Flipping the Script: Newspaper Reporting of the Trayvon Martin Shooting

Chad Painter
University of Dayton, cpainter1@udayton.edu

Erin Willis
University of Colorado, Boulder

Follow this and additional works at: http://ecommons.udayton.edu/cmm_fac_pub

Part of the African American Studies Commons, Gender, Race, Sexuality, and Ethnicity in Communication Commons, and the Social Influence and Political Communication Commons

eCommons Citation

Painter, Chad and Willis, Erin, "Flipping the Script: Newspaper Reporting of the Trayvon Martin Shooting" (2016). Communication Faculty Publications. 43.
http://ecommons.udayton.edu/cmm_fac_pub/43

This Book Chapter is brought to you for free and open access by the Department of Communication at eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Communication Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of eCommons. For more information, please contact frice1@udayton.edu, mschlangen1@udayton.edu.
Flipping the Script: Newspaper Reporting of the Trayvon Martin Shooting

Abstract
The purpose of this chapter is to examine newspaper coverage of the George Zimmerman-Trayvon Martin shooting and the frames of race and crime used in the context of newsworthiness. The researchers analyzed 1,177 articles in one local, six statewide, and three national newspapers. The local paper focused on the shooting and the ensuing police investigation instead of social and political issues, and local-interest stories instead of national events. There was virtually no mention of race. Coverage in the six Florida papers was mixed between details of the case and social issues such as Florida's Stand Your Ground law. There were few uses of racial descriptors. The three national papers focused on social and political issues such as Stand Your Ground, guns, and race, and referenced the shooting for context when discussing similar local incidents. Racial identifiers were used frequently, and Martin's clothing was referenced as a covert racial identifier or as shorthand for the shooting and its aftermath. The researchers then discuss the ethical implications of such coverage.

Disciplines
African American Studies | Communication | Gender, Race, Sexuality, and Ethnicity in Communication | Social Influence and Political Communication

Comments
The chapter provided for download is made available with written permission of the author and the publisher. Permission documentation is on file. Copying or distributing in print or electronic forms without written permission of IGI Global is prohibited.

This book chapter is available at eCommons: http://ecommons.udayton.edu/cmm_fac_pub/43
Impact of Communication and the Media on Ethnic Conflict

Steven Gibson  
*Northcentral University, USA*

Agnes Lucy Lando  
*Daystar University, Kenya*
Chapter 6
Flipping the Script: Newspaper Reporting of the Trayvon Martin Shooting

Chad Painter
Eastern New Mexico University, USA

Erin Willis
University of Colorado – Boulder, USA

ABSTRACT
The purpose of this chapter is to examine newspaper coverage of the George Zimmerman-Trayvon Martin shooting and the frames of race and crime used in the context of newsworthiness. The researchers analyzed 1,177 articles in one local, six statewide, and three national newspapers. The local paper focused on the shooting and the ensuing police investigation instead of social and political issues, and local-interest stories instead of national events. There was virtually no mention of race. Coverage in the six Florida papers was mixed between details of the case and social issues such as Florida’s Stand Your Ground law. There were few uses of racial descriptors. The three national papers focused on social and political issues such as Stand Your Ground, guns, and race, and referenced the shooting for context when discussing similar local incidents. Racial identifiers were used frequently, and Martin’s clothing was referenced as a covert racial identifier or as shorthand for the shooting and its aftermath. The researchers then discuss the ethical implications of such coverage.

INTRODUCTION
George Zimmerman shot and killed Trayvon Martin Feb. 26, 2012. Martin had purchased Skittles and an iced tea at a local 7-Eleven and was walking back to his father’s fiancé’s house in the gated community The Retreat at Twin Lakes in Sanford, Florida. Zimmerman, a local neighborhood watch volunteer, saw Martin, called police to report a suspicious person, and then confronted him. Before police arrived, Zimmerman had shot Martin, telling police that he acted in self-defense because Martin attacked him.

DOI: 10.4018/978-1-4666-9728-7.ch006
Violent crime such as this incident happens every day, but most crime does not make national headlines or remain part of the news agenda for months. The purpose of the current chapter is to examine newspaper coverage of the Zimmerman-Martin shooting and the frames of race and crime used in the context of newsworthiness, e.g., degree of relevance to newspaper audiences. Given the size of Sanford, Florida, and the age of Martin, it is obvious that this story is worth reporting. However, crime reporting typically follows a stereotypical script where the perpetrator is black, and the victim is white (Gilliam & Iyengar, 2000); in the case of Trayvon Martin and George Zimmerman—that script does not fit.

Characteristics of the media message are important to the public’s understanding of crime (McCombs, 2013). Walter Lippmann wrote that news media are powerful forces in shaping the “pictures in our heads” because “the world that we have to deal with politically is out of reach, out of sight, out of mind” (1922, pg. 18). While Lippmann largely was writing about the political pictures in our heads, the news media also explore the day-to-day happenings in citizens’ lives—including the Zimmerman-Martin shooting. The news values that are considered important when reporting crime and violence, as well as the frames used to tell the story, must be understood.

BACKGROUND

The Newsworthiness of Crime

Surveillance, which includes crime reporting, is just one of the five major functions of news, along with correlation, transmission, entertainment, and economic service (Wilson & Gutiérrez, 1995). Newspapers generally are regional, reaching audiences in defined markets and producing news that is relevant to those readers. There are reasons why one story is selected for coverage versus another; journalists construct stories to be newsworthy (Shoemaker & Vos, 2009; Shoemaker & Reese, 1996).

The selectivity of crime stories in the news may relate to journalistic news values. News values “play an important role in helping to structure public opinion” (Price & Tewksbury, 1997, pg. 177). News values are the characteristics of an event that, in part, determine its salience as a potential news story (Entman, 1993; Fiske & Taylor, 1991). These values may vary across culture or newsroom environment (Naylor, 2001). Galtung and Ruge (1965) first defined the concept when they identified 12 news values: frequency, threshold, unambiguity, consonance, unexpectedness, continuity, compositional balance, elite nations, elite people, personalization, and negativity. They argued that these values are additive, that a story including more of these components would be considered more newsworthy.

News values are culturally specific (Naylor, 2001). As society (and media) change, the criterion that influences the selection and production of news also changes. Some crimes impact wider society, resulting in changing behaviors or beliefs (Innes, 2004). For example, school shootings may influence the public’s attitudes toward gun control. Chermak (1995) identified criteria that news organizations use to assess the newsworthiness of crime, including the violent nature of the crime, demographic factors (e.g., age, race, gender) of both the victim and perpetrator, characteristics of the news outlet, the novelty of the event, and localization. Other scholars have found similar determinants of news organizations’ assessment of the newsworthiness of crime (Jewkes, 2004; Pritchard & Hughes, 1997). The extent to which a story contains these elements influences the likelihood that it will be reported.

Many criticize news outlets for the abundance of crime reporting, reinforcing the old adage: “When it bleeds, it leads.” However, the public desires news reporting of crime and violence, often forming their
opinions about such from the news (Pew Research Center, 2005). The reporting of crime is essentially selective (Ditton & Duffy, 1983); journalists could not possibly report on every crime in every city in every state. Criminal activity does not always translate into news. When it does, the presentation of the news story can influence its interpretation by the public (Scheufele, 1999).

Most Americans receive their news about crime and violence from local media outlets, and more adults rely on newspapers than any other form of media for crime reporting (Pew Research Center, 2011). Crime is one of the most prevalent issues in the news (Iyengar, 1991), and the media’s constant reporting of crime cultivates widespread fear and concern (Gross & Aday, 2003; Lowry, Ching, Nio, & Leitner, 2003; Romer, Jamieson, & Aday, 2003).

**News Framing**

Scholars suggest that crime is socially constructed (Peelo, Francis, Soothill, Pearson, & Ackerley, 2004), often by the rhetorical practices of storytelling (Beckett & Sasson, 2003). Framing theorists contend that the way a story is framed is very important to the audience’s opinion of the issue. Frames create a tone for the news story that increases the salience of a message (Entman, 1993). As salience increases, so does the likelihood that audiences will retain a message, come to a conclusion about the message, and remember that conclusion (Fiske & Taylor, 1991). As a result, the selection of topics covered (or omitted) in a news story can change the tone of the message (Entman, 1993) because “frames are the lenses through which social reality is viewed” (Dillard, Solomon, & Samp, 1996, pg. 706).

Journalists use subtle frames that often are unacknowledged yet are consistent patterns that have the power to influence interpretation. Entman (1993) wrote that when journalists frame an issue, they select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation for the item described. (pg. 52)

Elements in the story are said to be in the frame; elements not included are said to be out of frame and are considered less significant (Dorfman, Wallach, & Woodruff, 2005).

Because journalists receive event-specific details about crime from local police, their reporting of crime tends to repeat many of the details (date, location, offense) received directly from the police. This type of reporting usually results in episodic framing (Iyengar, 1991). The episodic news frame “takes the form of a case study or event-oriented report and depicts public issues in terms of concrete instances” (Iyengar, 1991, pg. 3). News media report most stories without context, leading audiences to focus on the individual(s) within the story and attribute responsibility to him or her for the problem and its solution (Iyengar, 1991). Episodic news frames provide audiences with little insight into the larger social and political circumstances contributing to the particular problem (Dorfman et al., 2005).

In contrast, thematic news frames “place public issues in some more general or abstract context and take the form of a ‘takeout,’ or ‘backgrounder,’ report directed at general outcomes or conditions” (Iyengar, 1991, pg.14). Thematic news frames provide audiences with information that offers context such as background and consequences. News that includes social determinants is thought to cultivate a sense of shared responsibility and encourage action (Dorfman et al., 2005).

Previous researchers have found that episodic frames and thematic frames have considerably different influences on audience’s understanding of an issue. Iyengar (1991) found that stories written with
episodic frames cause viewers to attribute responsibility to the individual(s) in the story. Thematic framing encourages audiences to consider why the crime may have occurred and thus are more likely to attribute responsibility to social determinants such as poverty or unemployment, and society’s structural failures. The framing of a crime story also can influence the collective action taken against the individual(s) or issue.

**Framing Race and Crime**

Previous researchers have shown that news framing shapes public opinion. For instance, visual images in the news tend to be vivid, salient, and memorable (Entman, 1990; Graber, 1990). Visual imagery used in combination with news story framing can instruct audiences how to think about an issue (Domke, Perlmutter, & Spratt, 2002). Journalists use exemplars to present a story or personify an issue (Brosius, 2003). Exemplars are frequently used in journalism and often are remembered more than the actual details of the story (Brosius, 2003).

The media’s reporting of crime influences audience’s attitudes about race and ethnicity (Gilliam, Valentino, & Beckmann, 2002; Gilliam & Iyengar, 2000; Entman, 1992). Crime reporting perpetuates racial stereotypes and biases (Leshner, 2006; Dixon & Linz, 2000). For example, Americans most often associate blacks with crime (Gilliam & Iyengar, 2005). Crime is a preferred television news topic because of the dramatic effect it has on audiences (Gilliam & Iyengar, 2000). Most news stories feature whites, and audiences thus tend to associate whites with a variety of topics such as business, technology, and science (Dixon & Linz, 2000; Entman & Rojecki, 2000); however, blacks most frequently are depicted as criminals, victims, or dependents of society (Leshner, 2006; Dixon & Linz, 2000; Entman & Rojecki, 2000). Traditionally, there is little explanation of circumstances such as poverty, unemployment, discrimination, and other social determinants that may explain why these crimes are committed (Entman & Rojecki, 2000). Thus, audiences tend to think about crime in terms of race.

Local television news in Los Angeles exaggerated black crime rates, and, as a result, caused audiences to perceive crime in terms of “blackness” (Gilliam, Iyengar, Simon, & Wright, 1996). Entman and Rojecki (2000) found that Chicago’s local television news did not accurately portray race consistent with the city’s crime reports. Instead, the news overrepresented black perpetrators, underrepresented black victims, and overrepresented white victims. In a similar study of California news versus crime reports, Dixon & Linz (2000) found that blacks were depicted as perpetrators more often than they were arrested; Latinos and whites were underrepresented as perpetrators when compared to their documented arrests. The media frame blacks as more dangerous criminals in subtle ways. For example, black perpetrators are shown in handcuffs more often than white perpetrators (Leshner, 2006; Entman & Rojecki, 2000). Entman & Rojecki (2000) found that on broadcast news, white perpetrators’ names were included with their mug shot, but black perpetrators’ names were omitted. This omission of information could influence audiences to categorize all blacks as criminals, instead of noticing characteristics of the individual perpetrators (Entman & Rojecki, 2000). Another example is that four times more black mug shots are shown on television in comparison to those of whites (Entman & Rojecki, 2000). Hurwitz and Peffley (2005) found that racial language such as “inner city” may influence audience’s attitudes toward race and crime, and that media framing primes racial attitudes. Uneven depictions of race are even seen in big media studies. For example, Park, Holody, & Zhang (2012) found that the media framed the 2007 Virginia Tech shooter in terms of the perpetrator’s ethnicity and the general criminal culpability of his ethnic group, at times even displaying racial and ethnic references in prominent positions in news stories.
This focus on race and ethnicity is contrasted with the coverage of the Columbine High School shooting, where the race of the shooters was virtually absent.

Exemplars related to crime and race engage audience’s emotions (Zillman, 1999), especially when aligned with racial stereotypes perpetuated by news media. Audiences rely on the information received by media, but the inaccurate portrayal of blacks and crime reinforces societal stereotypes of this minority group (Ramasubramanian, 2007). Audiences refer to this information when making evaluations about minorities, especially when they do not engage with members of the group regularly. Quillian and Pager (2001) argue:

Once established, stereotypes and the expectations they engender influence judgments and actions. This process can be subtle, in some cases operating without the subject’s conscious awareness that a racial stereotype has been invoked. (pg. 722)

Information consistent with stereotypes is more likely to be noticed and remembered than information that is not (Oliver & Fonash, 2002); information that is contradictory to accepted stereotypes is likely to be discounted by audiences (Quillian & Pager, 2001).

Gilliam and Iyengar (2000) argue that local crime news follows “a standard script” featuring violence (e.g., car-jackings, homicides, home invasions) and a specific perpetrator—typically someone who is black. However, in this study, researchers examined a news script that did not conform to the stereotype. Instead, a non-white Hispanic was the perpetrator, and the victim was black.

ISSUES, CONTROVERSIES, PROBLEMS

We seek to answer two questions in this chapter, “How did newspapers frame race and crime in the George Zimmerman-Trayvon Martin shooting case?” and “How was news framing similar and/or different in the local Sanford newspaper, six Florida newspapers, and three national newspapers?”

To probe the question of how race and crime were portrayed in print newspaper articles covering the Zimmerman-Martin shooting, researchers conducted a textual analysis of 1,177 articles in local, state, and national newspapers. The Sanford Herald (N=76) was chosen because it is the local newspaper where the shooting occurred. Six Florida papers—Orlando Sentinel (N=290), Tampa Bay Times (N=31), Tampa Tribune (N=32), South Florida Sun-Sentinel (N=126), Miami Herald (N=256), and Jacksonville’s Florida Times-Union (N=13)—were chosen because together they represent different levels of reporting (e.g., news values) and readership (e.g., news framing). Three national papers—The New York Times (N=254), The Los Angeles Times (N=64), and Denver Post (N=35)—were chosen based on their circulation and geographic region. Newspaper databases were searched using the keyword “Trayvon Martin” for a period between Feb. 27 and Aug. 31, 2012. The shooting occurred February 26, Zimmerman surrendered to authorities June 3, and he was released on bond July 6.

Textual analysis “is a means of trying to learn something about people by examining what they write” (Berger, 1998, pg. 23). Researchers using textual analysis “assume that behavioral patterns, values, and attitudes found in this material reflect and affect the behaviors, attitudes and values of the people who create the material” (Berger, 1998, pg. 23). The value of employing textual analysis is that “media texts present a distinctive discursive moment between encoding and decoding that justifies special scholarly engagement” (Fürsich, 2009, pg. 238). Thus, textual analysis was developed as an alternative to the qua-
titative content analysis commonly used in analyzing media messages (Hall, 1975). Thick description is used to determine what those structures of meaning are and to digest their meaning (Geertz, 1973). Exactness is key in thick description (Geertz, 1973) because one has to understand structures and their meaning to understand a culture.

Textual analysis goes beyond the manifest content of messages, allowing researchers to discern “implicit patterns, assumptions and omissions of a text” (Fürsich, 2009, pg. 241). Text should be thought of as “an indeterminate field of meaning in which intentions and possible effects intersect. The task of the analysis is to bring out the whole range of possible meanings” (Larsen, 1991, pg. 122). Readings have preferred narratives and subjects (Lester-Roushanzamir & Raman, 1999). Researchers do agree that multiple readings are possible and that the author of a text might not have intended what the researcher found in his or her reading of the text (Lester-Roushanzamir & Raman, 1999). Texts were examined several times: Themes emerged during initial readings, and more readings were done to explore those themes (McKee, 2003). While coding themes and patterns, the researchers isolated something “(a) that happen[ed] a number of times and (b) that consistently happen[ed] in a specific way” (Miles & Huberman, 1984, pg. 215). The researchers discussed reoccurring themes together in the context of the literature and returned to the texts in order to glean thick description (Geertz, 1973) in regard to the proposed research questions. For increased validity, the researchers compared notes and discussed themes after analyzing one percent, 10 percent, 25 percent, 50 percent, and 100 percent of the sample.

FINDINGS

This analysis occurs on three levels: local, state, and national. The local paper, which began reporting the Zimmerman-Martin story February 29, focused on the February 26 shooting and the ensuing police investigation instead of social and political issues, and local-interest stories instead of national events. There was virtually no mention of race. Coverage in the six other Florida papers, which began between February 29 and March 24, was mixed between details of the case and larger social issues such as Florida’s Stand Your Ground law. There were few uses of racial descriptors. The three national papers, which started coverage between March 10 and March 17, focused on social and political issues such as Stand Your Ground, guns, and race, and referenced the Zimmerman-Martin shooting for context when discussing similar local incidents. Racial identifiers were used frequently, and Martin’s clothing was referenced as a covert racial identifier or as shorthand for the shooting and its aftermath.

Local

The Sanford Herald reported on the shooting three days after it occurred. The Sanford Herald is a bi-weekly paper, published on Wednesdays and Sundays. Herald Editor Rachel Delinski’s 213-word article, “Boy, 17, shot to death after ‘altercation’” was the first time the public heard the name Trayvon Martin. Zimmerman’s name was not even included in the article; he was identified only as a “25-year-old [sic] man” and “neighborhood watch member.” After the February 29 article first reporting the shooting, the Sanford Herald did not include any further news coverage until March 12. In that article, the Sanford Herald did not describe the altercation, rather reporting “a fight and a gunshot” and that police “found Trayvon dead.” The Sanford Police Department released the 911 calls 19 days after the shooting (March 16), and it was not until this time that the Sanford Herald reported more details of the incident. Other
callers had confirmed that they saw “men wrestling, and then heard a gunshot” (March 17). This report is the only reference in the *Sanford Herald* of the physical altercation that occurred between Zimmerman and Martin. At this time, Zimmerman had not yet been arrested for shooting Martin because Sanford Police Chief Bill Lee said there were no grounds to charge Zimmerman. On March 13, homicide detective Christopher Seriono recommended Zimmerman be charged with manslaughter; following, coverage was frequent. During the month of March, authorities released the 911 calls from the night of the shooting, the U.S. Justice Department and the FBI launched an investigation, President Barack Obama spoke publicly about the controversy, and the New Black Panther Party offered a reward for the “capture” of Zimmerman. However, the news coverage in the *Sanford Herald* included more local-interest stories. For example, Rev. Al Sharpton held a rally at a local church (March 26), residents questioned the police department’s investigation into the shooting (March 21), and the location of a memorial was debated (July 10). The *Herald* continued to cover the story, publishing 76 articles from Feb. 27 to Aug. 31, 2012.

Because the perpetrator (Zimmerman) and the victim (Martin) did not fit the “standard script” (Gilliam & Iyengar, 2000) in crime reporting, journalists had to construct a new frame to report this particular incident. The frame used by the *Herald* was to virtually erase race from its coverage, especially Zimmerman’s race. Neither Martin’s or Zimmerman’s race was mentioned in the initial article. Martin is identified as being a “boy,” “17,” and “of Miami” (February 29). The article described Zimmerman as a “25-year-old man in the subdivision,” and a “neighborhood watch member” (February 29). Several weeks later, Zimmerman’s race was reported as “white” (March 12). Zimmerman turned out to be 28-years-old and Hispanic. His correct age was reported in a March 21 news story; however, Zimmerman’s race was never reported again after the March 12 article, and the newspaper’s editor made no correction. Nineteen of the 74 *Sanford Herald* articles included Martin’s race. This newspaper mentioned race in approximately 26 percent of the articles covering the shooting. Of the news coverage containing racial identification, Martin is labeled as “black” and Zimmerman “white.” When the race of either Martin or Zimmerman is mentioned, it is usually at least three paragraphs into the news story, not in the lead or headline.

The Zimmerman-Martin case quickly garnered national media attention and became a hot topic of discussion. The *Sanford Herald* was the only newspaper that did not use the Zimmerman-Martin case to discuss social topics such as racial profiling and gun control legislation. The other newspapers, both statewide and national, included articles that made comparisons between Martin’s death and other black teenage homicides, questioned Florida’s Stand Your Ground law, and rallied for new gun legislation.

### State

The *Orlando Sentinel* ran a total of 290 articles during the sample time period. The first article ran February 29 with the headline, “Boy, 17, shot to death in Sanford during ‘altercation,’ police say.” The article identifies Martin as a “17-year-old boy” and a “Miami high-school student,” and Zimmerman as “a member of the Neighborhood Watch” although he is not named. The next article in the *Orlando Sentinel* was published March 8, “Dad: Arrest crime watch volunteer who killed my son.” Martin’s father asks the media for help in pursuing justice for his son. Zimmerman is named in this article and identified as “the captain of his crime watch group.” Coverage thereafter was frequent, much of it aimed at drawing attention to the case: “Tensions still simmer in Trayvon Martin shooting case” (March 17), “Shooter was ‘reacting to the color of his skin,’ mom tells TODAY Show” (March 19), “Celebrities, others turn to social media to call for justice” (March 20). As readers learn of the shooting, protests and rallies are held for “justice.” George Zimmerman surrendered to police June 3, and thereafter, news coverage is less frequent. The *Orlando Sentinel* reporters ask questions about the circumstances of Martin’s shooting...
and focus on Florida’s Stand Your Ground law. For example, in “Fort Lauderdale senator asks governor to speed up task force work” (March 27), a state official asked the governor to evaluate the Stand Your Ground law after Martin’s shooting. Throughout the news coverage in the Orlando Sentinel, “unarmed” was used to describe Martin and “Neighborhood Watch volunteer” to describe Zimmerman.

The Tampa Bay Times published 31 total articles, the first March 20 with the headline “The trouble with ‘Stand Your Ground,’” citing Martin’s shooting as a “dangerous consequence” of the law. Across the United States, the case sparked racial tensions. March 21, Times staff writer Michael Kruse wrote:

[Zimmerman] has been described by the many different news organizations covering the case in a variety of different ways: white, Hispanic, white and Hispanic. All true. The most recent assessment from the Associated Press? Police call him white. His family says he’s Hispanic. Again, not wrong.

The Tampa Bay Times reported on Sanford Police Chief Bill Lee (March 22), Rev. Al Sharpton’s interest in the case (March 27), protestors looking for “justice” (March 28), and the “racial divide” (April 16). Several of the news articles reported on race, racism, and racial profiling in the United States. Similar to the Sanford Herald, Martin is often described as an “unarmed teen” and Zimmerman as “the neighborhood watchman.”

The Tampa Bay Tribune published 32 articles total, beginning March 22 with the headline “Revisit ‘Stand Your Ground.’” Much of the coverage focused on Florida’s self-defense law. For example, headlines included “Keep guns, but change the law” (March 27) and “Floridians support ‘Stand Your Ground’ Law” (May 25). Most of the news coverage in the Tribune focused on the self-defense law while a few articles mention race and racial profiling. Rallies in St. Petersburg are reported (April 4) followed by a “Hoodie Night Service” in Tampa (April 7). Again, Martin is described as “unarmed” and Zimmerman as a “neighborhood watch volunteer.” Overall, the news coverage encouraged civil action: “keep guns but change the law.” Additionally, the hoodie becomes a symbol of justice in the media, as seen through celebrities, politicians, and supporters donning hoodies in support of the case.

The South Florida Sun-Sentinel ran 126 total articles, 15 of these in Spanish. The first article was published March 13: “Trayvon Martin shooting case goes to State Attorney’s Office today.” The majority of the news articles originally were published in its sister paper, the Orlando Sentinel. Many of the opinion articles in the Sun-Sentinel focused on race. For example, one headline read “Irresponsible rhetoric takes focus off crucial issues in Trayvon Martin case” (March 26). The March news coverage is steady—daily or every other day. April’s news coverage reports again on the known details of the shooting. An article by Rene Stutzman on April 2, “Trayvon Martin facts vs. rumors” detailed the “altercation” between Martin and Zimmerman. This newspaper identified Martin as “17-year-old” or “unarmed black teenager” but often did not include any identifiers. Zimmerman’s age often was included, but most often he was identified as a “Neighborhood Watch volunteer.” Several rallies were covered such as student marchers in Sanford (April 8, from the Orlando Sentinel) and a “peaceful march” that required little police presence (April 10, from the Baltimore Sun).

The Miami Herald published 256 articles total. The first article was published March 2: “Miami teen shot dead while visiting family in Central Florida.” The opening sentence reads:

A Miami teenager visiting family in Central Florida is coming home in a casket. Trayvon Martin, 17, was visiting family members in Sanford when he was shot to death by a man at a convenience store on Monday night. The teen walked into the store to buy ice cream and Skittles.
The newspaper uses similar phrasing again on March 8:

*Trayvon Martin traveled to Sanford on a trip with his father. The teen returned to his Miami home in a body bag. Martin, 17, was shot and killed Feb. 26 by a neighborhood crime watch captain. The circumstances of the shooting are still unknown, but George Zimmerman, the 28-year-old man who shot Martin, told police he shot in self-defense.*

On March 11, one news article reported Martin’s mother “thinks her son was killed because he was black.” Race and racial profiling then became part of this newspaper’s coverage. For example, March 13’s headline: “Unarmed teen’s killing in Sanford deserves answers.” However, “Florida’s controversial self-defense law” was quickly seen in headlines (March 19, 20, 22). An article published March 21 made comparisons among Stand Your Ground cases. Just as the other newspapers, the Miami Herald reported rallies for “justice” (March 21, 22) demanding answers in the shooting case. Much of the news coverage in the Miami Herald during March focused on protests and rallies in the local, urban area. After Zimmerman had surrendered to police, the news coverage turned to the self-defense law and racial profiling. Much of the news coverage identified Martin as a “Miami Gardens teenager” and Zimmerman as the “neighborhood watch captain.”

The Florida Times-Union published 13 articles total, the first March 24: “Corey’s appointment draws contrasting views; State’s attorney’s critics say the Cristian Fernandez case shows poor judgment.” While this article is not specifically about the Martin shooting, it does discuss the complexities of the Stand Your Ground law and self-defense. In discussing Florida’s Stand Your Ground Law, comparisons among incidents are made. A May 1 article reports on Marissa Alexander’s case and compares her to Zimmerman. An editor acknowledged in an April 1 headline that the “Trayvon Martin case is not so simple” and referred to racial profiling and Florida’s self-defense law. All of the news coverage in April and May examined the Stand Your Ground Law. The Florida Times-Union identified Martin as an “unarmed teenager” and Zimmerman as a “neighborhood watch captain.”

The National

The New York Times initially reported on the shooting March 17 with both a news story and an op-ed column. Much of the early opinion/editorial used accusatory language such as the following headlines: “Shoot first, claim self-defense later,” “Guns, race and a killing in Florida,” and “Florida’s disastrous self-defense law.” Journalists wrote that laws such as “Stand Your Ground” made “it easy for shooters who kill to claim self-defense” and referred to “the gated community mentality” as if to explain Zimmerman’s motives. News coverage followed steadily, reporting scrutiny of the Florida self-defense law (March 21), investigation details (March 22), “hashtag activism” (March 26), the “gunman’s account” (March 27), and profits of the manufacturer of Skittles (March 29). News in the months that followed reported investigation findings, police missteps, and other similar cases across the country. Many of the articles in the summer months referenced the case but were not directly related to it. For example, on June 15, David W. Chen wrote about New York mayoral candidate Christine C. Quinn campaigning in a hoodie “to express her concern” about the shooting.

Coverage in The New York Times, as well as The Los Angeles Times and Denver Post, used the shooting as a platform for political and social debate. News coverage included Stand Your Ground law discussion. For example, a March 30 article in the Denver Post discussed the law by using the shooting
Flipping the Script

as a reference for debate. Stand Your Ground also is questioned in one of the first Los Angeles Times articles about the shooting (March 19). The law is mentioned in approximately half of the news articles from The New York Times. Much of the news coverage in The New York Times was reported in terms of social issues. Topics such as lobbyists (March 26), polarizing media coverage (April 2), racism (April 10), Emmett Till (April 14), the Second Amendment (April 17), racial profiling (May 1), neighborhood watch programs (June 23), gun control and Stand Your Ground laws (July 10), and conceal and carry permits (July 26) were included in the Times’ reporting.

From the first March 17 article, The New York Times included race: “the teenager, who was black” and “neighborhood crime watch volunteer…is white and Hispanic.” Both Martin’s and Zimmerman’s races are again mentioned March 22, with Martin described as a “young black man” and Zimmerman as “white and Hispanic.” Martin also is described as “African American” in some news stories. Zimmerman is labeled “Hispanic” (April 26) and then “white Hispanic” (May 1). Martin’s race is more frequently reported than Zimmerman’s race in The New York Times. For example, of the 254 articles collected, 71 mentioned race (approximately 28 percent). Martin’s race was mentioned in 71 articles, compared to 30 articles that mentioned Zimmerman’s race. The Times included “race” in headlines. The New York Times, as well as the Los Angeles Times, commonly used the term “hoodie” when describing Martin or as a symbol for the shooting and its social implications. For example, the term “hoodie” is used metaphorically in a May 14 New York Times article: “Trayvon’s hoodie is a reminder that neither Wall Street or Silicon Valley are terribly representative of our country.” The rhetoric of Martin’s “hoodie” focused on political issues such as racism and gun control. The “hoodie” was reported to be a symbol of empathy for Martin’s family. For example, a mayoral candidate “donned a hoodie to express her concern about the killing of teenager, Trayvon Martin” (June 15, The New York Times). Vigils were reported from New York to Los Angeles with supporters wearing hoodies “in memory of Trayvon Martin” (March 29, Los Angeles Times).

The Los Angeles Times first published an opinion column on Florida’s Stand Your Ground law (March 10), followed by commentary (March 23) and another opinion column (March 26). Both were about race and its importance in the Zimmerman-Martin case. This newspaper did not publish any wire content; all of the stories were original to the Los Angeles Times. The first news ran March 16. Much of the news reported on the case and its impact on political discourse, local rallies, protests in support of “justice,” town hall meetings, and similar cases in other states. As newsworthy events slowed during the summer months, the Los Angeles Times kept Martin’s case in the headlines. The Los Angeles Times first reported the incident March 16, and the article did not include the race of either Martin or Zimmerman. Martin’s race is first mentioned March 25, and Zimmerman’s race is not reported until April 26. He is then labeled as Hispanic. A May 3 news article confirms Zimmerman’s identity: “Mr. Zimmerman’s mother is from Peru and he identifies himself as Hispanic. Mr. Martin was black.” However, the Los Angeles Times later used labels such as “white and Latino” (June 4) and “half-white, half-Hispanic” (July 12) to identify Zimmerman. The majority of news articles from the Los Angeles Times contain reference to race—43 of the 64 articles sampled (67 percent). Martin’s race was reported much more frequently than Zimmerman’s race. For instance, 43 articles labeled Martin as either “black” or “African American,” while Zimmerman’s race was reported four times. It was common for race to be in the lead paragraphs, or at least in the first half of the news article.

The Denver Post initially reported the story using content from wire services and continued to do so as new information became available. The original news coverage in the Denver Post called for “justice” only days after the newspaper first reported on the case. Similarly, opinion pieces on March 29, and
April 4, 6, 8, 18, and 22 used words such as “hoodies,” “young minority men are under siege,” “racial politics,” and “Did hate kill Trayvon Martin?” in headlines, framing Martin as a victim of racial bias and Zimmerman as the guilty perpetrator. This newspaper’s coverage of the case (and related issues) ebbed after April. The Denver Post first published an Associated Press article March 13. This article did not mention race. On March 17, the Post reported Martin’s race as “black” and Zimmerman’s race as “white.” Here, Martin also was described as a “teenager” and Zimmerman a “neighborhood watch volunteer.” Zimmerman’s race was correctly identified later as being “Hispanic” (March 22). Ten of the 35 articles mentioned race (approximately 29 percent); Martin’s race was included in 10 of the articles while Zimmerman’s race was included in five. Race rarely was included in the lead of these articles. The Denver Post’s March 25 article was the first in this newspaper to use the shooting as foundation for debating racial profiling. Subtle racial overtones in news headlines were seen in this paper: “Solidarity over shooting” (March 22), and “Rally for respect” (March 26). This newspaper readily discussed the issue of race in accordance with the shooting and other similar incidents in the state of Colorado.

DISCUSSION

Crime is one of the most prevalent issues in the media. Most Americans receive their news about crime and violence from the media and follow such news closely (Pew Research Center, 2011). The media, therefore, can influence the public’s perceptions of and opinions about crime (Dorfman et al., 2005; Entman, 1993; Fiske & Taylor, 1991; Iyengar, 1991). The Zimmerman-Martin story was framed in terms of ethnic conflict, especially at the national level, and the inconsistent use of racial descriptors might have influenced readers to think of the story entirely in terms of race.

The race of both the victim and the shooter became part of the narrative. It was common for Martin’s race to be reported but Zimmerman’s race not to be reported. Newspapers first reported Zimmerman’s race as “white.” However, Zimmerman’s race changed during the news cycle. Some news stories called Zimmerman “white,” while others identified him as “half-white, half-Hispanic”; finally, news stories confirmed that he is “Hispanic” after learning his mother is Peruvian. Zimmerman’s race not only changed in the news coverage, but it also sometimes disappeared. In contrast, Martin’s race was more often reported than not and was reported even if Zimmerman’s race was not. When race was reported, Martin’s race always was included, but not so for Zimmerman’s race. Martin was usually identified as “black” but also as “African American.”

Framing theorists have argued that the way a story is framed is very important to the audience’s opinion of the issue (Dorfman et al., 2005; Entman, 1993; Fiske & Taylor, 1991; Iyengar, 1991). The local Sanford Herald focused on the shooting and its aftermath, paying little attention to race or to larger social issues. At the statewide level, coverage was mixed between details of the case and social and political issues. Race became a factor in the discussion, yet there were still few uses of racial descriptors. Once the story hit the national press, however, race typically was mentioned, and coverage switched from the crime itself to larger discussions about race, Stand Your Ground laws, and gun control. Why did Trayvon Martin and George Zimmerman stay in newspaper headlines months after the shooting occurred? As time moved away from the shooting, the news frames changed to focus on the aftermath of the incident and what might have been done to prevent it from ever happening. Salient news values were dependent on the framing of the story.
In the state and especially in the national press, the Zimmerman-Martin story lost its human center. Martin and Zimmerman were used to discuss a variety of larger topics; the shooting was used to illustrate social ills with little or no reporting on the actual case. Iyengar (1991) suggests that the news media report stories without context, while Dorfman et al. (2005) argue that episodic frames provide audiences with little insight into the larger social and political circumstances contributing to the particular problem. Here, journalists, at least on the national level, focused on larger social and political circumstances but lost touch with the core story they were covering. Both Martin and Zimmerman were used as exemplars, or representative types, in the national press. Such depictions are ethically problematic because Martin and Zimmerman were treated as having conditional worth.

German philosopher Immanuel Kant argued that every rational being is an end in himself, and, therefore, should be treated by others as ends instead of mere means (Kant, 1970). Treating a person as an end is treating that person with the respect he or she deserves; treating a person as a means is treating that person in such a way that he or she helps you attain one of your goals (Shafer-Landau, 2012). As rational beings worthy of respect, a human only should be treated as an end (Shafer-Landau, 2012; Cahn, 2009). Humans have unconditional worth; we are autonomous beings, and autonomy gives us a dignity and worth beyond all price, thus justifying our special moral status (Shafer-Landau, 2012; Olen & Barry, 2002).

When Kant’s second categorical imperative is applied to the Zimmerman-Martin coverage, the national and state press is found lacking. Treating a person, or any rational being, as an end is treating that person with the respect he or she deserves (Shafer-Landau, 2012). Neither Martin nor Zimmerman was treated as an end by the newspapers studied. Both were treated as a mere means to help journalists attain their goals—whether those goals were discussing Stand Your Ground laws, the need for gun control legislation, race relations and issues, or political and cultural protest. Kant argued that the morality of an action should be based on one’s duty. The duty of a reporter is to provide a truthful, comprehensive, and intelligent account of the day’s events in a context that gives them meaning (The Commission on Freedom of the Press, 1947). The duty of a columnist is to bring a perspective or opinion to the writing while presenting and clarifying the goals and values of the society (The Commission on Freedom of the Press, 1947). An overriding duty of all journalists, because we are humans before we are journalists, is to respect the humanity in others. This duty was lacking in the Zimmerman-Martin coverage.

CONCLUSION

Major American cities have dozens, if not hundreds, of shootings each year. The Zimmerman-Martin case most likely was of interest to a national audience (and, to a lesser extent, a statewide audience) only because of the broader social context. Giving context to a story, especially to illuminate larger social issues, is one of the goals of good journalism. The researchers do not suggest that the only ethical treatment that would satisfy the demands of both Kant and the demands of good journalism would be to ignore the story outside of the Sanford, Florida, coverage area. Journalists frequently use exemplars to present a story or personify an issue (Brosius, 2003). Martin and Zimmerman, like all people, can be used as examples or serve as representative types. However, both also need to be treated as unique, individual humans, not simply as representative stand-ins for all of humanity. This necessary treatment would conform to Kant’s formula of humanity.
However, such treatment is exactly the opposite of how both Martin and Zimmerman were treated by the national media. Both Martin and Zimmerman were treated as having conditional worth; their stories—or, more precisely, a small sliver of their life stories—often were told only when they could be used to discuss a larger social issue that only had a tenuous relationship with the heart of their shared experience. George Zimmerman was acquitted of second-degree murder and manslaughter on July 13, 2013. He since has had several run-ins with the law and has been a mainstay in the news. Trayvon Martin, sadly, has largely left the news cycle because his life story ended on Feb. 26, 2012.

REFERENCES


**Flipping the Script**


Kant, I. (1970). On the common saying: ‘This may be true in theory, but it does not apply in practice. In H. Reiss (Ed.), Kant’s political writings. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.


**ADDITIONAL READING**


**KEY TERMS AND DEFINITIONS**

**Episodic Framing:** An event-oriented report that depicts public issues in terms of concrete instances without context such as the social and political circumstances contributing to a particular problem. Such framing leads audiences to focus on an individual for the problem and its solution.

**Exemplars:** Representative types used to present a story or personify an issue.

**News Values:** Culturally specific characteristics of an event—such as newsworthiness, novelty, timeliness, and localization—that help determine its salience as a potential news story.

**Newsworthiness:** The degree of relevance to newspaper audiences.

**Principle of Humanity:** German philosopher Immanuel Kant’s argument that every person should be treated with the respect he or she deserves instead of treating a person in such a way that he or she helps you attain one of your goals.

**Stand Your Ground Law:** Florida law that allows a person to use lethal force to protect and defend himself or herself, with no duty to retreat, against a real or perceived threat of serious bodily harm or death.

**Thematic News Frames:** Reporting that offers context such as background, social determinants, and consequences, and is directed at general outcomes and conditions. Such framing cultivates a shared sense of responsibility in audiences and encourages action.