A Survey of Recent Mariology (1996)

Eamon R. Carroll
A SURVEY OF RECENT MARIOLOGY (1996)

Eamon R. Carroll, O.Carm. *

The three introductory items this year come from Italy, England and the United States. The first reflects the recent surge of interest in the place of Mary at the Second Vatican Council. Leading conciliar figures are gradually passing on; on May 6, 1996, Cardinal Suenens of Belgium died at ninety-one. Recalled as a major architect of twentieth-century Roman Catholicism, he was a strong advocate of ecumenism and of Marian doctrine and devotion (e.g., in the Legion of Mary). The third section of the eighth chapter of Lumen gentium (no. 65), which relates the Blessed Virgin’s spiritual motherhood to the apostolic mission of the Church, has been called the “Suenens amendment” (the Australasian Catholic Record [72 (July, 1995), 316-26] had an article by Sister Marie T. Farrell, R.S.M., “The ‘Suenens’ Amendment of Lumen Gentium”).

The first entry, then, comes from the first 1995 number of Marianum (whole number 147). In a book-length article (p. 17-238), Ermanno M. Toniolo, O.S.M., writes of “the contribution of the Servites to chapter eight of Lumen gentium,” using a treasure-trove of Servite documents and setting forth with marvelous openness the reservations of G. Roschini and his colleagues as the conciliar consideration developed, as well as the admirable way in which the Servite leadership accepted and implemented the Council’s imperatives.

A second introductory item comes from England, a pamphlet co-published in 1995 by the Methodist Publishing House and the Catholic Truth Society: Mary, Mother of the Lord: Sign

*Father Eamon R. Carroll, O.Carm., is a professor emeritus of theology at Loyola University (Chicago) and also a member of the faculty of the International Marian Research Institute of the University of Dayton. His address is 1036 W. Loyola Avenue, Apt. 3-E, Chicago, IL 60626-5233.
of Grace, Faith and Holiness—Towards a Shared Understanding. It was written by Fr. Michael Evans at the request of the British Methodist-Roman Catholic Committee. The foreword is signed by the Rev. Richard Jones (Methodist) and Bishop Leo McCartie (Catholic). Along with a splendid color cover reproducing the stained-glass window of the Annunciation from Taize, this slim publication—well-done, clear and concise—contains points for group discussion.

The third opening title is The Thousand Faces of the Virgin Mary (Liturgical Press, Collegeville, MN, 1996), by George H. Tavard, A.A., peritus at Vatican II, long-time Catholic member of many ecumenical dialogues, national and international. The work is the fruit of his courses on “Mary in ecumenical perspective,” and the five parts reflect Tavard’s long experience in the ecumenical and interreligious dialogue (e.g., part five is “Insights from World Religions”). The previous four parts also start with the word “Insights”—”from the Scriptures,” “from the Tradition,” “from the Reformation,” and “from Our Times.”

Many familiar Tavardian themes recur in this valuable book, which is more a collection of relevant essays than a thoroughgoing treatment of Mariology. In part two (“Insights from the Tradition”), three chapters take up 1) the conciliar period, 2) Mary in the East, then 3) Mary in the West; these range across icons, the rosary, poetry, liturgy, hymnody—all areas to which the author has given attention in many other writings. Fr. Tavard is a man of strong views, always clearly stated, even if the reader may disagree. For example, he finds the papal proclamation of “Mary, Mother of the Church” an instance of Marian maximalism and a disservice to Christian unity. He has little patience for Marian shrines (“the vested interest of travel agencies”), including Guadalupe (“no historical evidence whatsoever”). As in his other writings, he protests as well the conspiratorial reading of the Bible—as if the New Testament authors deliberately concealed the female dimension of God (p. 222)—and he likewise regards, as an abuse of language, the failure to distinguish between “female” and “feminine.” Grammatical gender is altogether distinct from sexual gender (p. 224). (The June, 1996, Theological Studies has the review by Sister Agnes Cunningham, S.S.C.M., of Marc B. Alexander’s Church and Ministry in
the Works of G. H. Tavard [Leuven, 1994]. The reviewer notes as Tavard’s charism the science of language, and his concern with “the semantic structure of theology.”


1. Periodicals and proceedings

The four issues of Ephemerides Mariologicae for 1995 (vol. XLV) have as theme of the year, “Mary, symbols and myths.” The first number (January–March) dealt with Christian origins; number two (April–June) developed “Mary, symbols and myths: universal symbolic evocation”; and the July–September issue continued with “Symbol, myth, and people.” According to custom, the fourth number (October–December) was given over to chronicles and reviews. Contents of the three earlier issues fall under these categories: studies, notes, texts, and liturgy.

The first 1995 number had four biblical articles: Xabier Pikaza Ibarondo (Mary, from history to symbol in the New Testament); Gonzalo Aranda Perez (Mary in the Gospels: myth, symbol or reality?); Bruce Malina, an American (Mary, Mediterranean maid and mother [original English version, entitled “Mother and Son,” appeared in Biblical Theology Bulletin 20 (1993), 54–63]); and Mercedes Navarro Puerto (the paradox of Mary, Virgin-Mother). Under liturgia, Lino Emilio Diez Valdades wrote of Mary’s virginal motherhood in the First Eucharistic Preface of the Blessed Virgin Mary—an analysis, with notes on its origins. E. Mazza wrote on the same preface in a recent Marianum (see below). This preface is still in the current Sacramentary, although the English translation is pallid.

Among items in the April–June number were articles by Ildefonso Murillo (the way of beauty in Mariology), a nota by Cristobal Sarrias on Mary in literature and cinema, a texto by Francisco Contreras Molina on Mary in current poetry, and, under liturgia, Gaspar Calvo Moralejo on Mary, star of evangelization. Under that title, Paul VI invoked Our Lady in Evangelii nuntiandi (December 8, 1975); it became the guiding light and
Survey of Recent Mariology (1996)

motto of the International Mariological/Marian Congress of Huelva, Spain, September, 1992, commemorating the evangelization of the New World. The cinematic essay includes references to Robert Graves, Nikos Kazantzakis, and, especially, the late Swiss, Jean-Luc Godard.

For the July-September issue, one of the two articles was on Marian apparitions and the collective unconsciousness (by Antonio Vazquez Fernandez, dependent on Carl Jung). One of the three notas was by Maria Teresa Porcile Santiso on Our Lady of Guadalupe. The final 1995 issue gives reports on three congresses: 1) Loreto, March 22-25, 1995 (by Nicanor Peña); 2) Medellin, Colombia, May 5-6,1995 (by Robert Tisnes Jimenez); and 3) the fifty-second meeting of the French Mariological Society, at Josselin, August 28-31,1995 (by Bernard Billet, O.S.B.). Mercedes Navarro Puerto reviews at length recent feminist writings on Mary, taking as title one such book: Desperately Seeking Mary, by Els Maeckelberghe (Kampen, The Netherlands, 2d ed., 1994; 1st ed., 1991). She mentions also Catherina Halkes, Rosemary Radford Ruether, Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, Marina Warner, Elizabeth Ann Johnson, (the Brazilians) Ivone Gebara and Maria Clara Bingemer, and a few others. There are reviews of eleven Marian titles, including volume 45 (1994) of Marian Studies. Other titles are a 1993 German dissertation on the way in which ecclesial and conciliar perspectives cast a new light on Mary as mediator (by Ins Eggeemann), and the recent BAC volume by José García Paredes, Mariologia (1995, 418 p.).

Both 1995 numbers of Theotokos, journal of the Italian Mariological Society (Associazione Mariologica Interdisciplinare Italiana,AMI), have appeared, to a total of 662 pages. The first 1995 issue was on "the Mother of Emmanuel." The editorial of Alberto Valenti, S.M.M., on the infancy gospels led into seven articles about Matthew's account, followed by a nota on medieval iconography and two rassegne—one by S. M. Perella on recent congresses and symposia, the other a short bibliography on the virginal conception by Angelo Amato. The seven studi explore Matthew's nativity narrative from many angles: exegetical, patristic, anthropological, liturgical, catechetical. Mauro Orsatti directs attention to the complicated genealogy.
E. Toniolo presents some patristic reflections; he traces the Matthaean pericope through the ancient creeds, then the evangelist's interpretation of Isaiah 7:14. His patristic evidence begins with Ignatius. Following the emphasis on the faith of Joseph in *Redemptoris custos* (August 15, 1989)—as on Mary's faith in *Redemptoris mater* and earlier in *Lumen gentium*—Toniolo describes Joseph as (a) predestined to the mystery ("betrothed to Joseph"); (b) in the presence of the mystery ("found to be with child through the Holy Spirit"); and (c) introduced to the mystery (he had not had intercourse with her, when she gave birth to a son). On Joseph's reaction to his wife's pregnancy, Toniolo surveys patristic comment from the *Protoevangelium Jacobi*, through Ephrem, James of Sarug and Romanos the Singer (both influenced by Ephrem in the same *sirio-occidentale ambiente*, and Basil of Caesarea's spiritual exegesis.

On the virginal conception, A. Amato describes three approaches: perplexity, denial, acceptance. Giulia Di Nicola presents the anthropological aspects of Mary's virginal motherhood. Her paper is filled with insights—so often women have been subjected to near slavery. The Bible shows woman's dignity (as in Genesis), and the Savior restores the bowed-over woman to full stature (Lk. 13:10 ff.). With insights from Simone Weil and St. Louis de Montfort, she writes of Mary's free service and servanthood, through which the harmony of heaven and earth has been restored and without which people remain subhuman. Weil cited the Vulgate of Sirach 1:14-19: "in gremio matris resident savientia patris." Stefano Rosso charts the incidence of Matthew 1:1-25, in the current liturgy. Cesare Bissoli offers catechetical recommendations, especially on the sensitive topic of virginity. Mario Masini writes of *lectio divina*, incorporating St. Bernard, G. M. Hopkins and P. Claudel.

The second 1995 *Theotokos* contained papers from the Loreto Congress (March 22-25, 1995), on "Mary in the mystery of the Incarnate Word." It starts with a *prolusione* by Cardinal Ratzinger, and has seventeen *studi*. Loreto itself looms large in the volume (e.g., the papal letter for the 7th centenary). U. Vanni considers the Incarnation in the Johannine corpus; J. Dupont studies the Annunciation. A. Serra's long article is on
"Joseph and Mary, man and woman of the new times," more precisely, in the new covenant inaugurated by Christ. Serra begins with the numerical significance of the "fourteens" in the Matthaean genealogy. A short paper by the Australian Jesuit Gerald O'Collins is on the psychology of Jesus, his human balance nurtured at Nazareth. The Don Bosco Salesian Angelo Amato writes on a subject to which he has been devoting increasing attention: Incarnation and inculturation, especially its "marian factor"—reflecting on the North-American Reinhold Niebuhr and the African Justin S. Ukpong.

The Lutheran Heinrich Ott, of the University of Basel, reviews the concept of *Theotokos* in the early Church and suggests a positive contemporary re-evaluation. Balancing Ott is "A Catholic Perspective on Mary in the Incarnation," by the Polish conventual S. C. Napiorkowski. R. Cantalamessa spoke of *Theotokos* at Ephesus and Chalcedon. Archimandrite G. Gharib's paper was on the Incarnation in Eastern icons. The Franciscan H.-M. Stamm examined Mary's incarnational role in selected medieval authors, including Scotus. F. M. Lethel, of the Teresianum, considers St. Louis Montfort and Bérulle. There is a reference to the same author's study comparing Montfort and St. Therese.

S. De Flores writes of Mary and the Incarnation in contemporary theology. I. M. Calabuig explores selected psalter collects from the fifth and sixth centuries: the category is *oratio super psalmum*, of which the purpose was to bridge the gap between the original psalm setting and the Christians who prayed them. Psalms considered are 2, 17(18), 18b(19), 18(19), 21(22), 22(23), 59(60), 73(74), 84(85), 95(96), 109(110). A. Triacca looks in on the Marian liturgical theology of the Incarnation, following through on his earlier article in *Theotokos* 2 (1994), 73–96. Mercedes Navarro Puerto of Salamanca offers an anthropological perspective on Paul's paradoxical "born of a woman." The Carmelite Bruno Secondin's article is "spirituality of the Incarnation."

The 146th issue of the *Marianum* contains the two issues for 1994. The editorial by Calabuig ("Mariology at the service of glory and of life") is followed by four articles, four miscellanea entries, and some 150 pages of documents, including
Survey of Recent Mariology (1996)


The first article is by José M. Canal on the “Latin version A ‘James’ of the Protogospel of James,” picking up where he left off in Ephemerides Mariologicae (1968). “James” is the Arundel Manuscript, named for the great scholar M. R. James (d. 1927) (see the entry on him in the New Catholic Encyclopedia). Canal provides an introduction, bibliography, and corrected and completed Latin text. The second article is on the contribution of Juan Alfaro, S.J., (d. August 5, 1993), long-time professor at the Gregorian University, Rome, by José María de Miguel González, O.Ss.T., including a two-page list of Alfaro’s writings in the field. The three stages in his thought were: 1) historical-theological studies on the Immaculate Conception, 2) Mary’s cooperation in salvation, and 3) interpretation of Vatican II Mariology.

The long third article is by Salvatore M. Perella, O.S.M., on virginitas in partu in contemporary theology (1962 to 1994), subtitled: “magistero—esegesi—teologia.” Titles of its main sections indicate the scope of the report: 1) before and after the Council, 2) current magisterial statements, 3) contemporary debate, 4) conclusion. Of recent official statements touching Mary’s virginity, most significant is the papal address of May 24, 1992, at Capua (16th-centenary occasion), to be found also in this issue of Marianum. Perella’s references to the American Bishops’ pastoral, “Behold Your Mother: Woman of Faith,” left me in doubt if he grasped clearly that ordinary American usage of the phrase “virgin birth” prescinds from the further modality of in partu.
Survey of Recent Mariology (1996)

The fourth article is by Sergio Gaspari, S.M.M., on "Mary, Mother and Model of Consecrated Life," the topic of the ninth ordinary assembly of the synod of bishops. Among items in the remainder of the issue, E. Toniolo gives extracts on Our Lady from the New Catechism; Mario Masini reviews two new books on the Rosary, alluding to a letter of April 4, 1987, for the Marian Year—from the Congregation for Divine Worship—suggesting other mysteries and, also, variants for the second part of the Hail Mary. R. Barile (Il Rosario: Salterio della Vergine, Bologna, 1990, 368 p.) argues strongly for calling the Rosary "Our Lady's Psalter," a link found in both Paul VI (Marialis cultus) and in John Paul II. Two of the Chronica entries are: 1) program of the tenth international Mariological symposium, Rome, October 4–7, 1994, on "The theological image of Mary today: faith and culture," with S. De Fiores' concluding address; 2) the conferral of the Pro Ancilla Domini—René Laurentin Award to Paolo Melada, O.F.M., October 7, 1994, with Laurentin's homage to the recipient.

The first 1995 fascicle of Marianum, whole number 147, was mentioned at the start of this Survey for its article by E. Toniolo on the Servite contribution on Our Lady to the Second Vatican Council. Calabuig offers a tribute to G. Besutti (d. December 23, 1994): "A life of service to Holy Mary and to the book," describing the accomplishments of this talented and dedicated Servite: bibliographer, librarian, teacher, publicist, member of the Marianum faculty. S. M. Daniell supplies a Besutti bibliography (p. 439–91). In the articles Simon C. Mimouni writes (in French), on the ancient and recent debate on the appearances of the Risen Christ; he questions the identity of "the other Mary." Enrico Mazza traces the ancient preface of the Blessed Virgin (still in current use) back to the eighth century (see reference above for a similar article in Ephemerides Mariologicae). Rosa Cali has an article on Assumption homilies of Andrew of Crete.

A special section is devoted to the seventh centenary of Loreto (1294–1994), with the papal letter, discussion of the Loreto tradition, and G. Santarelli's review of the investigations of the last three decades, many of them in his own studies and publications. There is one English-language article: Robert F.
Fleissner, "Virgin to Virgin: Did Shakespeare Really Shift from One Cult to Another?" The ever-recurring question of whether Shakespeare was a Catholic, albeit a crypto-Catholic, has been raised recently again (e.g., in the London Tablet, April 27, 1996, by Eamon Duffy: "Was Shakespeare a Papist?").

*Miles Immaculatae* is well described by its sub-title: "twice-yearly journal of Marian culture and formation according to St. Maximilian Kolbe." The July-December, 1994, number (anno xxx, fasc. 2) divides its material in customary fashion: editorial, documents, Marian doctrine, Marian life, Kolbian studies, reviews. The Polish conventual Celestino S. Napierkowski reports on the congress held in Poland September 19-25, 1994, on "Fr. Kolbe and the new evangelization, a century after his birth." There is a selection of papal documents. Two articles make up *dottrina mariana*: Luigi Perono on "the woman clothed with the sun," and Z. Kijas on Mary in Byzantine liturgy. Rosella Bignami's "Mary and consecrated life" is the first under the heading "Marian life"; a second is by Faustino Ossanna on the Angelus, the prayer recommended so warmly by Paul VI in *Marialis cultus*. G. Simbula continues his spiritual profile of St. Maximilian for the period July 16, 1936, to September 19, 1939, under the heading "Father and formation director of the friars." Jean-François de Louvencourt has the second part of his study on the prayer of the saint. The fifteen book reviews include four done in English by MSA-member Arthur B. Calkins: 1) A. Feuillet's book on the Messiah and his Mother in Matthew and Luke; J. Saward's *Redeemer in the Womb*; 3) E. Piacentini's 1994 short study on the infallibility of causes for canonization, which the author regards as indeed infallible exercises of papal magisterium (it would be instructive to hear from others on this issue); and 4) also from Piacentini, a brief book on the Immaculate Conception as the first principle of Mariology, pursuing insights of St. Maximilian.

Both 1995 issues of *Miles Immaculatae* have reached me. From the January-June issue, the *doctrina mariana* category has studies by L. Iammarrone on "the primacy of Christ and the Immaculate Conception in Scotus and Kolbe," and by L. Facenda, "The Saint's contribution to the intellectual ministry of the Franciscan Order." For *vita mariana*, F. Ossanna relates St.
Anthony of Padua to Kolbe, and Luigi Peroni has a short article on the name of Mary. G. Simbula's contribution to “Kolbian Studies” considers him as “mystic and martyr,” in the period December 19, 1939, to August 14, 1941. Fr. de Louvencourt has the third part of his study on the prayer of the saint, including chapters on the Rosary and the Eucharist. The twenty-one book reviews include a number of Polish titles (reviews in Italian), and again a handful reviewed by A. B. Calkins, covering such subjects as La Salette, Montfort and the new edition of Cardinal Philippe's (d. 1984) book, *The Virgin Mary and the Priesthood* (Alba, Staten Island, NY, 1993).

The July–December, 1995, *Miles Immaculatae* (anno xxxi), along with several entries of Kolbian emphasis, has two long English articles: one by Timothy Gray (Steubenville University), “God's Word and Mary's Royal Office,” incorporating insights from the as-yet-unpublished Catholic University doctorate of George E. Kirwin, O.M.I. (of our MSA). Gray's emphasis is biblical; were he to have extended his investigation into the Fathers, there is a rich vein of their interpretation of such psalms as 44(45). The other article is by Arthur B. Calkins (who also does several book reviews): “The Alliance of the Two Hearts and Consecration.” The phrase “the two hearts” comes from John Paul II (1985). Calkins' essay explores its development at the international theological symposium held at Fatima on “the alliance of the hearts of Jesus and Mary” (September 14–19, 1986), with Cardinal Sin of Manila presiding. There have since been follow-up meetings—one in Manila, another in Rome (May 23–25, 1995)—reported in the book *Alliance of the Two Hearts: The Core of Our Faith* (advertised as available from The Two Hearts Media Organization, P. O. Box 1756, Hawaiian Gardens, CA 90716). A. Calkins explains the theology of the Alliance, using writings of Cardinal Peter Paul Philippe (d. 1984), St. John Eudes (d. 1680), and John Paul II. He discusses also the meaning of consecration to the two hearts, answering current objections to “consecration to Mary and/or to Mary’s heart”—problems posed by René Laurentin among others, on the grounds that consecration strictly speaking can only be made to God alone.

The fifty-second session of the French Mariological Society was held at Josselin, August 28–31, 1995. The 233-page *Études*
Survey of Recent Mariology (1996)

**mariales (The Faith of Mary Mother of the Redeemer, vol. 2)** has ten papers. The new president, Sulpician Jean Longère, succeeded Charles Molette, who held the post for twenty years. The first paper is by René Laurentin on “Mary’s faith under test,” symbolically at the Presentation (Lk. 2:35) and finally on Calvary. Laurentin shows his habitual command of biblical material and an equally customary disagreement with partisans of other approaches (e.g., Raymond E. Brown). With an abundance of quotations, Georges Folliet traces the “faith of Mary in Fathers of East and West.” He considers the hesitations of authors like Origen and John Chrysostom, then the unmitigated praise of Ambrose, Augustine and Leo the Great. He carries his survey into Romanos the Singer, Venantius Fortunatus, Sophronius, Germain, Theoteknos, John of Damascus, as far as Bede, Ambrose of Autpert and Haymon of Auxerre. One theme is that the obedient Mary conceived the Word made flesh *per aurem*, in contrast to the deceived Eve—as in Venantius’ “Quem terra, pondus, aethera” (for February 2), also in Ildefonse of Toledo. Another comparison is that Mary is the “writing table of the Lord”—as the sense of her acceptance as handmaid of the Lord, in Titus of Bostra and others, also with reference to Psalm 44(45): “Audi filia et vide et incline aurem tuam.” He summarizes at the end of his article—from initial gropings up to Ambrose and Augustine, with the subsequent flowering about Mary’s obedient faith, concluding with several soaring passages from Maximus of Turin.

Monique Duchet-Suchaux looked at St. Bernard on Mary’s faith, his homilies on the Annunciation, Visitation, Nativity, Purification. In addition she considered themes he developed, as the “aqueduct” and “Mary at the cross.” The Sulpician Pierre Dupuy analyzed the “silence of Mary” in Bérulle: in two stages—silence of listening and silence of transformation. Brigitte Waché took up the influence of Mary’s faith on the origins of the Congregation of Our Lady of Sion, and the role of the brothers Ratisborne, Theodore and Alphonse. There are two short doctrinal essays: “The virginal faith of Mary” by Philippe Jobert, Benedictine of Solesmes, and “The total presence of Mary to sacred history” by Alain Gouhier.

The final paper runs nearly seventy pages, with the promise of a continuation next year: “Mary’s faith in present-day theol-
ogy," by Johann Roten. He sets the stage with some opening "benchmarks" and considers the faith of Mary under three categories: pedagogic, liturgical and doctrinal, incorporating insights of Lumen gentium, Marialis cultus, and Redemptoris mater. The examination of current theology is up to 1987, across a wide range in major Western languages. In addition, this latest Études mariales has two articles on iconography, with black and white illustrations, by Yves-François Riou and by Gaston Duchet-Suchaux (medieval and late-medieval, as Books of Hours).

2. Magisterial documents

First place goes to the addresses the Holy Father gave on his visit to the United States, October, 1995. In his strong defense of life, and on other occasions in New York, New Jersey and Maryland, he referred frequently to Our Lady and her role (e.g., at Central Park, New York City, October 7, Feast of the Holy Rosary; at the Angelus in Baltimore’s Oriole Park, October 8). Origins 25 (October 19, 1995: no.18) carried all his addresses; The Pope Speaks 41 (1996/1) offered a selection.

The pope devoted his Wednesday catechetical instructions to Our Lady in the fall of 1995. Some have appeared in English, as "Mary was united to Jesus on the Cross" (October 25) and "The Church grows in the understanding of Mary’s role" (November 15); both were in Catholic Dossier, 2 May–June, 1996. Many of these papal talks appear in the weekly English L’Osservatore Romano, and they are listed in the "log" of The Pope Speaks. The apostolic exhortation Vita consecrata (March 25, 1996) proposes Mary as model. The April 20, 1996, London Tablet has comments by Teresa Clements, president of the conference of religious. John Saward has edited Christ Is the Answer: The Christ-centered Teaching of Pope John Paul II (T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh), reviewed by Avery Dulles under the title "The heart of the matter" in The Tablet, May 25, 1996: one of the thirteen chapters is "Mariology." Orbis of Maryknoll is advertising John Paul II: The Encyclicals in Everyday Language, edited by Joseph Donders.

in inclusive language. Alba House of Staten Island, N.Y., has just published a new edition (1053 p.) of the classic *The Christian Faith*, edited by J. Neuner and J. Dupuis: it has much material on Mary. Thirty years after the Council, there has been a revival of interest in its achievements.

Orbis of Maryknoll has begun a five-volume *The History of Vatican II, 1959-1965*, edited by G. Alberigo and J. Komonchak; volume one has appeared: *Announcement and Preparation. Catholic Dossier* (May-June, 1996), the whole number focused on “The Blessed Virgin,” has my article “Light on Our Blessed Lady: Chapter Eight of *Lumen gentium*.”

Liguori Publications (Liguori, MO) issued in 1994 the brochure by Bishop Edward J. O’Rourke, *Jesus the Divine Teacher: Five New Decades of the Rosary*. Such a recommendation was made in the American Bishops’ pastoral of November 21, 1973, “Behold Your Mother: Woman of Faith.” The mysteries proposed by Bishop O’Rourke are: 1) Baptism of Jesus, 2) Cana wedding, 3) Sermon on the mount, 4) Prodigal son, 5) Transfiguration. It is curious to recall that the suggestion of the American bishops’ joint pastoral, “Behold Your Mother” (no. 97), provoked some strong protests as a departure from tradition. My file still includes a letter from Frank Duff (d. 1979), of the Legion of Mary, reacting most favorably to the idea. Bishop Alex Brunett’s “The Image of Mary Honored in the Church,” was in *Origins* 24 (February 9, 1995: no. 34).

3. Scripture and tradition

Biblical articles in the journals have already been noted, especially the new Italian *Theotokos*. Oxford University Press is advertising the volume by J. K. Elliott, *The Apocryphal Jesus*, an abridgement of his 1994 *The Apocryphal New Testament*; it has materials of Marian interest. The title *The Magnificat: Musicians as Biblical Interpreters*, by the Reformed theologian Samuel Terrien (Paulist, Mahwah, NJ, 1995), was reviewed in the Winter, 1995/6 Newsletter (no.31) of the Marian Library, by Fr. Thomas A. Thompson, himself a musician. Along with perceptive chapters based on the Hebrew background of the Magnificat, Terrien lists musical compositions
that add to the interpretation, with references to relevant phonograph recordings.


Tina Beattie—born in Africa, a convert to Catholicism, and mother of four children—is now studying theology at the University of Bristol (England). Liguori Publications has published her attractive *Rediscovering Mary: Insights from the Gospels* (Liguori, MO, 1955; in England, Burns and Oates). Tina Beattie is to be a speaker on "The Virgin Mary: Representation and Devotion in Great Britain," at the summer school entitled "Tradition and Change in the Cult of the Virgin Mary" (June 29–July 4, 1996), at Salisbury Cathedral, sponsored by the newly founded Marian Study Centre at L.S.U. College Southampton. The director of the Centre is Sarah Jane Boss; on the consultative committee is Eamon Duffy of Cambridge. When I picked up Beattie's book I checked the bibliography, and was unfavorably impressed by some names. Although there is a distracting, occasionally angry, feminist undertone in the book, my fears were allayed in reading the eleven chapters. Their titles catch the flavor of the excellent writing (e.g., chap. 4, "A Manger and a Murmur of Angels—Mary Gives Birth to Jesus"; chap. 8, "Water, Wine and the Glory of God—Mary and Jesus at the Wedding of Cana").

Under the heading of "tradition," I list the third volume of the writings of the late Alexander Schmemann: *The Virgin Mary: Celebration of Faith* (Crestwood, NY: St. Vladimir Seminary Press, 1995): sermons and academic lectures. Virginia Kimball has an article in the new Orthodox magazine, *The Handmaiden* (Spring, 1996: 2; from Ben Lomond, CA), "Celebrating Theotokos as the Model Disciple" (p. 8–15). John Breck (of
St. Vladimir Seminary) has published the paper he read to the Ecumenical Society of the B.V.M. in the Washington area, “Mary in the New Testament,” in Pro Ecclesia: A Journal of Catholic and Evangelical Theology 2 (Fall, 1993), 460–72. In Queen of All Hearts 47 (July–August, 1996), 24–27, Deyanira Flores has the article “Eadmer of Canterbury (c. 1130) Thinking of Mary,” under the heading “Discovering Mary in the Middle Ages.” Eadmer, the Saxon-born secretary to St. Anselm (d. 1109), was an important defender of the Immaculate Conception. To the extensive footnotes with Dr. Flores’ article, reference might well be added to the insights on the Marian contributions of both Eadmer and Anselm by Richard Southern (e.g., St. Anselm: A Portrait in a Landscape [Cambridge University Press, N.Y., 1990]: “Eadmer and the Immaculate Conception,” p. 432–36).

4. Doctrinal concerns

Earlier in this Survey, in the section on the major periodicals, there were notices of several recent full-scale “Mariologies.” Catholic Dossier 2 (May–June, 1996: no. 3) is edited by Ralph McInerny of Notre Dame, published by Ignatius Press of San Francisco; the whole issue is on the Blessed Virgin, with such authors and topics as John Paul II, Dante, Thomas Aquinas, M. Hauke, Fulton Sheen, St. Albert the Great, Charles Péguy, and Gerard Manley Hopkins.

The latest Marian Library Studies, (new series) 24 (1992–95), has extracts of two doctorates defended at the International Marian Research Institute (IMRI) of the University of Dayton: Johann G. Roten, “Im Zeichen der Ellipse” (on Hans Urs von Balthasar, but not including the section on Our Lady), and the late John F. Britt’s “Newman’s Use of Sacred Scripture in Texts on the Incarnation and Mary,” along with Theodore A. Koehler’s tribute, “To a Great Servant of the Church, Henri Cardinal de Lubac.”

Two recent books by Oscar Lukefahr, C.M., are noteworthy; both are Liguorian Publications (Liguori, MO, 1995), and both have accompanying “workbooks.” One is entirely on Our Lady: Morning Star: Christ’s Mother and Ours, the title reflecting Mary’s role to herald her Son, the Sun of Justice, to prepare for the millennium in 2000. Fr. Lukefahr begins with the Bible and
explains Catholic liturgy, doctrine and devotions (e.g., the Rosary). He comments also on the wave of apparitions of recent days. Lukefahr's "We Believe...": A Survey of the Catholic Faith is the revision of an earlier title; it is cross-referenced to the Catechism of the Catholic Church. Chapter 6, "Jesus Gives Us Communion with the Saints," explains Our Lady’s place.


At Yale University in the fall of 1995, Jaroslav Pelikan gave the DeVane Lectures which are to appear in Mary through the Centuries: Her Place in the History of Culture. Father Frederick M. Jelly, O.P., is preparing a new book, Preaching Christ through Mary, subtitled A New Advent in Preparation for the Third Millennium.

Queenship Publishing Company of Santa Barbara, California, issued in 1995 the title Mary: Coredemptrix, Mediatrix, Advocate: Theological Foundations: Towards a Papal Definition? The publisher is the center of the lay organization Vox Populi Mariae Mediatrici (Voice of the People for Mary Mediatrix) which "seeks the papal definition of the Blessed Virgin Mary as Coredemptrix, Mediatrix of all graces and Advocate for the People of God." The organization is circulating a petition to that effect, inviting signatures. Editor of the book is Mark I. Miravalle of the Franciscan University of Steubenville, Ohio. He also
wrote two of the articles: one on the “Foundational Presence in Divine Revelation,” and the other, in association with the Capuchin John A. Schug, on the significance of the title “Co-redemptrix” in the Magisterium of the Church. Bertrand de Margerie, S.J., also has two articles: one on the Fathers, the other asking whether the Spiritual Maternity is definable. The latter had appeared already in Marianum (1981). Arthur B. Calkins considers the topic in current Roman liturgy. William G. Most takes up scriptural support for Mary’s cooperation in redemption. Michael O’Carroll, C.S.Sp., of Ireland, suggests the value for Catholic-Orthodox unity. The exegete Ignace de la Potterie, S.J., writes of Mary’s mediation in the Incarnation, invoking the Johannine prologue and the Lukan annunciation story. (It is noted that Bertrand Buby, S.M., has translated La Potterie into English.)

Without prejudice to the zeal of the promoters of the petition to the Holy Father, the author of this Survey wonders at the wisdom of the goal of “the fifth Marian dogma: Mary, Co-redemptrix, Mediatrix, Advocate.” Not without carefully, even painfully, worked-out reason did the Vatican Council choose to describe Mary’s saving role in other language (e.g., the extraordinarily rich statement in the Council’s very first document, the Constitution on the Liturgy (no. 103): “Blessed Mary, Mother of God, is inseparably joined to her Son’s saving work.”

5. Liturgy, devotion and devotions

Overlooked in recent Surveys was the splendid entry by Brian E. Daley, Jesuit of Weston, on the Feasts of Mary in the New Dictionary of Sacramental Worship, edited by Peter Fink, S.J. (Liturgical Press, Collegeville, MN, 1990), 818–25. Typical is the remark that Mary’s presence at the Incarnation is evidence of the full humanity of her Son, and her Immaculate Conception the initial instance of full redemption. His entry for July 16, the commemoration of Our Lady of Mt. Carmel, is equally enlightening.

The Winter, 1996, issue of Carmelite Digest (vol. 11, no.1) has “Our Lady’s Calendar” (p. 2–17), and editor Pascal Pierini’s long and informative article “Stabat Mater” (p. 18–37). Edward D. O’Connor, C.S.C., has just published Marian Apparitions: Why So Many Today? (Queenship Publishing Co., Santa Bar-
bara, CA, 1996). Readers seeking a reasoned defense of private revelation will find it in this book, which consists of previous articles and addresses by the author, including his paper to the eleventh International Mariological Congress at Huelva, Spain, September, 1992.

The Spring, 1996, Marian Library Newsletter (new series, no. 32) is devoted to shrines and apparitions and the criteria for judging them in four short articles: "Marian Shrines: Signs of the Pilgrim Church," "The Message of Marian Apparitions" (James Bacik), "Discerning the Miraculous: Norms for Judging Apparitions and Private Revelations" (F. M. Jelly), "The Role of the Bishop in Discerning the Authenticity of Private Revelations and Apparitions" (Michael Smith Foster).


The article by Jean-Pierre Ruiz, "The Apocalypse of John and Contemporary Roman Catholic Liturgy," Worship 68 (1994), 482–504, includes comment on the feast of the Assumption. The premier pre-Reformation Marian shrine in England was Walsingham; destroyed and pillaged under Henry VIII, it has had in recent decades a renewal of the ancient pilgrimages, under both Anglican and Catholic auspices. The June 29, 1996, London Tablet has a review by Christopher Colven, who was administrator of the Anglican shrine, 1980–1987, of two new titles: Elizabeth Ruth Oubbard, O.D.C., The History and Spirituality of Walsingham (Canterbury Press); and Marina Warner, Walsingham: An Ever-Circling Year (Oxford University Press), outstanding for its photographs.

6. Ecumenism

Mary: Glimpses of the Mother of Jesus, by Beverly Roberts Gaventa, was published in 1995 by the University of South
Survey of Recent Mariology (1996)

Carolina Press (Columbia, SC). It is a title in the series Studies in Personalities of the New Testament. The author is professor of New Testament Literature and Exegesis at Princeton Theological Seminary. Employing literary analysis, she explores the depiction of Mary in four early-Christian narratives: Matthew, Luke-Acts, John and the Protevangelium of James. The Matthew chapter is titled “Threatened and Threatening”; the Luke-Acts “Disciple, Prophet, and Mother”; the Gospel of John “Cana and the Cross”; and, treating Mary in the Protevangelium of James, “A Life of Sacred Purity.” Dr. Gaventa inquires about the place of Mary in these early stories, an approach differing from both the historical-critical studies (that seek what lies “behind” the accounts) and the subsequent theological developments (that go “beyond” the narratives). She poses these questions to her four sources: What does Mary say and do? How do others speak to or about her? What actions do they take that have significance for her? How is Mary described in comparison with and contrast with other characters? In what ways, if any, does Mary change as the narrative develops? What role/roles does she play in the development of the plot? What place does Mary have in the “governing principle” of the work itself?

The Easter 1995 issue of The Tablet (London) carried a review of the title Anglicans and Roman Catholics: The Search for Unity, edited by Christopher Hill and Edward Yarnold, S.J., and co-published by the Catholic Truth Society and S.P.C.K. The reviewer was Colin Buchanan, himself a publisher, who recalled his friendship with Jean Tillard, O.P., and its result: how he “began to learn how, without deceitfulness in language, genuine new approaches to the unproductive restating of traditional doctrines could succeed.” The Ecumenical Society of the B.V.M. (ESBVM) has, I suggest, shown how this can be done. In the memorial tribute to Martin Gillett (d. St. George’s Day, April 23, 1980), founder of the Society, it was said of him that he “made one of the most divisive issues of Church history a means of reconciliation, an instrument of love.”

The ESBVM publishes a thrice-yearly Newsletter, and its mailings customarily include pamphlet copies of recent papers read at one of the British branches. American members of ESBVM receive all these, along with notices of the twice-yearly
meetings in the Washington, D.C., area. Talks given at the American meetings can usually be had on request, and the American Society is about to publish selected papers in more permanent form, under the title: *Hopes and Visions*. Some of the American talks have been published in various journals (e.g., Mark Chapman, "Sancta Maria, Sancta Ecclesia: A Lutheran Possibility for a Marian Ecclesiology," delivered October, 1993, in *Pro Ecclesia: A Journal of Catholic and Evangelical Theology* 2 (Fall, 1993: 4), 460–72.

Since last year's *Survey*, two ESBVM newsletters are to be noted. The January, 1996, issue (3rd series, no.1; the 2nd series concluded in September, 1995, with no. 60) wears a new brochure-format of twenty pages; it has reports on branch meetings throughout England: London, Bristol, Canterbury, Cornwall, East Sussex, East Yorkshire, West Sussex, also Rome and Washington. The Servite William McLaughlin writes of the conference held October, 1995, at Newry, Co. Down, Ireland (the Society has a Belfast branch), and there is an announcement of the Society’s eleventh international conference in Bristol, September, 1996, commemorating the Malines conversations of seventy-five years ago. Further articles are on the American Methodist Donald Charles Lacy, the Kevelaer shrine in Germany, also a paragraph on the new Marian Study Centre under Dr. Sarah Jane Boss at L.S.U. College, Southampton, which has been running courses on Our Lady through the spring and is hosting the program “Tradition and Change in the Cult of the Virgin Mary,” June 29–July 4, 1996.

The pamphlet accompanying the January *Newsletter* was *Rest and Light Perpetual: Prayer for the Departed in the Communion of Saints*, by the Methodist David Chapman. Under Martin Bucer’s influence, the second edition of the *Book of Common Prayer* (1552) had a Burial Office that broke with the pattern of the first edition of 1549, which had a direct commendation of the soul of the departed to the mercy of God. D. Chapman notes John Wesley’s acceptance of at least a generic prayer for the departed, and a beautiful hymn by Charles Wesley. He considers the lack of explicit scriptural support, the legitimacy of early-Christian tradition, purgatory (with contrasting descriptions by the flamboyant Frederick William Faber and the sober Karl Rahner) and the indispensable
Survey of Recent Mariology (1996)

significance of the communion of saints. Worth noting in this context is the anniversary essay (John Wesley died 1791), "Wesley and the Communion of Saints" by Geoffrey Wainwright in One in Christ 27 (1991: 4), 332–45.

The Spring, 1996, Newsletter (3rd series, no.2, May) is a sixteen-page brochure. It has the advance program for the Bristol congress of September, 1996, news-notes from local branches and groups, and the article "The Rosary since Vatican II," reprinted from the Marian Library Newsletter. Further, there is an announcement of our 1996 MSA meeting, and a note on the new "Mary Page" on the world-wide web (from the Marian Library, University of Dayton: http://www.udayton.edu/mary). Brother John Samaha has a short article on "The Rose as a Marian symbol." The accompanying pamphlet was John Hunwicke's Paul's Problems and the Assumption of Mary: an address given to the West Sussex branch, June, 1995; its original title was "The Grammar of St. Paul and the Eschaton of the Mother of God."

Under the auspices of the Immaculate Conception School of Theology at Seton Hall University (So. Orange, NJ), Eamon R. Carroll, O.Carm., delivered the public lecture "Mary in Ecumenical Perspective." It has appeared in print in the Carmelite publication The Sword 55 (1995: 1 & 2), 47–62.

7. Miscellany


Ignatius Press of San Francisco has just published Born Fundamentalist, Born Again Catholic by David Currie. Both his parents taught in the Moody Bible Institute. The book discusses such topics as the pope, the Eucharist and Our Lady.
Robert Reilly wrote a single-page light-hearted article for the column "Practicing Catholic" of the Claretian monthly *US Catholic* (May, 1996). He titled his contribution "Don't Leave Home without It," recalling his family's custom of saying the Memorare before car trips. He comments: "Asking for God's favor, through the intercession of Mary, is part of our honest relationship with our Creator."

The poetry editor of the Montfort magazine *Queen of All Hearts* is the distinguished Italian-born Joseph Tusiani. Roger Charest reviewed (in the January-February 1995 issue) the book *Joseph Tusiani: Poet, Translator, and Humanist: An International Homage*, edited by Paolo Giordano of Loyola University Chicago (publisher is Bordighera Inc., Purdue University, West Lafayette, IN, 1994). Some of Tusiani's poems on Our Lady have appeared in *Queen*; the same issue has his seven-section "John Takes Mary Home." In the Giordano volume, Lucia Petracco Sovran did the essay "Joseph Tusiani's Lyric Monologues of the Holy Week," which *Queen* also published: "The Man from Cyrene" (March-April, 1987) and "The Testament of Pontius Pilate" (March-April, 1979). The January-February 1995 article by R. Charest quotes the conclusion of Sovran's essay, and then the poet's English translation of his "Ad Sanctam Mariam." In "Ave Maria," our poet seems to recapitulate all his meditations on her personal *Via Crucis*. So shaken is he by the global impact of the *Passio Christi* on his soul, that in a moment of fervor synonymous with poetic inspiration, he even changes the unalterable "The Lord is with thee" into "Good Friday is with thee." So here is a compendium of all of Joseph Tusiani's lyrics inspired by the Holy Week:

Ave Maria, Good Friday is with thee,  
O full of sorrow, sea of sorrow, hail!  
Thou art of women that were and will be,  
The saddest and the one all tears assail.  
Pierced is the fruit of thy womb with a nail  
And a nail and a nail on the Cross of Calvary.  
O holy Mary, mother of Jesus and me,  
Jesus is dead, and I die in this vale  
of sin. Shall I then add one sword-pang more  
To the sharp seven in thy sinless heart?
Ah, make each tear of thine a prayer for me
So that, as Jesus rose to life and thee,
I too to thee and Him and life may soar,
And all thy children know the love thou art.

This sonnet was published also in the book edited by Clifford Laube, *Their Music Is Mary* (Bay Shore, NY: Montfort Publications, 1961); it is printed here with the permission of the Montfort Fathers, holders of the copyright.

**Further Selection of Recent Writings**

Titles here listed are as late as the beginning of September, 1996. The order is: A. Magisterium, B. Scripture and tradition, C. Doctrine, D. Liturgy and devotion, E. Ecumenism, F. Miscellany and last-minute items, some of which will be reviewed in the 1997 Survey.

A. Magisterium

1. *Inside the Vatican* 3 (May, 1995) had as cover story “Why Is Mary Weeping?: One focus of John Paul II's pontificate has been the restoration of Marian devotion: An assessment.” The May-June, 1996, issue has more on the pope's Marian devotion, under the title “Totus tuus.”


B. Scripture and tradition


Survey of Recent Mariology (1996)

C. Doctrine


D. Liturgy and devotion(s)


2. Therese Johnson, *Visions of Our Lady* (Roselle, IL: Roman Inc., 1995): twelve famous shrines associated with appearances of the Blessed Virgin, including Knock (Our Lady of Silence), Beauraing (Virgin with the Golden Heart), and Banneux (Virgin of the Poor).


4. Frederick L. Miller, “True Devotion to Mary,” *Homiletic and Pastoral Review* 96 (December, 1995), 817: according to St. Louis Montfort. Also found in the same issue, Donald De Marco, “Mary as Role Model for the Pro-Life Movement” (p. 25–31).

5. Orbis, the Maryknoll publisher, is advertising *Mary, Shadow of Grace*, by Megan McKenna, a well-known storyteller.
E. Ecumenism


2. *Newsletter of the Ecumenical Society of the Blessed Virgin Mary*, 3rd series, no. 3 (September 1996), notes that an article by Bernard Dupuy on the Mariology of Calvin, which first appeared in *Istina* in 1958, has been translated by Fr. Lennart Pearson, an Episcopal priest, in the *Sewanee Theological Review* 38 (Easter, 1995: 2), 114–25.


F. Miscellany


2. The Mariological Society of America now issues a Newsletter: volume 2 (no. 1) came out dated March, 1996: among items reported is "The Mary Page" on the worldwide web, from the Marian Library (Dayton, OH). Announcements and news items are to be sent to Virginia Kimball, MSA Newsletter Editor, 4 Wayne Road, Westford, MA 01886.


5. The January-June, 1996, number of *Miles Immaculatae* (anno xxxii, fasc. 1) has arrived, with several articles in English: one by John M. Samaha, S.M., "Mary's Apostolic Mission: The Contribution of Venerable Chaminade to Mariology."

6. The second fascicle of *Marianum* (annus lvii, no. 148, 1995) has arrived: a long article in English treats Jesus and his Mother in St. Mark, and, from the 210th General Chapter of the Order of the Servants of Mary, there comes the document "Servi del Magnificat: Il cantico della Vergine e la vita consecrata" (685–812).

7. The Catholic Home Study Institute has a new name: "The Catholic Distance University" (same address: 781 Catoctin Ridge, Paeonian Springs, VA 22129). One of their correspondence courses is "Madonna: Mary in the Catholic Tradition." They publish commentaries on four major Marian documents: *Marialis cultus* (Paul VI), "Behold Your Mother, Woman of Faith" (Bishops of the United States), *Redemptoris mater* (John Paul II), and the Marian chapter of *Lumen gentium*, the conciliar Dogmatic Constitution on the Church.

8. The Ecumenical Society of the B.V.M. (U.S. branch) has its office at Oblate College, 391 Michigan Avenue. N.E., Washington, DC 20017. Annual fee is $20.00; members receive the Newsletter and other publications from the parent society in England three times a year, news of the American meetings (twice a year), and publications.