONORABLE PETER B. SILVAIN JR., B.A., J.D.  
HONORABLE GREGORY F. SINGER, B.A., J.D.  
STEPHANIE L. SLONE, B.A., J.D.

# UNIVERSITY OF DAYTON LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 45

SPRING 2020

NUMBER 2

SUSAN SOLLE, B.A., J.D.

BRIAN SULLIVAN, B.E., J.D., LL.M.

ANITA TEEKAH, B.A., J.D.

MATTHEW WALKER, B.A., J.D.

HEATHER WELBAUM, B.A., J.D.

THOMAS P. WHELLEY II, B.A., J.D.

CHASTITY WHITAKER, B.S., M.S., J.D., PH.D.

JENIFER WILHELM, B.A., J.D.

MATHEW WILLENBRINK, B.S., J.D., M.B.A.

KATIE WRIGHT, B.A., J.D.

SANDRA G. ZIMMERLE, B.A., M.B.A., J.D.



# UNIVERSITY OF DAYTON LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 45

SPRING 2020

NUMBER 2

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### EDITOR IN CHIEF

EMMA M. WALTON

### MANAGING EDITOR

ALYSA MEDINA

### BUSINESS MANAGER

MARY KRAFT

### EXECUTIVE PUBLICATION EDITOR

ASHLEY CALDWELL

### OUTSIDE ARTICLES EDITOR & RESEARCH EDITOR

EMMA COMPTON

### COMMENT EDITORS

ALYSSA COLEMAN

MADISON DUFF

### PUBLICATION EDITORS

DAVIS SCHWARTZ

BRETT TAYLOR

### STAFF WRITERS

JACOB BOWMAN  
ALICIA FERGUSON  
HOLLY FUDGE  
JOANNA GISEL

MICKENZIE GRUBB  
ANGEL HIERREZUELO  
ALEXANDRIA HORNER  
JASON JUDD  
ABIGAIL LOWERS

ANTHONY MAIORANO  
ALLISON MIKICIUK  
MARGARET MILES  
ASHLEY ORAVETZ

### FACULTY ADVISORS

SUSAN ELLIOTT  
&  
JEANNETTE COX